De-Colonizing Media Literacy: An Indigenous Positive Deviance Case Study Of A Guam-Texas Community Empowering Civic Education For Inafaâmolek Self-Determination

Roque Aguon
University of Texas at El Paso

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.utep.edu/open_etd

Part of the Communication Commons, Liberal Studies Commons, Other Education Commons, and the Public Administration Commons

Recommended Citation
https://scholarworks.utep.edu/open_etd/3951

This is brought to you for free and open access by ScholarWorks@UTEP. It has been accepted for inclusion in Open Access Theses & Dissertations by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks@UTEP. For more information, please contact lweber@utep.edu.
DE-COLONIZING MEDIA LITERACY: AN INDIGENOUS POSITIVE DEVIANCE CASE
STUDY OF A GUAM-TEXAS COMMUNITY EMPOWERING CIVIC
EDUCATION FOR INAFA’MAOLEK SELF-DETERMINATION

ROQUE ANTHONY AGUON, JR.
Doctoral Program in Teaching, Learning, and Culture

APPROVED:

______________________________
Cesar A. Rossatto, Ph.D., Chair

______________________________
Jose Maria Herrera, Ph.D.

______________________________
Robert A. Underwood, Ph.D.

______________________________
Arvind Singhal, Ph.D.

______________________________
Stephen L. Crites, Jr., Ph.D.
Dean of the Graduate School
DE-COLONIZING MEDIA LITERACY: AN INDIGENOUS POSITIVE DEVIANCE CASE STUDY OF A GUAM-TEXAS COMMUNITY EMPOWERING CIVIC EDUCATION FOR INAFA’MAOLEK SELF-DETERMINATION

by

ROQUE ANTHONY AGUON, JR., B.A., M.P.A.

DISSERTATION

Presented to the Faculty of the Graduate School of The University of Texas at El Paso in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Department of Teacher Education

THE UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT EL PASO

December 2023
I want to thank God. My wife, Melissa Cruz Perez Aguon and our children (Riley, Victoria, Blaine, Natalia, Sang’ani, Roque III, and Alexandra) for the sacrifices we made on this journey--may you one day read this understand the way forward. To my parents and siblings; as well as Familian Cruz gi Malesso (Grandpa Antonio, Nana Antonia, and Mel’s brothers and sisters). Ancestors and Future generations, Friends and family that will remain unknown from the Campos Cepeda Castro Aguon “Mahetok” & San Nicolas Naputi Clan giya ‘FeFu yan Inalahan...TaoTao Haya, Guahan as well as La Familia Quiroz-Ortiz de Cedral, San Luis de Posti’, Mexico y Victoria, Tejas & Barrera Reyna de Houston. To our study participants and this committee: Dr. Rossatto, Dr. Underwood, Dr. Herrera, and Dr. Singhal. To the University of Texas at El Paso; Graduate School; the College of Ed; Dean Tanabe, and our Teaching, Learning, and Culture PhD Program faculty and program administrators, Dr. de la Piedra and Dr. Hsu; to June and Alex; Margo; my fellow students in the 5th cohort; and all preceding cohorts. I am grateful for funding received during this course of this dissertation from The University of Guam/Jesus U. Torres Professional-Technical Grant Award. To the City of El Paso and Latte’Advocating, LLC; to the U.S. Department of Commerce/Bureau of The Census, The City of Killeen/Department of Aviation; and FedWriters/U.S.Army-III Armored Corps Public Affairs Office, as well as the many colleagues from the Western Pacific, West Texas, and Central Texas that took part in the informal experiences along this journey. I will remain forever grateful for the knowledge and relationships.
ABSTRACT

DE-COLONIZING MEDIA LITERACY: AN INDIGENOUS POSITIVE DEVIANCE CASE STUDY OF A GUAM-TEXAS COMMUNITY EMPOWERING CIVIC EDUCATION FOR INAFA’MAOLEK SELF-DETERMINATION

This case study delves into the realm of civic and media education within varied municipalities in Guam and Texas, which, to date, have been underexplored by contemporary Indigenous social science researchers within the dominant white culture. The investigation focuses on elucidating how influencers from diverse cultural groups employ education and propaganda in the municipal public policy-making process, contributing to holistic community development, democratic citizenship education, and social transformation. The primary aim of this study is to underscore the imperative need for decolonizing civic and media engagement practices in the local policy processes and media literacy frameworks in the U.S.-West Texas border, the U.S. colony of Guam, and Central Texas. Such an imperative is heightened in the current era, marked by rhetorical confrontations pervasive in media and political spheres, particularly impacting minority and Indigenous communities. This dissertation advances knowledge through the creation of research methodologies, curriculum designs, and pedagogical approaches that cultivate community and individual critical consciousness, paving the way for self-determination.

The study caters specifically to Indigenous peoples and their allies, employing Indigenous knowledge to address the dearth of community education concerning democratic citizenship, with the ultimate goal of enhancing civic participation. The proposed methodology endeavors to construct a theoretical triangulation framework of analysis termed “An Indigenous Civic & Media Educational Research Framework towards Decolonizing Media Literacy” The research methods center on an Indigenous Positive Deviance Case Study applying the Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF), Critical Consciousness (CritCon) process to identify best practices for civic media futures empowering Indigenous-Minority education.

Key Words: decolonizing + media literacy + civic engagement + education + propaganda + Indigenous + Positive Deviance + case study + public administration + public policy + municipal
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ........................................................................................................ iii

ABSTRACT ........................................................................................................................ iv

TABLE OF CONTENTS ....................................................................................................... v

LIST OF TABLES ............................................................................................................... vi

LIST OF FIGURES .............................................................................................................. vii-viii

1. CHAPTER I-INTRODUCTION ...................................................................................... 1

2. CHAPTER II-REVIEW OF LITERATURE .................................................................. 58

3. CHAPTER III-METHODOLOGY ................................................................................ 129

4. CHAPTER IV-FINDINGS & ANALYSIS ..................................................................... 169

5. CHAPTER V-DISCUSSSION & CONCLUSION .......................................................... 292

REFERENCES .................................................................................................................. 359

APPENDICES .................................................................................................................. 384

CURRICULUM VITA ......................................................................................................... 532
LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.1: Media Tracking Observation Coding Table-Indigenous Self-Determination
  (Online) ................................................................. p.193

Table 4.2: PhD Field Notes/Coding of Researcher Reflections ................................. p.206

Table 4.3: PhD Field Notes/IMF Coding of Researcher’s Reflections ........................... p.210

Table 4.4: Interview Coding & Memoing—Emerging Civic and Media Uncommon
  Practices ................................................................. p.235

Table 4.5, Appendix Chapter 4 ......................................................... p.434
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Key Notions of Decolonial Theory, Appendix Chapters 1-3.................................p.380

Figure 2.1: A Conceptual Framework towards Decolonizing Media Literacy Pedagogy: Social Justice & Democratic Participation in the Municipal Policy-making Process to Transform Public Memory, Self-determination, and Civic Education for Indigenous/Minority Communities.................................................................p.61

Figure 2.2: An Indigenous Civic & Media Educational Research Framework towards Decolonizing Media Literacy.................................................................p.128

Figure 2.3: Framework of Analysis, Appendix Chapters 1-3..................................................p.380

Figure 3: Indigenous Mixed Methodologies & Methods Model, Appendix Chapters 1-3......p.381

Figure 4: Approach & Type-Methodology, Appendix Chapters 1-3.................................p.382

Figure 4.1: Patterns of DML activities representing critical consciousness behavior.........p.175

Figure 4.2: Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework.................................................................p.179

Figure 4.3: CodingIMFwordcloud.................................................................p.182

Figure 4.4: CRITCON Process......................................................................................p.183

Figure 4.5: Surveywordcloud.........................................................................................p.188

Figure 4.6: Online media tracking word cloud.................................................................p.201

Figure 4.7: Observations AI Word Cloud.................................................................p.226

Figure 4.8: Focus Group AI WordCloud.................................................................p.231

Figure 4.9: Life History Analysis AI WordCloud.................................................................p.240

Figure 4.10: Life History Analysis-Family & Cultural Values...........................................p.241

Figure 4.11: Interview IMF Word Cloud.................................................................p.259

Figure 4.12 Foundational tenets of IMF process- the CRITCON framework..................p.271
Figure 5: Decision Matrix-Mixed Methods Design, Appendix Chapters 1-3.................p.382
Figure 5.1: PD behaviors of propaganda/education-media/institutional knowledge.........p.315
Figure 5.2: PD practices-navigating narratives & landscapes......................................p.316
Figure 5.3: PD Practices-Public Memory/Personal & Community Development............p.319
Figure 5.4: Other’s Window of Knowing + IMF............................................................p.322
Figure 5.5: PD Behaviors-Value System Practices for Propaganda/Education.............p.325
Figure 5.6: PD Practices-navigating interpersonal communication............................p.327
Figure 5.7: PD Cultural Values-shifting family norms..............................................p.328
Figure 5.8: PD evolving values for cultural + personal development.............................p.330
Figure 5.9: PD Ethics-interpersonal communication..................................................p.331
Figure 5.10: The Municipal Policy/Sausage-Making Process......................................p.337
Figure 6: ConTri Design Type-Mixed Methods Design, Appendix Chapters 1-3..........p.383
Figure 7: ConTrans Design Type-Mixed Methods Design, Appendix Chapters 1-3.......p.383
Figure 8: Proposed Visualization of the Indigenous Concurrent Transformative /Triangulation Design........................................................................................................................................p.384
Figure 9: Overall Timeline..........................................................................................p.385
Figure 10: Indigenous Inafa'maolek Mediation Framework for Data Analysis.............p.386
Figure 11: Rossatto's Critical Consciousness Chart (2012).........................................p.388
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1-A. Overview

In the present discourse, private ethics have become increasingly entangled with the public sphere. This confluence is particularly notable as we witness the ascension of the Trump Administration to the highest office in the United States. This phenomenon has been characterized by some as the emergence of a new alternative-right movement, characterized by neo-Nazi and white supremacist ideologies (Ali, 2016; AM Joy, 2016; Democracy Now, 2016; Fahrenthold, 2016; Folkenflik, 2016; Fresh Air Audio Program, 2016; Hernandez, 2016; Hobbs, 2016; Hohmann, 2016; Lee & Puzzanghera, 2016; Montgomery, 2016; Morning Joe, 2016; Rhodan, 2016; Saul, 2016; Stelter, 2016; Volcovici, 2016). This has precipitated the emergence of a new media ecosystem characterized by the proliferation of alternative "facts," fake news, data breaches, and an unprecedented assault on the credibility of established media institutions—an ecosystem ironically catalyzed by the media spectacle surrounding Donald Trump, which yielded substantial profits (Calderone, 2016; Corcoran In Truthout, 2017; Fox News, 2016; Geiger, 2016; Gunaratna, 2016; Montanaro, 2016; Sillito, 2016; Tolan, 2016). Simultaneously, a counter-narrative posits that the middle-class white community has been victimized, experiencing a perceived erosion of their privilege due to what is characterized as "reverse racism." At the core of this inquiry lie pivotal issues that are central to the contemporary Indigenous/Minority experience. It seeks to deconstruct coloniality through an inter-institutional approach that encompasses media, government, and education. All of this transpires against the
backdrop of the waning post-modern neocolonial neoliberal era, as we navigate towards a more equitable present.

The implications of these inquiries hold significant promise for informing civic and media education curriculum and pedagogy for a diverse spectrum of individuals, including both mainstream and marginalized groups. This is particularly relevant considering recent and historical national policies that have amplified the militarization of the U.S.-Mexico border, portraying immigrants as invaders. This study aims to investigate the potential of teaching and learning about media/critical/cultural literacy within disenfranchised communities that have traditionally exhibited voter apathy and limited civic engagement. The aim is to counter prevailing hegemonies and empower self-determination through a situated approach rooted in municipal government discourse space. This entails paying meticulous attention to communications regarding the public policy-making process at the city, county, and independent school district levels. Curiously, civic education scholars have noted a dearth of data and studies focusing on municipal/local forms of government, even though this level fundamentally shapes a citizen's relationship with the system.

To address this research gap, this study employs an Indigenous-centered Decolonizing mixed-methodological approach, utilizing a concurrent transformative triangulation of methodologies and methods. This approach draws on theoretical paradigms from the fields of communication, public administration theory, and sociocultural foundations of education to probe this intricate situation. Given the scarcity of mixed methods approaches designed by and for Indigenous researchers, there is a clear imperative for Indigenous (INDIG), qualitative (QUAL), and
quantitative (quan) data, as well as the insights derived from their integration, thereby filling an academic niche for "a more comprehensive analysis, multiple viewpoints, and a need to explore and confirm" (p. 265, Creswell & Clark, 2018; Creswell, et al., In Tashakkori & Teddlie, 2003; and Smith, 2012).

Consequently, this research advocates for and proposes a pedagogy for Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML). The aim is to fortify civic and democratic citizenship education, fostering community empowerment to uncover inherent media education and civic participatory practices for future research and program implementation (Banks, 2017; Merry, 2018; and Weinberg & Flinders, 2018).

1-B. Statement of the Problem

This study delves into the civic and media education practices of Indigenous/Minority and dominant/White/Elite cultural groups. It examines their approaches to curriculum, pedagogy, and content regarding municipal policy processes with the aim of fostering self-determination, critical consciousness, and social change.

To put it plainly, there is a deficiency in research, curriculum development, and pedagogy regarding civic and media education across diverse municipalities in Guam and Texas. This gap is particularly pronounced when it comes to the contributions of modern Indigenous social science researchers in understanding how various cultural groups utilize public memory within propaganda to engage in municipal public policymaking. This engagement seeks to influence comprehensive community development, democratic citizenship education, and social change.
The justification for this research problem highlights a commonality among diverse municipalities in Texas and the Unincorporated Territories, where communities share a peripheral status in relation to centers of dominant power. Dominant cultures shape public policies addressing social issues, and civic participation within minority communities is often contingent upon factors like race, class, and culture. Knowledge of successful citizen engagement in the public policy-making process tends to be accessible primarily to those with privilege. Similarly, understanding how institutional actors operate, communicate (especially regarding media and political themes), and construct identity in the public policy-making process is typically confined to elite policymakers.

Analysis of Guam & El Paso Voter Participation and Educational Proficiency

Consequently, Guam presents an intriguing contradiction. General election voter turnout remains consistently high, reaching 60% or higher. However, educational proficiency among high school students in key subjects - English, Reading, and Math (with no assessment for Social Studies) - stagnates below 55%. Moreover, the attainment of a bachelor’s degree or higher hovers at approximately 20%. In stark contrast, the border city of El Paso and its surrounding region, encompassing Las Cruces, NM, and Ciudad Juarez, MX, report comparable trends in educational attainment. Here, less than 30% have achieved a bachelor’s degree or higher. However, the regional educational proficiency among high school students in El Paso is notably higher, ranging from 60% to 86% in English and Math, with over 90% demonstrating proficiency in U.S. History.
During the general election of 2016, El Paso reported a voter participation rate of 51%. It's worth noting that this pattern does not extend to non-Presidential election years, particularly Uniform elections in November, where voter participation in El Paso plummeted to below 4% in 2017, and in May of the same year, it remained below 9%, even with the inclusion of the Mayoral race. The trends persist in previous years as well, with the 2015 November Uniform Election falling below 7%, and the 2015 May Uniform Election dipping below 10%. In the 2014 November General election, participation was below 21%. In 2012, during the November General election with President Obama on the ballot for his second term, there was a 46% voter turnout in what is predominantly a democratic county (Borderplex Alliance, 2018; CREEED, 2018; El Paso County Elections, 2016; Guam Elections Commission; Guam Department of Education, Guam Pacific Daily News, 2017; U.S. Census Bureau, 2012; El Paso Independent School District, 2017). Both communities grapple with the challenge of educating an immigrant population. Guam's student demographic primarily comprises Pacific Islanders and Asians, while El Paso's makeup is predominantly of Mexican or Hispanic descent.

According to the Nations Report Card of the National Assessment of Education Progress-2014 Civics Assessment, compared to 1998, scores continue to increase among various student demographic groups. Although the population sample includes "Asian/Pacific Islanders", Guam and the Pacific Islands, (U.S. Territories) are not included among state profiles. These profile categories consist of mainland jurisdictions and "National Public", and do not include civic assessments only math, reading, science, and writing. Puerto Rico is the only U.S. Territory represented in the "National Public" category. This report indicates that Puerto Rico's 2017 average
score is significantly lower than the National Public score. However, among the "Student Group Scores" of the Civic Assessment, Asian/Pacific Islanders and Hispanics as Race/Ethnicity groups perform lower than their White counterparts do, with Asian/Pacific Islanders performing higher than Hispanics; both groups continue to see an upward trend though both groups demonstrate below proficiency. Point being as relevant to this dissertation, though Pacific Islander groups are lumped with Asian there is no data about where these Islanders are from aside from including Hawaiian. Further, the contradiction herein indicates that though, for example, in 2010 adopted GDOE K-12 Content Standards and Performance Indicators for the content area of Social Studies, these students are held to a national standard and required to learn "national level" content their contribution is not reflected in national assessments. GDOE standards for social studies include "Standard 4: Government and Civics" for High School about Guam History (which incorporates media literacy practices concerning Guam government and civics (political), discernment, argumentation, and American constitutional government, yet no mention of Guam's territorial status; World Geography; World History, with no mention of Guam's colonial history or significance in this process; U.S. History, with no mention of how Guam became a U.S. possession, and American local government with no comparative emphasis about mainland and Guam municipal governance, also included is the lawmaking process; American Government with emphasis on democracy and the federal system; elections; national government; public policy process and civic engagement; federal judiciary; civil rights; foreign policy; civic participation; and citizenship.

Challenges in Urban Education for Minorities
Urban education for minority populations in economically disadvantaged circumstances faces a significant societal perception. On a national scale, it is noteworthy that approximately 50% of black and Latino students are enrolled in schools where 75% or more of the student body comes from low-income backgrounds, while merely 5% of white students experience similar educational environments (CQ Researcher, 2007 & 2014). This discrepancy underscores a stark reality of social inequality, as income levels become a decisive factor in the democratic landscape.

Since the 1970s, the widening income gap has played a pivotal role in the politics of division within democracy. Presently, the top 1 percent of the population commands a substantial 33% of the nation's wealth. This economic divide has direct implications on income trends, with individuals possessing lower levels of education witnessing declining incomes, while those with higher educational attainment experience steady income growth. The intersection of race further exacerbates this issue, as individuals from black and Hispanic communities, across all educational strata, consistently earn less than their white counterparts.

The American Dream: Talent, Hard Work, and Success

The quintessential American dream posits that talent and diligence culminate in achievement. Brewer and Stonecash (2007) assert that national political and policy debates revolving around topics like taxes, welfare, unemployment, and social security underscore divisions in class and economic equality. Within this context, party elites, including donors, candidates, elected officials, and party officials, wield considerable influence in shaping policy stances on culturally
significant matters such as abortion, equal rights, school prayer, depictions of sexuality in popular culture, and LGBTQ rights.

For Latinos residing in the United States, a sense of belonging and the pervasive experience of discrimination are perceived as formidable barriers to realizing the American Dream. Within this framework, education emerges as the principal conduit to success. However, current trends in Latino educational attainment spotlight the existence of institutional hurdles, including enrollment segregation, inadequate funding, and a dearth of effective representation in policy-making spheres, as prominent factors impeding the realization of the American Dream for this demographic (Fraga et al., 2010).

Role of Public Decision Making in Discourse Environment

Drawing on critical discourse analysis frameworks, this study underscores the pivotal role of public decision-making within the broader context of discourse environments. These environments are conceptualized as intricate social constructs, encompassing acts, discourse, and identity, all of which are shaped by the interplay of social structures and events. These dynamics, in turn, are mediated by the practices of various institutions, including those within the realms of education, municipal governance, and media (Fairclough, 2014; Gee & Handford, 2014).

One proposed approach posits that transparent and inclusive public decision-making processes necessitate the active participation of minority representatives who can advocate for the best interests of low-income and segregated communities. This involvement is predicated on
the allocation of seats for minorities on public bodies, ensuring their voices are integral to the decision-making process (Lewis, 2008, pp. 126-166; in Hamilton & Atkins, 2008).

Inter-Institutional Dynamics Shaping Political Participation

An additional facet highlighting this issue underscores the significance of inter-institutional relationships governing the construction of meaning within the realms of political, media, and advertising discourse. These contexts wield a considerable influence on Hispanic voter engagement. Media entities are active participants in the political economy of formulating public policy, while individuals engaged in democratic processes within the public sphere assume roles as both consumers and producers of media content.

Despite the widespread use of media platforms, Hispanic voters in Texas have consistently faced disenfranchisement. This stems from the enactment of voter identification laws and the deliberate gerrymandering of voting districts, particularly for U.S. congressional and state legislative positions. These practices have perpetuated the dominance of Republicans in both statewide and national political offices, affording them control over all branches of the state government – executive, legislative, and judicial.

Challenges in Teacher Education and Civic Literacy

Moreover, this issue extends to the domain of teacher education. Within teacher preparation programs, various forms of literacy are addressed, yet often lack the pedagogical frameworks
necessary to comprehend the influence wielded by municipal government, media, and education in shaping collective consent (Macedo, p. xvii-xxxii; In Macedo & Steinberg, 2007). This deficiency in explicit curriculum has a cascading effect on the actions of community stakeholders, resulting in a dearth of timely and consistent civic engagement. Consequently, this dilutes public comprehension of the overarching goals set by institutions for economic and cultural development.

Prior to the formulation of a curriculum and pedagogical approach, it is imperative to conduct a comprehensive study of institutional actors vested with decision-making authority within the policy-making process. This entails an examination of how the social, political, and economic interests of both dominant and subordinate groups are represented. It is evident that the playing field is far from level, as policy elites not only comprehend and shape processes, but also possess the requisite knowledge and authority to govern the masses. This places those who choose to engage in a position of limited power and institutional knowledge, underscoring the need for an ultimate check and balance.

The Significance of Public Memory in the Policy-Making Media Market

The role of public memory constitutes a crucial dimension of this issue. Intercultural studies and Critical Media Literacy (CML) approaches in the realm of public policymaking, community education, intergovernmental relationships, and democratic media citizenship often overlook the pivotal role of public memory. Fields such as communications, public relations, public opinion, and media serve as institutions of power devised to influence the collective in coordination with
governmental and nongovernmental entities (Lippmann, 1922; Bernays, 1928; Herman & Chomsky, 1988; Hammer & Kellner, 2009). Notably, according to Edison Research, the media market is experiencing significant growth: 81% of individuals in the U.S. aged 12 and above, equivalent to 226 million people, own smartphones. Moreover, weekly online radio listenership is estimated at 53% (or 148 million), YouTube usage has risen to 68%, and AM/FM radio remains the source of audio for 57% of in-car listening. Additionally, social media usage has surged to 81%, encompassing 226 million users (2017, The Infinite Dial, Edison Research & Triton Digital).

While scholarship in media and policy studies duly recognizes the role of media as the fourth institutional component of democracy, complementing the executive, legislative, and judicial functions, there persists a conspicuous absence of a pedagogical framework that imparts knowledge about what is remembered and forgotten, by whom, and for what reasons. This omission exacerbates an existing issue, which adeptly deconstructs racism, sexism, and discrimination but falls short of imparting the skills necessary to interpret the world from an Indigenous/Minority perspective. In such a scenario, the media fulfills its intended purpose of diversion or "entertainment."

Addressing the Core Issue: Media Literacy and Civic Education

At the heart of this study lies a critical concern. The realm of media literacy is bereft of a civic education pedagogy that delves into the political economy of the media, the pivotal role of new media in shaping democratic practices, and the engagement of indigenous and minority
communities in the public policy-making process. A mere fraction of 14-15-year-old students in the United States have had the opportunity to partake in specialized courses like civics, tailored to educate them about political institutions and processes (IEA civic education project, 1999, p. 594, Civic Education across Countries). Noteworthy, the overall score results for eighth graders have witnessed a marginal increase of 4 points since 1998, albeit still falling below proficiency levels. Importantly, there has been no significant change when compared to the assessments conducted in 2010 (NAEP-Civics Assessment, 2014).

In the context of Texas, the landscape of civic education remains entrenched in political overtones. This can be attributed to the influence wielded by the elected state board of education and the absence of a robust assessment mechanism to gauge the efficacy of the social studies curriculum (Williams & Maloyed, 2013, "Much Ado about Texas: Civics in the Social Studies Curriculum," The History Teacher, 47(1), pp. 25-40, Society for History Education).

Fulfilling the Imperative of 21st Century Democracy: A Call for Education and Social Science Research

Taken together, these attributes delineate a scenario wherein our democracy necessitates the rigorous application of education and social science research to cater to the requisites of a 21st-century polity. While our cognition and behaviors may outpace the pace of technological advancements in our globalized world, it is incumbent upon us as education researchers to discern the frameworks that underpin the perpetuation of established oppressive norms. This, in
turn, calls for a process of disentangling established paradigms, reevaluating them, and subsequently forging new connections to emergent practices.

Addressing Deficiencies: Unraveling Media Influence on Public Policymaking

The inadequacies in available evidence underscore the pressing need to articulate the ways in which media shapes the public policy-making process to uphold prevailing cultural interests. Remarkably limited educational research has delved into the power dynamics analysis of policy elites at both the state and city levels, particularly in the context of their influence on educational decision-making processes (Anyon, p. 17-26; in Ladson-Billings & Tate, 2006). Additionally, extant municipal, state, and federal public policies perpetuate urban poverty through mechanisms such as minimum wage standards, corporate tax regulations, suburban impoverishment, inadequate public transportation, rampant underemployment, public allocation of funds for private sector development at the expense of taxpayers, persistent economic disparities, and the scarcity of affordable housing. These factors collectively leave public educational services bereft of adequate financial resources.

Constraining Civic Education: Implications of Epistemological Frameworks and Social Structures

The scope of civic education, encompassing community members' comprehension and engagement with democracy for the purpose of effecting social change through media, encounters constraints imposed by critical epistemological frameworks. Additionally, dominant
social structures characterized by dimensions of race, class, and culture, along with influential social events enacted within organizations and institutions such as government, educational bodies, civic associations, and media platforms, collectively serve as formidable barriers to civic participation among minority populations grappling with low socio-economic status.

Challenges to Educational Equity in Urban Contexts: An Analysis of External Social Structures and Policy Impact

External social structures and resultant public policy decisions exert a detrimental influence on urban schools and systems, impeding their capacity to enhance educational outcomes and offer avenues for upward social mobility to students. These formidable social forces significantly encroach upon the realm of educational equity. Individuals vested with authority strategize, act, and mobilize resources to sustain policies and practices that, regrettably, undermine urban communities and educational institutions, all while safeguarding elite political and economic networks. Within urban, minority, and Indigenous communities, there exists a notable deficit in access to pertinent knowledge, opportunities for empowerment, and mechanisms for orchestrating social movements capable of countering the prevailing policy change environment and enabling effective participation.

Empowering Marginalized Minority Communities: Unraveling the Phenomenon of Political Culture Wars
This study holds the potential to empower various marginalized minority communities by shedding light on the resurgence of civic agency within the public sphere amidst political culture wars. Hodgkinson et al. (In Ornstein et.al, 2011) highlight a demographic shift in Texas where minority population growth surpasses white fertility rates, sparking concerns over the perceived "browning of America". Census surveys have revealed certain limitations in data collection validity, particularly in relation to race, with racial categories lacking scientific rigor; a mere 2-4% of mixed-race census respondents identified as such (Hodgkinson, p.313-317; as cited in Ornstein, Pajak, Ornstein, 2011). Notably, recent additions to the official questionnaire, such as the citizenship question, have stirred controversy and led to widespread protests and legal action against policy decisions made during the Trump Administration, including measures that resulted in the separation of immigrant families.

1-C. Need for the Study-RESEARCH GAP

A significant research gap exists in the realm of decolonizing media literacy, particularly concerning both mainstream and indigenous populations. While fields such as education, media literacy, civic education, and municipal government public policy-making processes have been studied independently within areas like public administration, communications, sociocultural foundations, and Indigenous education, there is a dearth of comprehensive exploration into the intersection of these domains. Specifically, there is a scarcity of literature addressing civic and media education among diverse cultural groups within the unique contexts of U.S.-Pacific and U.S.-Mexico borderlands, encompassing Indigenous perspectives and municipal governance.
Researchers in the field of public administration emphasize systems of policy processes and city management, which are highly pertinent to the subject matter. Likewise, scholars specializing in communications, focusing on areas such as media culture, propaganda, intercultural communications, public memory, and Positive Deviance (PD), provide a foundational knowledge base that informs the development of media literacy education. The concept of PD significantly contributes to the methodological framework of this project, as it advocates for indigenous solutions to emerge as a means of addressing the identified issue. Furthermore, Civic Media, as a sub-field of civic engagement and participation in a mediated context, offers a contemporary lens through which to understand how technology interfaces with democratic citizenship. Additionally, the incorporation of the concept of public memory enhances the applicability of this notion within the social sciences, extending its relevance from traditional museum settings to encompass spaces of civic engagement.

Research within the field of sociocultural foundations and Indigenous education has underscored the pivotal role of concepts such as identity, race, critical pedagogy, and multiculturalism in fostering a culturally responsive educational environment. Moreover, Indigenous scholars worldwide have emphasized the imperative of respectfully integrating Indigenous knowledge, culture, language, and implementing policies that safeguard and empower these elements, thereby advancing the rights and agency of marginalized communities.

Nonetheless, it is crucial to acknowledge the inherent constraints within the paradigms of previous scholars, influencing the governance, communication, and education of marginalized communities, particularly Indigenous minorities and the economically disadvantaged. In the realm
of Decolonial scholarship, the endeavor to foster inquiry, research, and capacity-building for catalyzing social transformation among self-determining communities calls for an approach rooted in pluri-versality, transcending the confines of a constrained zero-point universalism.

Moreover, there exists a paucity of literature delving into the nuanced avenues of democratic citizenship engagement for minority and Indigenous populations. This scarcity extends to the application of counter-hegemonic media literacy strategies, practices, and techniques aimed at bolstering political self-determination within civic education. Furthermore, a dearth of scholarly work specifically pinpoints and assesses critical consciousness in relation to neoliberal/conservative cultural propaganda campaigns. These campaigns, regrettably, serve to disempower the audience and electorate, impeding the realization of a democratic and progressive transformation within the public sphere and civic participation.

The imperative for unexplored research is deeply rooted in the prevailing nationalist political landscape, exemplified by the ascent of a white supremacist figure with a background in reality TV to the Presidency of the United States. This administration has implemented conservative policies that stand in opposition to progressive propositions in areas such as affirmative action, immigration, education, and civil rights, underscoring the pressing need for comprehensive investigation.

This proposed study delineates the methodologies for active engagement in various channels of democratic citizenship tailored to empower Indigenous/Minority communities through the application of counter-hegemonic media literacy strategies, culturally-grounded media
regulation policies, and techniques. This is especially pertinent in the context of unfolding political events in 2019 and 2020, spanning national, international, regional, state, and local arenas. Significantly, the study takes place during the U.S. Congress' impeachment inquiry into President Donald Trump, and pivotal developments surrounding social media policies related to misinformation and propaganda, COVID-19, as well as the 2020 Census, among other crucial subjects.

The adage "all politics are local" resonates deeply. Hence, this study situates the exploration of citizenship education for democratic empowerment and the examination of effective practices among cultural groups and individuals within distinct settings. These settings encompass the U.S.-Mexico border, the U.S. Pacific Island of Guam, as well as both dominant and marginalized communities in Central Texas. Further depth is added by focusing on municipal issues that underpin policy-making at local and state levels, subsequently influencing political strategies for the 2020 election cycle, including the Presidential election.

For example, when a presidential candidate visits a city and addresses a policy position or offers a solution to a complex local issue with broader state and national implications, their influence on resolving these policy matters can significantly impact the candidate's support at the local level. This form of civic engagement becomes an integral part of the advocacy phase of policy-making. Civic education becomes an integral component of a student's life experience, where various communicative events shape their learning journey. These themes are embedded in local pedagogy to foster comprehensive content mastery across disciplines (English, math, Social Studies, Science) essential for formal standardized testing. Moreover, students are encouraged to
connect real local civic issues with the development of civic engagement skills and media culture practices within a democratic framework. This pedagogical approach holds immense potential and informs the core of this research inquiry.

Initially, the researcher formulates a broad inquiry incorporating two sub-queries, the responses to which will serve as the foundation for discerning best practices within a particular community. Expanding on this framework, the subsequent inquiries delve into depictions of public memory in connection to Indigenous wisdom and policy advocacy. This line of inquiry is designed to elucidate how the most effective civic and media practices within diverse cultural groups contribute to the development of civic education curriculum and pedagogy. Finally, the ultimate question propels an exploration into the methodologies and origins within the context of indigeneity, ethics, and the realm of teaching and learning.

Subsequently, these inquiries are operationalized and the explication of data is enriched through a triangulation of methodologies drawn from three distinct domains: communications (with a focus on positive deviance and public memory), public administration (encompassing educational research, public policy, and social network analysis with an emphasis on power dynamics within dominant and marginalized groups), and Indigenous Decolonizing methodology, underpinned by the Native Chamorro epistemology known as the Inaf'a'maolek Mediation Framework (IMF). In concert, these blended methodologies give rise to a decolonizing approach that propels a theory of civic and media literacy rooted in decolonization, thereby shaping the contours of pedagogy and curriculum development across secondary, adult, and community education.
A substantial body of literature exists on topics encompassing media literacy, critical media literacy, decolonization, indigenous studies, public administration, policy, and civic education. However, there remains a critical gap in research that addresses the identification and amplification of critical consciousness regarding neoliberal/conservative cultural propaganda campaigns. These campaigns often marginalize audiences and voters, impeding the realization of democratic and progressive transformations within the public sphere and limiting civic participation. Furthermore, this research gap highlights the need to align national and state assessments, curriculum, and pedagogy with the aim of countering dominant policy agendas at various inter-institutional levels (including federal, state board of education, local ISD, school, and classroom). This gap in research also provides an opportunity to investigate how engagement in diverse channels of democratic citizenship, alongside the application of counter-hegemonic media literacy strategies, practices, and techniques, can empower political self-determination for minority and Indigenous populations. Consequently, the research gap addressed in this dissertation pertains to the critical mass of the public who, by choosing to remain uninformed and critically disengaged consumers of culture, may be susceptible to manipulation and may lack the skills to discern between fact and fiction.

Maintaining Indigenous Methodological Center

The conceptions of the marginalized/dominant dialectic that underlie this study and inquiry are encapsulated in a decolonizing methodology. Anyon (2005) and Tuhiwai-Smith (2012) provide the foundation for the arguments substantiating the necessity of this study. They posit that Indigenous researchers must decolonize methodologies for Indigenous peoples, a process that
involves forming alliances with dominant cultural groups. This premise calls for educational researchers to actively engage with powerful dominant cultural groups, seeking to comprehend their thought processes, interactions, and decision-making mechanisms. Consequently, the development of civic engagement strategies informed by these approaches can either disrupt or support agenda building.

Until a decolonizing media literacy framework is established to describe and explore these power dynamics within a civic and media engagement context, particularly concerning the municipal policy-making process, research related to civic/media education and Indigenous communities will remain stagnant. As part of the triangulation of mixed methodologies in this study, a Positive Deviance (PD) approach will be introduced. In this method, the researcher takes a back seat to participants, allowing them to uncover how minority individuals within a dominant cultural setting successfully navigates the challenges of participating in the municipal public policy-making process through media. Thus, by learning from those who effectively engage with them communities, researchers can then teach marginalized communities how to do the same. This dynamic contributes significantly to the discourse about democracy and social change.

Civic Media Education Gap

Mihailidis and Gerodimos (2016) delve into the utilization of new media by various groups to engage in the public sphere, with a specific focus on the potential of digital media in amplifying "civic voice". Their study underscores the necessity for innovative approaches that involve the acquisition of new digital skills to drive traditional democratic participation, such as voting, tax
payment, volunteering, and engagement in community meetings. The realm of pedagogy dedicated to this purpose represents a fertile area of inquiry for this dissertation.

Nurturing civic voice as an integral component of civic education encompasses "the dispositions and modalities of expression that young people use to participate in daily life". This involves applications both within and beyond the classroom, emphasizing a culture of active involvement in relation to the role of media in civic affairs (Mihailidis & Gerodimos, 2016, p. 374). Literacies play diverse roles in civic learning, rooted in the transformative potential of media education, while also acknowledging its constraints. Despite being labeled as digital natives, research indicates that proficiency with technology is not universal. The foundation of this study is built upon Paulo Freire's concept of conscientização, which centers on critical consciousness (Mihailidis & Gerodimos, 2016).

**Municipal Gap in Civic Education**

This portrayal of the dynamic between media and politics aligns with President Trump's characterization of it as "fake news" in his critique of mainstream media. This highlights a shift where institutions once regarded as arbiters of "truth" are now subject to scrutiny, particularly from conservative policy advocates. Additionally, Nieme and Junn (1998) posit an important consideration, emphasizing the need to integrate curriculum addressing local government within civic and media education. This pedagogical implication centers on utilizing media resources to enhance classroom instruction on government, specifically within the context of the criminal and civil justice system, as supported by national assessments of civic education. In contrast, data from state and local government sources indicates that nearly three-quarters of high school seniors
possess awareness regarding the administration of public schools by local governments; considering the existence of state curricular guidelines, graduation requirements, state-operated universities, and the like, this percentage appears quite substantial (p.31). However, fewer than two-thirds were proficient in "recognizing a description of the process (how a bill becomes law) used in most states" (p.33). This highlights a trend where students tend to acquire factual knowledge rather than grasp conceptual frameworks. When it comes to understanding Parties & Lobbying, it appears that students exhibit even less proficiency. Survey questions regarding organizations like the National Rifle Association (NRA) and Political Action Committees (PACs) indicate a limited understanding of who lobbyists are and their roles. In fact, nearly half of the respondents were unable to identify the Supreme Court as the branch of government least influenced by lobbying (p.34).

Two key findings highlight a gap in the field of civic education. Firstly, civics classes tend to touch only lightly on contemporary events, problems, or controversies. Secondly, students appear to retain knowledge of civic information that was either already familiar to them from other contexts (such as the media) or directly meaningful to them. While this may seem self-evident, this fundamental observation also provides insights into potential improvements in civic education. Specifically, it suggests that students might develop a better understanding of government at all levels if greater emphasis were placed on local politics, in line with the adage that "all politics are local" (p.51). Nieme and Junn (1998) contend that students would likely acquire civic knowledge more effectively if instruction initially focused more heavily on aspects of government that they can directly observe and immediately comprehend, particularly within the realm of local government and its operations.
Recent results from the NAEP Civics Assessment corroborate the same sentiment, as findings since 1969 (Easton and Dennis) have indicated that "young children had almost no sense of local government." A pedagogical approach rooted in a low power distance can enhance comprehension of the purpose of public administration, its structures and functions, as well as the exercise of power. However, a notable gap persists in the development and provision of curriculum resources.

There are clearly difficulties in redirecting a civics curriculum away from a national level. Emphasis and toward a stress on local matters. Textbooks about local governments are rare, and given the diversity of local structures, it is hard to imagine how a textbook could be written to cover all their areas. Nevertheless, teaching civics through the study of local government makes American politics and democracy more tangible to students. Instead of seeing government as distant and defined by a collection of unmemorable rules, with a focus on community democracy, students may learn why governments exist and how they operate, (p.154).

The broader context of local government serves as a scaffold for learning, even if the curriculum content centers on the chief executive. In a municipal context, this would encompass city councilors, the mayor, and the city manager; in a county context, it would involve the commissioners and judge, along with regional entities. The NAEP results affirm that students tend to grasp concepts related to local government more readily than those pertaining to the federal government (Nieme & Junn, 1998, p.153).

Understanding why it can be so difficult to pave one street or zone one piece of land, and examining all the individuals and interests affected, for example, can make it easier for students to understand how politics works at all levels and why there is a need for executive, legislative, and judicial components in local democracy may require studying local maps, reading municipal laws, and examining town budgets; this would encourage interpretive and inferential skills in which the NAEP assessment showed students lacking (p.153-154). The approach entails acquiring a foundational understanding of government and then applying it to national levels. At this juncture, the focus shifts back to the federal and international arenas, offering a substantial recommendation for reform in civic education.
Media Literacy Gap

Kellner and Share emphasize in "Critical Media Literacy, Democracy, and the Reconstruction of Education" (Macedo & Steinberg, 2007) the importance for community leaders to adopt media literacy initiatives. They argue that, given the proliferation of technology, it is imperative to develop and allocate resources for pedagogy and programs in this domain. Given that "communication and society" permeate all facets of modern curriculum, integrating media literacy into all content areas is highly advisable (Macedo & Steinberg, 2007).

In her study on civic education in schools in the digital age, Hobbs (as cited in Gordon & Mihailidis, 2016) underscores the diverse impacts of capitalism, consumerism, and communication in student agency. She argues that there are significant gaps and oversights that challenge educators to advance authentic civic education in this digital era (Hobbs, as cited in Gordon & Mihailidis, 2016, p. 356). Research indicates that higher levels of civic engagement can be achieved when teachers employ innovative methods to link media and civic participation. While there are some media literacy programs supported by technology firms and formal curricula developed by the Center for Civic Education, these remain exceptions rather than the norm. This underscores the importance of a decolonizing media literacy pedagogy.

Despite the National Council for the Social Studies (NCSS) embracing progressive concepts like experiential education, media literacy, and project-based learning, the integration of such practices into civic education curricula in most schools is progressing slowly (Hobbs, as cited in Gordon & Mihailidis, 2016). As mentioned earlier and reiterated by Hobbs, the results from the National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) underscore this need.
As measured by these tests, American students fail to demonstrate good understanding of civics. In 2010, test scores showed that only 25 percent of American fourth, eighth, and twelfth grade students were proficient in civics. Fifty percent of Grade 8 students could not correctly interpret a question that required the interpretation of a political cartoon. The NAEP tests also showed substantial disparities in civic knowledge between white students and minority students. Educators may attempt to shovel content knowledge into the minds of learners through lectures and textbook reading, but it does not seem to be effective. Many students graduate without a firm conceptual understanding of the legal, regulatory, and civic dimensions of being a citizen in a democracy. (p.358)

The research gap is most evident in the specific context of Indigenous/Minority groups and individuals, as well as their practices of democratic citizenship engagement, particularly in countering dominant cultural misinformation campaigns.

The existing body of relevant dissertations sheds light on the methodology for media literacy-based studies. Mihailidis (2008) highlights that the current media literacy curriculum and academic research, with a primary emphasis on critical analysis skill development, might be limiting the effectiveness of cultivating civic engagement in post-secondary higher education students. The author contends that there is a need for more robust programs rooted in defined learning outcomes. Mihailidis identifies two core aspects of media literacy education: 1. critical analysis, and 2. education. However, it is worth noting that Mihailidis' focus lies on the critical development of student learning, as opposed to the civic and media education gap which is the central exploration of this dissertation. This study underscores the necessity to bridge this gap in higher education, substantiating media literacy as a substantive content area and a distinct discipline. In Chapter One, Mihailidis initially poses three key questions: What constitutes a media literacy course? Where does the integration of media literacy courses fit within the curriculum? Should media literacy be incorporated or remain a standalone subject? However, in Chapter 3, the research narrows down to two core inquiries: How does media literacy impact the media comprehension, evaluation, and analytical skills of undergraduate university students? How does
media literacy education shape university students' perception of the roles and responsibilities of media in a democratic society?

Mihailidis (2008) contends that several key principles contribute to the development of a theoretical framework for media literacy education, challenging current practices in higher education. These include the need for a shift towards student learning outcomes-centered media literacy education, recognizing media literacy as a distinct field of study, and establishing a consensus among practitioners regarding its definition. Mihailidis also puts forth additional theses delving into the role of media literacy in education and proposes avenues for advancement with clear objectives.

Regarding curricular applications, the prevalence of media literacy as a subject matter can be seen as both a part of the issue and a support for media literacy as a pedagogical tool rather than an epistemological foundation. In the context of civic media pedagogy, it is imperative to draw connections between civics and the value of media literacy, representing an essential component of teaching and learning about media literacy. Consequently, these foundational aspects of media literacy hold significant civic implications, aligning pedagogy with the socio-historical context of students and communities, informed by media practices.

In the context of this dissertation, Mihailidis' (2008) media literacy education framework introduces "engaged citizenship" as a crucial element in cultivating effective media literacy skills for post-secondary students' educational outcomes. Mihailidis employs a mixed-methods approach, incorporating a quasi-experimental design with nonequivalent groups and focus groups for data collection in his dissertation proposal. The quantitative segment evaluates the impact of a
media literacy curriculum on students' media comprehension, analysis, and evaluation skills within the experimental and control groups. The media literacy skills assessment encompasses engagement with television, radio, and print media through a two-part survey questionnaire, including both multiple-choice and open-ended questions. The latter segment seeks to ascertain the perceived value of comprehension, analysis, and evaluation. The data analysis strategy encompasses three stages: 1. assigning numerical values to pre-test survey responses; 2. establishing a coding protocol for the survey responses; and 3. recording and transcribing the focus group sessions. Specific coding procedures for open-ended questions are designed to assess comprehension, evaluation, and analysis. The author grounds the research question, media literacy assessment, protocols, and questionnaire design in the prior work of esteemed scholars in the field of media literacy. The plan also outlines the operationalization of key theoretical constructs.

Expanding on the examination of the media literacy gap, Aldana (2014) approaches it through a lens of critical consciousness and civic engagement. This study delves into the socio-political development of adolescents within the framework of multicultural education, with a particular emphasis on empowering school culture. The initial segment of the study identifies the gap in terms of the socio-political development of youth who are both living and learning in an ethnically and racially integrated school setting. The latter portion of Aldana's dissertation centers on Intergroup Dialogue (IGD), specifically in relation to equity pedagogy in secondary education. The research questions probe into the interplay between critical consciousness and civic engagement within the school environment, the role of equity pedagogy in fostering socio-political learning, and the critical elements in cultivating dialogic pedagogy within schools.
**Teacher Education Programs + Training**

The contributions of Schilder and Redmond are significant in shedding light on the student's interaction with mediation within the context of the new media landscape. Schilder and Redmond (2019) find:

a well-cited study by Wineburg, McGrew, Breakstone, and Ortega (2016) shocked audiences with the conclusion that school-aged students were unable to differentiate between false and legitimate information. They cautioned: "Whether [the Internet] will make us smarter and better informed or more ignorant and narrow-minded will depend on our awareness of this problem and our education response to it (Wineburg, et al., 2016, p.5), (In Schilder and Redmond, 2019, p.95-96).

The current scenario prompts educational researchers to assess the outcomes of media literacy through the application of inquiry-based methodologies, thereby promoting the development of critical consciousness. As posited, "examining students' abilities to ask their own questions may offer fresh insights into the potential of media literacy practice to improve students' critical thinking" (p. 96). Incorporating this approach both before and after media learning episodes during data collection and analysis proves valuable in evaluating the concepts that emerge from participant inquiries. This endeavor serves to address the research gap, allowing for an examination of the critical mass of the public that chooses to remain uninformed, functioning as critically disengaged consumers of culture, susceptible to manipulation, and lacking the skills to discern between fact and fiction.

**Indigenous Education Research-Knowledge Gap**

The imperative for this study aligns with the Indigenous research paradigm, which establishes the decolonizing framework underpinning the mixed-methodology of this dissertation. This framework advances theoretical paradigms drawn from the disciplines of communications, public administration, and sociocultural educational foundations. As Creswell and Plano Clark
(2018) assert, research approaches that integrate mixed methods are underrepresented in scholarship, despite their potential to enhance the research process holistically, spanning from conceptualization to implementation. This entails a commitment to thorough analysis from diverse perspectives, prioritizing the need for comprehensive investigation and substantiation. Furthermore, viewed through an Indigenous lens, these hybrid Indigenous epistemological qualifications foster the development of an Indigenous researcher adept in utilizing multiple methodologies, employing both Native and Western approaches to analysis and data collection (Smith, 2012, p. 144).

Indigenous methodologies are often a mix of existing methodological approaches and indigenous practices. The mix reflects the training of indigenous researchers, which continues to be within the academy, and the parameters and common sense understandings of research which govern how indigenous communities and researchers define their activities. Hence, an evident knowledge gap emerges, encompassing an Indigenous research agenda rooted in the decolonizing potential of this study to address deficiencies in media literacy education, teacher training programs, and civic media education, particularly within the context of marginalized communities. In simpler terms, our aim is to comprehend how various cultures engage in civic participation within the policy-making process, leveraging media for social transformation. This involves examining those who possess this knowledge to benefit those contending with such challenges in the era of hyper-mediation, ultimately promoting democratic ideals.

1-D. Purpose of Study

Considering this significant gap, the primary objective of this study is to generate knowledge that fortifies the central aim of this dissertation: the development of research, curriculum, and pedagogy geared towards enhancing community and individual capacity for self-determination. This endeavor is driven by Indigenous perspectives and research, specifically
addressing the dearth of community education concerning the pivotal role of self-determination in democratic citizenship within the contemporary landscape of new media ecosystems. This context amplifies the importance of mediation frameworks for civic participants' critical consciousness—specifically, understanding how to discern values and facts in an era saturated with misinformation, disinformation, education, and propaganda within media and civic systems. This discourse pertains to the field of education administration and research, focusing on the formulation of curriculum and pedagogy that empowers the teaching and acquisition of civic media literacy skills across various disciplines, ultimately fostering community-driven transformative action rooted in critical consciousness.

Furthermore, this research endeavor encompasses various facets that bolster the overarching vision outlined above. It endeavors to scrutinize the content of media literacy and civic education curricula, aligning them with contemporary standards for both student and teacher proficiency. These endeavors are poised to yield individual, social, institutional, and organizational impact by fostering the cultivation of critical consciousness in the interpretation of media education and propaganda campaigns disseminated by external entities aiming to sway one's actions. The introduction of new content standards incorporates evaluative metrics designed to comprehend intricate phenomena, engender novel insights, inform constituencies, and retrospectively assess the outcomes of civic media efficacy.

Considering the transformative essence inherent in studies dedicated to the pursuit of social justice, one of the primary objectives of this purpose is to propel an Indigenous mixed-methods research inquiry structured on the framework of concurrent transformational
triangulation. This approach places emphasis on the integration of Indigenous, qualitative, and quantitative data collection, followed by meticulous analysis and interpretation of the findings.

Drawing on the literature review and leveraging a mixed-methods approach, this study establishes a logical framework that intertwines the problem, need, purpose, research questions, and methodology. This framework is underpinned by a vision of Native identity rooted in the principles of a decolonizing media literacy paradigm, which aims to foster civic engagement through the lens of Oceania's navigation methods—a process akin to triangulation. This approach acts as a modern-day wayfinder within technology-dominated environments. The inception of this framework considers institutional structures and their diverse political ideologies across cultural groups. It specifically examines how communities, both minority and white, of varying racial and socioeconomic backgrounds participate in shaping public opinion and engaging in propaganda efforts, particularly considering the advancements in social media and the proliferation of misinformation campaigns on a global scale.

The thematic thread linking the problem, need, purpose, literature review, and methodology is woven through the interdisciplinary realms of communication, public administration, and the sociocultural foundations of Indigenous education. In the domain of communication, specialized subfields delve into areas such as media studies, media culture, intercultural communications, public memory, and the problem-solving methodology of Positive Deviance (PD) through an observational-participatory lens. Additionally, public memory places emphasis on the processes of remembrance and forgetting within cultural groups, assigning significance to various events.
Within the problem formulation phase, communication plays a pivotal role in assessing the value of self-determination as both practiced and exemplified within civic education. The nexus between civic education trends, both contemporary and historical, sheds light on national patterns and socio-demographic factors pertaining to Pacific Islanders and U.S. un-incorporated students, with a focal point on the civic performance of Hispanic minority populations in standardized assessments. Moreover, the examination extends to scrutinizing the content of current civic and social studies curriculum standards, with a specific emphasis on municipal and policy processes, which are currently underrepresented.

This study also delves into the interplay between civic education and voter turnout, elucidating how students, in their journey towards democratization, learn to either engage or disengage with the educational system. Thus, the research endeavors to unearth and showcase existing correlations hypothesized to inherently exist among variables encompassing civic education, public engagement, and media utilization practices. Employing Positive Deviance, the study endeavors to locate Indigenous knowledge and practices within communities where the majority have yet to rectify the situation.

The identified problem creates a significant void in academic discourse, compelling the researcher to forge connections across the spectrum of media, spanning from traditional forms to the dynamic realms of new social media and data-driven technologies within the expansive online pluriverse. Recognizing the imperative nature of avant-garde cyber-cultural methods, it becomes evident that teacher education programs must incorporate these to facilitate the delivery of a decolonized civic and media education literacy. In this educational paradigm, both educators and
learners are equipped with the essential skills to construct cultural frameworks, enabling the interpretation of digital experiences within the context of online civic engagement that ultimately manifests in tangible, real-world impacts. Proficiency in comprehending the intricacies of technology, content, and the actors orchestrating mass media messages remains a cornerstone principle for discerning the global landscape, particularly for marginalized communities endeavoring to navigate the prevailing cultural paradigms governing public engagement structures, systems, and processes, ultimately empowering self-determination.

Yet, the journey commences with a comprehensive grasp of municipal governance, an area of significant import and a ripe field of research within academic literature that can markedly contribute to calls for the expansion of civic education. It is paramount to acknowledge that these municipal systems operate with distinctive characteristics in Guam in contrast to local institutions along the U.S.-Mexico border in Mexico, New Mexico, and Texas. Public administration, in a general context, defines these systems as institutions entrusted with the societal function of managing diverse facets of community affairs, including but not limited to economic matters, public safety, transportation, and land planning.

Within any given system, an intricate policy process framework assumes various forms in the context of municipal, county, state, regional, and national community development. Probing into the influencers of these processes within the realm of elections and government structures provides a snapshot of cultural groups and their communication patterns, shedding light on the functionalities of public administration. This, in turn, informs our understanding of social change,
constituting a focal point of study. In the Grounded Theory context of methodology, the emergence of best practices assumes paramount significance.

The research endeavors to unearth effective modes of engagement, learning from those adept at the process. Subsequently, these practices are disseminated to communities lacking self-determination and agency, empowering them to actively participate in civic engagement through media channels. Simultaneously, adopting a classical Positive Deviance approach, the study delves into Indigenous groups that have demonstrated effectiveness in civic and media engagement, aiming to disseminate these practices to scale civic participation.

It is essential to emphasize that this understanding is situated within a socio-historical context specific to the Indigenous space; there is no one-size-fits-all approach. Rather, it necessitates the elucidation of native frameworks and approaches. Specialized attention is accorded to the delivery of pedagogy, ensuring that content is anchored in local wisdom and knowledge systems, placing a premium on narrative and identity. The aim is to identify and dismantle constructs of colonization, propelling a transformative trajectory towards decolonized futures across the spectrum of educational formats, spanning from K-12 to higher education and community education. This pedagogical framework, which the researcher endeavors to develop, is christened as Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML).

Employing Positive Deviance (PD) as a methodological framework to delineate and characterize an array of culturally distinct groups enables active participation and leadership among indigenous community members in identifying and resolving issues, ultimately enhancing
civic engagement within minority enclaves along the U.S.-Mexico border and the Pacific Island of Guam. This approach, rooted in cross-cultural international comparative education, serves to bridge the experiential gap between Hispanic-oriented communities in the Western U.S. and those in the Western region of Texas, facilitating a reexamination of the historical trajectories and roots of colonization, particularly considering the 16th-century imperial Spanish doctrine.

The underpinning of this endeavor is founded on these tenets, which in turn guide the development of a comprehensive civic and media literacy curriculum tailored for formerly colonized regions and their inhabitants. This curriculum aims to catalyze social transformation through democratic educational practices across various dimensions of citizenship.

The proposed pedagogical framework, termed Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML), advocates for a media education approach that is both directed towards and led by Indigenous, minority, and non-dominant groups, challenging established paradigms in media education that extend beyond conventional critical and colonial media literacy. This endeavor encompasses the cultivation of community empowerment and the exploration of intrinsic media education, ultimately culminating in the delineation of civic participatory practices, serving as a foundation for future research and program implementation.

Furthermore, an ancillary objective of this study is to scrutinize the interplay between media, (non)indigenous knowledge, and the construction of democratic ideals and civic identity among culturally diverse groups. It also entails the examination of elitist policy-making processes and communication methodologies within municipal domains, thereby contributing to
the refinement of civic education content and pedagogical approaches tailored specifically for Indigenous and minority education.

Moreover, this dissertation endeavors to cultivate an Indigenous research methodology, drawing inspiration from Guam's Chamorro concept of inafa'maolek, thereby providing a unique lens for knowledge generation within the purview of Indigenous education research. The construction of such a methodology entails a triangulation of diverse research approaches, encompassing Educational Research for Social Justice, Positive Deviance (PD) applied within the framework of Participatory Action Research (PAR), and Indigenous/Decolonizing methodologies. These combined methodologies serve as the underpinning for the comprehensive investigation carried out in this study.

This inquiry delves into the effective strategies for optimizing individual, group, and community engagement in the democratic process, particularly for Indigenous and minority populations in the U.S.-Pacific and Mexico region. It does so by leveraging the principles of media literacy and drawing upon Indigenous epistemologies to establish mediation frameworks. Additionally, this research endeavors to align national and state assessments, curriculum, and pedagogy with the cultural values of both minority and majority populations, countering the prevailing policy agenda across various institutional levels (federal/state boards of education/local ISD/school/classroom). The researcher's aim is to gain a nuanced understanding and provide a comprehensive description of the role of media in shaping perceptions of democracy and civic identity within diverse cultural groups. Furthermore, this study aims to identify the communication practices of policy and political leadership within municipal public
policy-making processes, thereby informing the content and pedagogical approaches in civic education.

The examination of socio-historical context is paramount, particularly for minority and Indigenous communities in the U.S., who, after enduring decades of struggle for political self-determination and civil rights, have come to believe in the universality of democracy. However, beneath this widespread belief lies a disconcerting reality: policy and political elites collaborate to orchestrate propaganda campaigns, utilizing the media as tools for societal control. It is imperative to investigate the development of media literacy as a means to educate about the production and critical aspects of societal discourse in the media. This inquiry arises from the prevalent perception that public institutions engage in collaborative efforts to suppress minority voters through various channels and mechanisms within the policy-making process (e.g., urban education, voter identification laws, gerrymandering, wage depression, parliamentary procedure, and so forth). As we move forward, comprehending the escalating use of media and new media in tandem with technological advancements, juxtaposed with the stagnant state of civic education and public participation, becomes of paramount importance. Effectively bridging this gap stands as a significant anticipated outcome.

This approach is geared towards addressing the fissures in the study by delving into culturally grounded media regulation policies, forged collaboratively by Indigenous and non-Indigenous communities, drawing from Indigenous knowledge. In the contemporary landscape, with the widespread proliferation of media, there exists a notable dearth of public policy initiatives aimed at regulating a multitude of pressing issues: foreign interference in elections,
data breaches, dissemination of fake news, propagation of misinformation, identity theft, cyberbullying, and ensuring net neutrality, among others. Regrettably, there seems to be a palpable deficit of political resolve at various governmental levels—be it national, regional, state, or local—to proactively devise viable solutions in this domain. In the absence of robust political leadership either to safeguard the interests of the public or to incentivize the media industry towards more empowering public-oriented approaches to these challenges, this dissertation contends for the regulation of the media through the lens of decolonizing media literacy pedagogy. Such an approach champions critical consciousness, both within and beyond the confines of the classroom.

This purpose elucidates a crucial intersection within academic discourse, one that converges on the realms of technology, media, political economy, social media, and public policy. It also delves into the intricate dynamics of how diverse groups commemorate or perhaps overlook cultural ethics in the sphere of civic engagement and media utilization. At the heart of this amalgamation lies the centrality of Indigenous communities and their inherent value systems, which serve as lenses for interpreting and comprehending events, ultimately culminating in an impetus towards self-determination. It is imperative to underscore that this perspective does not pass judgment on what is right or wrong. Embracing this nuance is vital, as it allows for a departure from a binary outlook, which often confines the discourse to a polarized interpretation, limited by partisan truths and prescribed talking points. In the contemporary era, characterized by an inundation of misinformation within explicit media landscapes, the ability of audiences to navigate and derive meaning from contradictory statements emerges as a pivotal
skill set. This proficiency, among others, serves as a linchpin for the exploration, comprehension, and conceptualization of curriculum and pedagogy geared towards nurturing such capacities.

The examination of civic education within municipal governance seeks to align with this overarching purpose, employing a triangulation of qualitative and quantitative methodologies. This distinctive approach entails a fusion of Indigenous and conventional methodologies within the realm of social sciences, thereby enabling comprehensive data collection, research design, implementation, and subsequent analysis of findings, within a comparative cross-cultural framework. The contextual foundation of this dissertation is rooted in the comparative analysis of two regions: the U.S. Western Pacific Island of Guam and the U.S.-Texas/Borderlands. These areas share a common influence of Hispanicization, which reciprocally impacts both communities. Additionally, the first research question underscores the imperative to comprehend public policy as a subject of study. Within the municipal sphere, a convergence of institutions, cultural groups, and agendas coalesce, exerting influence and shaping civic practices. Here, citizenship education takes root, offering a democratic lens through which to perceive the form of governance that directly impacts community and individual lives—a facet that remains relatively unexplored within civic education, thus ripe for investigation.

The second question builds upon the anticipated findings, anticipating the emergence of instances of public memory that not only reflect an intercultural approach to policy influences but also illuminate facets of Indigenous knowledge. This line of inquiry further advances the discourse on mediation.
Finally, grounded in this understanding of Native origins, a system of values appears to accompany these meanings. When applied to the realms of teaching and learning, a pedagogy encompassing media literacy and civic education materializes, thus advocating for a holistic approach to community education.

1-D.2. **Significance of Study**

The research objectives of this dissertation aim to investigate the most effective practices employed by advocates for public policy initiatives and community programs, specifically tailored to benefit Indigenous and Minority communities. This endeavor will subsequently inform the development of teacher education curricula, as well as civic and media education standards, both at the school district and state levels. The aspiration of this dissertation is to enhance the capabilities of civic leaders—ranging from elected officials and business leaders to non-profit management and administrators—in contemplating the most effective means of providing public education. By "public education," we refer not only to K-12 institutions, but also encompass community education, community colleges, and universities.

Ultimately, the aim is to influence civic leadership to spearhead social change propelled by communication strategies firmly rooted in community-centric approaches, both at local and global community levels, as opposed to the current top-down methodologies in place. This vision of civic participation recognizes the intrinsic value of genuine public input, in contrast to superficial engagements, particularly within the evolving landscape of new media and civic environments that characterize our present era.
The aim of this dissertation is to comprehend how civic participation can be enhanced within historically marginalized, disenfranchised, and voiceless communities, particularly in the context of prevailing cultural, social, and political norms in the United States. These norms hold sway over the processes of public policy formulation at various levels—ranging from municipal and state to national, regional, and even international spheres. At the core of this endeavor lies the concept of self-determination, which is approached as a collective undertaking involving individuals, groups, and communities.

This review, in relation to the dissertation, strives to articulate, comprehend, and construct an interpretative framework for a decolonial pedagogy in civic education. This is achieved by leveraging media education designed for, created by, and rooted in Indigenous/non-mainstream/non-dominant groups, individuals, and community practices. Such an approach is envisioned to empower democratic participation (Lichtman, 2013, p. 174). For example, there exists a fundamental imperative for the public to cultivate critical thinking and epistemic disobedience when confronted with the deluge of information for decision-making. This is because democracy is inherently imbalanced (Mignolo, 2018). Some posit that it has been this way from the inception, while others contend that the practices we observe in figures like President and Candidate Trump have always been present. The notable difference today is the unprecedented proliferation of media. Phenomena like shadow governments, covert channels, and irregular diplomacy are akin to the concealed curriculum within education. The significance of unveiling these practices of civic engagement and media utilization in shaping public perception cannot be overstated in the realm of teaching and learning about democratic citizenship education.
This study is fundamentally oriented towards serving the interests of Indigenous and Minority communities residing in the U.S.-Texas/Borderlands and the U.S.-Western Pacific Territory of Guam. Understanding the unique cultural fabric and identities of these regions is imperative in comprehending the subordinate status of these communities in relation to U.S. Federal policies and their impact on local families. El Paso, located in the westernmost part of Texas, shares its border with Ciudad Juarez in the Mexican state of Chihuahua and with New Mexico. With a population exceeding 600,000 residents, of which over 80% identify as Hispanic, the city operates on an annual budget approaching $1 billion. Notably, while El Paso is often hailed as one of the safest municipalities in the nation, it grapples with the challenge of being one of the poorest home-rule municipalities. This economic disparity poses a consistent concern for local leaders in both economic and educational spheres. The municipal governance structure in place is known as the Council-Manager system, which governs the City of El Paso. Additionally, the discourse surrounding life on the border is replete with euphemisms, particularly in reference to the experiences of those living in Juarez.

In relation to the U.S.-Mexico border, Guam is situated over 7,000 miles away. Despite this geographical distance, it stands as the westernmost U.S. territory in the Asia-Pacific hemisphere. With a population of approximately 200,000 residents, nearly half of whom identify as Indigenous Chamorro, and a government budget nearing $1 billion, Guam operates as an Unincorporated Territory. This unique status entails a distinctive governmental structure, functioning as an insular area under the purview of the U.S. Congress, with federal administration responsibilities overseen by the U.S. Department of Interior/Office of Insular Affairs (Aguon, R., 2005).
The historical backdrop of this study is deeply influenced by Guam's well-documented colonial history, shedding light on the pivotal roles of education and media in the process of assimilating Indigenous and Minority populations into U.S.-Western culture (Underwood, 1987). As is common in communities of similar scale, Guam's society is governed by a complex interplay of federal, state, regional, county, city, and neighborhood-level structures. These encompass a diverse array of institutions endowed with authority and defined rules governing interactions among them. The media, encompassing both traditional and new forms, constitutes a significant social phenomenon subject to a multitude of social practices enacted by various actors within the process. This paradigm prevailed until the advent of recent developments in new media applications for civic engagement.

**Definitions of Terms**

*Social Studies, Civic Education, and Citizenship Education*

According to Vontz (*Perspectives on Civic Education* 1898-1916; 1997), in analysis of the historical visions for civic education provided by the National Education Association's Committee on Social Studies,

The social studies are understood to be those whose subject matter relates directly to the organization and development of human society, and to man as a member of social groups. ...More specifically, the social studies of the American high school should have as their conscious purpose the cultivation of good citizenship.

Social studies is the integrated study of the social sciences and humanities to promote civic competence.... The primary purpose of the social studies is to help young people develop the ability to make informed and reasoned decisions for the public good as citizens of a culturally diverse democratic society. (p.2)

From an international context of citizenship education, UNESCO asserts,
Citizenship education can be defined as educating children, from early childhood, to become clear-thinking and enlightened citizens who participate in decisions concerning society. (http://www.unesco.org/education/tlsf/mods/theme_b/interact/mod07task03/appendix.htm)

In the multicultural context, Noncitizens and Citizens-citizenship education is founded on the notion of human rights and national citizenship. According to Kymlicka (2017, In Banks, 2017; pp. 368),

argues compellingly that citizenship theorists should distinguish civic education for citizens and noncitizens because they should have overlapping but distinct aims. The focus of civic education for noncitizens should be on expanding their human rights. Civic education for citizens should include human rights but emphasize helping individuals from diverse groups learn how to become fully participating citizens in the polity while retaining important aspects of their home and community cultures.

This perspective also conflates national citizenship and globalization as problematic due to waning dispositions of population for respective patriotism.

Similarly, in historical context for the municipal purposes of this dissertation, Fitzpatrick (1916, In McDonald, 2010) proposes,

Without attempting any specific definition, I shall understand civic education as that which helps to make a man a useful citizen. From the basic meaning of the term, it relates itself to the city, and particularly from our standpoint to the city government. (p.278)

In contrast to generic or broad definitions, the Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (2007/2018) claims,

In its broadest definition, “civic education” means all the processes that affect people’s beliefs, commitments, capabilities, and actions as members or prospective members of communities. Civic education need not be intentional or deliberate; institutions and communities transmit values and norms without meaning to. It may not be beneficial: sometimes people are civically educated in ways that disempower them or impart harmful values and goals. It is certainly not limited to schooling and the education of children and youth. Families, governments, religions, and mass media are just some of the institutions involved in civic education, understood as a lifelong process. (https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/civic-education/)

**Critical Pedagogy**

This dissertation accepts a definition of critical pedagogy, according to McLaren (2006),
Critical pedagogy attempts to provide teachers and researchers with a better means of understanding the role that schools actually play within a race-, class-, and gender-divided society, and in this effort, theorists have generated categories or concepts for questioning student experiences, texts, teacher ideologies, and aspects of school policy that conservative and liberal analyses too often leave unexplored. (p.189)

In Ornstein, Pajak, & Ornstein (2011), McLaren continues,

Critical pedagogy is a way of thinking about, negotiating, and transforming the relationship among classroom teaching, the production of knowledge, the institutional structures of the school, and the social and material relations of the wider community, society, and nation-state (McLaren, 1993; McLaren & Lankshear, 1994).

In contrast, Giroux (2015b) notes about critical pedagogy,

Critical pedagogy rejects views of education instead as a political and moral project attentive to matters of agency and to the history and specificity of the contexts in which students learn. Learning is always political because it is connected to the formation and acquisition of agency. For this reason, pedagogy can never be viewed merely as a method or disinterested practice because it always represents, whether consciously or not, a deliberate attempt on the part of educators to influence how and what knowledge and subjectivities are produced within particular sets of social relations. As a political project, critical pedagogy illuminates the relationships among knowledge, authority, and power, drawing attention to questions such as who has control over the conditions for the production of knowledge, values, and skills. It raises important questions about the kind of life presented to us in the classroom and whether it enables students to be autonomous, self-determining, and capable of self-criticism and social critique. Moreover, it sheds light on the ways in which knowledge, identities, and authority are constructed within circuits of power and whether such relations neutralize or make visible the challenges facing an aspiring democracy. (p.67)

Similarly, Fasset & Warren (2007) propose critical pedagogy as,

to mean efforts by people concerned with education to embrace profound ideological difference and socioeconomic context as constitutive of what happens in schools and classrooms. Critical pedagogy, at its best, is inherently Freirean: efforts to reflect and act upon the world in order to transform it, to make it a more just place for more people, to respond to our own collective pains and needs and desires (Freire, 1970/2003). Critical educators appraise education for pain, for inequity, and seek to act accordingly, which is to say with each other, not on, for, or to each other. Quite simply, critical pedagogy is a journey, not a destination. (p.26-27)

Public/Civic Engagement/Participation
At this point it is vital to offer a definition of public/civic engagement/participation from a civic media perspective. Williams (2016, in Gordon E. & Mihailidis, 2016), in examining how data visualizations in media empower public engagement suggests,

The term public engagement has varied--and often conflicting--definitions, and public "participation" might be an easier way to understand the term. One of the clearest definitions comes from *Public Participation Handbook: Making Better Decisions Through Citizen Involvement* by James L. Creighton in which he states "Public participation is the process by which public concerns, needs, and values are incorporated into governmental and corporate decision making. It is a two-way communication and interaction, with the overall goal of better decisions that are supported by the public" (Creighton 2005, 7). Public engagement is different from public participation as this two-way participation is not always incorporated in public engagement strategies. Those often involve more-passive interaction, although this is not recommended. Important to this definition is the idea that public participation is about making decision and communicating those decisions. (p.166-167)

Public engagement is equal with civic engagement. Williams continues, based on Adler & Goggin about civic engagement, "the ways in which citizens participate in the life of a community in order to improve conditions for others or to help shape the community's future" (Adler & Goggin 2005, 236). Here "civic" relates to one's role as a citizen, and "engagement" is synonymous with interaction" (Ibid.). Essentially, civic engagement is considered a one-way process of thin participation where civic participation is two-way and thick about the citizen-interaction process taking into consideration the concerns, needs, and values that a given government/corporation applies in discernment.

**Public Policy & Policy-making Processes**

Kraft & Furlong (2007), In *Public Policy: Politics, Analysis, and Alternatives (2nd ed.*) describe public policy as "what public officials within government, and by extension the citizens they represent, choose to do or not to do about public problems (p.5). de Tocqueville said about American Democracy in the early nineteenth century, "in no country in the world has the principle
of association been more successfully used or applied to a greater multitude of objects than in America." (p.5, In Gerston 2008). Therefore, Public policymaking,

is the combination of basic decisions, commitments, and actions made by those who hold or affect government positions. Typically, such initiatives direct the flow of resources that impact the public. These resources may be defined in terms of economic advantages, individual rights, or shifts in political power (ibid).

Definitions of policy also include, "a standing decision characterized by behavioral consistency and repetitiveness on the part of both those who make it and those who abide by it" (Eulau and Prewitt 1973, 465, In Kraft & Furlong 2007, p.5); as well as, "policies can also be thought of as the instruments through which societies regulate themselves and attempt to channel human behavior in acceptable directions (Schneider and Ingram 1997, ibid.). Ultimately, Kraft and Furlong settle on this definition: "public policy is a course of government action or inaction in response to public problems. It is associated with formally approved policy goals and means, as well as the regulations and practices of agendas that implement programs," (ibid).

**Media Literacy**

Silverblatt (2013) defines media literacy as,

1. Media literacy is a critical thinking skill that enables people to make independent choices with regard to (1) which media programming to select and (2) how to interpret the information they receive through the channels of mass communication. (xv)

The National Association of Media Literacy Education (NAMLE) describes The Core Principles of Media Literacy Education as,

1. Media Literacy Education requires active inquiry and critical thinking about the messages we receive and create.
2. Media Literacy Education expands the concept of literacy to include all forms of media (i.e., reading and writing).
3. Media Literacy Education builds and reinforces skills for learners of all ages. Like print literacy, those skills necessitate integrated, interactive, and repeated practice.
4. Media Literacy Education develops informed, reflective and engaged participants essential for a democratic society.
5. Media Literacy Education recognizes that media are a part of culture and function as agents of socialization.
6. Media Literacy Education affirms that people use their individual skills, beliefs and experiences to construct their own meanings from media messages. (https://namle.net/publications/core-principles/)

Silverstone (1999) makes a cogent argument aimed at Why Study the Media? Written at a time before the world wide web/internet boom of new media today his claims emphasize the value of media as experience, common sense, trust, mediation, the role of technology as culture, memory, and new media politics. Making a case for media literacy,

But there is more to new media politics than debates about regulation. I want to suggest that education is just as important, and by education, in this context, I mean media literacy. We need to know, all of us, how the media work and we need to know how to read and understand what we see and hear. This is our project, of course; for those of us who study the media must also pass on what we learn. But given the electronic media's ubiquity and centrality to everyday life, given its salience to our everyday project of making sense of the world we live in, nothing less will do. (p.153-154)


Civic Media

Henry Jenkins defines civic media as "any use of any medium which fosters or enhances civic engagement," (Gordan & Mihailidis, 2016, p.2), formed by actions and communities of
practice—social ties built on common practices or shared goals. The term civic media differs from similar labels such as: political communication, civic technology, community media, educational media, and citizen journalism, according to Gordan & Mihailidis,

We contend that the value of the umbrella term is the ability to disentangle media practice from its outcomes. Its power lies in the potential to identify civic communities that form around the production or use of media technologies, without making claims about the technologies themselves or their formal and aesthetic composition. We are not interested in defining a genre of media and technology; instead, we are interested in identifying common practices, dispositions, and motivations that organize communities toward achieving civic outcomes and common good. (p.3)

A critical distinction about civic media is that, for the most part, it remains the domain of the privileged given that access to technology remains stratified.

**Conscientização (critical consciousness)**

An additional notion proposed by Freire that grounds critical pedagogy is critical consciousness (*conscientização*), "refers to learning to perceive social, political, and economic contradictions, and to take action against the oppressive elements of reality" (Freire, 1970/1993, p.35). From the perspective of civic media scholars, media literacy has emerged as a field based on the work of Paulo Freire's notion of *conscientização* (critical consciousness). Mihailidis & Gerodimos explain,

Individuals develop the ability to perceive their social reality "not as a closed world from which there is no exit, but as a limiting situation which they can transform" (49). Media literacy education, then, prepares citizens for democratic participation by helping them analyze mediated *representations of their communities*, as well as address *issues within their communities* (Mihailidis, 2014a). (p.375)

In terms of sociocultural foundations of education, the transformation of consciousness laid out by Rossatto (2012) describes a process for Critical Consciousness development (*conscientização*): conforming (magical consciousness), reforming (naïve consciousness), and transforming (critical consciousness) based on Freire (1970). In the process three categories emerge which describe how
one moves through the various states of conscientization in navigating systems of oppression/colonization towards liberating/de-colonial futures. The first, Naming involves how the problem is defined and whether things should be as they are. Secondly, reflecting inquiries about the purpose of why things are the way they are and to whose interest the system serves to which benefits. Lastly, Acting explores the behaviors being done to subscribe, defend, or transform such systems. For purposes of this review media literacy will be applied as a generic term. As the reader progresses, note that new perspectives will be introduced about critical media literacy.

**Pedagogy**

Another significant distinction inherent in critical pedagogy relates to the term "pedagogy", according to Donaldo Macedo (In Freire, 1970/1993),

As one can readily see, the mechanization of Freire's revolutionary pedagogical proposals not only leads to the depolitization of his radically democratic work but also creates spaces for even those liberals who embrace Freire's proposals to confuse "the term he employs to summarize his approach to education, 'pedagogy' [which] is often interpreted as a 'teaching' method rather than a philosophy or a social theory. Few who invoke his name make the distinction. To be sure, neither does The Oxford English Dictionary." This seeming lack of distinction is conveniently adopted by those educators who believe that education is neutral as they engage in a social construction of not seeing. That is, they willfully refuse to understand that the very term "pedagogy," as my good friend and colleague Panagiota Gounari explains it, has Greek roots, meaning to "to lead a child" (from pais: child and ago: to lead). Thus, as the term "pedagogy" illustrates, education is inherently directive and must always be transformative. (p.24-25)

**Decolonial**

Mignolo (2011) describes the history of decolonial thinking, the epistemic shift and the emergence of decolonial thinking, as well as the philosophical origins of decolonial thought in relation to coloniality/modernity. He concludes with a call for the furthering of the decolonial turn. This argument rests on the premise that the establishment of colonial thinking is the genesis of
decolonial thought (p.45). A key emphasis of this work that grounds this dissertation is the notion of decoloniality which Mignolo claims has a long tradition of decolonial scholars (i.e., Quijano, 1991) which stressed the importance of "epistemic de-linking",

Epistemic disobedience leads us to decolonial options as a set of projects that have in common the effects experienced by all the inhabitants of the globe that were at the receiving end of global designs to colonize the economy (appropriation of land and natural resources), authority (management by the monarch, the State, or the Church), and policy and military enforcement (coloniality of power), to colonize knowledges (languages, categories of thought, belief systems, etc.) and beings (subjectivity). "Delinking" is then necessary because there is no way out of the coloniality of power from within Western (Greek and Latin) categories of thought. Consequently, de-linking implies epistemic disobedience rather than the constant search for "newness". Epistemic disobedience takes us to a different place, to a different "beginning", to spatial sites of struggles and building rather than to a new temporality within the same space. (Ibid.)

The notion of decolonizing assumes a particular framework promoted by decolonial scholars (Appendix, Figure 1; Mignolo, 2007). For this dissertation about decolonizing media literacy, the next key term to be defined pertains to Indigenous knowledge.

**Indigenous Epistemology and Indigenous Methodology**

Louis (2007) explains Indigenous epistemology as not only the non-scientific truths people hold, but also how those truths came into being and how they have shaped reality. These forms of knowledge and methods of knowing also allow individuals to place trust in things that the scientific community cannot necessarily explain. This gives an individual a broader sense of the world, how things function and what might be possible.

Indigenous methodology are ways of knowing about knowledge in a quest to develop research processes--approaches that emphasize circular and cyclical perspectives. The main goal ensures research for Indigenous community by Indigenous researchers of a variety of policy and social issues accomplished in a more sympathetic, respectful and ethically correct fashion from an Indigenous perspective. They are not merely ‘a political gesture on the part of Indigenous peoples
in their struggle for self-determination’…they are necessary to ‘reframe, reclaim, and rename’ the research process so that Indigenous people can take control of their cultural identities, emancipate their voices from the shadows, and recognize Indigenous realities (Louis, 2007; Tuhiwai-Smith, 1999/2012; Nabobo-baba, 2006, 2007).

In combining both Indigenous epistemology and Indigenous methodology principles, those open to such among contemporary dominant society would create unique philosophies or ideologies which promote environmental, social, and critical consciousness.

**Self-determination**

According to the Australian Indigenous Governance Institute, Common Roots, Common Futures: Indigenous Pathways to Self-Determination, Preliminary Report into Indigenous Governance Education and Training in Australia which features highlights from a conference across global Indigenous and non-indigenous civic leaders (Wighton & Smith, 2018), self-determination is defined as,

'Indigenous peoples'' assumption of real decision-making power and responsibility for what happens on their lands, in their communities, in their governing systems, and in their development strategies' (AIGI Toolkit 2017b). (p.33)

**Inafa'maolek**

Applying fundamental communication patterns of Pacific Islanders informs this dissertation arguing that a modern decolonial hybrid Chamorro-Native *Guahan* approach to knowledge appreciates the value of "making right" the meaning of discourse which is contextualized by Indigenous values of an inafa'maolek belief system, introduced here and centered on six Chamorro traditional values, according to K. Aguon (1993, 2003, 2009, 2011, 2018):
(1) **Respetu** - the provision of respect afforded to our elderly and others significant individuals within the family and community.

(2) **Manginge** - an expression of respect given to elders and persons of authority; likened to a kiss, this expression of reverence is displayed by the motion of a slight touch of the nose to [the] back part of a person's right hand.

(3) **Mamahlao** - to be shamefaced, embarrassed or ashamed.

(4) **Chenchule** - present (money) donation, thing that is given away, gift not specifically associated with any event.

(5) **Che'lu** - relationships with siblings.

(6) **Patgon** - Children are valued and raising them is everyone's responsibility.

Recognizing these values emphasize explicitly what is cultural knowledge for those embedded in said culture, while some may come from the outside as diasporic Natives, they inform an ontological, epistemological, and axiological map to survival in modern times as an *Inafa'maolek Mediation Framework (IMF).*

**Positive Deviance (PD)**

Positive Deviance (PD) is a community based, solution oriented, inside-out approach to problem solving for the most complex social problems (Pascale, Sternin, Sternin, 2010; Singhal, Dura, 2009). In *Turning Diffusion of Innovations Paradigm on Its Head* (Singhal 2011) inverts how to think about spreading change in communities,

The classical diffusion paradigm has been criticized for reifying expert-driven, top-down approaches to address problems and thus, by default, overlooking and rejecting local solutions. Diffusion of innovation experts now increasingly believe, and humbly acknowledge, the value of local expertise and indigenous wisdom in finding culturally appropriate solutions to community problems (p.203).

The key terms which inform this review for purposes of the dissertation defined above include **Positive Deviance (PD); inafa'maolek; self-determination; civic education; Indigenous epistemology & methodologies; decolonizing; conscientização (critical consciousness); civic media; media literacy; public policy & policy-making processes; public/civic engagement/participation; and social studies, civic education, and citizenship education.**
Summary of Chapter 1

In the 2016 introduction, questions regarding the impact of Trumpian politics on media literacy, civic engagement for democratic citizenship, and education resonate with particular significance in our contemporary societal context. As of 2019, this research study delves into these phenomena at a pivotal juncture in democratic life, characterized by a prevailing dichotomy of viewpoints and the dominance of partisan generalizations that often masquerade as common sense. Amidst this tumultuous backdrop, an Indigenous researcher hailing from the Island of Guam undertakes the task of interpreting surrounding community events, discerning their influence on the representation of public memory, and its impact on community decision-making, particularly in the lead-up to the 2020 election cycle. This examination is focused from the municipal standpoint on the U.S.-Mexico Border.

Furthermore, the preceding pages introduce definitions of key concepts within the domains of media cultural studies, public policy, and sociocultural foundations of education. They also present the background and statement of the problem, elucidating the impact on individuals, as well as underscoring the significance, relevance, and importance of the chosen topic. The number of individuals affected, the purpose of the study, and the identified need are also addressed in relation to the research questions at hand.

1. Who are the Indigenous-Minority members of the public engaging in the local government policy process across transnational settings, and how are they doing so?
2. How do community leaders, particularly in municipal settings across transnational contexts, teach and learn about the local policy-making process?

3. What constructions of critical consciousness towards civic engagement are socially formulated across various municipal locations and intercultural groups over time? What are the underlying reasons for these constructions?

Evidently, the dearth of civic education, teacher education, and media education in minority communities is not an isolated concern. Yet, uncovering the identities of those who, and the methods by which they, successfully navigate these issues to effect broader social change is paramount to comprehending and developing a new curriculum and pedagogical framework for citizenship education in 21st-century marginalized spaces. The inquiries emanate from the following introductory premises:

- Do we subscribe to the Trump narrative positing that the middle-class white community has been disadvantaged in recent times, with claims of reverse racism and a perceived erosion of their privilege?

- How do Indigenous/Minority educators and government leaders devise public pedagogy for imparting media literacy skills to Indigenous/Minority communities in the new media landscape, including the ability to differentiate between fact and opinion?

- What insights might Indigenous/Minority education researchers glean about prevailing communication social practices within the local municipal policy-making process?

- How would this contextual understanding inform new civic education curriculum standards, content, and pedagogy, as well as a fresh legislative agenda centered on social justice, all
designed to optimize democratic participation and self-determination for Indigenous/Minority voters?

- How do Indigenous/Minority pre-service educators, as well as educator and teacher-educators, approach teaching this subject matter within Indigenous/Minority spaces, using media as a conduit?

As previously noted, the issues framed by these questions lie at the core of the contemporary Indigenous/Minority experience, endeavoring to deconstruct coloniality at the culmination of the post-modern neocolonial neoliberal era, and navigate toward a more equitable present.
CHAPTER II
REVIEW OF LITERATURE

2.0 Description of the literature review

The primary aim of this review is to underscore a conspicuous lacuna in the existing body of literature, one that underscores the pressing necessity to decolonize civic engagement within the framework of municipal public policymaking, as well as media literacy practices, particularly along the U.S.-Mexico border and within the U.S. colony of Guam. This is of paramount significance in the contemporary era, as evidenced by the vehement rhetorical outpourings witnessed across various media and political platforms. These, in turn, significantly shape the development of civic education curricula, especially within minority and Indigenous communities. This imperative is particularly resonant when viewed through the prism of the researcher's autobiographical narrative—an individual who has transitioned from an Indigenous/Hispanic communications practitioner (with a comprehensive repertoire of over 28 years of experience in diverse communications roles) to an academic. This transition was forged against the backdrop of a childhood spent navigating intercultural global contexts as a dependent of the U.S. military during the 1970s and 80s.

The comprehensive review of literature encompasses a diverse array of scholarly resources, comprising peer-reviewed academic journals, reputable websites, online news articles, published books, pertinent case studies, and theses/dissertations sourced through exhaustive inquiries within Google Scholar, the UTEP library catalog, and EBSCO. Employing a judicious selection of search terms such as decolonial studies, media literacy, indigenous peoples, epistemology,
communications, intercultural communications, media studies, cultural studies, public memory, positive deviance, education, public policy-making process, civic engagement, civic participation, Guam, Chamorro, U.S-Mexico Borderlands, civic media, inafa'maolek, indigenous knowledge, sociocultural foundations, identity, and agency, this review was designed to be both thorough and incisive.

The conceptual framework underpinning this study derives its logical foundation from three distinct disciplinary domains: communications, public administration, and Indigenous Decolonizing methodology. This intricate framework synthesizes the theoretical paradigms expounded upon in Chapter 2's comprehensive literature review (refer to Appendix, Figure 2) which encompasses:

2. Civic Media, Intercultural Communication & Public Memory
3. Decolonizing methodology: Indigenous Chamorro Inafa'maolek Mediation

This triangulated approach serves as the bedrock for the development of a decolonizing civic and media literacy theory, subsequently informing the pedagogical and curriculum endeavors spanning secondary, adult, and community education realms.

During the initial search, the online search engine, Google, yielded results primarily focused on educational conference presentations pertaining to "decolonizing + media + literacy," particularly in the context of Indigenous communities. However, no scholarly journal articles or publications were found that specifically synthesized these topics. Nevertheless, it is noteworthy that individual works addressing each of these themes separately do exist. This evidential
landscape highlighting the gap in Indigenous civic media education aligns with the assertions put forth by Niemi and Junn (1998) regarding the imperative for civic education research grounded in municipal governance. Additionally, it resonates with Jean Anyon's (2005) call for educational research to underscore policy-making processes and scrutinize how power dynamics can either empower minority communities or lead to disenfranchisement when left unchallenged.

2.1 A Conceptual Framework towards Decolonizing Media Literacy Pedagogy

Next, we turn our attention to constructing a conceptual framework that underpins the advancement of Indigenous Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML) with the goal of augmenting civic engagement for social justice. This review involves a triangulation of key disciplinary domains pertaining to sociocultural foundations of education (SCFE), public administration (PA), and communications (COMM). These domains collectively contribute to the theoretical framework of analysis, elucidating the optimal approach for this dissertation, which will be further explored in Chapter 3—Methodology. Within this section, we will meticulously unpack the following theoretical standpoints:
Figure 2.1: A Conceptual Framework towards Decolonizing Media Literacy Pedagogy: Social Justice & Democratic Participation in the Municipal Policy-making Process to Transform Public Memory, Self-determination, and Civic Education for Indigenous/Minority Communities

Note. Triangulation of paradigms intersecting intercultural frames of meaning for an Indigenous Methodology centering self-determination.

2.1.1 Civics: Education, Media, Engagement/Participation & Pedagogy

Dewey (1916) envisioned a democratic education marked by principles of equality and diversity, breaking down racial and class barriers during a pivotal period in our nation's history. In his work "The Democratic Conception of Education" (p.51-60), Dewey emphasized two key attributes of a democratic society: 1. The use of mutual interest as a form of social control; and 2. The promotion of change in social habits as a fundamental democratic ideal. Dewey pointed out the crucial role of the state, as an institution, in our educational system, a concept that has roots dating back to the 19th-century development of public education in Germany. He aptly concluded,
"The conception of education as a social process and function has no definite meaning until we define the kind of society we have in mind" (p.58). For the scope of this review, what form of education is appropriate for the society we envisage? What type of individual will our standards, curriculum, and education system cultivate in the context of the Trumpian Era? To provide a foundation for such an inquiry, this dissertation will now forge a connection to theoretical underpinnings rooted in the field of public administration and its interplay with policy, policymaking, civic participation, and civic education.

Vontz (1997) delves into the evolution of civic education as a discipline in the late 19th and early 20th centuries in the U.S., drawing insights from the National Education Association's Committee on Social Studies. He posits that these foundational principles remain relevant to this day. Vontz (1997) identifies four conceptualizations for teaching and learning civics: (1) substantive civic education, (2) valuative civic education, (3) practical/participatory civic education, and (4) civic education as community civics. These facets of civic education are linked to Niemi and June's (1998) model, where civic education encompasses knowledge acquired from external structures and individual student motivations related to government and civics—an approach termed the Exposure-Selection Model (p.55). This model identifies four key sets of factors: civics curriculum (including coursework volume, subject matter, recency, and pedagogy), home environment (involving literacy, language, parental composition, parental education, and media consumption), individual achievement (encompassing participation in student government, disposition towards subject matter, and college aspirations), and background/demographics (considering race and gender). Pertaining to this proposal, this analytical model informs teacher pedagogy as a structural determinant. This is a significant point, given the influential role of teacher education and pedagogy in this context, especially
considering the shifting dynamics within the home environment, a factor identified by Nieme and Junn as potentially problematic, impacting exposure and retention—highlighting the centrality of media exposure in this dissertation's framework. Similarly, Kahne and Middaugh (2008) advocate for a model of high-quality civic education founded on the principles of capacity, connection, and commitments. They assert that experiences fostering civic and political commitments and capacities contribute to academic consensus on best practices for nurturing civic capacity. Furthermore, Galston (2001) scrutinizes political knowledge in relation to educational attainment. His findings challenge the conventional belief that civic education in classrooms is ineffective for promoting civic participation, suggesting that through the pedagogy of Service Learning, it is possible to challenge these preconceived notions about civic education's impact.

In accordance with Gordon and Mihailidis (2016), society is recognizing the pivotal role of online mechanisms in reshaping institutional and political landscapes (p.5). They note that the establishment of civic technology departments within national and local government offices, alongside a renewed emphasis on democracy and community, signifies a mainstream acknowledgment of the civic potential inherent in digital technologies. As a result, civic media is no longer vying for attention, but rather seeking to establish its distinct identity (p.5). One significant area of inquiry explored in the text revolves around "the pedagogies and support structures that foster knowledge and critical thinking about the media" (p.6). Moving forward, this section of the review will provide a concise summary of key points from Mihailidis' (2016) work on Civic Media.
In Section 1, Peter Levine delves into the overarching challenges presented by the digital age, which include the fragmentation of choices, heightened ambiguity surrounding state sovereignty, the state's growing capacity to surveil society, and its diminishing dependence on citizen participation. Levine aptly notes that while the digital age may grant power to some individuals, it also disenfranchises many, bestowing unprecedented influence upon small groups that hold sway over governments and corporations (p.7). In the context of this dissertation's focus on municipal governance, Section II delves into Systems + Design and underscores the burgeoning popularity of civic technology at the local governance level.

Civic tech has motivated scores of municipal governments to form "innovation offices" charged with inventing and integrating technologies that enable and streamline the work of government (New Tech City Report 2012), including notable organizations like New Urban Mechanics in Boston or the Laboratorio para Ciudad in Mexico City, (p.8). Section III delves into the realm of Play + Resistance, examining play as a modality for civic participation, drawing on Bourdieu's concept of habitus. The text posits that civic media can be viewed as games in and of themselves, necessitating a shift in the player's sensibility from one field to another. Civic media, as such, can challenge Bourdieu's notion of the "miraculous encounter between habitus and field," positing that media are not disembodied systems, but rather deliberate encounters contingent on the variability of both players and designers. In this regard, play offers a means of resisting the normative rules of the game, providing a critical opportunity to transcend the confines of everyday reality (p.11).

In Section IV: Learning & Engagement, the focus shifts towards civic competencies and pedagogy for civic engagement. Given that young people incorporate media into their personal lives, it becomes imperative to comprehend how these media practices, or literacies, shape civic life, democratic ideals, and education.
In Section V: Community + Action, this section delves into research about the utilization of new media social networks for political activism. Notably, it introduces a clear distinction that fractures the concept of a "citizen" into two distinct forms: the "actualizing citizen" and the "dutiful citizen". The former adopts an individualistic approach to participating in democracy through activism, while the latter views civic engagement as a responsibility to their respective community.

In Section VI: Research + Funding, the focus shifts to the domain of institutional research within academia, posing essential questions like "how are individuals utilizing media to attain civic objectives? And to what extent are media platforms shaping the parameters of such use?" (p.18). This segment contributes to the methodological framework of this dissertation, illustrating prior studies that have employed Participatory Action Research and Community-based Participatory Research, while also addressing the challenges associated with acquiring financial resources.

2.1.3 Public Administration, Policy-making processes, and Gilley's Colonial Framework

According to Nicholas Henry (1975) in his work "Paradigms of Public Administration," the exploration of "What is public administration?" constitutes a branch of humanistic social science studies linked to political science and administrative science principles. It encompasses policy formulation, political dynamics, and the management of public affairs in the best interest of the populace. Henry elucidates five fundamental paradigms (Paradigm 1: The Politics/Administration Dichotomy; Paradigm 2: The Principles of Administration; Paradigm 3: Public Administration as Political Science; Paradigm 4: Public Administration as Administrative Science; Paradigm 5: Public Administration as Public Administration) that have shaped this field
since the early 1900s. In the aftermath of World War II, public administration encountered a degree of conflict with the realm of political science. Intellectual discourse centered around the idea of bridging the divide between public administration and political science. Drawing from Easton's Systems Framework (1965), it is evident that both intra- and extra-societal environmental factors exert an influence on policies, policymakers, and citizens. Various institutions, including government bodies, media outlets, and educational establishments, engage in the policy-making processes within ecological, biological, personality, and social systems. For example, a policy aimed at either mobilizing or suppressing voters generates demands and garners support from one segment of society (typically the wealthier and more civically engaged), thus acting as inputs into the political system, potentially to the detriment of the other segment (comprising of the economically disadvantaged and non-voters), which can be seen as an output of this process.

In her work "Policy Paradox: The Art of Political Decision-Making," Stone (2002) presents a political model that grapples with policy market dilemmas in the contemporary era, contrasting the perspectives of a free market approach against the Polis Model (p.32). Stone identifies crucial principles that underlie decision-making processes, encompassing elements such as community, public interest, common problems, influence, cooperation, loyalty, groups, information, passion, and power—each shaping specific ideological orientations within society. Notably, a pivotal divergence lies in how each paradigm conceives of the public interest. Within the market model, it tends to be an afterthought, whereas the polis model places the interests of the citizenry at the forefront. The core of an individual self-interest market aligns with colonialism. Gilley (2017) advances the argument that colonialism functioned as an economic tool in a mutually impacting global, imperial, and recolonized context. Gilley critically assesses decolonial, postcolonial, and
anticolonial studies, deeming them as ideological. This positivist stance against decolonial thought represents a rare and explicit theoretical position in the academic discourse, making a case against anti-colonial critique, asserting that colonialism was objectively harmful rather than beneficial, and subjectively illegitimate rather than legitimate, as it offends contemporary societal sensibilities (p.2). Gilley delves into the hypothetical question of what might have transpired in each location in the absence of colonial rule, employing an epistemic critique and advocating for dialectical interpretations guided by the principles of falsification. He links anti-colonial thought with Marxism, emphasizing that Marxist scholars criticized colonialism both when it failed to invest in public health and infrastructure (displaying a callous disregard for labor), and when it did invest (with the aim of exploitation) (p.3). Gilley contends that colonialism lacks an antithesis because there is no equality between the concepts as dialectical contradictions—Hammer (1995) would term this false symmetrical opposition. Gilley endeavors to sanitize the concept of colonialism, positioning it as a co-equal, if not superior, contradiction to anti-colonialism. Drawing from a Hegelian perspective on dialectics, the negation of the negative tends to lead to reductionism. Gilley proceeds to propose a neoliberal approach to city governance akin to the business structure of charter schools, which he terms "charter cities".

Finally, charter cities could be effective—which was Romer's main concern in developing the idea—because they have a blank slate to transplant home institutions without having to work with rotten local ones, (p.11).

The administration of decolonial governance within a colonial framework is intrinsically linked to the ideological underpinnings that steer policy decisions. This dynamic is characterized by the both/and phenomena in dialectics, where decolonial spaces are concurrently colonized spaces. In this nuanced interplay, neocolonial neoliberal thinkers embrace transnationalism to further capitalist interests, culminating in what is termed "Transnational Governance" (p.10).
2.1.4 Social Justice, Policy, & Policy Elite

A Freirean educational research paradigm aligns with the enduring pursuit of social justice, action, and policies in the public interest (Ladson-Billings & Tate, 2006). The significance of investigating public policy and the influential figures shaping it is underscored by Jean Anyon in her work "What Should Count as Educational Research" (pp.17-26, 2005).

In order to transform policies and practices that undermine urban communities and schools, we need to understand how those with power to make the decisions think, act, and organize themselves: Power analyses of public policy decision making that impacts education are called for. A model for this type of work at the national level is the work of sociologist William Domhoff (2001). He has carried out network analyses of institutions and organizations to which national policymakers belong—linked corporation boards, government groups, private clubs, foundations, think tanks, elite school trusteeships, and so on. By assessing the actions and interactions of overlapping members of these groups. Domhoff identifies what he calls a policy elite. It is the functioning of this elite that needs to be examined—and their actions interrupted. When we know who the powerful decision makers are [shadow government—my emphasis] and what they do, we are more likely to be able to know how and where to intervene. Power analysis of policy elites would be useful at the state and city levels as well, (p.22).

The focal point of inquiry lies in comprehending the civic processes that underlie policy development, particularly as it pertains to the cultural groups influencing minority community progress. As noted by Gerston (2008), public policymaking encompasses the amalgamation of pivotal decisions, commitments, and actions undertaken by individuals who hold or impact governmental positions. The quintessential stages of this process encompass: 1. Identifying public policy issues; 2. Formulating a public policy proposition; 3. Engaging in political advocacy; 4. Implementation; and 5. Evaluation. By applying a Systems Perspective (Easton, 1965) to scrutinize a foundational issue of public involvement in the policy-making process, elections emerge as a conduit for citizen engagement in the meta-political sphere. In this interaction, as outlined by Harrigan (1998, p.103), citizens employ five methods to interact with public officials:
For a citizen to exert influence on the policy process, two conditions must be met: "The channels themselves must effectively influence government policy, and the channels must be responsive to citizen demands." This is of paramount importance, as voter apathy reflects the dearth of responsiveness experienced by participant-spectators in contrast to the heightened levels of response characteristic of multi-channel producers of political outcomes. Harrigan delineates between participant and non-participant members within a social group, wherein participants represent the "gladiators" and "spectators" (p.92-95). This perspective aligns with the notion of the "public as spectator" advocated by Walter Lippmann, who asserted that the social objective for policy elites should be to shield the voting majority from the "trampling and the roar of a bewildered herd...ignorant and meddlesome outsiders (whose role in democracy should be) spectators not participants [in the democratic process]" (Macedo, 2007, p. 188). Expanding on this, James Anderson (p.3.5, 2014) characterizes the policymaking cycle as,

a sequence of functional activities beginning with problem identification and agenda formation, and continuing through the evaluation of policy, which may result in the continuation, modification, or termination of policy. Additionally, the stages of the policy process framework, which denotes a "sequential pattern of activities or functions that can readily be distinguished analytically although they may be empirically more difficult to pull apart":

1. Problem identification and agenda setting.
2. Formulation.
3. Adoption.
4. Implementation (administration).
5. Evaluation.
In contrast, Noam Chomsky (as cited in Macedo, 2006) elucidates the hypocrisy inherent in modern "democracy." The evolution of public administration as an academic discipline, with policymaking as a key component, has become a subject of study within the U.S. educational system. Similarly, Stanley (2015) deepens our comprehension of propaganda in contemporary society, highlighting its potent role within a democracy. Stanley defines political propaganda as "the employment of a political idea against itself" (p. XIII), founded on the exploitation of flawed ideologies. The perpetuation of these false narratives involves a protracted process of acquiring power and influence over the dissemination of information in educational and media contexts.

An essential aspect of this dissertation involves the community's grasp of propaganda models, as described by Herman (Hammer & Kellner, 2009) in his Propaganda Model. Herman delineates the distinctions between media as a tool of the dominant elite, characterized by overt control by state/public media authorities. However, in more subtle forms of propaganda machinery, private media outlets present themselves as operating in the public interest. These entities serve functions such as determining newsworthiness and elucidating the inner workings of a propaganda campaign. This conceptual framework is pivotal for media literacy, providing community members with the scaffolding to discern when and how powerful dominant forces attempt to manipulate media for their own agenda.

Additionally, Edward S. Herman (Macedo & Steinberg, 2007) argues that shifting the media landscape towards a more civic-oriented and less capital-driven ideology necessitates financial support from the private sector for publicly funded initiatives. There are two proposed avenues for achieving this transformation: the first involves an internal shift within the media industry, while the second entails external intervention from sources such as private entities or
government agencies. Various forms of media, including television, radio, and the internet, are identified for potential democratization.

One prominent concern in discussions about democratizing media is the apprehension of potential "ungovernability in the U.S." (p.49). It is important to note that the internet, despite its transformative potential, does not inherently embody democratic media, as access is often contingent on socio-economic factors. This limits its capacity for widespread outreach. Herman's work carries relevance in understanding contemporary mass media coverage of national and international politics, exemplified by policies and discourse reminiscent of those advocated by figures like Trump. This includes initiatives like building a border wall, strict immigration measures, and prioritizing American interests both domestically and abroad. These actions align with Herman's assertions.

Furthermore, it is imperative to consider the advantages presented by the policy process or policy cycle (Anderson et al., 1984). Within the framework of elite theory, this group-oriented notion encompasses elements such as access, interests, group dynamics, ideas, and institutional influences on the policy-making process (p.22-23). It is crucial to recognize that there is no one-size-fits-all solution in policy development. Elite Theory (p.23-25), drawing on the work of Domhoff and Robert Dahl, underscores that a select few often hold sway in policy formulation, with limited influence from the broader population. As Andersen aptly points out, "Whether elites rule and determine policy, with little influence from the masses, is a difficult proposition to handle. It cannot be proved merely by assertions that the 'establishment runs things,' which has been a familiar plaint in recent years" (p.24). Dahl's assertion aligns with the concept often referred to by
civic practitioners as a "shadow government." While this notion may seem unconventional within the American context, it is undeniably intertwined with our civic and democratic culture.

Institutionalism (p.25) encompasses "a set of regularized patterns of human behavior that persist over time and perform some significant social function or activity." These established behavioral patterns, including procedures, rules, structural arrangements, and other institutional features, "are usually not neutral in their effects; rather, they tend to favor some interests in society over others and some policy results over others" (Ibid.). Institutions form an integral part of the contextual backdrop in the policy formation process. Additionally, it is essential to account for factors such as political parties, interest groups, and public opinion.

Contrarily, Anderson (2014) astutely observes that there is no singular "process" for policy formation, but rather, a range of distinct approaches warranting examination. He articulates, "There is not a single process by which public policies are formed. They do not come off an assembly line as do automobiles, refrigerators, and other standard products. Rather, variations in the subjects of policies will produce variations in the style, techniques, and politics of policymaking" (Ibid., p.2). While policymaking assumes diverse forms, elite theory postulates an interconnected network of influential and affluent individuals responsible for steering decisions. In alignment with this perspective, Manza et al. (2002) delineate additional processes through which the power elite engage in the policy-making process, particularly in economic matters, leaving social issues for liberal and conservative parties to deliberate publicly. These include special interests, policy planning, opinion shaping, and candidate selection. An essential facet of his analysis underscores the pivotal role of the power elite, defined as "the leadership group for a dominant social class consisting of the owners and managers of large income-producing properties."
These owners and managers come together as a corporate community [due to] common ownership interests, shared law firms, and interlocking directorships, among many connections” (p.124).

A fundamental contradiction facing civics education appears to stem from entrenched dispositions among elite cultural groups regarding both methods and content (Loewen, 1995, as cited in Ibid). These findings underscore the existence of a civics education designed to cater to elite groups, thereby highlighting the need for a more inclusive approach. According to Hobbs, citizenship education represents a crucial component of social studies education, but it poses a challenge for school faculty in navigating institutional demands. The history of U.S. education is replete with debates over the inclusion of specific content, pedagogical strategies, and overarching themes in civic education (p.359). Notably, capitalism has emerged as a prominent theme, with a particular emphasis on financial literacy within current civic education curricula. However, it is imperative to contextualize this theme within the broader curriculum, content, and pedagogical framework to offer a more comprehensive understanding of today's media landscape.

2.1.5.1 Indigenous Re-thinking Critical Media Literacy

For the discerning reader, Hammer elucidates the relevance of dialectical theory within the context of a critical media literacy pedagogy (1995, as cited in McLaren et al., 1995, pp.33-85). In this discourse, several points articulated by Hammer warrant contemplation for the non-dialectical concept of inafa'maolek. Inafa'maolek embodies Hegel's notion of the Absolute/Spirit, a departure from the historical materialism advocated by Marx and Engels, which grounds reality in the materials and matter essential for societal progress. Inafa'maolek finds its roots in the epistemology of Native Pacific Islanders, as documented by Hau'ofa (1994). Here, the navigational perspective of movement, as noted by Hammer, is dialectical in its essence, involving a contradiction of
opposites (not false symmetry) between static and dynamic states, directed toward a goal. This stands in contrast to the Western perception of bodies in motion. According to Indigenous knowledge, as imparted by skilled navigators, the vessel/body remains stationary while the islands, oceans (events, knowledge, people) are in motion. The fundamental disparity between the Indigenous self, whether colonized or decolonized, lies in our perceptual lens of the world. Hau’ofa (1994b) cites Ward and Webb (1973) to illustrate this contrast in cultural perspective and meaning-making, grounded in a nature-centric worldview. In this context, inafa'maolek does not represent the antithesis of a thesis, nor a contradiction within the realm of dialectical meaning. Instead, inafa'maolek embodies harmony in nature and social relations—an Indigenous way of life that was practiced by Native Chamorros of Guam prior to the arrival of colonial/imperial European forces, who subsequently reshaped society in their dominant image. The subsequent discussion will further elucidate the significance of inafa'maolek, providing an Indigenous Research Framework to replace a theoretical one—remembered, not constructed, as inafa'maolek simply is.

Thus, we embark on a reevaluation of the theoretical underpinnings for a pedagogy of Decolonizing Media Literacy, rooted in dialectical relationships that manifest in the broader societal context, often as contradictions or vice versa—of the representations within educational institutions. It is crucial to underscore that, as Hammer (1995) elucidates, this is referred to as a "critical semiotic meta-theoretical approach". The Indigenous inafa'maolek perspective is proffered as a vehicle for democratic education among Indigenous and minority communities—an approach that predates Western hierarchies of theory and meta-theory, transcending the dichotomy of neither/or and both/and. This embodies an essence that surpasses mere conceptual or substantive realms. In Indigenous epistemology, natural signs signify harmonious relations.
Until this juncture, scant attention has been directed towards the theoretical and meta-theoretical underpinnings and potentials of media literacy. Rhonda Hammer (McLaren, et.al, 1995) proposes that a media literacy pedagogy serves as the bridging element in curriculum, interweaving course content—a point that addresses the ongoing debate regarding the integration of media literacy within public education. Epistemologically, this analysis highlights the juxtaposition of critical dialectical and Newtonian Reductionism. The former prioritizes an examination of meta-relationships in context, often at the expense of the object itself, while the latter ascribes reality to the object devoid of contextual considerations (p.36). The scrutiny of relationships, a prevalent theme in scholarly discourse on media for student analysis, necessitates an understanding of how these patterns interconnect in a "dialectical contextual manner". Theory serves as the bedrock for students' counterhegemonic production of media.

In advocating for Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML), the pivotal role of teacher education comes to the fore, as effective instruction demands that the educator possesses a deep-seated comprehension. Hammer contends that the initial step is acknowledging that "no media form is value free". This signifies the absence of objectivity or value-neutral communication. According to Donaldo Macedo (In McLaren, et.al, 1995, vii, p.37), this is an ideological act, asserting, "Objectivity always contains within it a dimension of subjectivity; thus, it is dialectical" (1991). The dialectical method is rooted in what Raymond Williams terms the concept of "contradictions in reality", extending beyond a mere surface-level contradiction (1976: 107; Ibid.). Consequently, "the dialectical process [entails] the continual unification of opposites, in the complex relation of parts to a whole" (ibid.). The intricate nature of media literacy necessitates a rigorous theoretical approach for analysis.
Hammer (McLaren, et.al, 1995) employs a critical semiotic meta-theoretical approach to challenge prevailing paradigms in educational reform by interrogating the dialectic. She contends, "As critical educators, we operate on the premise that an exploration of the dialectic as a mode of communication will empower educators to reconsider social issues in a more contextual and critical manner, thus enabling an affective pedagogy of media literacy" (p.39). By reconfiguring the dynamic surrounding dialectical concepts, it lays the groundwork for a "metacommunicative process" that underpins a media literacy pedagogy for enacting social change. The subsequent step in this analysis links the perspectives of the Frankfurt School (Hegel, Marx, and Engels) on dialectics to Hammer's conception of a critical semiotic meta-theoretical approach.

According to Hammer (Ibid.), Socrates perceived the emergence of dialectics in recognizing the contradiction between ideas (p.42). Aristotle similarly conceptualized dialectics as a meta-communicative exchange of perspectives (Ibid.). Expanding on these notions, Hegel establishes this critical semiotic meta-theoretical approach, emphasizing the interplay between components, the "pattern" that establishes connections, contextualization, layers of communication, and, notably, defining this emerging epistemology as inherently aesthetic and transdisciplinary (p.43). Context is intrinsic to the process of communication. For Hegel, the concept of antithesis must hold its own significance; he terms this "the negation of negation" (p.44-45), signifying that the negation carries positive meaning. "A" represents one facet of the contradiction, a fixed point in meaning, while "not-A" encompasses everything else. Hammer interprets this as "levels of communication" in the formulation of meta-communication/meta-theory. As "A" reconciles with "not-A," a positive "B" emerges from this conflicting relationship; in meta-theoretical terms, hence "not-B" arises from this "higher synthesis" in an ongoing process. Each iteration constitutes what Hammer describes as "punctuation" and "repunctuation," with the
Hegel posits that what initially appears real to us is, in fact, merely an abstraction or a "bare particular" of the actual existing relations, implying that something only becomes real once it ceases to be "a bare particular" (p.47). Elaborating on this notion towards "The Absolute"—fully rational—it stands as the ultimate ideal of reason, which "the dialectical consciousness of man can grasp only as a goal endlessly to be striven for, yet never reached or even comprehended..." (Ibid., p.48). The process by which The Absolute is to be attained involves a triadic process—thesis, antithesis, and synthesis. Consequently, "Hegel himself regarded all contradictions as dialectical moments in the life of absolute spirit, unified in a single comprehensive system of philosophy" (Acton 1967: 451), (In Ibid., p.49). Hegel's perspectives on the dialectic are viewed as transdisciplinary (both/and) in the development of a critical semiotic meta-theoretical approach to the dialectical process.

Hammer (McLaren, et.al, 1995) further delves into a third phase of analysis, focusing on the evolution of dialectics as articulated by Marx and Engels. In their interpretation, Hegel's concept of "spirit" undergoes a transformation, giving rise to "matter" and culminating in the formation of "historical materialism" (p.53). Marx regarded Hegel as an idealist who employed the dialectical method to probe philosophical truths and dialectical oppositions (thesis/antithesis) in the examination of historical processes of development (p.44). Building on the insights of Ludwig Feuerbach, Engels posits that idealism elevates the primacy of the mind, whereas materialism posits matter as a fundamental premise (p.44).

In the context of this dissertation proposal's methodology, which seeks to investigate policy elites for their perspectives on the policy-making process to inform media literacy pedagogy for civic participation, Marx's ideas are particularly pertinent. His work illustrates how various levels of experience and realities contribute to the reevaluation of our understanding of the world—an
essential aspect mirrored in both Marx and Engels' development of an epistemology aimed at grappling with the intricate nature of actual social relations (p.55).

To put it concisely, Marx and Engels' dialectical materialism aligns with Hammer's concept of the critical semiotic meta-theoretical approach. In the context of media literacy pedagogy, Marx and Engels sought to comprehend patterns of relationships within their respective contexts (p.56). While Hegel, Marx, and Engels collectively employed the dialectical method to scrutinize historical change, they diverged in their interpretations of the idea that "history repeats itself". According to Hammer, Marx specifically referred to political, social, and economic contexts, emphasizing the pivotal role of context in understanding historical transformation (p.57).

Furthermore, Hammer (Ibid.) introduces a crucial departure from the foundational notions of the dialectic proposed by Hegel, Marx, and Engels, unveiling a distinctive perspective on Dialectical Materialism. This perspective contends that Marx advances "dialectical materialism" by rectifying a fundamental oversight in Hegel's thinking, which posits Absolute Spirit above the individual. Marx and Engels assert that the individual and spirit are subordinate to the group, grounding their argument on the value of spirit in Hegelian terms. This is juxtaposed with the Indigenous Chamorro concept of infa'maolek (harmony) as the essence/spirit in meaning-making. Additionally, this argument advocates for the value of Marxist notions of the group over Hegelian individual-centered analysis. While Marx advocates for a socialist examination of class, this argument places democratic-centering and ideology above class as the focal point of analysis.

Further examination of Hammer's interpretation of Engel's "Laws of Dialectics" reveals two fundamental principles: the Unity of Opposites and the Negation of the Negation, which hold
significant relevance for the argument presented in this dissertation (McLaren, et.al, 1995, p.64-72). These principles seek to elucidate the mechanisms of transformation, premised on the idea that without tension, stasis would persist, as there would be no impetus for change.

The Law of Opposites bears critical implications for scrutinizing societal relationships. Engel's construal posits that all opposing relations are in an equitable and hierarchically symmetrical stance, a premise that may not always hold true. The utilization of false opposites casts the relationship into an illusory contrast; as a result, the asymmetric conflict that should exist is obscured, replaced by a false-positive opposition. For example, employing Hammer's terminology (p.65), the common framing of decolonial/colonial studies as opposites actually "creates an imaginary opposition between the two. In this process, the hierarchical contradiction inherent in the relations of colonial and decolonial is neutralized; the two are placed in a falsely constructed opposition." This concept is denoted as "symmetrization," wherein a genuine conflict exists between the two, yet what is simulated is an appearance of equality.

The Law of the Unity of Opposites encapsulates the notion of the "unity of contradiction," wherein the described relationship encompasses two logical types, with one prevailing over the other. An erroneous interpretation of hierarchical relations thrusts them into an illusory opposition, resulting in a misrepresentation of "actual" communicative phenomena (p.67). To grasp "the dialectic" and a "critical semiotic meta-theoretical approach," comprehending the concept of the "identity of opposites" in relation to context and punctuation is paramount. Hammer posits four types of relationships that constitute the "identity of opposites": Unity of Differences, Unity of Distinctions, Unity of Opposites, and Unity of Contradictions.
Engels' second proposed law, the "Negation of the Negation," is predicated on the triadic interplay of thesis, antithesis, and synthesis. Simply stated, the antithesis annuls the thesis, giving rise to synthesis, thereby delineating conflict, contradictions, and transformative processes in social relations. Hammer highlights a weakness in this principle, emphasizing its failure to differentiate among "inorganic, organic, and socioeconomic systems." This underscores yet another instance of symmetrization, underscoring the potential for complex hierarchical relations to be oversimplified and diffused when the thesis and antithesis are not appropriately contextualized. This can lead to mispunctuation akin to the "identity of opposites." The crucial insight here is that for the negation of negation to instigate meaningful change, the thesis and antithesis must emanate from distinct hierarchical relations. In essence, a unity of contradiction must be present for the law of negation of negation to be effective. Furthermore, these relations necessitate rigorous scrutiny in lieu of the educational content students are typically presented with regarding contradictory associations or subcategories of association.

Hammer proceeds by citing Wilden (1987: 276) regarding the complementary nature of "analytic logic" and "dialectical logic." Analytical logic encompasses "either either-or both/and," whereas dialectical logic entails the application of both "either-or" and "both/and" modes of analytical thinking. The distinction between these two forms of logic lies in the fact that dialectical logic presupposes a choice among equal and unequal levels of relations. The dialectic is wielded to generate new meaning from the established order, with the central tenet being learning through conflict.

In the context of this dissertation proposal, applying a dialectical understanding entails heeding Hammer's insights derived from Wilden (1987: 22), which posits that the dominant
ideology tends to create the impression that symmetrical conflict or opposition constitutes the fundamental (and natural) conflict underpinning most forms of relations. This diversion deflects inquiries away from issues concerning illegitimate power, privilege, domination, and oppression (p.74). Additionally, building upon Hammer's examination of Malcolm X's differentiation between the individual and collective, which is also conflated with the analytical logic of "either-or," the false oppositional model of the dominant code represents the application of the critical semiotic meta-theoretical approach advocated by Hammer as a pedagogy of media literacy. This underscores the imaginary opposition as emblematic of a colonial relationship, prompting Hammer to suggest the exploration of a decolonial theoretical space. However, this dissertation, from an Indigenous standpoint, takes exception to and identifies limitations in this analysis.

Hammer further underpins this analysis by drawing on Giroux's dialectical theory of dialectics. The application of dialectical logic aids in teachers' comprehension of contradictory relations in social life. Subsequently, Hammer turns to Adorno's conception of Negative Dialectics, which constitutes a mode of critical thought striving to remain cognizant of its own socially constructed nature while simultaneously seeking to unveil the genuine connections between language and reality. Negative dialectics not only reveals that any facet of reality has been historically shaped, but it also contains within its "images" or "possibilities" of what it could potentially become (Gibson 1986) (Ibid.). Ultimately, Hammer contends that a critical pedagogy of media literacy negates representations rooted in patriarchal self-conceptions and Eurocentric narratives of liberation predicated on the marginalization of certain groups. Rethinking the dialectic, therefore, a decolonizing media literacy pedagogy displaces Euro-centric notions of criticality and semiotics, and instead centers an Indigenous knowledge system. This endeavor commences with the
decolonization of the dialectic from its Western epistemological origins, a topic to be expounded upon later in this chapter. In lieu of a critical semiotic meta-theoretical approach to inform a media literacy pedagogy, this dissertation advocates for a decolonizing Inafa'maolek meta-theoretical approach.

2.1.5.2 Intercultural Communication & Public Memory

In "The Handbook of Intercultural Discourse and Communication," Paulston, C.B., et al. (2012) provide a comprehensive examination of the historical underpinnings of intercultural communication as a socio-cultural linguistic descriptor. The concept of intercultural communication is applied across various contexts, encompassing both broad cross-cultural social phenomena and more nuanced theoretical understandings rooted in linguistics. Kubota offers critical perspectives on intercultural communication, propelling it towards post-modern, post-structural, and post-colonial frameworks of intercultural discourse (Kubota in Paulston, 2012, p.90). Kubota contends that intercultural communication is founded on perspectives, practices, and products. Debates persist regarding the most effective approaches to interpreting culture and communication, as well as the methodologies best suited for this field of study. One pivotal dimension of intercultural communication revolves around the notion of "cultural difference" (Kaplan 1966, as cited in Paulston, 2012, p.104, Kubota). In this context, an analysis suggests the necessity of a de-colonial approach to critical communication, one that delves deeper than mere critical examinations of power dynamics.

Furthermore, Kubota posits that power relations in communication manifest within a range of institutional settings, providing a nuanced understanding of the role of intercultural
communication. When applied to the realm of education, Amanda J. Godley (2012), in "Interactional Domains," scrutinizes Intercultural Discourse and Communication in Education. She underscores the imperative for teacher education programs to equip pre-service educators with the skills to teach students about intercultural communication, given the diverse array of communication patterns encountered by contemporary students, encompassing issues of language, cultural identity, technology, and globalization. Additionally, Godley offers recommendations for intercultural communication to fortify relationships among stakeholders within the educational community. This is illuminated through case studies exemplifying recent strides in intercultural communication in education, spanning student-teacher communication, student-student communication, intercultural communications within specific disciplines, and communication between parents and schools.

In the realm of education, Godley (2012) offers a supplementary perspective, suggesting strategies for fostering effective intercultural communication. These include emphasizing the development of hybrid discourse communities within schools, explicitly outlining communication and discourse norms, incorporating instruction on language, and advocating for teacher-driven research. Communication scholars such as Hall (1959) and Rogers & Steinfatt (1999) advocate for viewing culture as an integral facet of communication, emphasizing the importance of understanding specific cultural groups within their contextual framework. Hall (1959) posits the concept of "culture as communication." He is also cited by Rogers and Steinfatt (1999), who propose a connection between intercultural communication and public memory through the process of mediation and meaning making. Rogers and Steinfatt (1999) define "intercultural communication" as the exchange of information between individuals who hail from distinct cultural backgrounds. Public memory, as elucidated by Dickinson, Blair, and Ott (2010),
encompasses the shared beliefs about the past among members of a group, whether at the local community level or within the citizenry of a nation-state. This concept of public memory exerts influence over the narrative of history, the shaping of physical and conceptual spaces, and the formulation of rhetoric, all of which contribute to defining the notion of the "public" (Dickinson, Blair, and Ott; 2010, p.3). A pivotal element within the construct of public memory is the "remembering-forgetting" dialectic, a concept supported by Demo and Vivian (2012, p.20), which posits that memory is subject to the influence of visual and rhetorical dynamics. Moreover, the notion of place serves as the rhetorical backdrop against which public memory is molded, imbuing it with subjectivity and context.

2.1.5.3 Indigenous Research, Knowledge & Guam's Chamorro Inafa'maolek Framework; De-colonial Theory; Self-determination

In "Decolonizing Methodologies," Dr. Linda Tuhiwai-Smith (1999/2012) advocates for an Indigenous-centric approach to research. Embracing this perspective entails not only dismantling the colonial experience but also deconstructing personal experiences, particularly for an Indigenous Native academic and researcher of middle-class heritage, with a complex ethnic identity encompassing both Pacific Islander and Hispanic roots (Nabobo-Baba, Perez, 2010). This process involves staking a claim to a distinct "center" within Indigenous discourse, allowing Native communities to draw upon Indigenous scholarship as a foundation for interpreting the world through Native lenses, both in social and historical contexts.

Moreover, Tuhiwai-Smith (2012) advocates for The Indigenous Research Agenda, emphasizing processes of decolonization, transformation, mobilization, and healing as essential steps toward self-determination. This journey involves navigating through phases of survival,
recovery, and community and personal development (Tuhiwai-Smith, 2012, p. 121). Similarly, Unaisi Nabob-Baba, in her work "Knowing & Learning: An Indigenous Fijian Approach" (2006) asserts that Indigenous communities must actively reclaim their native knowledge through decolonizing practices, engaging not only the intellect but also the heart. Consequently, for the Indigenous peoples of Guahan (Guam), the homeland of the Chamorro Tao Tao Tano (people of the land), adopting an Indigenous epistemological framework is imperative for an education that critically engages with knowledge rooted in Indigenous philosophy. This approach is vital in supporting the processes necessary for survival and achieving self-determination, both at the individual and collective levels, particularly considering their status as non-self-governing peoples (Underwood, R.A. in Cunningham, 2001; Aguon, K. in Hattori, A, 2011).

This analysis extends the discussion of mediation as a sociological construct (Silverstone, 2005, p. 189), weaving in an Indigenous theoretical framework encapsulated by the concept of inafa’maolek. Rooted in Chamorro culture, inafa’maolek embodies the notion of fostering goodwill and harmony within social relations (guampedia.com). When applied as a foundational framework, inafa’maolek becomes an Indigenous ideology that encompasses the societal institutions of the Chamorro Tao Tao Tano, ultimately contributing to the capacity building necessary for self-determination. This distinctive approach holds the potential to shape the construction of research paradigms, setting it apart from the conventional positivist methodologies of social science research. Applying the inafa’maolek framework as a form of mediation provides a lens through which to examine social phenomena from an Indigenous perspective, akin to the Kaupapa Maori approaches (Tuhiwai-Smith, 2012). The development of this framework entails the identification and specification of key concepts that serve as indicators of variables. By doing
so, it has the potential to situate the center of Indigenous pre-contact Chamorro philosophy from Guam within Indigenous culturally sensitive communities. This delineation of existing knowledge about these relations enriches the process of conceptualization. Indigenous Pacific Islander-Chamorro scholars (Underwood, R.; Aguon, K., in Perez-Iyechad, L., 2009; and Hattori, A., 2011) advocate for the application of Indigenous Chamorro philosophy in education. As outlined earlier, the foundational tenets of inafa’mo’olek embody essential Indigenous-Oceania values, including Respetu’; Manginge; Mamahlao; Chenchule; Che’lu; and Påtgon.

These conceptualized dimensions exhibit varying degrees of influence based on relative social and cultural variables, offering a fertile ground for operationalizing in research design. The Indigenous Chamorro mediation sheds light on the concept of inafa’mo’olek as an ontological process of learning and being. Ontological approaches to curriculum development find support among post-modern curriculum theorists and Pacific educational scholars (Underwood, 1997; Aguon in Hattori, 2011; Thaman, K., 2012; Nabobo-Baba, U., 2007; Slabbert, J.A., & Hattingh, A., 2006).

Particularly, the process of inafa’mo’olek provides an Indigenous approach to ontological curriculum development in educational learning and meaning making within Indigenous communities. It serves as a model of Indigenous communication patterns rooted in unique ways of interacting, specific to each community. Fasset and Warren (2007) in *Critical Communication Pedagogy* advocate a similar stance to Pacific Scholars, endorsing ontological curriculum development as a means of decolonizing methodologies (Nabobo-Baba, 2009; Thaman, 2003; Tuhiwai-Smith). In doing so, Fasset and Warren align with the ideological foundations outlined by Tuhiwai-Smith (p.199-216, 2012), proposing that the notion of struggle is integral to emancipatory pedagogy and is an intrinsic part of the journey of identity development. As they
aptly put it, "Critical communication pedagogy is ultimately about the journey, rarely the destination" (p.164).

The analysis of Indigenous literature strongly suggests that each dimension of inafa’maolek offers a unique opportunity to advance these communication patterns. This can be achieved by formulating theoretical principles that can be applied to Indigenous mediation practices. By employing Underwood’s (2012) framework of pre-contact Chamorro beliefs, Indigenous-Pacific Native Studies can contribute significantly to the development of mediation theory, as well as to the establishment of an Indigenous Chamorro decolonizing research methodology. This endeavor necessitates the researcher's adept navigation of the interplay of meaning within these frameworks, particularly in relation to the experienced phenomena.

In further reflection on media literacy, this analysis amalgamates Indigenous epistemology, intercultural communication, and critical pedagogy within the context of Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML). This synthesis forms a robust foundation for the investigation and understanding of the pertinent subject matter.

**De-colonial Theory**

Mignolo (2011) meticulously traces the evolution of decolonial thinking, elucidating its epistemic transformation and its roots in relation to coloniality/modernity. His discourse culminates in a compelling call for an even deeper engagement with the decolonial paradigm. Central to this exposition is the assertion that decolonial thought finds its origins in the establishment of colonial thinking (p.45). Of paramount importance to this dissertation is the
concept of decoloniality, which Mignolo argues, boasts a longstanding tradition among decolonial scholars such as Quijano (1991). These scholars emphasized the critical significance of "epistemic de-linking." Mignolo identifies the inception of decolonial thought in the resistance to colonial impositions, as articulated by Indigenous voices in the writings of Waman Puma de Ayala and Ottabah Cugoano during the 1500s and 1700s, respectively. It is established that coloniality is an integral facet of modernity, leading Mignolo to posit that decoloniality similarly exists within modernity (p.46). Pertinently, decolonial thinking disrupts the logic of coloniality, as colonial ideology has seldom been subjected to rigorous scrutiny. By doing so, decolonial thought unveils the unintended consequences of modernity, which have been obscured by dominant Western knowledge and culture. Mignolo also distinguishes post-colonial theory or studies from the decolonial, underscoring that the former's genealogy is more rooted in French post-structuralism than in the rich tapestry of global decolonial thinking (p.46). Furthermore, Mignolo credits Anibal Quijano's "colonial matrix of power" as instrumental in driving de-colonial epistemic shifts.

Furthermore, Mignolo (2011) asserts that two of the earliest proponents of decolonial thought were Waman Puma de Ayala, known for his work "New Chronicle and Good Government" (1616), and Ottabah Cugoano, renowned for "Thoughts and Sentiments on the Evil of Slavery" (1787). Their ideas emerged prior to the advent of prevalent ideologies such as Christian, Liberal, and Socialist/Marxist underpinnings of imperial modernity. These thinkers laid the foundation for an alternative discourse stemming from the enduring impact of colonialism (p.48).

Mignolo aptly explicates the significance of the decolonial turn. A crucial insight gleaned from Mignolo's work, particularly relevant to this dissertation, pertains to the process of epistemological decolonization in the realm of intercultural communication. Building on Quijano's
framework, Mignolo asserts that the decolonization of the colonial matrix of power is imperative for the emergence of a novel intercultural communication paradigm (Mignolo, 2011; Quijano, 2000).

for an interchange of experiences and meanings, as the basis of another rationality which may legitimately pretend to some universality. Nothing is less rational, finally, then the pretension that the specific cosmic vision of a particular ethnie should be taken as universal rationality, even if such an ethnie is called Western Europe because this is to impose universalism on provincialism (p.48-49).

Mignolo aptly underscores the influence of mass media in propagating the rhetoric of modernity. In contrast, he contends that decolonization endeavors during the Cold War era—exemplified by movements in countries like Haiti, India, and the Congo—were ultimately undermined by their neocolonial character. As Mignolo elucidates, these movements altered the content of discourse without fundamentally reshaping its underlying terms. They preserved the prevailing conception of the state within the framework of a global capitalist economy (Mignolo, 2011). From Mignolo's vantage point, what is envisaged is a form of decolonization that aligns with pluri-versal objectives, as opposed to the pursuit of universality. Such an approach is geared towards empowering diverse modes of thinking.

Furthermore, it is imperative to emphasize that transitioning from one empire to another does not equate to genuine freedom. Mignolo astutely highlights this nuanced contradiction (Mignolo, 2011).

They were interpreted as processes of imperial liberation: in the nineteenth century, England and France supported the decolonization of the Spanish and Portuguese colonies; in the twentieth century, the United States supported the decolonization of the French and English colonies. In reality, it was a liberation from one empire only to fall into the hands of another, and was supported by independence movements in the name of freedom (p. 51). This observation holds resonance, given that the Island of Guam has grappled with a comparable governance situation. Rethinking an independence event within a revolutionary context entails a reevaluation of the Western notion of revolution for colonized peoples. This reevaluation involves
a deliberate effort to disentangle the logic of decolonizing independence from Western paradigms and experiences (Mignolo, 2011, p. 52).

Mignolo (2011) further emphasizes a crucial distinction between post-colonial and decolonial modes of thinking within the contexts of modern/postmodern critical theory as opposed to critical decolonial thinking. While Mignolo delineates this differentiation between critical theory and critical decolonial theory, this proposal contends for the development of an Indigenous decolonial theory firmly rooted in Native epistemology.

Mignolo further posits that the philosophical underpinnings of decolonial thinking were initially laid by Waman Puma and Ottabah Cugoano, who forged this alternative intellectual space. In this examination, Mignolo underscores the existence of an "epistemic colonial difference" between Waman Puma's communications to King Phillip III of Spain in the 16th century, characterized by his Indigenous Castilian perspective. This created a substantial gap in comprehension, akin to a metaphorical barrier, as the colonial audience lacked the frame of reference to grasp this critique of the colonial society in the new world.

Waman Puma advocates for a governance model characterized by multicultural representation. He critiques the amalgamation of Castilians, Africans, and Indigenous peoples (forming the mestizaje) through arguments rooted in the Christian paradigm and its implications on the colonial condition. His initial argument is epistemic and logical in nature. Waman Puma advances his critique of the colonial situation by applying Christian principles, despite acknowledging the presence of malevolent actors within this context. This quotation serves to provide crucial context to Waman
Puma's decolonial stance, which began more than four centuries ago. Waman Puma's vision of a "good government" is established as a realm of coexistence, aiming to transcend the colonial disparities (Ibid.). This concept strongly aligns with the purpose and theoretical framework of Indigenous mediation, particularly inafa'maolek, which is central to this study. Waman Puma's ideas find resonance in the Indigenous notion of Tawantinsuyu, effectively dislodging the King of Spain from the imperial coloniality of the Renaissance and replacing it with an Indigenous decolonial framework.

In a similar vein, Ottobah Cugoano, an emancipated slave, challenges the Enlightenment ideals in the latter half of the 1700s. He achieves this through his published work: "Thoughts and Sentiments on the Evil and Wicked Traffic of the Slavery and Commerce of the Human Species, Humbly Submitted to the Inhabitants of Great Britain, by Ottobah Cugoano, a Native of Africa" (1787, London). Mignolo's (2011) analysis sheds light on the contradiction exposed by Cugoano's work. It underscores how the disposability of both Indigenous and African peoples remained suppressed from the onset of coloniality up until the conclusion of World War II, effectively veiling this reality from the Western world.

Mignolo's argument is further substantiated by Aime' Cesaire's (1955) insights. Cesaire underscores the significance of adopting decolonial viewpoints in contrast to colonial perspectives. This sheds light on the contradictory nature of experiences faced by Pacific Islanders on Guam during the Japanese occupation, especially in how this event has been remembered in comparison to the Holocaust in Europe. Even though the U.S. absolved the Japanese empire from war crimes against the islanders who were interned in concentration camps prior to the U.S. reclaiming Guam, the ongoing struggle for successive generations of victims to receive rightful compensation is hindered by the public policy process in the U.S. Congress, which is hesitant to grant war claims
to Chamorros on Guam or to provide repatriation to families of African slaves. This observation holds pertinence for the goals of this study, which seeks to develop pedagogy and curriculum for a decolonizing media literacy. Notably, existing generic media education and critical media literacy programs for Indigenous communities have yet to incorporate this perspective.

Moreover, Mignolo (2011) introduces the concept of a "decolonial turn," while Cugoano gazes towards, speaks, and writes in a distinct direction, which Mignolo argues was always present at the inception of coloniality. The deconstruction of modern Indigenous-American identity constitutes a process, founded in this instance on the fundamental tenets of Decolonial Theory outlined in the Appendix, Figure 1.

**Self-determination**

Indigenous knowledge is deeply rooted in the concept of self-determination. It serves as the means for Indigenous communities to both reclaim and reconstruct their history, language, and cultural beliefs within educational curricula (Deyhle, Swisher, Stevens, & Galván, 2008; Tuhiwai-Smith, 1999). While ongoing debates persist among scholars regarding terminology like self-determination, inherent sovereignty, reserved rights, human rights, and treaty rights, it is indisputable that Indigenous peoples are entitled to all the forms of justice (McCarty et al., 2005, p. 2). Self-determination represents a significant political endeavor within Indigenous communities. However, when considered as a learning theory, it presents a contradiction to Indigenous epistemology. Ormrod (2012) delineates the social-cultural learning theory, incorporating perspectives from fields such as social cognitive theory and cognitive psychology, which hold relevance to this discussion.
This analysis posits that self-determination holds a crucial position in unlocking human potential within colonized environments, particularly in terms of enhancing student efficacy. Adopting a postcolonial/decolonial perspective on learning theory aims to delve into the fundamental factors and principles of communication within this context. It is proposed that self-determination, akin to Bandura's concept of Self Efficacy (1977), fosters an environment where parental involvement and the valuing of education offer an opportunity to ameliorate the circumstances of underprivileged individuals.

As previously discussed, Linda Tuhiwai-Smith emphasizes in "Decolonizing Methodologies" (2012) the importance of the Indigenous Research Agenda, which highlights processes of decolonization, transformation, mobilization, and healing, ultimately leading towards self-determination. This journey involves stages of survival, recovery, and the development of our communities and states of being (p. 121).

A point of contention arises within self-determination discourse, prompting a deeper inquiry into the multifaceted nature of self-determination as a Learning Theory vis-à-vis the pursuit of self-determination leading to a self-governing political state. This inquiry necessitates an examination of how self-determination is actualized in contexts involving non-self-governing subjects in relation to the state, as opposed to scenarios involving self-governing states and their subjects.

In the context of critical indigenous qualitative research, Bishop (2005, cited in Denzin et al., 2008) contends that when employing a kaupapa Maori research approach designed by and for Maori communities, autonomy is operationalized as self-determination. According to Durie (1995), self-determination encapsulates a sense of Maori ownership and active control over the future (Bishop, 2005, p.440). However, Bishop posits that self-determination is a relative
concept, which may be perplexing to non-indigenous individuals. She further emphasizes that it does not imply non-indigenous individuals should abstain from engaging with indigenous communities. Rather, it calls for those who are not of indigenous heritage to allow native voices to emerge on their own terms.

A pivotal distinction in the definition of self-determination arises within an Indigenous-Interinstitutional relational context of interdependence. As Bishop (2005) elucidates, "The indigenous position on self-determination therefore in practice means that individuals should be free to determine their own goals and make sense of the world in their own culturally generated manner" (p.440). Young (2004, cited in Denzin et al., 2008) suggests that this is achieved, as articulated by Smith (1992/1997), through "a cycle of conscientization, resistance, and transformational praxis," which is emblematic of indigenous community struggles. What is proposed is an educational research framework towards Decolonizing Media Literacy. The foregoing theoretical underpinnings lay the foundation essential for comprehending the organization and analysis of the ensuing literature, which encompasses the following domains:

- Civics: Education, Media, Engagement/Participation & Pedagogy; Public Administration, Policy-making processes, and Gilley's Colonial Framework; Social Justice, Policy, & Policy Elite
- Re-thinking Critical Media Literacy; Intercultural Communication & Public Memory
- Indigenous Research, Knowledge & Guam's Chamorro Inafa'maolek Framework; Decolonial Theory; Self-determination

This framework represents an educational research endeavor aimed at Decolonizing Media Literacy.
2.5 Communications is how we get there.

The field of communication studies boasts a rich epistemological tradition focused on the examination of behavior, technology, advertising, culture, and mass media, often categorized into seven distinct traditions: socio-psychological, cybernetic, rhetorical, semiotic, socio-cultural, critical, phenomenological, and ethics (Barrera, 2014; Williams, 1973). It is acknowledged that scholars may have varying perspectives on the terminology used here, as some may perceive communication to fall into one category or another. This section of the review places particular emphasis on media studies, interculturalism, public memory, and media literacy.

The fields of media, cultural, and critical studies are instrumental in shaping the development of Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML). This section dissects the intricate relationship between media, politics, and society, delving into aspects of power dynamics, class dynamics, and public policy. Additionally, it delves into the intersection of culture and pedagogy, as well as the intricate tapestry of race and gender politics within the context of media studies and education. This section also addresses the essence of approaching media with a critical lens, as well as the practical application of media literacy in contemporary contexts (Silverstone, 1999; Kellner, 2010; Hammer & Kellner, 2009; Macedo & Steinberg, 2007).

Silverstone (1999) presents a compelling argument in favor of examining the media. His insights, though articulated prior to the explosive growth of the internet and new media, remain highly pertinent. They underscore the significance of media as a form of experiential knowledge, a repository of common societal norms, a platform of trust-building, a tool for mediation, a shaper of cultural identity through technology, a vessel of collective memory, and a terrain of political discourse in the realm of new media.
Kellner (2010) further bolsters the case for media literacy by delving into the intersection of U.S. politics and cinema, with a particular focus on the Bush-Cheney era. He astutely examines how both domestic and international political matters are portrayed in Hollywood, shedding light on the ideological divides between conservative and Obama-era policies. Kellner's analysis of film not only enriches our understanding of media literacy, but also advances the pedagogical application of dissecting institutions, cultures, and films as a form of praxis in media education.

2.5.1 Propaganda

Hammer and Kellner (2009), in their work "Media/Cultural Studies: Critical Approaches," delve into the intricacies of Media/Cultural Studies, encompassing Teaching, Doing, and exploring Emergent Digital Cultures. They advocate for empowering students and citizens to engage in critical analyses, interpretations, and reconstructions of their culture and society. This approach is pivotal in discerning the interplay between the development of media literacy skills and the influence of media as a societal institution on politics. The text also illuminates the historical lineage of communications and media studies, drawing connections to the development of mainstream mass communications research in the United States, influenced by government propaganda, corporate interests, and state public relations research.

Stanley (2015) extends our comprehension of propaganda in contemporary contexts, highlighting its potent role within a democratic framework. He defines political propaganda as the strategic deployment of a political idea against itself, rooted in the notion of flawed ideology. The perpetuation of such fallacious ideologies involves a protracted process of acquiring power and control over the dissemination of information within educational and media spheres. Stanley
contends that propaganda, through flawed ideologies, robs individuals of their consciousness while suppressing collective and individual well-being. This approach to propaganda obstructs the very epistemic foundations of democracy. Stanley raises probing questions about whether the United States can truly be considered a functioning democracy, suggesting that propaganda has a detrimental influence on democratic deliberation. While this dissertation acknowledges Stanley's critical perspective on propaganda and democracy, it contends that these manipulative strategies warrant public comprehension. This understanding equips citizens with the knowledge and skills to critically assess flawed ideologies as forms of hegemony. Hence, when employed judiciously and for the right purposes, propaganda can serve as a constructive force in a democratic society.

These principles of propaganda find their roots in the seminal work of Edward Bernays, often regarded as the pioneer of propaganda within the realm of public relations (1928). Bernays contends that a well-informed public leads to a more effective use of propaganda. He also underscores the pivotal role of educators, who serve as mediators between academic ideas and the public. According to Bernays, teachers hold a dual role as educators and practitioners of propaganda, despite the undervaluation of their profession in society. To rectify this situation, Bernays suggests that educators take proactive steps to elevate the status of the educational profession. Similarly, Rev. Martin Luther King (1954) extols the virtues of propaganda. King's positive perspective on propaganda is corroborated by W.E.B. Du Bois's call for African Americans to harness the power of propaganda as, emotional appeals to win the respect, empathy, and understanding of whites. Du Bois clearly uses "propaganda" in a neutral sense, rather than a pejorative sense, and calls for propaganda to be used as a weapon for Black liberation. Liberatory propaganda of this kind does not aim at the truth. But it nevertheless seems acceptable, and even at certain moments necessary, as a method of realizing those ideals in states that follow liberal democratic ideals. The difficulty of the topic of propaganda lies not just in describing its
nature and efficacy. An account of propaganda must also explain when it undermines liberal democratic ideals and when it supports them. (p.38, Stanley 2015)

Propaganda is key to a pedagogy for decolonizing media literacy which produces counter-hegemonic narratives for self-determination and empowering civic agency. In addition, it is crucial to recognize that Anglo-American and global communications/media theory and research were fundamentally shaped by the intellectual milieu of U.S. public, private, and elite circles in the aftermath of World War II. This intellectual evolution was in continuation of the ideas initiated by Hanno Hardt of the Chicago School. Deliberate consideration was given to mass communications in the context of evolving democratic processes, as the society transitioned from a post-WW2 industrial model to one characterized by a consumer-driven citizenry and the pursuit of the "American Dream". Notably, it was during the World War I era that social theory and behaviorism in mass communications were employed to formulate propaganda strategies, encompassing advertising and public relations, aimed at garnering public support for the war endeavor. This historical account elucidates the emergence of public information and public opinion within the realm of mass communications as a burgeoning domain of public relations practice.

"Who managed to hone and develop revolutionary and highly sophisticated techniques of influencing public opinion" (xvii).

The text proceeds to delineate two pivotal issues intertwined with mass communications, namely, the populace and democracy, which encompass: 1. the populace itself; and 2. the role of the media. Noam Chomsky draws upon the contributions of Edward Bernays and Walter Lippman, esteemed as progenitors of public relations, propaganda, and public opinion. Specifically, about the populace, Bernays introduces the concept of "engineering of consent," which encapsulates the deliberate shaping and manipulation of public sentiment to influence behavior and attitudes.
"To describe the importance of manipulating the public mind to support the status quo, and advanced ways to do this that included government policies, using advertising and commercial interests, and promoting social conformity" (p. xvii).

In this same vein, Lippman refers to the public as

"Ignorant herds", "The public must be put in its place...That goal could be achieved in part through the 'the manufacture of consent...'. This revolution in the 'practice of democracy should enable a 'specialized class' to manage the 'common interests' that 'very largely elude public opinion entirely" (Chomsky, 2003: 6, In Ibid.).

These perspectives provide a theoretical framework for understanding the relationship between mass media, social cohesion, and the principles of liberal democracy. Furthermore, Lasswell's conceptualization (1927, as cited in Defleur and Ball-Rokeach, 1989) of the "Bullet or Hypodermic Theory" addresses the notion that media exerts a direct and immediate influence on social behavior. This theory gained prominence during World Wars I and II, as the propaganda role of the media became increasingly evident. It sparked extensive debates concerning the media's impact on a wide array of social issues, spanning from crime rates to the rise in adolescent pregnancies (Defleur & Ball-Rokeach, 1989, p. xviii).

These historical connections, though often omitted from mainstream U.S. media education due to their politically charged nature and the tendency to exclusively associate propaganda with the WWII-Nazi era as inherently undemocratic, play a pivotal role in informing the development of media literacy pedagogy, especially for Indigenous and minority populations. Notably, scholars from the Frankfurt School were among the first to witness and analyze the propaganda machinery employed by both the Nazis and the U.S., leading to the inception of critical communication studies. Figures like T.W. Adorno, Horkheimer, Lowenthal, Fromm, and Marcuse from the
Frankfurt School articulated the concept of the "culture industry," highlighting its role in exerting social control, manipulation, and propagating ideology in the context of corporate capitalism. Their work also laid the foundation for critical theories pertaining to consumer society, rooted in Marxist principles.

An additional influential figure in the field of communication studies is Marshall McLuhan, associated with the "Toronto School". McLuhan’s seminal work (1964) introduced the groundbreaking concept that "the medium is the message", underscoring the profound influence of communication forms on the structuring of society (McLuhan, 1964, p. xxii). In contrast, Baudrillard (1994) presents a new theoretical framework that challenges conventional perspectives on media, especially pertinent to the contemporary media landscape explored in this dissertation.

In the era of ubiquitous social networking sites, the axiom "the medium is the message" assumes renewed significance, given the ongoing political, social, and economic transformations. Additionally, Noam Chomsky and Edward Herman's seminal research in the 1960s and 1970s delved into the political economy of media, investigating topics such as media imperialism, ownership concentration, and the perils to democracy posed by corporate dominance over the media (Chomsky & Herman, 1988, p. xxii-xxiii). Their critique of cultural imperialism and the media's role in disseminating Western culture globally holds relevance to the present study. This dissertation endeavors to establish transdisciplinary connections between the realms of media/communications and cultural studies to formulate a pedagogy for decolonizing media literacy.

2.6 Summary
The second section of this literature review provides a methodological framework to approach our epistemological objective, which will be further elaborated in the subsequent sections. The field of communications serves as the connective link, establishing a bridge between the realms of public administration and educational foundations. Concurrently, examinations of intercultural communications, public memory, and community-based problem-solving methodologies contribute essential insights to the ensuing chapters. Furthermore, the literature reveals both disparities and parallels when contemplating communications in conjunction with critical pedagogy for critical communication studies. A crucial nexus underscores the necessity of evaluating the field of media literacy and its correlation to theoretical underpinnings as an ideological construct within national and state-level education. Notably, the reevaluation of media literacy pedagogy engages with dialectics at a meta-theoretical level, enabling the deconstruction of the Western-centric epistemological origins of critical media literacy. This underscores the significance of incorporating Indigenous knowledge for this purpose, a facet that will be explored in the subsequent sections.

2.7 Implications for Methodology-Modes of Inquiry

2.7.1 Communications Research, Intercultural Communications, Healthy Communities & Pedagogy

In the realm of communications research, an important historical division emerged in the 1940s, distinguishing between "administrative research" and the "critical school." The latter, championed by the Frankfurt School Institute for Social Research, directed its attention towards
understanding the societal impacts of media, particularly on values such as individuality, critical thinking, education, and democracy (Hammer & Kellner, 2009, p. xix). Conversely, Paul Lazarsfeld's research was primarily oriented towards established media, corporate, and government institutions. His approach involved the application of scientific methods to assess audience preferences, media usage patterns, demographic characteristics of media consumers across various platforms, as well as the examination of existing media organizations (p. xviii, Hammer & Kellner, 2009). In addition to his contributions in these areas, Lazarsfeld's work extended to advertising and consumer behavior, the study of public opinion formation, and an analysis of voter behavior in political campaigns. Within the scope of this dissertation, Lazarsfeld's "two-step flow model" served as a foundational concept, which would later be further developed by Everett Rogers in his seminal work on the Diffusion of Innovation (Rogers, 1983).

"Where media provide information, but opinion leaders shape and disseminate it and are the main forces in disseminating information" (p. xix, Hammer & Kellner, 2009).

Distinct communication strategies are presented herein to underscore the importance of teaching and learning how to enact meaningful change through individual and group communication practices that foster social justice within institutional contexts (Briskin et al., 2009; Kidder, 2009; Kahane, 2010; Pascale, Sternin, & Sternin, 2010; Singhal & Dura, 2009; Lipmanowicz & McCandless, 2013). A recurring theme across these readings suggests the power of active listening and creating space for diverse voices to collaboratively address complex societal issues. Briskin et al. (2009) argues for the concept of "collective wisdom," rooted in Indigenous communication patterns, which promotes unity while honoring individual voices within group dynamics, particularly benefiting the most marginalized communities. Expanding on this perspective, Kidder (2009) draws from real-life experiences with Dr. Paul Farmer, a distinguished
physician and anthropologist dedicated to serving patients in Haiti and other impoverished regions worldwide. Kidder posits that true power emanates from a place of love (Kahane, 2010). While conventional power dynamics often manifest in detrimental and dehumanizing ways, Kahane advocates for a constructive and humanizing approach to wielding power, effecting change at the personal, group, and community levels. Similarly, Lipmanowicz and McCandless (2013) offer specific pedagogical approaches aimed at deconstructing institutional norms that perpetuate oppressive environments. They advocate for interpersonal and small-group communication practices that cultivate positive and liberating interactions, ultimately fostering communication pathways conducive to collaborative problem-solving (e.g., Didactic Action Dialogue). In alignment with these perspectives, Positive Deviance (PD) practitioners (Pascale, Sternin, & Sternin, 2010; Singhal & Dura, 2009) propose PD as a research methodology in communication. This approach unlocks the potential of local problem-solvers, as opposed to conventional methods where external experts impose solutions onto complex community challenges.

Expanding on the foundational works of Freire and Giroux, Fasset and Warren (2007) posit that the concept of critical communication pedagogy serves as a cornerstone in delineating critical intercultural communication studies as applied within educational contexts. The pivotal aspect of this analysis lies in defining what critical communication is not, while also emphasizing the interdisciplinary nature of communication and education in the development and research of pedagogy. In their exposition titled "Naming a Critical Communication Pedagogy," Fasset and Warren deconstruct ten core commitments that bind critical communication educators. Commitment 1 underscores that identity is constructed through communication. This commitment challenges positivist approaches to communication research, which tend to draw comparisons and make inferences based on stereotypical communication patterns. Such methods erroneously
portray minority populations, highlighting a significant distortion within critical paradigms. Critical communicators, on the other hand, seek to apprehend identity from a post-modern standpoint, reframing manipulation in communication as representative of social and cultural paradigms that perpetuate dominance over others. Embracing the positivist view of identity and communication further blurs the delineation between identity, power dynamics, and cultural influences. When scrutinizing these fractures, critical communicators regard the liminal spaces between the identities of both student and teacher as an evolving process—a continuous journey rather than a fixed destination. Empirical approaches persist in objectifying identity, necessitating critical educators to confront their own complicity in oppressive systems, ultimately paving the way for a liberated approach to pedagogy. In Commitment 8, critical communication educators wholeheartedly adopt pedagogy and research as praxis. Fasset (2007) delves into the concept of Freirean Praxis,

Critical communication pedagogy is epistemological. It is also axiological; it is a value system, an ethic, a way of situating oneself in relation to another...is ontological; it is and must be a way of being, (p.110).

Similarly, Freire (1970/2003) contends that "critical communication pedagogy is our ontological vocation; we live it because it is in our efforts that we find hope, meaning, and possibility" (p. XX).

2.7.2 Indigenous Mode of Inquiry: Navigating Indigenous Methodologies for Mediation

This section delves further into the incorporation of Indigenous culture within education research, addressing the roles of the researcher, epistemology, methodology, and the inafa'maolek research methodology. The impact of these events and dynamics on an institutional level entail examining dialectical variations in future visions of students: prioritizing corporations versus
public life, weighing market values against democratic values, and considering students as citizens versus educational consumers. To endorse the commodification of public education with the aim of bolstering these perspectives, one potential avenue involves private fundraising initiatives to support the development of curriculum models. These models would recenter discourse and actions in alignment with progressive curriculum scholars, emphasizing educational research methodologies and curriculum studies focused on internationalization and interculturalization (Connely, 2007).

In foregrounding alternative perspectives and giving voice to marginalized groups, this exploration places class struggle and ideology at the forefront of the discussion. A crucial aspect of this preliminary scholarly examination involves providing a concise historical overview of critical pedagogy, emphasizing its capacity to transcend prevailing neoliberal and conservative ideologies while aligning with a leftist socialist agenda focused on political consciousness (McLaren, 2006). In the vein of Paulo Freire and Henry Giroux, the establishment of a democratic center for "active agency" becomes pivotal in fostering social justice within a post-colonial framework. It is imperative to acknowledge that coloniality persists as an enduring philosophical, political, and social phenomenon, necessitating redress. Moreover, the development of a voice for the subaltern within their own land necessitates the application of a critical-turned-decolonial theoretical framework, which guides analyses by recognizing Indigenous Pacific Islander communication patterns (Spivak, 1988).

These diverse conceptual frameworks propose an Indigenous mediation of meaning in communication, as perceived by a Native individual scrutinizing the modern "dominator" as the "other" (Silverstone 1999/2005). Within this context, studies advocate for discourse along a new
center. The reconfiguration of Pacific education for Oceanic peoples entails the formulation, navigation, and negotiation of critical pedagogy, ultimately culminating in a decolonial approach to education that fosters solidarity in the pursuit of a postcolonial democratic citizenry (Tuhiwai-Smith 1999/2012; Diaz & Kauanui, 2001; Nabobo-baba, 2009; Rossatto & Allen, 2009; Freire, 1970; Giroux, 1992; McLaren, 2006).

Communication patterns hold the potential to signify an ontological emphasis on human existence, indicating a set of values integrated into the process of meaning-making through discourse. Establishing a course from the initial point to the culmination involves the identification of a fixed reference point, a foundational Indigenous communication pattern. In their work "Native Pacific Cultural Studies on the Edge" (2002), Diaz and Kauanui elucidate this concept within the context of navigating complex issues at the intersections of native studies, Pacific studies, and cultural studies. By employing a navigational framework to delve into the theoretical foundations of academic scholarship, the authors propose a strategic approach for Indigenous Native studies. This approach brings issues of colonization to the forefront, thereby creating an academic space for Indigenous scholars to construct a native identity that counters notions of diaspora, exile, and the post-colonial context.

At the core of understanding lies the concept of "navigating," which brings forth perspectives rooted in the dominance of Western European knowledge, particularly within the realms of anthropology. This assertion urges an examination from Indigenous vantage points, emphasizing Native authenticity, authority, and offering an alternative to the notion of "inventing tradition" as a source of "authentic" knowledge. The process of analysis, guided by the method of "triangulation," serves as the foundation for establishing the relationship between the elemental forces of heaven, sea, and land. A Native approach to analysis and politics instills a distinct social
cadence in the process, commencing with a consideration of the starting point, culminating in the destination, and incorporating a guiding marker to stay on course. This methodology empowers an Indigenous researcher to chart a course toward institutional reform in education. For example, within the socio-historical context of education in Guam, Indigenous narratives are enriched by the contributions of Dr. Robert A. Underwood in "American Education and the Acculturation of Chamorros on Guam" (1987). This seminal dissertation delves into the social constructs of American education on Guam prior to World War II. It sheds light on a history of cultural colonialism, with education serving as a pivotal mechanism. The deployment of religious, familial, governmental, and media institutions to "Americanize" Indigenous Chamorros on Guam signifies a significant facet of colonial administration in education, stretching back from the Spanish colonial era to the U.S. Navy's oversight of earlier educational systems, resulting in a population that was, regrettably, under-educated, possessing only a fourth-grade level of proficiency—sufficient solely for deciphering governmental memorandums for civil guidance.

Applying the navigational approach to educational reform in Guam, the discourse among colonial educational reformists in this Pacific community revolves around recent curriculum and instructional developments addressed by the 31st Guam Legislature. This notably encompasses the recent policy directive mandating the Guam Department of Education (GDOE) to phase out the dual tracking system for secondary students, which previously delineated vocational and college-bound paths. In lieu of this curriculum structure, federal authorities mandated education administrators, policy boards, and policymakers to institutionalize the "College and Career Readiness Act." Enacted into law on January 14, 2012, this legislation integrates academic curriculum with career technical education within the foundational curricula of GDOE.
Persisting with the endeavor to "reform" educational curriculum from colonial, political, and capitalist-conservative standpoints perpetuate an educational milieu where students internalize specific values rooted in ideological consciousness. To counteract this, a prevailing narrative of genuine "reform" charts a course oriented towards achieving "holistic" educational advancement as the ultimate objective. For instance, in 2011, GDOE released SAT-10 academic assessment results that disclosed a mere 10-12% of students demonstrating basic proficiency in English and mathematics. Within the existing parameters of "adequate education," reform measures appear deficient. Consequently, Indigenous educators bear the responsibility of ensuring that Native students enter an educational environment that nurtures a spirit of inquiry, supplanting positivist notions of objectivity and subjectivity. This shift also involves the transformation of political passivity into active and engaged civic-political consciousness. Crucially, effecting these changes necessitates a nuanced understanding of how, when, and with whom to negotiate—and for what ultimate purposes.

At this juncture, the central thrust of the analysis revolves around the delineation of learning theories that underpin a pedagogical framework for decolonizing communication within educational contexts. This is achieved through an examination of the contributions of eminent sociocultural learning theorists in the realm of education, namely Cannella and Viruru (2003), Greene (1994), Habermas (1987), and Tuhiwai-Smith (2012). Moreover, Groppo (2005) and Luke (2005) posit that the contemporary surge in exploration and concerted efforts to engage with Indigenous knowledge systems can be attributed to Indigenous peoples' response to the homogenizing influences of globalization. In essence, it reflects a deliberate turn inward, a reclaiming of what is inherently theirs—embracing their cultures, modes of cognition, epistemological frameworks, pedagogies, and knowledge processes. As articulated by Albert
Wendt, "We have survived through our own efforts and ingenuity. We have indigenized much that was colonial or foreign to suit ourselves" (Nabobo-Baba, 2009, p. 138).

David Hanlon, in his chapter titled "The End of History for the Edge of Paradise?" from the book "Remaking Micronesia: Discourses over Development in a Pacific Territory, 1944-1982," posits that we currently inhabit what Nabobo-Baba identifies as a neocolonial milieu, "one where the systems of coloniality remain, the subjects the same, and those exercising power of discourse find ourselves at the center exercising dominion over 'other' periphery" (Personal Interview, 2011).

Similarly, in her examination of Indigenous Bolivian Rhetorician Evo Morales, Tricia Naputi contends that Indigenous academic activists critique the state of indigenous education and highlight the intellectual marginalization that consigned indigenous education to obscurity [sic]" (Morales 2006, trans. Tiara Naputi, paragraph 35). This underscores that in the absence of illumination, rural schools are figuratively blinded, consigned to the shadows of the periphery, excluded from the monocular gaze of the West (Naputi, 2009, p. 89). This analysis of the Bolivian "Both Eye Theory" contributes to our comprehension of the contemporary underpinnings of education and coloniality within a context of hybridity, signifying the capacity to traverse boundaries of socio-cultural constructs, akin to Freire's concept of border-crossing (Giroux, 1992), Anzaldua's Frontera (1987), and the notion of transfronteriz@s (Esquinca, 2012, 2014).

This section of the review aims to comprehend learning theory from an Indigenous perspective. As an Indigenous Pacific Islander hailing from the Western Pacific Island of Guam, the author approaches the colonizer's academy as an Indigenous researcher with the aspiration of
dismantling dominant ideologies. Guam is among several Un-incorporated U.S. Territories recognized by the United Nations as colonized lands and peoples, designated as "Non-Self-Governing Territories" (United Nations). This positioning remains crucial in formulating a pertinent theoretical framework employing hermeneutic inquiry. According to Habermas (1971), "hermeneutic inquiry" reimagines the process of knowing through subjectivity, communicative action, hermeneutic sciences, and mutual perspectives. Drawing from Linda Tuhiwai Smith's examination of Indigenous Pacific Islander-Maori thought, an Agenda for Indigenous Research toward self-determination is proposed (1999). Within this framework, the elements of healing, decolonization, transformation, and mobilization appear to encompass varying degrees of peripherality around the central function of self, analogized as a tide's ebb and flow along the shore. The peripheral subjects of analysis commence with development, progress to recovery, and extend further outward to survival. Each facet of this framework embodies distinct dynamics for thoughtful consideration; any learning theory or pedagogy endeavoring to integrate Indigenous knowledge for the betterment of the community must encompass Tuhiwai-Smith's Indigenous research agenda. The aim of the proposed framework is to propel self-determination within Native communities.

Navigation, as an Indigenous concept, holds potential for advancing learning theory tailored for Indigenous students. Diaz & Kauanui (2002) delve into the triangulation of ocean, heaven, and land forces to elucidate a Native-style approach to analysis and a mode or rhythm of politics. This metaphor, rooted in the maritime traditions of Oceanic peoples, encapsulates a profound history of Indigenous expression. The context of the discussion revolves around the division between subjects of anthropology and Native Studies. The Natives serve as the backdrop, charting traditional courses for contributions to a far-reaching vision of cultural studies.
Leveraging Indigenous Pacific epistemology, Diaz (2011) applies Indigenous Sea Faring knowledge to conceptualize diaspora, exile, Indigenous identity, and articulation. These ruptures and attachments give rise to articulations that serve as a foundation against the dominant discourse on the supposed "invention of tradition" by natives. This groundbreaking work establishes academic terrain for an evolving sense of Indigenous identity amid nationalist agendas, globalization, neocolonial, and postcolonial conditions. In Diaz & Kauanui, James Clifford assesses [Stuart] Hall's "politics and theory of articulation" as applied to Pacific Indigeneity. Here, sweeping historical forces find articulation, informing curriculum development that oscillates between traditional and contemporary themes (e.g., political: Christianity, sovereignty, nationalism, and independence). Merging Indigenous-centered content with Native thought and English expression forms the basis for culture-transforming pedagogies that consider these articulations as themes for student engagement and enlightening learning experiences. Clifford's articulations regarding Pacific Indigeneity possess the ability to establish connections, acting as joints that link, detach, and recombine (link, delink, relink). The development of Indigenous learning theory centers on mediation frameworks within the field of theorists (sociocultural, cognitive, behavioral, etc.). Navigating this terrain requires an integral multidisciplinary communication approach.

Understanding one's temporal and spatial context, as well as discerning the epistemological stance of the researcher, are pivotal factors in meaning-making, rooted in Native knowledge. Diaz (2011) employs the metaphor to elucidate the connection between the Native odyssey with the ocean and discourse theory. In parallel, Grant & Giddings (2002) employ an Indigenous Pacific Islander Maori framework of whakapapa (genealogy) to provide structure to social science methodologies.
poststructuralism rests on an assumption that no-one can stand outside the traditions or discourses of their time. For this reason, "the search for grand narratives will be replaced by more local, small-scale theories fitted to specific problems and specific situations" (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994: 11).

As Stuart Hall suggests, audiences often attribute meanings subjectively. Grant & Giddings further affirm this by emphasizing that "meanings are multiple, unstable, and open to interpretation" (McCouat & Peile, 1995: 10). Poststructuralist investigations hinge on interlinked theories of discourse, power, and subjectivity. Discourses, in a Foucauldian poststructuralist context, are defined as "interrelated systems of social meaning that systematically shape the objects they refer to" (Foucault, 1974: 49). Grant & Giddings elaborate, stating that "discourse theory asserts that truth is a socially constructed historical concept which gives rise to specific categories and entities that collectively regulate the boundaries of what can be conceived, thought, desired, articulated, and ultimately, accomplished" (Cocks, 1989: 105).

Stuart Hall (1973) introduces a "New Theory of Communication" that challenges long-standing assumptions about the production, circulation, and reception of media messages. In this paradigm, mass communication involves three fundamental components: meaning, message, and audience. Hall contends that meaning is not fixed by the sender, the message is never entirely transparent, and the audience plays an active role in the interpretation process. Wood (2003) aptly observes, "Pacific Islands research that relies on Euro-American paradigms to answer these questions tends to perpetuate Euro-American dominance in the region, even when the intention is antihegemonic." Wood (2003) further delves into an analysis of Tuhiwai-Smith,

What Smith declared for herself and for other Maori is true as well for many other Native peoples in Oceania: "we have a different epistemological tradition which frames the way we see the world, the way we organize ourselves in it, the questions we ask and the solutions which we seek (Tuhiwai-Smith, 1999, p. 187-188 In Wood, 2003). The audience actively engages in the process of meaning-making, which is facilitated by cultural meaning frameworks that are rooted in epistemology.
Gegeo and Watson-Gegeo, Meyer, and Salmond (as cited in Wood, 2003, p. 355) outline key characteristics of "studies of Native Oceanic Epistemologies," providing an illustration of how Indigenous epistemology informs the process of meaning construction. In the realm of classic human communication, this aligns with the concept of high-context culture, wherein messages carry implicit meanings that are not explicitly stated. Therefore, context plays a pivotal role in determining meaning. Simultaneously, Meyer suggests that attempting to universalize any specific Oceanic epistemology or regional epistemology proves to be a challenging endeavor (Meyer, as cited in Wood, 2003, p. 356).

Diaz (2011) further expounds on the overarching objective of framing this knowledge as pedagogy, emphasizing its role in fostering a sense of democratic citizenship identity. This stands as a countermeasure to the prevalent colonial political status that prevails in many Pacific territories, signifying self-determination as a political endeavor within Indigenous contexts. However, it's important to note that as a learning theory, self-determination may appear at odds with Indigenous-based epistemology. Ormrod (2012) provides a visual representation of social-cultural learning theory, encompassing various perspectives in the field, including social cognitive theory and cognitive psychology. The question of whether a postcolonial approach to learning theory challenges contemporary perspectives or offers an alternative narrative to socioculturalism remains a subject warranting further investigation. Moreover, there arises the need to probe into the relevance of multicultural curriculum design. Questions concerning the significance of interculturalism and how these concepts may either foster or impede cultural imperialism in educational settings, within the school environment, and in the broader community, remain pertinent areas for scholarly inquiry.
This analysis posits that in colonized settings, the realization of human potential hinges on the concept of self-determination, which is instrumental in enhancing student efficacy. A postcolonial lens on learning theory seeks to delve into the foundational elements or principles of communication within this framework. It is proposed that self-determination, akin to Bandura's notion of Self Efficacy (1977), is nurtured through active parental engagement and a deep appreciation for education. This dynamic presents an avenue for ameliorating the circumstances of underprivileged individuals. The subsequent discussion will delve into the intricate interplay between identity and mediation.

The analysis commences with a deconstruction of the veneer of hybridity, laying bare the neocolonial foundations wherein Indigenous groups exert dominion over their counterparts. Nabobo-Baba (2006) delineates the dual dynamics within Oceanic society—the Insider and the Outsider identities—epitomizing the Indigenous Fijian framework applied in this examination. This framework gives rise to the Insider assuming the role of the Outsider, and vice versa, within a culturally imperialistic intercultural paradigm. Furthermore, it juxtaposes the peripheral Insider as Outsider within Insider social circles.

In alignment with Hall's discourse on Cultural Identity—Towards the Global Post-Modern (1996), post-modern identity is characterized by its fluidity, as culture melds into a unified notion tailored for ethnic marketability and commodification within the global milieu. Part of identity construction entails comprehending one's placement within a Native community—whether as an insider, outsider, or a hybrid of the two. Drawing parallels between Hall’s global identity perspective and the Indigenous peoples of the Pacific, Baba contends that globalization may offer advantages to Indigenous groups by enabling their participation in the knowledge economy. This
hinges on research that identifies the requisite resources, skills, and knowledge, along with the equitable distribution of the acquired knowledge (Baba, 2004: 98, as cited in Philp, 2009, pp. 104-105). Moreover, Naputi (2009) connects Indigenous discourse environments in neoliberal contexts to overarching themes of ideology, drawing on Stuart Hall (1992). This correlation underscores the interplay between mediation, discourse contexts, and ideology. Consequently, in building on these foundations for the ensuing analyses, Silverstone (2005) underscores the premise that mediation is intimately linked to the Pacific Island of Guam and its history of colonization. This assertion aligns with Underwood's (1987) argument advocating for the colonizing roles upheld by institutions such as education, government, and media in society and culture.

The literature analyses above encompass critical discussions on the sociocultural underpinnings of education, Indigenous identity, and critical pedagogy. These focal points underscore that the epistemological and ontological perspectives originating from Oceania possess the capacity to facilitate self-determination as both a learning theory and a socio-political endeavor for justice. Furthermore, this Indigenous-oriented approach emphasizes the importance and urgency of decolonial examinations of meaning-making, leveraging the cultural insights gleaned from Pacific Native studies, applicable not only in the context of the U.S.-Mexico border, but also in broader contexts worldwide.

2.7.3 Pedagogy of the Self-determined & Remembrance

This section within the literature review seeks to examine commonalities, distinctions, and contradictions, which can inform future research design and contribute to the development of a new pedagogical framework.
Commonalities

Giroux (2014) contends that the United States is composed of hyper-mediated communities, where violence and military dominance are often upheld as ethical imperatives necessary for establishing a particular social order that primarily benefits a specific societal class. He envisions a cultural remedy that employs innovative media practices as a potential key to unlock the transformative potential of a grassroots social movement, countering the prevailing hegemony of mega-corporate media institutions. Angela Davis serves as an embodiment of this idea, skillfully combining civic engagement and critical pedagogy within the framework of self-determination. As Giroux emphasizes, "She has navigated through challenging and ever-shifting circumstances to underscore the significance of education as a fundamental element in nurturing self-governance" (Giroux, 2014, p. 205). Giroux characterizes Davis as a Freedom Fighter who has aligned herself with the oppressed, implying that social institutions (e.g., media, government, commerce, and policy) are not merely part of the problem but can be harnessed as tools of liberation when wielded by the marginalized masses. Any pursuit of critical literacy aimed at comprehending the world necessitates pedagogy that compels educators to empower themselves in voicing a well-articulated dissent against a system of governance and society that seeks to cultivate a public predisposed to exploitation and social control.

For instance, scholars investigating the role of media in society and in the lives of students may explore strategies for developing a counter-hegemonic approach to "Organizing for Forgetting" social movements, as well as advocating for public and community education grounded in the
principles of "Organizing for Remembering." In situations where media literacy initiatives are restricted, public discourse spaces, whether within classrooms, communities, or civic spheres, tend to veil the social, political, and economic realities of our communities. This masking serves to disempower research endeavors and offers a less-than-rigorous examination of the arguments, evidence, and ideologies that permeate our educational environments.

Unfortunately, there remains a notable absence of significant voices from educational and community political leadership addressing the critical public policy issues that encapsulate the intersection of public and private ethics within the realm of media. These issues encompass government surveillance in public spaces, the privatization of education (including the proliferation of charter schools and diverse voucher systems, including tax credit programs), as well as the challenges associated with standardization and the pervasive school-to-prison pipeline. It is imperative that action in this domain be spearheaded by a collective of Indigenous teacher education researchers, teacher educators, pre-service teachers, and online communities. This recalls the mobilization witnessed during the Egyptian Summer, where the political potency of social media networks was harnessed to galvanize social movements against oppressive regimes and institutions.

Furthermore, it is worth reflecting on the pivotal role played by media and popular culture in bridging critical pedagogy, civic education, and media literacy. As proponents of critical pedagogy endeavor to cultivate critical consciousness for the sake of a more democratic society, the aspiration to foster a culture of empowered individuals assumes paramount importance. This pedagogical approach endows students with the skills and knowledge requisite for effecting transformative change within themselves, their families, and their communities across a spectrum
of contexts – be it intrapersonal, interpersonal, within small groups, through computer-mediated communication, in mass media, or via social media platforms. Additionally, it extends to the sphere of political and public governance.

There exists a notable contradiction within the discourse on self-determination, warranting further investigation into the nuanced nature of self-determination as a Learning Theory vis-à-vis its manifestation as a drive toward self-governing political autonomy. This line of inquiry seeks to delve into the dynamics of realizing self-determination within non-self-governing contexts, examining the interplay between subject and state, juxtaposed with scenarios involving self-governing states and their respective subjects.

This endeavor carries significant implications for community development, entailing the cultivation of awareness, identification, and the formulation of strategies to navigate intricate social and cultural challenges. These challenges encompass a range of issues, including but not limited to low socio-economic circumstances, elevated dropout rates, premature teenage pregnancies, heightened instances of alcohol and substance abuse, as well as prevalent cases of domestic and family violence. A pivotal area of investigation pertains to the allocation and distribution of political, social, cultural, and economic power (or its absence) among individuals, families, and wider communities, influencing the agency of subjects within various institutional frameworks – spanning schools, familial units, religious institutions, educational establishments, media outlets, government bodies, hospitals, and other public institutions.

Moreover, it is imperative to explore the barriers hindering teacher and parental engagement in critical community discourse. Often, public inclination leans towards a collective act of forgetting
as a means of self-preservation. In this context, Tuhiwai-Smith advocates for a "pedagogy of remembrance" in her work "Twenty-five Indigenous Projects, #5, Remembering." This approach calls upon educators to challenge established norms by asserting their rights and strategically leveraging collective bargaining to emancipate themselves (Simon & Eppert, 1997). Nevertheless, it is essential to confront and transform conservative ideological pre-service teacher education programs through a de-colonial lens.

The endeavor to emancipate micro-societies from the dominion of media hegemony finds its anchoring in Freirean methodologies aimed at dissecting institutional bias, with a specific focus on media institutions. Freire's work, "Pedagogy of Freedom" (1998), propels a challenge to the conventional notion of teaching as a mere transmission of knowledge, advocating instead for a humanizing practice. Within this framework, individuals are seen as active agents in the tapestry of history, inherently incomplete in their understanding due to their proximity to systems of oppression. Through the lens of "epistemological curiosity," pedagogy endeavors to pivot towards the cultivation of student self-determination. Freire further outlines essential features of a humanizing pedagogy that fosters the liberation of subjective consciousness in "Teaching is a Human Act." These encompass elements such as empathy, dialogue, ideological engagement, decision-making, acknowledgment of the boundless nature of freedom and authority, education as a form of intervention, unwavering commitment, and competence. In his discourse on "Openness to Dialogue," Freire unflinchingly addresses the role of the media. He establishes a link between inquiries into media and the cultivation of critical consciousness concerning communication channels that inherently lack neutrality. This recognition necessitates a pedagogical intervention for communities to comprehend the intricacies of media operations and recognize how the
institution itself is both implicated in and implicates viewers as subjects of oppression through the manipulation of desires and other influential factors.

2.7.4 Indigenous Ethics of Decolonizing Media Literacy & Civic Consciousness

The analysis delves into the components of subaltern epistemic positioning, drawing from an Indigenous Oceania-Chamorro (Tao Tao Guahan) epistemological framework, to delineate an ethical foundation for a decolonized media literacy pedagogy. This pedagogical approach serves to achieve civic empowerment. A central theme explored is the influence wielded by public institutions—such as education, media, and government—on the development of ethics within both global and local public and private spheres. This investigation illuminates how ethics can function as a decolonizing practice, steering away from the conventional understanding of ethics rooted in Euro-centric constructs. Conventional scholarship predominantly attributes the origins of "ethics" to Western European intellectual traditions, with epistemological and ontological foundations tracing back to the philosophies of ancient Greece, including figures like Socrates, Aristotle, and Plato.

Emerging from the confluence of meta-ethical hyper-globalization, characterized by the advocacy of "universal ethics" within neoliberalism, and a "zero-point perspective" inherent to decolonization theory, there arises a synthesis of inter-institutional dynamics involving education, media, and government. Within this context, an inter-epistemological arena is cultivated, where the discourse on "universal ethics" is juxtaposed against ethical relativism, while concurrently challenging the notion of a decolonial "pluri-versal ethics" rooted in decolonial scholarship (de Sousa Santos, 2014; Mignolo, 2007; Grosfoguel, 2007). Within the decolonial worldview, there is
a pressing need to honor and provide inter-global interpretations of subaltern knowledge emanating from diverse cultures, countering the dominance of Euro-centric epistemologies and establishing new epistemic centers for subsequent development.

In the absence of a concerted endeavor to educate individuals on the distinctions between right and wrong from the vantage point of a decolonial pluri-versal perspective on humanity, contemporary Indigenous communities risk unwittingly contributing to neocolonialism through the perpetuation of an "ethics of colonization" that permeates our public discourse and, eventually, infiltrates private cultural and familial spheres. These ethics of colonization are deeply rooted in processes of commodification and consumption, warranting a counter-balancing force. Numerous institutions must engage in this endeavor, including the home, communities, government, education, and the media. Failing to establish an Indigenous epistemic-ethical core dedicated to decolonial initiatives—spanning curriculum, pedagogy, and progress assessment—leaves the younger generation susceptible to the influences of public neoliberal ethics. When Indigenous communities rely on the media to instruct their children on how to interact with one another, potential dangers loom. While the media is driven by imperatives to enhance profits, expand audience share, and maximize "time spent entertaining," the responsibility lies not with the media itself, but rather with teacher educators, educational researchers, and those envisioning decolonial futures aligned with principles of social justice, to grasp the immense power and influence wielded by the media, as well as the forces steering its trajectory.

The examination of the literature presented above indicates that in the absence of deliberate efforts to instill Indigenous-centered ethics, contemporary Indigenous students—whether in their ancestral homelands or navigating diasporic experiences—may internalize the prevailing public
values of entertainment, popular culture, and American capitalist consumerism. In an Indigenous framework, survival necessitates a nuanced understanding of both modernity and Native knowledge and values. Consequently, instead of fostering a sense of modern Indigenous self-efficacy, where individuals adeptly negotiate between tradition and contemporary norms, there is a risk of witnessing a shift towards an Indigenous inclination to internalize an ideology rooted in self-worth, as defined by neoliberal representations perpetuated through media.

A critical insight gleaned from the literature review and subsequent analysis posits that both Indigenous and non-Indigenous practitioners in the realm of media production must strive for equilibrium. In this endeavor, educational researchers are summoned to awaken an epistemological consciousness or conscientização (Freire, 1970; Rossatto, 2012). This shift calls for a departure from naivety—a belief that advocates of social justice within the realms of public and community education will inherently deconstruct neoliberalism and its attendant capitalist ethos—toward a position of actively transforming prevailing cultural paradigms. Expanding upon this notion, Indigenous individuals wielding institutional influence bear a responsibility to challenge prevailing narratives and proffer counter-narratives that defy the dominant values of society. Failing to do so could result in the private and public ethical frameworks guiding the upbringing of children—within local, national, regional, and international contexts—succumbing to re-colonization, becoming subject to the objectification propagated by consumer culture.

The theoretical objective presented here entails a pragmatic endeavor: to empower Indigenous youth by acquainting them with organizations and community leaders dedicated to fostering capacity in this domain. It seeks to provide them with tools forged by the principles of "Indigenous ethics" to serve the betterment of such communities in matters of decision-making.
How might this be achieved? This analysis proposes a transformation from critical media literacy pedagogy to the establishment of a de-colonizing media literacy program (DML).

The literature discussed above initiates the unpacking of a synthesis between the sociocultural underpinnings of education and the process of identity formation among Indigenous teacher educators along the U.S.-Mexico border, juxtaposed with Indigenous knowledge pertaining to ethics. Particularly, anchored in an Oceanic epistemological framework, the assertion of ethical de-colonization for Indigenous objectives presents a crucial theoretical pathway for advancing the pedagogy of de-colonizing media literacy (DML). Its purpose lies in nurturing self-determination and augmenting civic consciousness within Indigenous and minority communities.

In this context, the analysis underscores the imperative of decolonizing epistemology and ontology. The global south asserts its distinct way of knowing, which should not be co-opted by the global north or its agents of epistemicide (de Sousa Santos, 2014). Rather, it calls for a receptive space to listen and apply these knowledge systems. As the global north embarks once more on a quest for new resources—now in the form of knowledge and ways of knowing—Indigenous epistemologies face renewed threats. Lands, identities, and languages have already been expropriated for the global market. Nevertheless, modern Indigenous communities, cultivating a "de-colonizing consciousness," hold the capacity to safeguard what remains of their heritage.

Regarding research implications and within the realm of developing De-Colonizing Media Literacy (DML) within the framework of "critical education," there exists a pressing need to further decolonize critical thinking in education, particularly within marginalized communities (ethnic minorities, people of color, religious and political minorities, individuals of varying body
sizes, those in poverty, LGBQ, and transgendered individuals). Deeper exploration is warranted on how critical education has become a metric for standardized assessments, serving as exercises in pedagogy for "critical thinking," as well as the media's role in critical media literacy. This form of literacy, with its own historical colonizing agenda among Indigenous communities, may necessitate additional paradigm development (Kuhn, 1970). Furthermore, an area ripe for further field research lies in the influence of dominant political powers over local education policy boards (and other bodies like City Councils), as well as the potential for local interests to empower these groups. Maximizing civic participation—encompassing electoral and policy-making processes—within these entities provides community leaders with an opportunity to act in the best interests of their constituents, including identifying candidates, fundraising, crafting messages, and mobilizing voters toward this objective.

The essence of this de-colonizing initiative within U.S. public education and (inter)governmental community education campaigns is to foster self-determination among diverse groups within colonized populations across various settings: the U.S./Texas-Mexico borderlands; U.S. Colonial Territories overseen by the U.S. Department of Interior’s Office of Insular Affairs (such as Guam, Puerto Rico, Virgin Islands, American Samoa, The Commonwealth of the Northern Marianas Islands).

Who should be engaged in this endeavor? It necessitates a coalition-building effort, extending beyond the confines of academia into our communities. Just as critical race theorists advocate for racially conscious white individuals to assist minorities by educating other white individuals about the potency of whiteness and the privileges it bestows, with the aim of dismantling racial barriers, a similar approach may prove effective in countering neoliberalism. Within communities, there
exist individuals endowed with resources and interests aligned with the transfer of power. The proposition here is to pioneer inventive collaborations among diverse social and cultural strata, identifying community leaders who possess both the capacity and the empathy to instigate a more inafa’maolek world.

2.8 Implications for Methodology-Theoretical Framework of Analysis

The subsequent discussion introduces a meta-paradigm for formulating a Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML) pedagogy tailored for and by Indigenous communities, with the aim of enhancing democratic engagement for social justice through civic education. This framework involves a triangulation of significant disciplinary domains encompassing public administration (PA), communications (COMM), and sociocultural foundations of education (SCFE). It serves as the theoretical underpinning for guiding the methodology employed in this dissertation. The initial stance establishes the interconnection between sociocultural foundations of education and public administration, as elucidated by educational research scholar Jean Anyon (2005).

We embark on a triangulation process to delineate our current position, historical trajectory, and envisioned path forward concerning the focal point of our research—media literacy for civic participation among Indigenous/Minority populations. The nomenclature of this dissertation section as "Theoretical Framework," as derived from the lexicon of social science research rooted in the Dominant Other (western/white/European/global north) epistemology, inherently reinforces the colonial paradigm. Instead, this framework advances an Indigenous Inafa'maolek perspective to guide Western expectations pertaining to theory, ideology, philosophy, ontology, and
axiological considerations, serving analytical and dialectical purposes (Aguon, K. 1993; Underwood 2012; Hattori 2011).

To constructing an analytical framework, an Indigenous Pacific-Islander method of mediation or meaning-making, rooted in the concept of Inafa’maolek, embodies an Indigenous ideology, ontology, and epistemology that encapsulates Guam's Chamorro-Tao Tao Tano society and philosophy towards self-determination. This stands apart from Western positivist mediation and research methodologies.

Within this context, the literature delves into inafa’maolek as a tool for mediation, while also re-centering the epistemological core of Indigenous pre-contact (Pre-Latte’) Chamorro thought. Among the Chamorro people of the Marianas Islands, inafa’maolek is a philosophical approach to communication that Westerners might label as such. Indigenous Pacific Islander-Chamorro scholars (Underwood, 2012; Aguon in Hattori 2011) advocate for the application of Indigenous Chamorro philosophy in education. In essence, inafa’maolek encompasses the following Indigenous-Oceania values:

(1) *Respetu’* – the provision of respect afforded to our elderly and others significant individuals within the family and community.
(2) *Manginge* – an expression of respect given to elders and persons of authority; likened to a kiss, this expression of reverence is displayed by the motion of a slight touch of the nose to the back part of a person’s right hand.
(3) *Mamahlao* – to be shamefaced, embarrassed or ashamed.
(4) *Chenchule* – present (money) donation, thing that is given away, gift not specifically associated with any event.
(5) *Che’lu* – Relationships with siblings.
(6) *Påtgon* – Children are valued and raising them is everyone’s responsibility.” (Aguon, K. in guampedia.com).
Aguon’s conceptualization of *Inafa‘maolek* is furthered by Underwood’s (2012) explanation of pre-contact *Chamorro* beliefs:

1. Family authority and ties are pre-eminent in all social relationships.
2. Interdependence in man is more important than personal independence.
3. Responsible persons always respect social position and the social situation.
4. Old age brings wisdom and age governs social relationships.
5. Nature must be lived with, not struggled against.
6. A sense of mamahlao (shame) guides your daily behavior. (p.17)

Hence, "ethics" align with practices observed in the U.S. context. While the Guam and El Paso Borderlands communities are situated within the framework of Western influence due to colonization, the "ethics" upheld by these cultures shape the behavior and communication patterns, both ontological and epistemological, evident in educational systems (institutional), administrators, staff, teachers, students, parents, and the broader community across public and private settings.
Figure 2.2: An Indigenous Civic & Media Educational Research Framework towards Decolonizing Media Literacy

Note: The Theoretical Framework is based on Anyon's New Education Research Paradigm; Intercultural Communication & Public Memory; and Decolonizing Methodology: Indigenous Chamorro Inafa'maolek Mediation. The foregoing theoretical underpinnings provide the necessary foundation for understanding the organization and implementation of the methodology, drawing from scholars such as Tuhiwai Smith (2012), Freire (1970), DeSousa Santos (2014), Giroux (2019), and Chomsky and Herman (1988).
CHAPTER III
METHODOLOGY

Introduction to Methodology

In applying the Positive Deviance methodology and method for this study, the process of formulating problem and question statements is guided by the researcher in collaboration with the local community. Traditionally, research questions remain formative, seeking to understand how the most marginalized members of a community, impacted by problematic outcomes, have managed to overcome the challenges they face. This approach challenges the assumption that these individuals should have inevitably failed. The central issue at hand is that Indigenous and minority members of a community tend to have lower levels of civic knowledge and participation, potentially influenced by media culture. Consequently, this leads to an under-representation in advocating for social policy changes that promote community development. The lack of education about municipal governance acts as a barrier to empowering civic participation, particularly among individuals aged 19-24 (early college/post-high school/early career professionals), especially when compared to their counterparts in white-dominant communities. The primary objective is to explore the decolonization of civic engagement in the municipal public policy-making process and media literacy practices in three distinct contexts: the U.S.-Mexico border (West Texas), Central Texas, and the U.S. colony of Guam. It is important to note that a key distinction between these cross-cultural settings lies in the extent of municipal governance, which plays a larger role in Texas compared to Guam. This aspect of the study also contributes to the field of public administration by shedding light on local governance within the U.S. colonial system.

RESEARCH QUESTIONS
Justification for Research Questions in a Transnational, Multi-sited Setting

The chosen setting for this inquiry offers a rich contextual understanding across both white-dominant and Indigenous-Minority cultures. As advocated by Anyon, the emphasis is on studying groups in positions of power for the benefit of education research (In Ladson-Billings, et al., 2006). Mazzucato's research on transnational migration emphasizes the need to comprehend relationships across distances, encompassing the efforts expended in establishing and sustaining them, the evolving meaning of these relationships in diverse contexts, and the exchange of information, resources, and services that occurs through them (Mazzucato, 2020; 2011, p. 1). This assertion aligns with the focus of the dissertation proposal, which centers on civic and media engagement within transnational communities situated in various locations.

The proposed research questions are designed for a multi-sited study, drawing from Mazzucato's approach applicable to Social Network Analysis (SNA) (Mazzucato, 2020). According to Basch, Glick Schiller, and Blanc (2005), transnationalism involves the processes through which immigrants establish and sustain complex social connections that link their societies of origin with their new settlements (p. 7). Furthermore, Bartlett and Vavrus (2017) emphasize the importance of comparative case studies within a multi-sited fieldwork setting, encompassing horizontal analysis (examining how similar policies or phenomena unfold in interconnected locations), vertical analysis (tracing phenomena across different scales), and transversal analysis (tracing phenomena and cases across time) (p. 15).
These proposed research settings encompass Central Texas, El Paso, and Guam. The term "transnational/cross-cultural settings" is employed to elucidate the rationale and the participants within these diverse multicultural spaces, particularly where military communities intersect with local groups. It is noteworthy that each of these locations shares the commonality of hosting a U.S. military base and community. This unique co-location is significant as it aligns with the researcher's identity as an Indigenous U.S. military dependent. This identity brings forth a distinctive perspective as an educational researcher representing the professional development identity of Guam-El Paso-Central Texas.

The focal point of this inquiry is to articulate cultural responses across the examined settings. The researcher's identity plays a pivotal role in the exploration of critical consciousness within democratic contexts. Specifically, it holds potential value for Pacific Islander cultural identity, diasporic communities, and civic engagement in U.S. democratic processes, which stands in direct contrast to the example of U.S. democracy vis-à-vis the colonization of Guam's people and beyond. In all three research locations, there exists a prevailing social injustice affecting minority-Indigenous populations - be it at the U.S.-Mexico border, Guam, or Central Texas, which serves as a diasporic location for these transient natives, transitioning from a liminal/marginalized state to one where they experience the aspirations associated with the American Dream. It is important to note that this inquiry does not seek to compare the settings, but rather aims to delineate the civic-media dimension within the context of transnational culture.

Hence, the research questions examine:

- Who and how are **Indigenous-Minority members of the public** engaging in the local government policy process across transnational settings?
• How and what do community leaders teach and learn about the local municipal policy-making process across transnational settings?

• What meanings of critical consciousness towards civic engagement are socially constructed across municipal localities and intercultural groups over time? Why?

Anticipated Outcomes

This dissertation puts forth an Indigenous-centered mixed-method approach, with a qualitative emphasis. It involves the adoption and adaptation of a decolonizing Indigenous framework for meaning making, in conjunction with a Participatory Action Research (Positive Deviance) Case Study. The expected outcomes encompass:

1. Insights into community-driven practices of civic engagement and media utilization among Indigenous and minority communities.

2. Enhanced understanding of municipal policy-making processes, with implications for civic education initiatives.

3. Promotion of media literacy education tailored to the needs of Indigenous and minority communities, fostering intercultural comprehension across diverse ideological landscapes.

4. Facilitation of critical consciousness development, empowering individuals towards self-determination, and prompting engagement in democratic forms of action within marginalized groups.

This dissertation outlines a triangulation of methodologies, incorporating Participatory Action Research (Positive Deviance), Indigenous-Decolonizing Methodologies, and Auto-biographical Narrative/Case Study methodologies. Additionally, the multi-sited nature of Comparative Case Studies supports the cross-cultural exploration of civic and media practices across diverse cultural spaces. Positive Deviance (PD) is a central component of the proposed process. In traditional PD practice, a community identifies a problem and collaborates with a researcher to pinpoint effective behaviors for resolution. In this study, Positive Deviants will be selected based on specific criteria, including their demonstration of Positive Deviant behavior and socio-economic background. Furthermore, data collection will incorporate the researcher's personal reflections, drawing from their role as a participant-observer. The interpretation and analysis of data will be guided by the Indigenous Guam-Chamorro Inafa'maolek mediation framework, informing the development of civic education curriculum and pedagogy principles for critical consciousness and self-determination empowerment. By integrating these methodologies, this study aims to provide a comprehensive understanding of the complex interplay between Indigenous communities, civic engagement, and media practices within a cross-cultural context.

Mixed Methodologies for Transformative Inquiry: Empowering Indigenous Knowledge in Civic and Media Engagement

The amalgamation of these mixed methodologies reinforces the transformative agenda of this study, led by an Indigenous social science researcher committed to harnessing local wisdom to address the intricate societal challenge of civic and media engagement, while
discerning propagandist motives. It is important to note that this study does not seek to make broad generalizations. Instead, its aim is to provide a detailed account of specific instances of civic and media engagement practices within various locations and cultural contexts.

Mode of Inquiry: Qualitative Inductive Approach Informed by Indigenous/Decolonizing Methodology

This section situates the research within a qualitative framework, engaging with empirical research design while providing a scholarly foundation for an Indigenous/Decolonizing research methodology. The study adopts an inductive approach, characterized by its progression from specific observations towards the identification of underlying patterns that imbue a degree of order among the given events (Babbie, 2011, p. 23, 5th ed., Cengage Learning, The Basics of Social Research). Given its aptitude for pattern recognition, this study contends that the inductive approach aligns seamlessly with the Positive Deviance method, as further elaborated in the subsequent section, particularly about inductive theory formulation (Charmaz, 2006; Glaser & Strauss, 1967; In Babbie, 2011, p. 56-57).

**Participant Action Research (PAR): Positive Deviance**

Within the framework of this dissertation, a distinct mode of qualitative inquiry is employed, known as Participant Action Research (PAR). Specifically, Positive Deviance (PD) is applied—an approach rooted in the community that is solution-oriented and addresses the most intricate social challenges (Pascale, Sternin, Sternin, 2010; Singhal, Dura, 2009). According to Pascale et al.,
Along a continuum of change tools, the positive deviance approach is one among a broad set of participatory methods. The basic premise is this: (1) Solutions to seemingly intractable problems already exist, (2) they have been discovered by members of the community itself, and (3) these innovators (individual positive deviants) have succeeded even though they share the same constraints and barriers as others. (p.3-4)

Supporting the relationship between PAR and PD, Lichtman (2013) defines Participatory Action Research as "a form of action research in which those involved in the research have a goal of improving a program or community" (p.324). Singhal (2011), in "Turning the Diffusion of Innovations Paradigm on Its Head," reorients our thinking about effecting change in communities, inverting conventional perspectives.

The classical diffusion paradigm has been criticized for reifying expert-driven, top-down approaches to address problems and thus, by default, overlooking and rejecting local solutions. Diffusion of innovation experts now increasingly believe, and humbly acknowledge, the value of local expertise and indigenous wisdom in finding culturally appropriate solutions to community problems (p.203).

An additional aspect of this framework incorporates inquiry-centered pedagogies outlined by Lipmanowicz and McCandless (2013). These pedagogies aim to deconstruct institutional norms that contribute to oppressive spatial use and interpersonal/small group communication practices. Their goal is to foster positive and liberating interactions that encourage communication for the purpose of problem-solving, a concept known as Didactic Action Dialogue. In alignment with this, Pascale et al. (2010) and Singhal and Dura (2009) advocate for Positive Deviance as a research methodology in communication. This approach seeks to tap into the potential of insider problem-solvers, diverging from dominant methods that rely on external experts to provide solutions for complex community issues.

**RESEARCHER POSITIONALITY**

At this juncture, this study scrutinizes my positionality as an Indigenous Native/Mexican.
American Researcher hailing from the Island of Guam and Victoria, Texas. This examination delves into my perception of self, my self in relation to others, and my role within the larger system. To begin, the concept of self:

'Si roque aguon-yu tao tao talofofo guahan
un isla in la oceana pacifico pasado Hawaii
sur de Japon
mi mama es Mexicana/Tejana de Victoria
familia Qurioz-Ortiz-Reyna de Cedral San Luis de Potosi
immigrants from Spain and Greece
Chamoru-hamyu i tata-mu Cepeda-Castro-Aguon
familian Mahetok

I have spent my formative years as a U.S. Military dependent, a lifestyle often affectionately referred to as a "brat". Through the vivid narratives shared by my Abuelita, I was transported to a time when she, as a young girl, gathered around the campfire, eagerly absorbing stories of our profound connection to the Aztec-Nahuatl people. On the Pacific Islander side of my lineage, we can trace our roots back to the 1700s, when a Spanish Don united with our esteemed local matriarch in wedlock.

In my current role, I am a devoted son, a loving husband, and a doting father. I consider myself a dedicated servant of humanity, driven by the values instilled in me by my Catholic faith. In essence, I embody the essence of a contemporary Indigenous-Native, transcending geographical boundaries. However, it is imperative to acknowledge the profound impact of Americanization on my identity formation. This facet has played a pivotal role in shaping the person I have become today.
My heritage and legacy represent a cultural amalgamation of Mexican American lineage, spanning four generations in Victoria, Texas. Simultaneously, I am an involuntary immigrant from the un-incorporated Island of Guahan, further enriching my cultural tapestry. Both Texas and Guam hold a special place in my heart, as I call them home. As a U.S. Citizen, I exercise my right to vote, aligning myself with the Democratic party as a moderate.

I firmly believe in the tenets of capitalism, while also valuing the significance of local wisdom in our democratic processes. In my view, media and civic engagement are intrinsically linked, necessitating the active involvement of a diverse array of individuals. This participation should be free from manipulation, underpinned by cognitive frameworks that empower self-determination and foster critical consciousness, especially in this era dominated by technology.

My personal journey has been profoundly influenced by my interactions with civic and media education, experiences that have evolved and continue to do so in the contemporary era. As a child of the 1980s, I came of age during the advent of MTV in the pre-Internet epoch, a time characterized by the ubiquity of mass media. I was subject to the influence of the Western media empire's propaganda machine in colonized spaces. Growing up on U.S. military bases in Europe and Central America during the 1970s and 1980s, my family's presence symbolized American democracy and the formidable strength of the U.S. Armed Forces. This brought with it a responsibility to represent our nation abroad, exposing me to a wide array of civic engagements and the pervasive influence of Armed Forces Radio & Television Stations (AFRTS) broadcasts and films.

My high school years, spent in schools under the purview of the Department of Defense Educational Agency, followed a pattern common for minorities in the military milieu. I
navigated the intricate dynamics between Commissioned Officers and Non-commissioned Officers. From residing in Panama until shortly before the intervention to apprehend the renegade Panamanian General Manuel Noriega, to being in Germany during the Iran Hostage Crisis in elementary school, these experiences profoundly shaped my civic consciousness and reinforced my appreciation for the principles of democracy. This realization dawned on me while situated in the heart of the U.S. Western Pacific, on an Un-incorporated U.S. Territory, commonly referred to as a colony.

My conscious reckoning with my native roots, growing up in our village of fewer than 3,000 inhabitants, occurred during my undergraduate tenure at the University of Guam. It was here, amidst my pursuit of a Bachelor of Arts in Communications, that I also delved into my avocation of radio broadcasting. As an American youth, I was immersed in the media landscape of the Armed Forces Radio and Television Services, along with Voice of America. Figures like Wolfman Jack, Casey Kasem, and Rick Dees were fixtures of my upbringing. The medium of radio, in my eyes, resembled a colossal revolving stage, and during this period, I learned how to tailor media content to cater to specific market demands. I was welcomed into the fold, in part due to my local moniker and the quintessential "American" cadence I carried. My foray into the world of radio in Guam, assuming the role of a radio personality, truly began to take form between 1990 and 2001. It was in 2001 that I received an offer from the preeminent radio station ownership group in the market, ranked 35th in the nation's top 50—Hispanic Broadcasting Corporation. Subsequently, I returned to Guam in pursuit of civic opportunities, which eventually culminated in my appointment as a media executive at the largest broadcasting corporation in the Western Pacific, while concurrently maintaining an on-
air presence from 2002 to 2008. It was during this juncture that I resolved to return to Guam for a venture into politics. This transition to executive management intersected with my pursuit of a master’s in public administration, during which I undertook a practicum in Washington, D.C. in 2005. This immersive experience involved an in-depth study of Guam's policy matters submitted to the Office of Insular Affairs within the U.S. Department of the Interior—an agency vested with administrative oversight of the Territories.

My journey in the realm of civic engagement and media advocacy burgeoned from my proficiency in devising and orchestrating extensive mass media advertising initiatives, initially geared towards commercial objectives but eventually pivoting towards civic pursuits. This shift engendered a succession of political opportunities closely aligned with media-related ventures. It became evident to me that an in-depth understanding of government policy greatly amplified my effectiveness as a communicator, both in representing elected officials and advocating for the constituents I served. As I ascended to executive roles within the media landscape across diverse formats, my tenure at Hispanic Broadcasting proved instrumental in equipping me to assist local media ownership in navigating the intersection of traditional media and emerging digital platforms, particularly the internet.

While my professional identity crystallized around civic and media interests, a profound personal juncture catalyzed a period of introspection. The devastating loss of my three sons during childbirth prompted a profound transformation in my consciousness. It brought into sharp relief the realization that despite my privileged existence, there was a deeper calling. My aspirations are not only a reflection of who I am and what I aspire to achieve, but also an articulation of what I eschew. I harbor no desire to contribute to societal challenges or inflict harm or manipulation upon others through commercially driven propaganda campaigns.
Instead, my aim was to delve into the study of sense-making amidst the deluge of information. This resolve was spurred by a poignant firsthand observation of how a resolute Indigenous leader could face electoral defeat due to the pervasive influence of media manipulation.

Prior to embarking on my PhD studies, my engagement with the local education system spanned over two decades (1990-2011). During this period, I assumed various roles, including serving as a substitute teacher across K-12 levels and as a middle school educator specializing in 7th grade Reading and ESL, primarily instructing Indigenous Native students. Additionally, I undertook the responsibility of teaching high school Language Arts to alternative students in the 9th grade. My teaching journey also encompassed progress towards a Master of Arts in Teaching, wherein I successfully completed all coursework, save for the student-teaching practicum. Regrettably, this was attributed to the exclusion of ESL classes from university credit eligibility for the course—an occurrence that I contend exemplifies race-based policymaking within teacher education and certification. It served as a poignant revelation, compelling me to recognize that institutions of higher education in Guam persist as the final vestiges of colonial infrastructure, warranting deconstruction.

Subsequently, my foray into post-secondary teaching transpired over a span of four years, encompassing a two-year tenure at the University of Guam as Adjunct Faculty for Communications, followed by another two-year stint in a similar capacity at the Guam Community College. These courses were enriched by a diverse cohort of Pacific Islander students, thereby fostering my deep-seated appreciation for communications research and the imperative to investigate the realm of media culture.
Throughout my PhD tenure in West Texas, I held significant roles as a legislative staffer and Chief of Staff within the District office of The City of El Paso, operating under the Mayor & City Council division. This position afforded me invaluable insights into the intricacies of city management governance, enabling me to discern both the commonalities and distinctions in legislative processes when compared to Guam. In Guam, my role was situated at the "state" level, whereas in West Texas, I operated at the municipal level. These civic engagement experiences equipped me to provide guidance and support to a newly elected city councilor in his 30s, who was navigating governmental service for the first time. Over the course of three years, I witnessed tremendous growth and accomplishments, ultimately recognizing that he no longer required the training wheels. This prompted my decision to shift my focus towards advancing my dissertation.

During this period, I was also presented with an opportunity to consult at the state level for a legislative advocacy project, which subsequently led to my involvement in a U.S. Congressional campaign project in Central Texas from 2017 to 2018. In 2018, I assumed a role on the 2020 Census-Trump Administration advance team for the U.S. Department of Commerce/Bureau of The Census, representing the 12-state Denver Regional team. My jurisdiction encompassed a sprawling area, spanning 16 counties from El Paso in the west, extending to Midland/Odessa in the east, and reaching down to Terlingua, TX in Brewster County, inclusive of all jurisdictions in between. During this period, I traveled extensively, representing the Trump Administration during the initial phases of the Census partnership outreach, engaging with local elected officials (City and County), congressional offices, and regional community leaders from the business and non-profit sectors.
Following this one-year temporary appointment, I transitioned to a role with a local/national attorney (2019-2020), focusing on the research of deep web activity associated with online hate groups, specifically pertaining to the El Paso Walmart Shooter. This engagement formed part of a civil suit filed by a victim's family against the shooter, his family, and media/tech companies that facilitated these online interactions. Presently, my civic media background has paved the way for an opportunity in Central Texas, where I serve as the Airport Business Manager for two facilities (commercial and general aviation) within a local municipality. In this capacity, my primary responsibility lies in fostering civic media engagement among stakeholders. This role provides a distinctive insider perspective into city management, collaborating closely with the department leadership team as a representative of aviation. The content of this discourse reflects the ongoing dialogues within city management regarding public civic issues, shedding light on the political intricacies underlying these decisions—a rich resource for civic education. This study encapsulates the policy-making perspectives of city management (internal), city council/community leadership, and agents of issue advocacy across diverse settings, ideal participants for this research endeavor.

The lens through which I perceive the world is one of hybridity, influenced by a mosaic of cultural backgrounds. This intricate interplay shapes my research endeavors, presenting an opportunity for transformation within intercultural spaces. My experiences are imbued with the values, attitudes, and beliefs that resonate within American, Hispanic, and Pacific Islander communities. Of particular significance is the anchoring of an Indigenous epistemological framework known as Inafa'maolek, a focal point of discussion within this study. This Native way of understanding the world has been instrumental in my journey to comprehend and
embrace my own Indigenous identity—an explicit articulation of values that I initially struggled to fully grasp as a transplant from the mainland, coming of age in the village of Talofofo in Guam.

These invaluable cultural insights were imparted to me through oral histories, narratives shared by elders, and interactions with peers, collectively serving to transmute foundational concepts into normative behaviors rooted in Native traditions. In the context of this study, the Indigenous-Guam/Tao Tao Tano mediation framework shapes the data analysis methodology, underscoring a pivotal assertion: Native modes of understanding govern the construction of meaning in civic and media practices, fostering critical consciousness and empowering self-determination.

It was during my evolution in civic participation that I began to discern the profound significance of this research study. I recognized its potential to elucidate and address the disparities in civic and media education, particularly in relation to voters' proficiency (or lack thereof) in decision-making—a factor that renders them susceptible to the influence of competing propaganda campaigns. The outcome of this susceptibility often tips the scales in favor of one political faction (Republican/Democrat) over another, ultimately shaping the course of elections. Winning or losing an election is a multifaceted endeavor, demanding a nuanced understanding of its various components. Yet, swaying the mass public necessitates a comprehensive communication strategy, one that underpins initiatives such as Get Out The Vote (GOTV) campaigns, widespread messaging, and fundraising endeavors crucial for triumph on Election Night.
By virtue of my Indigenous family's esteemed standing in Guam as grassroots leaders representing the interests of the people, I was afforded access and opportunities to engage in political campaign coordination. Leveraging my professional background in media, I assumed a trusted role in the decision-making process, offering insights on crafting impactful mass media messaging. This confluence of my native Guam heritage with my Mexican American lineage epitomizes the convergence of diverse cultural identities, influencing my personal and professional relationships, each carrying its own set of social advantages and drawbacks.

These cumulative experiences continue to sculpt my research focus, orienting it towards conducting research "for Indigenous" rather than "of" Indigenous communities. This necessitates the development of an Indigenous mixed methodology, firmly rooted in Native knowledge and methodologies, emphasizing the intrinsic value of local "insider" solutions to intricate problems, as encapsulated by the Positive Deviance (PD) approach. The underlying objective remains straightforward: to foster community development, empowering the inhabitants of a given space or locality.

I pose questions that serve to both fortify and potentially scrutinize my positionalities. These positionalities are aligned with the pursuit of research endeavors tailored to benefit Indigenous communities. These inquiries diverge in nature, for they scrutinize dominant cultural factions to discern clusters of privilege, accessible only to select insiders who wield influence over policy formulation and decision-making procedures. Gaining acceptance within these circles necessitates adept intercultural maneuvering, allowing for a fluid sense of identity that seamlessly spans white, minority, and Indigenous realms of self and knowledge systems.
Moving forward, I delve into my research positionality concerning my Relationship with Others. The rapport I share with my participants is firmly anchored in grassroots civic involvement and media interaction at the municipal level, involving influencers from both minority/Indigenous communities and dominant cultural groups who leverage these activities for societal transformation. More specifically, my objective is to decode the process of discerning authentic information from propaganda, consequently devising strategies to counteract and disseminate such messaging within the realm of policy communication. In this shared zeal for civic engagement, I, like many others, also explore the art of leveraging technology to catalyze mass participation. While the social justice dimension of this connection may be perceived differently from various vantage points, it undoubtedly forms an integral aspect of this engagement.

This understanding is rooted in both extensive research and personal experiences within diverse cultural contexts across the study's specified settings: Guam (where I resided from 1990 to 2011), West Texas (my residence since 2012), and Central Texas (a place I've been visiting since childhood and continue to do so). It underscores a shared cross-cultural legacy shaped by the complex dynamics of colonization. While experienced in distinct ways, these heritages exemplify the interplay between U.S.-Pacific/Federal-Territorial relations, the border communities of U.S.-West Texas, and the predominantly influential White cultural groups in Central Texas—all set against the backdrop of a U.S. military presence. These unique settings offer a rare insight into the discourse environments central to this study. The historical terrain is marked by narratives, both public and private, encompassing the experiences of colonizing white settlers, juxtaposed with the perspectives of Indigenous-Native/minority communities.
regarding public memory, recollections, and omissions within the context of colonization. Moreover, this extends to considerations of contemporary neocolonial futures. Ultimately, this framework aims to dismantle neoliberal frames of thought and challenge prevailing axiological paradigms.

The background of my participants offers a complex lens through which to interpret the world, particularly considering media portrayals that often oversimplify or distort racial and political dynamics, especially during the Trump presidency and the 2020 campaign period. While the minority status and challenging socio-economic conditions of these participants are indeed significant aspects of this study, the common thread that unites them lies in their shared commitment to effective civic engagement practices for instigating social change. It is important to note that this is not an assessment of the moral or ethical dimensions of these practices within the community; rather, it serves as valuable material for shaping civic education initiatives, particularly among marginalized groups. This positioning underscores a participant-centric research approach that prioritizes community well-being over researcher-driven perspectives from an outsider or expert vantage point.

In the context of Research Positionality, I extend this perspective from Self to System. Within the scope of this proposed study, I draw upon a wealth of knowledge imparted by Indigenous elders, family members, community leaders, and peers. This reservoir of wisdom is complemented by a robust foundation in academic research spanning the landscapes of Guam-Pacific and the U.S.-MX borderlands, as well as the disciplines of communications, public administration studies, and sociocultural foundations of education research. My unique privilege lies in the diverse array of experiences accumulated within professional and personal
cultural spheres, transitioning seamlessly between those associated with local/municipal policymaking.

While the Western positivist paradigm tends to conceptualize race, class, and gender as socially constructed notions, predominantly framed within progressive and liberal ideologies, the Indigenous Native epistemology offers a contrasting viewpoint. It sheds light on the inherent biases and discriminatory tendencies embedded within these concepts, particularly when applied in cultural ethnographic and anthropological investigations. Here, such constructs have historically been utilized to legitimize structural inequalities based on socio-economic status, skin color, and identity. Moreover, from a pragmatic governance standpoint, these concepts are operationalized to furnish data for decision-making, often within the context of entrenched historical disparities. This dynamic is further amplified within the framework of the contemporary capitalist neo-liberal global society. In the context of this study, these notions furnish a navigational route for comprehending and redressing this intricate issue across an array of diverse cultural landscapes.

In the thorough examination of the existing literature, emphasis is placed on Indigenous communities and their interface with media within the realms of public administration, communications, and sociocultural foundations. Notably, this exploration unveils distinct variations in policy-making processes for municipal institutions between Guam and the formal city management-styled municipal governance systems in Texas, whether in the West or Central regions. Specifically, it is evident that the researcher's municipal city management perspective differs markedly from West Texas to Central Texas. The former adopts a
legislative standpoint, while the latter is viewed from the vantage point of City Management, both placing significant emphasis on civic engagement within the policy-making process.

Socially, it is well-documented that in Guam, Village Mayors possess limited authority in taxing and local budgetary matters, a situation divergent from the Home-Rule status enjoyed by Texas municipalities as self-governing and taxing entities. In Guam, the centralized state/territory-level government takes precedence, with revenues processed and budgetary determinations made by the Governor as the Chief Executive, superseding the municipal system in place. This stands in stark contrast to the responsibilities shouldered by Village Mayors, which typically encompass overseeing tasks such as arranging chairs and tables, tending to landscaping, or directing traffic during funerals. This differentiation underscores the distinct approaches to city management and urban administration elucidated in the review.

The people of Guam bear the historical distinction of being native inhabitants on a military outpost and U.S. Territory. Within U.S. Department of Defense circles, Guam holds a significant strategic position, influencing crucial decisions regarding the political status of non-self-governing populations, a matter overseen by the United Nations Commission on Decolonization. Our Pacific Islander identity is a source of pride, with "Chamorro" denoting those indigenous to Guam, and "Guamanian" extending to those who have chosen Guam as their home.

The border city of West Texas also occupies a distinctive place in public memory. It serves as a Smelter Town, a hub of cultural and economic exchange bridging the global south (U.S.-Mexico border). Additionally, it is home to Fort Bliss, a haven for immigrants, and has gained
notoriety for its association with Narcoculture. Central Texas, on the other hand, is characterized as a military community centered around Fort Hood, marked by a rich tapestry of ethnicities and races. At its core, it remains a stronghold for the predominantly white Central Texans—ranchers and farmers who settled the region during the expansion of the railroad system in the 1800s. Following World War II, the area experienced exponential growth in population and industry, evolving into one of the most robust economic recoveries in the state amid the COVID-19 pandemic. It is crucial to underscore the influence of the dominant white community and white settler powerbrokers, who serve as key drivers of social change and proponents of minority participation in this transformative process.

The central determinant of systemic and organizational barriers that delineate the experiences of communities and individuals, both locally and globally, is colonialism. This overarching concept encompasses the social structures and hierarchies that govern our respective settings. It is essential to recognize that the legacy of colonialism is intergenerational, exerting its influence over time. Economic and capitalist frameworks often prioritize the commodification of life experiences to benefit a select group of corporate oligarchs.

Within the framework of colonialism, one finds intertwined elements of racism, Christendom, and the expansionist tendencies inherent in Western cultural history. These foundations have also contributed to the development of political concepts such as polity and democracy, as defined by ancient Greek thought. Notably, considerations of color, gender exploitation, and
class dynamics further confer privileges upon specific groups within distinct spaces and contexts.

A significant observation pertains to the prevalence of historical amnesia in the collective global consciousness, a phenomenon that allows for a discourse on totalitarianism, as articulated by Giroux. It is worth noting that, at the time of writing, this discourse may face a potential shift in the wake of the election results, possibly signaling a transformation akin to what has been termed the "Trumpian" era. These entrenched barriers and structures persist within the realm of media, where they are perpetuated, harnessed, and often leveraged for the gains of media entities. Concurrently, civic participation and engagement are subject to limitations or empowerment, particularly for marginalized populations, as new modes of governance undergo a process of transition.

Interpreting these unfolding events within the socio-historical context of this study leads me toward a deeper comprehension of the research methodology that aligns most effectively with my inquiries. This serves as a conduit to acquire fresh insights into civic and media engagement within the post- Trump era, particularly within the realm of critical consciousness, the full implications of which are yet to be fully elucidated. It is important to emphasize that my paradigm is not singular; I eschew the positivist empirical research frameworks that categorize Indigenous ways of knowing as mere "world views."

Instead, I assert Inafa'maolek as an Indigenous mode of cognition, distinct from a philosophy, belief system, or theoretical construct. This framework guides my understanding of the
research process and defines my position within it. In essence, my researcher positionality encompasses both the diverse settings in which I have situated my experiences across geographical landscapes (Guam, El Paso, and Central Texas), and the authentic validation of these professional observations, as evidenced by auto-biographical narratives along the Positive Deviance/PAR journey. This approach lends verifiable credibility to my insights and reflections.

Setting:

This research encompasses both virtual and physical spaces within a municipality spanning West Texas along the U.S.-Mexico border, Guam, USA, and a municipality in Central Texas.

Indigenous Qualitative Dominant Research Design

The proposed study adopts a qualitative orientation, delving into the existence of multiple realities. This approach acknowledges that ontological reality is socially constructed, with meaning intricately interwoven within the context of socio-cultural values and institutions, particularly in relation to intercultural public memory. The epistemological foundation of this Qualitative Research is rooted in the Guam-Chamorro Indigenous concept of "INAFA'MAOLEK." This serves as a framework for interpreting the diverse social constructions of meaning and knowledge. The research employs an inductive approach, seeking to generate theory from a subjective, holistic, and process-oriented perspective. The hypothesis put forth is tentative, poised to evolve in response to the exigencies of the study. The research design
adheres to a naturalistic framework that aligns with the socio-cultural environments under examination. Measurement protocols will be in line with non-standardized narrative methods, ensuring an ongoing and adaptable approach. Furthermore, the research design remains flexible, accommodating the application of Participatory Action Research (PAR), specifically the Positive Deviance (PD) approach.

Additionally, this proposal underscores a qualitative research approach, involving the collection of raw textual data and the continuous synthesis of sources. Data interpretation will entail drawing inferences and generalizing based on the reader's discernment. The validity and reliability of the study will be reinforced by the credibility of participants engaged in observations and focus group discussions. These participants will meet specific cultural criteria pertinent to problem-solving practices within their respective communities, particularly in relation to individual and group civic participation in public policy processes through media utilization.

To enhance confirmability, meticulous record-keeping of field notes will be maintained, and the data will be analyzed employing the Indigenous Knowledge framework and coded manually. The dependability of the study hinges on explicit procedures governing data collection. This encompasses method triangulation and the triangulation of sources, featuring structured observation and focus groups, surveys conducted pre- and post-Positive Deviance (PD) intervention, and selective interviews representing influential group members. Ongoing observations will be carried out to identify suitable participants for the study. Comprehensive documentation will encompass audio recordings of focus group sessions and interviews, field notes from observations, and the tracking of media stories related to the participants and their
patterns of media use for civic purposes. Transcription will be performed manually or via digital recording by the researcher or an assistant.

The transferability of the findings will expound upon the process of empowering community development among marginalized minority groups within dominant cultural settings. This study lays claim to ontological, educative, catalytic, and tactical authenticity.

**Mixed Methodology: Indigenous + Qualitative + Quantitative**

The proposed study underscores a mixed methodology research design, centered on an Indigenous approach to Participatory Action Research (PAR) termed Positive Deviance (PD). This approach serves as a decolonizing methodology that challenges fundamental tenets of Western epistemological frameworks. The triangulation of methods encompasses participatory action research and educational research for social justice, offering a cross-cultural perspective that guides the development of civic and media education curricula for both minority and majority communities. This is referred to as Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML) (Denzin, Lincoln & Smith, 2008; Tuhiwai-Smith, 1999/2012; Lichtman, 2013; Ladson-Billings & Tate, 2006; Clandinin, 2016).

The Indigenous mixed methodologies and methods model (see Appendix, Figure 3) illustrates how the qualitative, quantitative, and Indigenous methodologies shape the respective methods, guide data collection, and produce outcomes from an Indigenous-centered perspective. This dissertation employs a mixed methods and methodology approach with a qualitative focus during the implementation phase, concurrently with quantitative data collection and analysis, which inform the results. The data collection process will encompass implementation, priority,
integration point, and theoretical perspective, as outlined in Figure 4 (refer to the Appendix), aligning with the Positive Deviance method. This Indigenous-centered mixed methodology and methods encompasses two design types: Concurrent Triangulation (ConTri) and Concurrent Transformative (ConTrans). Within the ConTri x ConTrans design types, elements include implementation, priority, stage of integration, and theoretical perspective. Refer to Figures 5, 6, 7, and 8 (see Appendix) for the visual representation of these relationships.

METHODS

This dissertation employs a mixed-method approach, with an emphasis on the Positive Deviance method as the framework for collecting both qualitative and quantitative data (Creswell, 2003; Pascale, Sternin, & Sternin, 2010, p. 195-205; Tuhiwai-Smith, 2012). The data collection instruments are rooted in the Participatory Action Research (PAR) methodology of Positive Deviance, which involves the use of oral history and structured in-depth interviews to gather narratives from identified Positive Deviants. Additionally, the tools are designed to capture the researcher's interest in media tracking, encompassing traditional, online, and social media platforms. This includes a content analysis of civic and media engagement activities of both Indigenous and dominant cultural group members.

Furthermore, data collection efforts will incorporate participant-observation of both online and real-life civic activities involving members from both Indigenous and dominant cultural groups. Additionally, structured focus group discussions will be conducted with participants from these
groups. Lastly, a survey on civic and media engagement practices will be administered for further analysis.

Research Procedures

The participants selected for this study are individuals identified as Positive Deviants from various cultural groups across three distinct locales. These participants represent a diverse range of professional, educational, age, gender, and socio-economic backgrounds, all of whom have demonstrated an ability to devise innovative solutions to the intricate challenges associated with civic and media engagement for the purpose of effecting democratic social change. The sampling approach is purposeful, targeting a relatively small sample size of 22 participants (refer to Appendix B-Note 2). This method allows for an in-depth exploration that encompasses both dominant and minority civic leaders actively engaged in local city and county public policy-making processes in West and Central Texas, as well as in the U.S.-Western Pacific Island of Guam. Additionally, the sample includes community educators specializing in civic education, active civic and media participants, and members of Indigenous communities.

Data collection

Data collection will encompass an examination of civic and media engagement practices, both in online and real-world contexts. This analysis will involve the assessment of variables relative to notions of Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF) and Critical Consciousness (CritCon) particularly in relation to propaganda/education within specific civic activities, including advocacy and governance.
The comprehensive steps for this process are outlined as follows:

Step 1: Clearly define the problem and articulate the desired outcome.
Step 2: Identify the commonly practiced approaches.
Step 3: Investigate and observe the less conventional yet successful behaviors and strategies.
Step 4: Develop an action plan to encourage participants' learning initiatives based on the research findings.

The overall timeline for this process spans 16 weeks, encompassing stages of data collection, analysis, writing, and presentation (refer to Appendix Figure 9).

Step 1: Defining or Reframing the Problem

In this initial step, the research process will be initiated by inviting key representatives from diverse cultural groups, including minority demographics such as Asian/Pacific Islander, Hispanic, and Indigenous communities, as well as individuals from low socio-economic backgrounds, early career/college professionals, and members from intergenerational groups. Additionally, leaders from both the minority and white cultural groups within the community will be included, spanning various sectors including elected officials, city management, business, media, education, and non-profit organizations. The purpose of this gathering is to collaboratively generate and critically review an array of data sources. These will encompass information from the 2020 Census population and Quick Facts, the National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) Civics Assessment, scores from State Education Agencies in the domain of Social Studies, educational attainment statistics, voter registration data, 2020 November election turnout results, as well as market-specific media metrics. These metrics will be drawn from an assortment of sources,
including social media platforms, online activity within the market, academic journals, and broadcast measurements. This comprehensive examination will serve to establish a clear and substantiated rationale for the implementation of minority-focused civic education and media literacy initiatives within each respective market.

The purpose of the participant selection process is to identify individuals within both dominant and minority/Indigenous cultural groups who exemplify Positive Deviance (PD) within their respective communities, grouped by location (Guam, El Paso, and Killeen). This will specifically focus on Indigenous/minority members who operate within dominant groups and demonstrate active civic participation in the municipal policy-making process. The aim is to comprehensively describe and explore the intercultural experiences of these individuals as they navigate and surmount challenges in their endeavors to effect policy change through civic engagement and media practices.

Recruitment will be initiated through a snowball effect, leveraging both real-life and social media networks. The goal is to identify and engage at least one member per group, ensuring that each participant aligns with the demographic characteristics outlined in the APPENDIX. These individuals should be recognized within their communities for their notable contributions to effecting policy change, especially in instances where such outcomes were not initially anticipated.

TOOLS AND ACTIVITIES FOR DEFINING THE PROBLEM:
1. Initial Meeting: The researcher will convene an introductory meeting with potential participants to outline the purpose and objectives of the dissertation.
2. Cultural Identifiers: Collaboratively with invited community opinion leaders, the researcher will apply specific criteria for the selection of Positive Deviants (PD) within the community. These criteria include:

- Articulating a preferred future distinct from the past.
- Exploring the issues influencing the problem and prevailing behavioral norms.
- Compiling a list of common barriers and challenges associated with the problem.
- Identifying all stakeholders, including potential PD participants for observation and interviews.
- Disseminating the group's findings in a community-wide meeting.
- Utilizing baseline data through techniques like mapping and visual scoreboards.

3. Quantitative and Qualitative Data: The researcher will employ a combination of quantitative and qualitative data to reveal patterns in civic participation, civic education scores, and media literacy among community members. This data will be generated through facilitated discussions and database analysis.

4. Time-Framed Goal: The community will collectively establish a specific, time-bound objective, agreed upon by all stakeholders. For instance, a goal might be to enhance civic participation among both minority and dominant community members within a designated timeframe, such as two years.

STEP 2: THE COMMUNITY DETERMINES COMMON PRACTICES BY:
• Establishing Exclusion Criteria: Positive Deviants (PDs) will be selected based on stringent exclusion criteria. Only individuals or entities facing similar or more challenging barriers as others will be considered. This ensures that PDs are representative of diverse backgrounds, including minorities with low income, those in the post-high school to early college/professional career phase, as well as elite white individuals from medium- to high-income brackets spanning various generations and professions.

• Conducting Focus Groups: The researcher will facilitate and conduct online and real-life community focus groups in each targeted market (Guam, El Paso, and Killeen). These sessions will employ Liberating Structures, specifically Didactic Action Dialog, to engage as many community members as possible in meaningful conversations.

• Utilizing Discovery and Action Dialogues (DADs): The focus group discussions will be structured around the Discovery and Action Dialogues framework, adapted from Lipmanowicz and McCandless (2013). The key prompts for discussion will include:
  - How do you recognize the presence of problem X?
  - What strategies do you employ to effectively address problem X?
  - What impedes you from consistently implementing these strategies?
  - Can you identify individuals who frequently succeed in addressing problem X and surmounting associated barriers? What specific behaviors or practices contribute to their success?
  - Do you have any innovative ideas to share?
  - What steps need to be taken to realize these ideas? Are there volunteers for specific tasks?
  - Who else should be involved in this process?
STEP 3: THE COMMUNITY DISCOVERS THE PRESENCE OF POSITIVE DEVIANTS BY:

• Conducting Observations: The researcher will systematically observe online and real-life interactions, employing structured media tracking techniques, to discern communication patterns of Positive Deviants (PDs) engaged in the local municipal policy process within each specific cluster (Guam, El Paso, and Killeen).

• Conducting Interviews: The researcher will conduct in-depth interviews with a total target of 22 identified Positive Deviants from the research communities in Guam, El Paso, and Killeen. These interviews will focus on exploring common practices and normative behaviors related to civic engagement and media literacy, specifically in the context of processing, retaining, and discerning propaganda, as well as developing critical consciousness (for detailed protocols, refer to the APPENDIX). Participants will be recruited through a combination of online networking and in-person attendance at professional and social events.

• Identifying Uncommon Practices: Building upon established common practices from Step 2, the researcher will identify less conventional practices that exhibit positive outcomes. This process will involve the identification of baseline data benchmarks for civic and media engagement.

• Vetted Results Presentation: The researcher will present the identified Positive Deviant behaviors and outcomes to the entire community in an online meeting format. Additionally,
presentations will be made to community leaders, ensuring a comprehensive dissemination of the findings in each targeted market (Guam, El Paso, and Killeen).

TOOLS AND ACTIVITIES TO IDENTIFY AND LEARN ABOUT COMMON BEHAVIORS (STEP 2) AND IDENTIFY BEHAVIORS AND STRATEGIES FROM POSITIVE DEVIANTS (STEP 3):

• Conducting In-depth Interviews: The researcher will conduct structured interviews, either online or in real-life settings, to monitor civic and media engagement practices. This process will involve:

• Implementing Discovery and Action Dialogues (DADs): Adapted from the work of Lipmanowicz and McCandless (2013), these dialogues will be employed to foster meaningful conversations and elicit insights from participants.

• Organizing Community Feedback Sessions: The researcher will facilitate sessions to gather community feedback on the findings related to Positive Deviants.

• Conducting Online Community Education Sessions: These sessions will assist community leaders in identifying activities characteristic of Positive Deviants. A survey questionnaire will be administered to group members, allowing them to self-report their levels of civic and media engagement. The survey will encompass details such as inquiries regarding propaganda.
• Applying the Civic Media Participation Equation: Drawing from Zuckerman's framework, the researcher will employ the equation "I will act if C < BP + ΣI" to assess civic effectiveness. This equation considers whether the cost (C) of a civic action is lower than the sum of perceived benefit (BP) and the actions of peer influencers (ΣI).

• Assisting with Data Collection and Analysis: The researcher will aid the group in collecting and analyzing their findings within the context of media market monitoring.

• Identifying Positive Deviants: Individuals meeting established criteria will be identified as Positive Deviants for further study.

• Conducting In-depth Interviews with Positive Deviants: The researcher will conduct individual interviews, either online or in real-life settings, with identified Positive Deviants from the research community (Guam, El Paso, and Killeen). These interviews will follow the Civic Engagement Interview instrument, adapted from Lee & Lee (1939).

  o Exploring their Journey: Participants will reflect on their journey, sharing personal experiences related to civic participation, including acts, costs, benefits, perceptions, effectiveness, and behaviors of peers, colleagues, and family.

  o Analyzing Propaganda: Participants will choose an example of propaganda and provide insights on the propagandist's intentions, methods, and alignment with societal interests.
Life History Technique: Participants will reflect on their current life values, any changes from the past, and the influences that have shaped these beliefs.

Final Reflections: Participants will offer concluding thoughts on their experiences and insights gained.

STEP 4: THE COMMUNITY DESIGNS AND DEVELOPS ACTIVITIES TO EXPAND THE PD SOLUTIONS BY:

The researcher will take the lead in developing a comprehensive curriculum and pedagogical framework for a community-based civic education program. This program will be tailored to young adults, post-high school individuals, as well as members of minority, Indigenous, and dominant cultural groups. It aims to empower these groups with essential knowledge and skills for active democratic citizenship, both in online and real-life forums. The key objectives of this program include:

• Broadening the Solution Space: By involving various stakeholders, the program will seek to apply the established Positive Deviant (PD) behaviors and strategies to a wider context.

• Starting with Small-scale Initiatives: The program will initiate projects on a modest scale to showcase early successes, thus building confidence and momentum.
• Fostering New Connections: Efforts will be made to connect individuals who may not have previously interacted, promoting cross-cultural engagement and collaboration.

• Ensuring Inclusivity: The program will target a diverse range of community members, ensuring that the benefits of civic education are accessible to all.

• Providing Safe Learning Environments: Participants will have the opportunity to learn by doing, with the assurance of a supportive peer network and a secure space for experimentation.

• Employing Creative Approaches: Innovative methods, such as media literacy workshops and civic participation fairs, will be employed to actively engage the community in the learning process.

TOOLS AND ACTIVITIES FOR DESIGNING OPPORTUNITIES FOR COMMUNITY MEMBERS TO PRACTICE THE DISCOVERED BEHAVIORS AND STRATEGIES:

• The researcher will convene a community meeting, whether in an online or real-life setting, to present the Positive Deviance (PD) inquiry findings. The goal will be to identify a working group of volunteers who will form an action team, guided by the researcher's advice.

• The researcher will conduct workshops for the action team, which will include members of the resource team and self-selected volunteers who have actively participated in the process. These workshops will address various aspects such as finance, budgeting, business development, staffing, and day-to-day operations.
• In collaboration with community leadership, the researcher will develop an annual action plan. This plan will also involve creating an Executive Committee and formulating a capital development plan to ensure the sustained operation of the initiatives. Clear organizational roles and responsibilities will be defined.

THE COMMUNITY MEASURES, MONITORS, AND EVALUATES THE EFFECTIVENESS OF ITS INITIATIVES BASED ON THE PD FINDINGS BY:

• The researcher will conduct a workshop for community leaders aimed at supporting the development of an evaluative framework. This framework will draw on the Indigenous concept of Inafo'maolek and be tailored to the specific characteristics and needs of the local community. It will guide the assessment, analysis, and actions taken based on gathered information.

• Another workshop for community leaders will focus on translating progress into tangible outcomes. The aim is to engage the community in establishing its own set of indicators to monitor progress. These indicators will encompass both quantitative and qualitative measures of behavioral and social change. Examples may include increases in voter registration, voter turnout, greater minority representation in policy changes, and higher representation of minorities in elected positions and community leadership roles.
• The workshop led by the researcher will place significant emphasis on creating culturally appropriate methods for communicating data to the community. This approach will be based on a localized understanding of language, social hierarchies, familial and organizational relations, operating at various levels from village to village, family to family, and clan to clan. Distinctions between rural and urban regions will also be considered.

• A research workshop training component will cover grant application, administration, reporting, funding, and evaluation of PD Civic and Media Engagement initiatives. This will be carried out on an annual basis with regular, frequent updates provided on a quarterly basis.

As the process matures and demonstrates successful impact on the identified problem, other communities and groups may express interest in adopting a similar approach. Considering this, the researcher will undertake comprehensive documentation of the study for the Indigenous community. This will include an evaluation of program effectiveness, pinpointing best practices for enhancing civic participation through media literacy. Additionally, the results will be shared for the benefit of other communities, allowing them to explore how the PD process can aid in addressing similar challenges. This dissemination effort may involve publication and the delivery of academic and community-based presentations and workshops.

Ethical Considerations

Considering the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic, this research endeavor will strictly adhere to the guidelines recommended by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC).
Furthermore, all aspects of this study will be conducted in strict accordance with the guidelines outlined by the Collaborative Institutional Training Initiative program for Social and Behavioral Responsible Conduct of Research within the realms of Social, Behavioral, and Education Sciences Responsible Conduct of Research.

Data Analysis Approach

The data analysis in this study will employ a comprehensive approach involving Hand Coding and Analysis, utilizing the Indigenous Inafa’maolek mediation framework as outlined in the provided Appendix. This framework draws on an Indigenous Pacific-Islander method of mediation and meaning-making, rooted in the profound concept of Inafa’maolek. It encapsulates the unique ideology, ontology, and epistemology of Chamorro-Tao Tao Tano society, upholding values and philosophies that are intrinsically tied to the pursuit of self-determination. It is important to note that this approach significantly differs from conventional Western positivist mediation and research practices.

Furthermore, the data analysis process will integrate Rossatto's Critical Consciousness Chart (Figure 9) to facilitate Media Content Analysis. This will enable the identification of civic themes and assess the frequency of media usage among diverse cultural groups, particularly in the context of Indigenous self-determination.

Significance of the Study
The outcomes of this research hold substantial implications for the formulation of a comprehensive media literacy curriculum tailored to foster civic engagement and education within a minority-majority demographic residing in the U.S.-MX border region and the Pacific Islander community. This study delineates the operational practices of a diverse array of cultural groups actively engaged in effecting social transformation. By empowering civic participation through strategic media utilization, this endeavor seeks to bolster democratic agency, with particular emphasis on fortifying the capacities of Indigenous communities.
CHAPTER IV
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

Introduction to the Data Collection Process

Commencing with Chapter I, we embark on a narrative journey delving into the ascent of Donald Trump to the White House in 2016. As of the spring of 2023, Donald Trump currently resides in Mar-a-Lago, Florida, marking the initiation of his new Presidential Campaign for the upcoming 2024 election cycle. This juncture presents urgent challenges that permeate our environment, society, and culture. These challenges stand as stark reminders of the potential collapse of first-world Western nations across the global landscape, threatening the very foundations of our democracy.

At the national level, Republican conservatives are advocating for a disunification reminiscent of civil war dynamics, seeking to address the prominence of fringe voices that exert influence within our public sphere. Concurrently, within the Texan Legislature, bills are being considered to defund diversity, equity, and inclusion programs, with potential implementation as early as September 2023. This legislative reality aligns with the prevailing sentiments of a substantial majority of state-level GOP elected officials. The redistricting efforts led by conservatives have effectively undermined the electoral process, with legal battles being waged in both district and higher levels of federal courts. This is further compounded by the substantial number of federal judges appointed during Donald Trump's tenure.
Simultaneously, GOP units view these advancements as upholding the integrity of a national promise, safeguarding the institutional structures that underpin the way of life for future generations. However, it is undeniably clear that these institutional bulwarks are currently under siege, warranting a comprehensive and nuanced analysis of the data that underlies this complex and ever-evolving political landscape.

**Layout of Data Collection from Three Different Sites-Western Pacific Island, West and Central Texas**

On March 2, 2022, the researcher initiated the data collection process by distributing a Media Survey Questionnaire (refer to Appendix B) via email to participants located in three distinct regions: the U.S. Western Pacific Island, West Texas, and Central Texas. Of the respondents, three individuals completed the survey, with two hailing from Central Texas and one from the West Texas study area. Following this, on March 12, 2022, the researcher sent out an observational email notice, proposing potential dates for coordinating future in-person interviews. Over a span of almost three weeks (from March 20 to April 9, 2022), the researcher conducted online observations (semi-structured) pertaining to the tracking of participant civic and media engagement practices. Additionally, in-person observations were made at various community engagement events throughout Central Texas. On March 7, 2022, an email was dispatched to participants to coordinate the scheduling of a focus group session. A MICROSOFT/TEAMS link was provided for the focus group, with two potential dates (3/14 or 3/18) proposed. The latter date was ultimately selected. The questions posed during the focus group were structured and open-ended in nature. Subsequently, on March 18, 2022, the
researcher conducted the focus group, which included two participants exclusively from the West Texas study location.

Starting from March 31, 2022, the researcher commenced the process of scheduling personal interviews with participants, facilitated through email correspondence. All interviews were conducted online, spanning from March 12, 2022, to May 10, 2022. In July of 2022, the researcher initiated the transcription process for focus group notes, voice recorder notes of observation field notes, and eight personal interviews. Subsequently, the data underwent analysis utilizing an Indigenous Qualitative dominant Triangulation of Mixed Methods approach (INDIG +QUAL+quan). This analysis involved manual coding in accordance with the Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF) and Rossatto’s Critical Consciousness (CritCon) Chart.

**Participants Recruitment Process**

The recruitment process for this study involved outreach to (22) identified recruits across three distinct regions: the U.S. Western Pacific, West Texas, and Central Texas. Initially, (8) participants were identified. None of these participants self-identified as members of the Anglo/White/Dominant Culture. However, this did not significantly impact data collection, as minority participants in government positions were able to represent dominant cultural group narratives when analyzing minority voices from perspectives of power among the three communities studied. Participants were coded using pseudonym initials for first and last names, location determined by area code, gender indicated by male (m) or female (f), ethnic cultural
background labeled as Indigenous (INDIG), Pacific Islander (PAC ISL), Black (BLK), Mexican American (MEX AMER), Caucasian/Anglo/White (WHT), and professional status.

1. Savanah Delisle (SD-915f) [INDIG + ASN-PAC ISL+FIL/AMER]/education/civilian-ISD/MA-FED spouse: West Texas; female; Indigenous Asian Pacific Islander of Filipina American descent; education professional; civilian employed by an Independent School District; holds a Master of Arts in Education; spouse of a federal employee. Immigrated to the U.S. and grew up in poverty.


3. Wyatt Cruz (WC-671m) [INDIG + PAC ISL+ GU/AMER]/business-public admin-former State Leg and Gov Staff/civilian-ROTC/PhD: U.S. Western Pacific Island; male; Indigenous Pacific Islander of Guam/U.S. descent; business professional with a background in various capacities of public administration; served as a former Territorial Legislator, Executive Chief of Staff to a Territorial Governor, U.S. Congressional Delegate candidate; staff to local policy makers; involved in U.S. Navy Reserved Officer Training Corps in high school; holds a doctorate degree. Raised in a working-class household.
4. John Acosta (JA-254m) [INDIG + PAC ISL + GU/AMER]/business/veteran-CityGovEDC/HS: 
Central Texas; male; Indigenous Pacific Islander of Guam/U.S. descent; business entrepreneur; 
U.S. Armed Forces Veteran (enlisted); active in municipal government as a board member for a 
local Economic Development Corporation; candidate for various municipal offices (City Council 
and County Commissioner); high school education. Raised in poverty.

5. Connor Juarez (CJ-915m) [INDIG + MEX AMER]/city management-CMcomms/civilian/BA: 
West Texas; male; Indigenous Mexican American; city management communications/public 
affairs executive; civilian—no military connection; holds a Bachelor of Arts degree. Raised in 
poverty.

6. John Jimenez (JJ-915m) [INDIG + MEX AMER]/business-nonprofit-CityCouncil spouse and 
staff/military/MA: West Texas; male; Indigenous Mexican American; business and non-profit 
organization executive/lobbyist/political communications consultant, former city council and 
U.S. Congressional Representative policymaker staff; spouse of an incumbent city council 
representative; briefly attended the U.S Military Academy at West Point; holds a Master of Arts 
degree. Raised in a working-class household.

7. Martha Bartholeum (MB-254f) [INDIG + WHT AMER]/elected official-CityCouncil/military 
spouse/HS: Central Texas; female; Indigenous/Native American/White Anglo-American 
descent; an elected city council representative; spouse of U.S. Armed Forces Veteran; high 
school graduate. Raised in poverty under foster case conditions.
8. Laura Nichols (LN-254f) [BLK AMER]/elected official-CityCouncil and County Party Chair/veteran/HS: Central Texas; female; Black-American descent; an elected city council representative (incumbent), and Democratic Party Chair as the first Black person to hold both offices; a U.S. Army Veteran; high school education. Raised in poverty.

The final participant count was eight (8). For the Email Informed Consent template sent to participants on February 28, 2022, refer to Appendix B. The cultural groups represented encompassed minority and elite/white members among community leaders, with varying professional backgrounds in elected positions, city management/public administration, business, media, education, and non-profit organizations.

*Step 1 of the Positive Deviance (PD) method, the community defines or reframes the problem:*

Step 1 of the Positive Deviance (PD) method involves the community defining or reframing the problem. In this study, participants were selected based on specific criteria, including being from a low socio-economic background and demonstrating effective civic and media engagement practices for social change in their respective communities. During the participant recruitment process, each member of the study community met with the researcher to review data describing the problem. This data included information from various sources such as Census 2020 population and Quick Facts, NAEP Civics Assessment, State Education Agency Scores in Social Studies, educational attainment data, voter registration, 2020 November election turnout results, and media market share figures obtained from social media accounts, online
activity, academic journals, and broadcast metrics. The researcher then conducted a Triangulation of Mixed Methods Indig+QUAL analysis. This involved coding the collected data, which included survey results, transcriptions, and field notes. The coding was done using an Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF) to identify patterns of DML (Digital Media Literacy) activities representing critical consciousness behavior.

Provided here are three concepts that remain significant in understanding the dynamics of social and cultural systems:

1. Media and Propaganda Beliefs: Media and propaganda beliefs - institutional discourse patterns which represent ideas to promote organizational neoliberal social constructs of power and privilege.

2. Value systems - axiological discourse patterns demonstrating moral, ethical, philosophical concepts which influence social expectations of acceptable behaviors.

3. Notions of public memory - remembering and forgetting of cultural design which advance narratives of public knowledge and sociological ecosystems.

**Figure 4.1: Patterns of DML activities representing critical consciousness behavior**

1. Media and Propaganda Beliefs:
- This concept involves the study of how media and propaganda play a role in shaping public opinion and beliefs. It looks at how institutional discourse patterns are utilized to promote ideologies, often aligned with neoliberal social constructs of power and privilege. It's important to analyze the ways in which information is disseminated, controlled, and framed within society.

2. Notions of Public Memory:
- This concept delves into how societies collectively remember and forget historical events and narratives. It's about examining the cultural design and narratives that influence public knowledge and sociological ecosystems. This includes understanding which events are emphasized, celebrated, or downplayed, and how these choices impact a society's collective identity and understanding of its history.

3. Value Systems:
- This concept focuses on the moral, ethical, and philosophical principles that guide societal behavior. It encompasses the discourse patterns through which these values are communicated and reinforced. Understanding value systems is crucial for comprehending why certain behaviors are deemed acceptable or unacceptable within a given culture or community.

The interplay of these concepts is particularly evident in a societal framework. For instance, media and propaganda beliefs wield substantial influence over public memory by shaping which events or narratives are given prominence. Concurrently, value systems exert a significant influence over both media and public memory, informing the framing and interpretation of events, as well as the messages conveyed through various media platforms. Additionally, it is
crucial to acknowledge that these concepts are susceptible to transformation over time and may adapt in response to shifts in cultural, political, and technological landscapes. In aggregate, these observed patterns of Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML) activities serve as a foundational basis for formulating curricular strategies geared towards fostering civic agency. These strategies are further nuanced by the mediating influence of specific cultural knowledge systems, including institutional beliefs in media and propaganda, notions of public memory, and underlying value systems. Throughout this study, an Indigenous Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF) is employed. In the analytical phase, the researcher meticulously identifies each activity's resonance with the meaning ascribed by the conceptualized 'Other.' This process is facilitated by a distinct color-coding system, as outlined herein.

**DML Findings from Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF)**

It's clear that the Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF) is a vital tool rooted in Indigenous Native Chamoru beliefs and value systems, specifically designed to foster and maintain harmony within social relations. Developed by Indigenous Pacific Islander scholars from Guam, the framework draws on cultural concepts such as respetu’ (respect), mang’nge (blessings from elders), mama’lao (shame), chen’chule (gift), chelu’ (sibling), and patgon (children). These core beliefs reflect the deep cultural wisdom and values of the Chamoru community. They serve as guiding principles in maintaining meaningful and respectful interactions among community members. It's evident that the IMF not only offers a structured approach to mediation but also ensures that cultural values are upheld, contributing to the overall harmony of social relations within the community. The utilization of such a framework in this
study demonstrates a profound commitment to understanding civic engagement within this cultural context. It also highlights the importance of respecting and valuing the wisdom embedded in Indigenous belief systems. This approach has the potential to offer unique and invaluable insights into how these cultural values influence civic agency and social dynamics.

The Indigenous Inafa'maolek Mediation Framework (IMF) draws on the rich cultural values of the Chamoru community, emphasizing key concepts that are foundational to their way of life:

1. Respetu': This involves showing deep respect to elders and other significant individuals within the family and community. It's a recognition of the wisdom and experience that comes with age.

2. Manginge: This is a physical expression of respect, akin to a kiss, where one gently touches their nose to the back part of a person’s right hand. It's a gesture of reverence toward elders and those in positions of authority.

3. Mamahlao: This term encapsulates the feeling of being shamefaced, embarrassed, or ashamed. It acknowledges the importance of humility and being aware of one's actions in relation to the community.

4. Chenchule: This refers to the act of giving, particularly in the form of a present or monetary donation. It's not tied to any specific event, highlighting the value of generosity in everyday life.

5. Che’lu: This signifies the relationships with siblings. It underscores the significance of family bonds and the responsibilities that come with them.
6. Påtgon: This principle emphasizes that children are treasured and that the responsibility for their upbringing is shared by the entire community. It highlights the collective effort in nurturing and guiding the younger generation.

By incorporating these values into the framework, the analysis gains a profound cultural context. It allows for a deeper understanding of how these principles influence various aspects of civic engagement and social dynamics within the Chamoru community. This approach not only respects the Indigenous wisdom but also sheds light on the unique strengths and perspectives that come from this cultural heritage.

![Indigenous Inafa'maolek Mediation Framework](image)

**Figure 4.2: Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework**

The Indigenous Inafa'maolek Mediation Framework (IMF) provides a valuable lens through which to understand the patterns of transformative critical consciousness behaviors within the
community. By utilizing color codes, the IMF offers a visual representation of how cultural values like respetu', mang'nge, and others intersect with civic and media engagement activities. This framework not only helps to identify and categorize these behaviors, but also establishes a theoretical foundation for recognizing the importance of intercultural translation space, often referred to as "Knowing Other." It highlights the significance of understanding and respecting different cultural perspectives, a vital aspect in promoting meaningful and effective civic and media engagement. By aligning these transformative critical consciousness behaviors with specific dimensions of the IMF, the analysis gains a deeper cultural context. It sheds light on how these behaviors are not only influenced by, but also contribute to, the rich cultural heritage of the Chamoru community. This approach not only acknowledges the strength of Indigenous knowledge, but also underscores its crucial role in shaping community dynamics and engagement practices.

**IMF Color Coding**

The IMF color code serves as a valuable tool in understanding and categorizing various concepts, activities, and practices within the mediation framework, particularly from the perspective of "Knowing Other." Each color corresponds to a specific dimension of the framework:

- **Respetu (red):** Symbolizes the concept, activity, or practice of paying honor and respect to others. This dimension emphasizes the importance of recognizing and valuing individuals in the community.
- Mang’nge (blue): Represents the concept, activity, or practice of establishing rules of engagement. It highlights the significance of setting clear guidelines and expectations for interactions and relationships.

- Mamahlao (aqua): Signifies diverse emotional human feelings, encompassing concepts, activities, or practices related to emotions like shame, humility, and embarrassment. This dimension acknowledges the complexity of human emotions in social interactions.

- Chenchule (green): Reflects the concept, activity, or practice of assigning value based on social capitalization. It emphasizes the significance of recognizing and appreciating contributions and offerings within the community.

- Che’lu (yellow): Focuses on the concept, activity, or practice of establishing valued sibling relationships. This dimension highlights the importance of familial connections and bonds within the community.

- Patgon (pink/magenta): Represents the concept, activity, or practice of empowering actions for the benefit of future generations. It underscores the responsibility of preserving and enhancing the well-being of upcoming generations.

By applying this color code, the mediation framework gains a visual representation that aids in understanding the various dimensions and their respective roles in shaping community dynamics. It offers a structured approach to analyzing and interpreting behaviors, values, and interactions within the community.

An example, below, represents an Artificial Intelligence rendering of the IMF coding system (https://www.wordclouds.com/).
The subsequent step in the analysis delves into these concepts, as discerned through Rossatto’s Critical Consciousness framework chart (2019). The assessment is inherently
subjective, contingent on the researcher’s application of the IMF coding and the distinctive attributes of the activities, which are juxtaposed against prevailing institutional-driven cultural paradigms (delinking). This is then counterposed with mainstream practices that embody innovative application or otherwise (rethinking), and finally, the dynamic evolution of behavioral practices with the potential for humanization and the cultivation of cultural equity, or the lack thereof (relinking). The ensuing figure provides an illustrative depiction:

Figure 4.4: CRITCON Process

By dissecting these facets of critical consciousness, specific behaviors emerge as promising candidates for expansion within community education curriculum development.

Analysis Process (Coding and Memoing) & Units of Observation
The analysis process involves classifying each civic engagement and media literacy practice based on its propaganda characteristics and its association with the degree of remembering and forgetting propaganda in relation to critical consciousness. This classification is conducted for both Indigenous-Minority and Dominant-Elite cultural group opinion leaders, allowing for a comparative examination of civic and media engagement practices. The observational units under scrutiny are the specific civic and media literacy practices, each representing a distinct aspect of the analysis. The unit of analysis pertains to the assessment of remembering and forgetting propaganda, further categorized based on its classification.

The initial step for the researcher involves delineating the dimensions of cultural systems, utilizing representations for Media/Institutional Cultural Beliefs, Public Memory, and Value Systems. Subsequently, the researcher applies the Inafa'maolek Mediation Framework (IMF) to code the transcription. This coding is aligned with the characteristic notions associated with Inafa'maolek, such as Respetu, Mang'nge, Mamahlao, Chenchule, Che'lu, and Patgon. These codes are then examined to ascertain how the behavioral patterns align with modes of critical consciousness, namely Conforming, Reforming, and Transforming, as defined within the IMF. This step entails a meticulous hand-coding process, contextualized within the framework of the Indigenous Inafa’maolek mediation framework. The coding endeavors to identify uncommon civic and media engagement practices within this specific PD community, reflecting PD behaviors that exemplify transformative facets of critical consciousness. The community is characterized by its nature as INDIG/MINORITY, demographic diversity in terms of gender, dominance in socio-economic strata, U.S./American nationality, educational attainment at the high school level or higher, affiliation with the U.S. military, and involvement in civic government leadership roles. These distinct civic and media engagement practices are further
categorized based on their foundation in media/institutional knowledge, public memory, and value systems. Each category reveals transformative insights, classified as epistemological, ontological, or axiological in nature.

*Step 2 of The Positive Deviance (PD) method: The Community Determines Common Practices:*

Step 2 of the Positive Deviance (PD) method involves the active participation of the community, which, in this context, refers to the participants across the three settings. This step is crucial for identifying common practices related to education and propaganda within the community. The process began with a comprehensive media survey questionnaire, aimed at establishing a baseline understanding of the mediation frameworks employed by the participants. This questionnaire likely included questions about participants' perceptions and examples of propaganda. Following the survey, the researcher conducted both online and real-life observations. This involved systematically tracking participants' behaviors in online media spaces, focusing on content related to education and propaganda in the context of civic engagement. Patterns related to the remembering and forgetting of propaganda were carefully noted. Finally, a Civic Engagement Focus Group was organized and conducted using specific protocols. The purpose of this focus group was to gather insights into common practices and normative behaviors related to civic engagement and media usage within the community.
By combining these methods, the research aimed to gain a comprehensive understanding of the prevalent practices and beliefs within the community regarding education, propaganda, and civic engagement. This step lays the groundwork for further analysis and interpretation.

**Media Survey**

The media survey played a crucial role in understanding the participants' perspectives on propaganda and critical consciousness. Here's a breakdown of the findings:

1. **Survey Respondents**: Three participants from Central Texas and West Texas completed the survey. Their responses indicated a tendency towards conforming and reforming notions of critical consciousness rather than transformative consciousness.

2. **IMF Conceptual Dimension and Critical Consciousness**: Each element of the IMF conceptual dimension (Respetu', Mang'nge, Mama'hla'o, Chen'chule, and Patgon) was associated with a specific degree of critical consciousness. For example, Respetu' was linked with a conforming perspective, Mang'nge with reforming, Mama'hla'o with conforming, and so on. This suggested a prevailing conforming bias in the identified propaganda practices.

3. **Participant-Provided Questions**: The participants were given the opportunity to pose questions about their encounters with propaganda. While none of these inquiries were classified as transformative consciousness-based, most demonstrated reformative ideations of critical consciousness. The most frequently occurring inquiry related to Mang'nge (social rules), followed by Mama'hla'o (emotion), Chen'chule (gift/money), and Chelu' (sibling), which were equally distributed.
Overall, the survey provided valuable insights into how participants perceived and engaged with propaganda, shedding light on their critical consciousness and mediation frameworks. It served as a foundation for further analysis and interpretation of the data.

An example, below, represents an Artificial Intelligence rendering of the Survey coding system (https://www.wordclouds.com/).
The concept of Mang'nge, which relates to sociological rules and norms, aligns with the idea that people play a central role in assigning meaning to propaganda. This perspective emphasizes the significance of individuals in shaping the interpretation and impact of media messages. It
highlights the dynamic interaction between people, messages, and the media, underlining the importance of considering the human element in any analysis of propaganda and communication. This people-centered approach recognizes that meaning-making is a collaborative process influenced by societal norms and individual interpretations.

**Structured Observations- online media tracking and various community engagement events**

On March 12, 2022, the researcher initiated the observation phase by dispatching an email notification proposing prospective dates for coordinating forthcoming personal interviews. The observations were conducted over an extensive period of nearly three weeks, spanning from March 20 to April 9, 2022. These observations, characterized as semi-structured, centered on online media tracking and diverse community engagement events across Central Texas. The overarching objective was to discern discernible patterns of civic and media involvement within diverse cultural cohorts, with a specific focus on Indigenous Self-Determination. Notably, a salient trend surfaced in the realm of civic engagement: a recurrent pattern of remembering and forgetting propaganda. On March 12, 2022, the researcher sent an observation email notice with proposed dates to begin coordination for a future personal interview. Observations occurred over an almost three-week period (March 20-April 9, 2022) during online observations (semi-structured) having to do with online media tracking and various community engagement events throughout Central Texas. The purpose of which is to identify civic and media activity patterns among various cultural groups, as it pertains to Indigenous Self-Determination. Specifically, propaganda in civic engagement emerged as a pattern of remembering and forgetting.
Structured On-line Media Content Tracking-Remembering and Forgetting Patterns

After applying the Indigenous Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF) for hand coding, the identified patterns of Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML) behavior are subsequently contextualized in relation to the analysis of online media content. This analysis, which encompasses media article data collected during the observation phase, serves to delineate civic and media activity patterns within diverse cultural groups, particularly concerning Indigenous Self-Determination. The researcher conducted online media tracking from March 20 to April 9, 2022. Through the Mozilla web browser and search engine platform, the researcher queried articles related to "indigenous + self-determination." This search algorithm yielded several pertinent articles, which were subsequently forwarded to the researcher’s email address and analyzed for relevant themes pertaining to propaganda within civic engagement (patterns of remembering and forgetting). A total of four articles were identified meeting the established criteria.

The U.S. Department of the Interior, Office of Insular Affairs, has been mandated by Congress to oversee the affairs of the Insular Areas on behalf of the federal government, akin to the role of the Bureau of Indian Affairs within the same federal agency. Since 1901, the U.S. Supreme Court has adjudicated on the legitimacy of an "Un-Incorporated Territory" as a political status, thereby establishing the intergovernmental relationship between the United States and several Island governments. These Insular Areas encompass various U.S. Territories, including Guam, American Samoa, Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands, Puerto Rico, and the Virgin Islands. This territorial status has been critiqued by Native Indigenous Islander scholars, public knowledge, and their respective Island governments as a contentious aspect of the imperial-colonial relationship central to this dissertation.
Online Media Tracking-U.S. Un-Incorporated Territorial Policy

This section elucidates findings pertaining to civic and media practices observed in online platforms, exemplifying their effectiveness within Indigenous communities to bolster self-determination and enhance democratic participation. These practices were gleaned from the direct experiences of an elected U.S. Congressional Delegate, shedding light on how systemic racism has historically and presently impacted the residents of U.S. Territories, and the prevailing discourse on these territories in our Nation’s Capital. Structural racism casts a profound influence on U.S.-Territorial policy formulation, embodying a persistent colonial issue with tangible ramifications for the affected populace. In this context, a coalition of twelve national civil rights advocacy organizations called upon the Biden-Harris administration's Department of Justice to repudiate the Insular Cases, generating two pivotal findings with respect to civic and media practices for effecting social change: 1. the identification of the issue; 2. the formation of a well-organized and reputable advocacy group for support. The foundation of this case challenges the racially biased assumptions underpinning the U.S. Supreme Court's 1901 legal rulings establishing "Un-incorporated Territorial status." One especially potent action entail composing and dispatching a letter to a designated official, presenting a compelling case for immediate action. In one instance, such a missive implores the federal government to promptly discontinue reliance on the Insular Cases in any present or future legal proceedings. This practice holds substantial public weight, as it condemns the Insular Cases and the territorial incorporation doctrine by constructing an organizational website, initiating a press release campaign, and disseminating information through influential digital social networks (such as LinkedIn). The
premise rests on the notion that the U.S. Department of Justice ought to feel a sense of shame {mama'hlao} in persisting to rely on the Insular Cases to defend the colonial framework in U.S. territories. Moreover, the parent organization, Equally American, advocates for equality and civil rights for the 3.5 million residents of U.S. territories, 95% of whom are people of color. This umbrella organization extends invitations to various minority civil rights groups, including the American Civil Liberties Union, Asian American Legal Defense and Education Fund, Ayuda Legal Puerto Rico, Brennan Center for Justice, Demos, Hispanic Federation, Human Rights Campaign, Lambda Legal, LatinoJustice PRLDEF, Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights Under Law, NAACP Legal Defense and Education Fund, Inc., OCA-Asian Pacific American Advocates, and the Washington Lawyer's Committee for Civil Rights and Urban Affairs.

Furthermore, another letter-writing campaign underscores the Department of Justice's lack of support for decolonial legal arguments in oral arguments (United States v. Vaiolo Madero). Likewise, this campaign spotlights the reliance of the Biden-Harris Justice Department on Insular Cases to contest the right to citizenship in U.S. territories (Fitisemanu v. United States). Particularly significant in terms of public memory, this letter-writing initiative COMMEMORATES the 100th anniversary of Balzac v. Porto Rico—the final case in the series of the Insular Cases—as the U.S. approaches an April 10th remembrance. According to Neil Weare, President of Equally American, this commemoration signifies a call "to reject the Insular Cases as DOJ has other racist Supreme Court decisions." Mr. Weare, a U.S.-raised individual of Caucasian heritage who hails from Guam, embodies the value of alliance-building to advocate for these civic causes on broader platforms, akin to the legacy of the Civil Rights Movement and the leadership of Martin Luther King Jr.
Following the hand coding of data using the Indigenous Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF), these patterns of Digital Media Literacy (DML) behavior are further contextualized in the analysis of online media content tracking. This process involves the examination of media articles collected during the observation period, aimed at delineating civic and media activity patterns across diverse cultural groups, particularly in the context of Indigenous Self-Determination. The researcher conducted online media tracking from March 20 to April 9, 2022, utilizing the Mozilla web browser and a search engine platform. The search algorithm employed the key terms "indigenous + self-determination," resulting in the discovery of several pertinent articles. These were subsequently forwarded to the researcher's email address and analyzed for relevant themes relating to propaganda within civic engagement (patterns of remembering and forgetting). Ultimately, four articles were identified meeting the established criteria.

Table 4.1: Media Tracking Observation Coding Table-Indigenous Self-Determination (Online)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hon. Donna Christensen (USVI)</td>
<td>American Civil Liberties Union; Asian American Legal Defense and Education Fund; Ayuda Legal Puerto Rico; Brennan Center for Justice; Demos, Hispanic Federation; Human Rights Campaign; Lambda Legal; LatinoJustice PRLDEF, Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights Under Law; NAACP Legal Defense and Education Fund, Inc.; OCA-Asian Pacific American Advocates;</td>
<td>[remembering naming people of CHamoru ancestry--identity]</td>
<td>[remembering Angel Santos of the Chamoru Nation Traditional Council;]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hon. Robert Underwood (Guam)</td>
<td>EA President, Neil Weare</td>
<td>[how systemic racism has impacted and continues to impact residents of U.S. Territories]</td>
<td>[12 national civil rights organizational advocacy coalition]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
[how people really talk about U.S. territories on Washington]  
[structural racism impact U.S.-Territorial policy process]  
[America's colonies problem]  
[impact on people]  
[first-hand experience]  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>calling on Biden-Harris Department of Justice</th>
<th>activist turned senator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[reject the Insular Cases]</td>
<td>[seeking public office as an &quot;activist&quot;--difficult balancing act]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[racist assumptions represented in legal Supreme Court 1901 decision establishing Unincorporated Territorial status]</td>
<td>[Former Sen. Angel Santos, one of few to accomplish, Robert Underwood, former U.S. Congressman and activist]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[sent letter, urging to immediately case relying on the Insular Cases in any present or future cases]</td>
<td>[PD: &quot;Angel Santos is the greatest example of activist who became a politician&quot;, said Underwood.]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[publicly condemn Insular Cases and territorial incorporation doctrine]</td>
<td>[Activism x advocacy; trying to go against the flow--&quot;trying to change the flow of a society by creating a general perspective and power and influence]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[DOJ should be ashamed {mama'hlao} to continue relying on Insular Cases to defend colonial framework in U.S. territories]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Equally American, advocates for equality and civil rights for 3.5 million residents of U.S. territories--95% of whom are people of color]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
[letter highlights lack of support for decolonial legal argument by DOJ in oral arguments in United States v. Vaello Madero]
[letter highlights Biden-Harris Justice Department reliance on Insular Cases to argue against the right to citizenship in U.S. territories in Fitisemanu v. United States]
[letter REMEMBERS 100th anniversary of Balzac v. Porto Rico—the last of the Insular Cases—approaches on April 10...to reject the Insular Cases as DOJ has other racist Supreme Court decisions," Weare added."]

that is not normally available,"
[being an advocate is not being an activist, Underwood]
[activist goes out and organizes communities, speak-outs, demonstrations]
[the title of activist refers to someone who actively fights for Chamoru rights to self-determination and the indigenous people's control over Guam land]
[Ultimate icon of Chamoru rights activism]
[leader of Nasion Chamoru]
[Santos worked to increase awareness of Chamoru rights]
by organizing sit-in protests and marches at the Governor's complex at Adelup]
[Santos' method of pushing the envelope]
[rare phenomenon--politician who is a true activist]
[politician lip service to decolonization efforts]
[decolonization rhetorical device of propaganda]
[anti-military activism shapes perception of policy maker influence in process]
[others perception of activism: not moving fast enough x moving too fast]
[mediation of decision: greater good of potential outcome...civic engagement formula applies]

[true activism involves generating power where there is none, and challenging ideas and policies”, Underwood]

[politicians’ priority is re-election, not challenging norms]

[Chamoru self-determination x Right to vote in presidential elections]

[activism for economic development; cultural heritage]
The table above offers a comprehensive exploration of civic engagement, media advocacy, and activism within the U.S. Territories, with a focus on Guam. Several noteworthy patterns and themes have been identified. Firstly, underscoring a concerted effort by a coalition of civil rights organizations to urge the Biden-Harris Department of Justice to reject the Insular Cases. This initiative is viewed as pivotal in contesting the legal framework that underlies territorial status. Equally American, led by Neil Weare, emerges as a significant organization dedicated to championing equality and civil rights for residents of U.S. territories. The group collaborates with various civil rights entities to advance its mission. Angel Santos, transitioning from
activism to political engagement, is highlighted as a significant figure within the Chamoru rights movement. This shift is considered a rare occurrence and is examined within this context. The distinction between activism, characterized by community mobilization and advocacy for societal transformation, and advocacy, which may focus on policy reform within established systems, is elucidated. The challenges surrounding Chamoru self-determination and the right to participate in presidential elections are examined. It is noted that while authentic activism may entail questioning established norms, politicians may prioritize re-election over decolonization pursuits. The text conveys an underlying sentiment that substantial change often necessitates a potent voice and concerted effort from citizens, potentially even compelling elected officials into action. Additionally, the text briefly touches on how anti-military activism has influenced perceptions of policy maker influence in the political process. References to online media tracking and press releases as tools employed by advocacy groups underscore the significance of media in disseminating advocacy efforts. Lastly, activism is revealed to be intricately linked to various facets, including economic development and the safeguarding of cultural heritage. In sum, the text provides a vivid portrayal of the intricate interplay between advocacy, activism, and political processes within U.S. Territories. It also underscores the hurdles faced by those advocating for self-determination and decolonization.

An example, below, represents an Artificial Intelligence rendering of the online media tracking coding system (https://www.wordclouds.com/).
Figure 4.6: Online media tracking word cloud

Chamoru rights + activist + insular + cases + American

*The “Making the Sausage” Process observations: Voice recording of CritCon memoing*
On March 12, 2022, the researcher sent an email notice to schedule interviews. Observations spanned nearly three weeks (March 20-April 9, 2022) and encompassed online tracking of media content and participation in various community engagement events across Central Texas. The primary aim was to discern civic and media behavior patterns within diverse cultural groups, specifically in the context of Indigenous Self-Determination. Notably, the emergence of propaganda in civic engagement unveiled distinct patterns of remembering and forgetting. Starting from March 28, 2022, the researcher initiated the transcription of audio recordings, concurrently engaging in field observations and media tracking. An important consideration arose during the implementation of the study when a self-identified member of the Catholic faith, noting the scheduling of interviews during Holy Week (or the week of Easter), brought attention to this religious observance. Consequently, in deference to this significant holiday, the personal interviews were postponed. This discourse element underscores the pivotal role of faith as a value system in shaping public memory. Concurrently, the researcher commenced the transcription of audio recordings as field notes.

This study discerned key patterns of Positive Deviance (PD) behaviors through meticulous documentation utilizing a voice recorder for field notes. It is imperative to note that the memoing process underscores the identification of media and institutional discourse patterns, the exploration of notions of public memory, and the investigation of axiological value systems, as previously coded. These patterns were then systematically color-coded applying the Indigenous Inafa’maolek
Mediation Framework (IMF), categorizing them into CONFORMING, REFORMING, and TRANSFORMING. The observations delved into the intricate municipal public policy process, often likened to the metaphorical "sausage-making" process of public administration, providing insights from the researcher's unique standpoint. Memoing encapsulated various facets, including the interplay of legal systems, council dynamics, parliamentary procedures, and policy formulation.

Likewise, the study uncovered intriguing insights during Public Hearings, where recurrent patterns emerged, particularly in the engagement of female and white participants. Notably, this engagement echoed earlier practices observed in the context of MB civic involvement prior to elections. Additionally, the study delved into the realm of transformational culture, uncovering pivotal dynamics at play. One notable observation was the proposition extended to a member of the Municipal Native Group (MNG) by a former mayor to stand for council, aligning with developer interests. Each facet of the Indigenous Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF) - Respetu, Mang'nge, Mamah’lao, Chenchule, Chelu, and Patgon - manifested varying degrees of application in fostering critical consciousness. The represented behaviors serve as a lens through which to discern meaning, contingent upon the specific decolonial context. For instance, when crafting pedagogy and curricula for media literacy and civic engagement, the theme of Patgon within IMF holds paramount significance. It fundamentally asserts that the collective responsibility for children transcends individual domains. This assertion, in turn, necessitates an in-depth exploration to contemporize its interpretation within the broader context of the student ecosystem.

Moreover, a systematic deconstruction of the various characteristics of this value enhances comprehension and affords a more profound understanding of its applicability. The interpretation
of a conforming, reforming, or transforming relationship with a child unfolds across diverse dimensions. As a result, conventional expectations of the parent-child dynamic undergo a process of delinking, empowering a reevaluation of these interactions with the explicit objective of fostering re-linking towards transformative critical consciousness practices. In this specific instance, institutional discourse patterns synergize with the construct of public memory, reinforcing established methodologies of meaning-making. The questions posed in this context not only hold intrinsic value but also bear practical implications for shaping pedagogical practices, particularly in the realm of music education. They hold potential in addressing economic realities within the framework of place-making. These findings substantiate the potential for decolonial pedagogy, emphasizing an approach centered on 'how to learn' as opposed to a prescriptive 'what to learn' paradigm.

This next section of observations and PhD field notes delves into the researcher’s professional involvement in scrutinizing the municipal administrative department deliberation process, colloquially referred to among public administrators as “Making the Sausage”. It also encompasses the engagement of institutional actors in civic and media practices, encompassing the planning, organization, staffing, coordination, reporting, and budgeting of municipal policy for public consumption. During this phase, meticulous memoing endeavors to discern patterns in behavior, discourse, and ideation, categorizing them into distinct phases of critical consciousness: CONFORMING, REFORMING, or TRANSFORMING, or alternatively, noting if such phases are not evident. This process is further delineated in TABLE 2.2, encapsulating the field notes on Critical Consciousness. These memoed codes are subsequently subjected to a comprehensive analysis against the backdrop of the meta-values that underlie the principles of
the Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF). Maintaining these IMF concepts as consistent variables of analysis, albeit with diverse dimensions of critical consciousness, these outlined behaviors are identified as either media or institutional discourse patterns, elements of public memory, or facets of value systems. Through this analytical lens, pivotal transformative aspects of critical consciousness come to the forefront from the observations, each accompanied by corresponding IMF coding.

The observations underscore the researcher's reliance on field notes and their application through the Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF). It places great importance on comprehending various facets like historical context, power dynamics, desires, racial relations, and fostering harmonious coexistence within a community. This suggests that employing IMF coding based on these field observations can serve as a valuable tool for intercultural theoretical applications, ultimately contributing to transformative processes within communities.

Several discernible patterns emerge. Firstly, the notes consistently emphasize the pivotal role of appreciating diverse cultural viewpoints, especially concerning historical narratives, power dynamics, aspirations, racial dynamics, and the cultivation of peaceful cohabitation. Secondly, repeated references are made to the application of IMF coding derived from the researcher's meticulous field notes. This points towards a systematic and structured approach to analyzing and interpreting the observations. Additionally, the text places strong emphasis on the necessity for transformative processes within communities. This indicates a proactive, goal-oriented approach towards instigating positive change. The term "Grounded Translation Space" is introduced to underscore the vital need for a solid foundation or platform that facilitates effective communication and mutual understanding among individuals with diverse backgrounds and
perspectives. Lastly, the Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF) stands out as a cornerstone in the researcher's methodology. It serves as the theoretical foundation for the analysis and interpretation of the field notes, implying its central importance in the research approach. In short, the observations highlight the researcher's unwavering commitment to fostering intercultural understanding and their practical application of theoretical frameworks, particularly the IMF, to drive positive change within communities.

Table 4.2: PhD Field Notes/Coding of Researcher Reflections

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>media/institutional discourse patterns</th>
<th>public memory</th>
<th>value systems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In Guam we have racism too, but its brown-on-brown [white/haole as minority in Pacific Islands].</td>
<td>[one thing I've noticed that has been lost in my own education is the explicit learning of how to understand the political dynamics of power in institutional workspace which is a vital skill for professional development--DML teaching the hidden curriculum of power structures of privilege.]</td>
<td>220506_001: 050622 Phd Field Notes. Similar to Johari's Window where's the open self, hidden self, the blind self, and the unknown self. In this case that knowledge, that window between [ecosystems], remember these sub-ecosystems that we were talking about between different cultural groups. Instead of that wall this bridge is actually a window--not a square window, but a circular window. It has 4 quarters.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Those private sentiments: people's ideas, belief, and culture that's practiced behind closed doors and in closed communities, now It's good you learn about activism, social justice, critical consciousness. [researcher aside] If you're going to talk like that there's |
| everybody knows because the private has become public. [Tai-mamahlao] | going to be consequences. You need to be aware, and as a parent I have to make sure you know--understand what you're learning--as you're curious, [epistemological curiosity, Freire 1970] |  
| The role that I'm at, at the airport, the researcher; I'm a part of that social change process, including my relationships that are extending to the political realm, to turn Texas blue--not purple, blue. Specifically, here in Bell County with LN and that relationship--going from airport extending into political, and how recruiting this Local IQ firm that work in aviation, even KWTX-talking with them. [Rbordallo corruption case involving Chenchule x bribes/corruption x opportunity...EP City Management] | searching for your identity [researcher de-linking, re-thinking, and with this framework learning to re-link to new culture of military with fresh perspective] | They don't know what we know. We have to share with them what we know. [+ you won, now you share--+--we share what we know] --and find those allies. Find those allies. This windowpane acts as a tool, a tool to understanding different cultures. |
| Point is, then help the kids understand what to do in a bullying situation in predominantly white communities. [exist as a privileged structure for any culture] | 220506_001: 050622 Phd Field Notes. Johari’s Window. Creating a space for intercultural translation zone I'm claiming, "Other's Window of Knowing". | This perspective framework helps build trust. Requires risk, but works vice-versa, for the other to understand. Me and my group, but for me to understand the other's |
Then, you have permission to defend yourself, but you have to make sure people know so you can protect yourself [raa-middle school/jr high-prince george VA county bullying incident--reports to history teacher to avoid frame of blame from white male aggressor].

Why we have to get involved to help change all that. I want them (researcher's children) to be curious. I want to share with them the realities of the world. I give them a blessing. I'm proud of them for asking those questions. [link to method--inquiry based analysis] Being curious, and they're learning.

[making sausage]: ExDir AvN managing IBCC relationship-planning, strategizing, assessing outcomes of behavior for hostility

Apologetic post event with family and reflection: internalization of colonizer by researcher framework influences processing of observations and field experiences as dissertation research implementation fresh on conscious of researcher, in writing mode. [phone call with LN-254f]. [delink-rethink-relink]
The provided text encompasses a collection of observations, reflections, and statements that offer insights into various facets of the researcher's experiences and perspectives. These observations reveal several discernible patterns and key themes:

Firstly, there is an acknowledgment of racial dynamics within Guam, emphasizing a unique form of "brown-on-brown" racism, distinguishing it from more conventional white-on-brown racism. Secondly, the researcher reflects on the critical importance of comprehending the political power dynamics within institutional settings, deeming it an essential skill for professional growth.

Metaphorically, Johari's Window is employed to illustrate the process of understanding and revealing aspects of oneself and others in intercultural interactions. It serves as a metaphorical bridge connecting different cultural groups. The text also touches upon the transformation of private sentiments, beliefs, and cultural practices into more public and accessible domains. This shift is attributed to factors like heightened awareness and activism. Parental concern for their child's learning, particularly in areas associated with activism, social justice, and critical consciousness, is expressed. It implies a recognition that certain knowledge comes with corresponding responsibilities. The researcher identifies themselves as an active participant in the process of social change, with involvement in both the airport industry and political engagement, particularly in endeavors to influence the political landscape of Texas. Issues related to identity are grappled with, especially in the context of a military culture. There's a process of de-linking, re-thinking, and re-linking to adapt to a new cultural environment. The text emphasizes the role of understanding as a means to build trust. This involves a reciprocal
process where both the researcher and the other party seek to understand each other, even if it involves risk-taking.

The importance of addressing bullying, particularly in predominantly white communities, is highlighted. There's an acknowledgment of the privilege that exists within certain cultural structures. The researcher engages in introspection regarding their own internalized biases, particularly in the context of being influenced by a colonizer framework. This awareness plays a role in shaping the researcher's approach to their dissertation research.

Emerging from the study is a nuanced understanding of intercultural interactions, power dynamics, and the researcher's role in various contexts, ranging from academia to personal and familial experiences. It also reflects a deep consideration of identity, privilege, and the intricacies of navigating cultural spaces. The memoed codes undergo a meticulous analysis within the framework of the meta-values that define the principles of IMF, maintaining consistency as variables of analysis. This process enables the categorization of identified behaviors into media or institutional discourse patterns, elements of public memory, or components of value systems.

IMF Color Code (APPENDIX CH4)

From these observations, key transformative notions of critical consciousness have surfaced, each accompanied by its corresponding IMF coding:

Table 4.3: PhD Field Notes/IMF Coding of Researcher’s Reflections

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>media/institutional discourse patterns</th>
<th>public memory</th>
<th>value systems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Respetu</strong> 220505_004: 050522 PhD Field Notes.</td>
<td><strong>Mang'ngo</strong> 220419_004: 041922 PhD Field Notes; the triangle, the vertices of God-Self and Other; help maintain perspective in the framing of situations as chaotic as they come to us in the management of affairs which provides discernment. You and God in one corner. You and the Other (wife, co-worker, kids, colleague, boss); and You and You.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cinco de Mayo. Mexican American Pacific Islander in rural south remembering what Mexican historians note about the value of Cinco de Mayo to the U.S. history as it is today.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Respetu</strong> Our job is to be respectful.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mang'ngo</strong> Rationalize: economic and social impact of researcher in professional environment, to keep perspective, role of faith/religion; inafa'maolek systems.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Respetu</strong> 220516_002: 051622 PhD Field Notes.</th>
<th><strong>Respetu</strong> 220516_001: 051622 PhD Field Notes. remind him about how he must be respectful.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chamorro activist that idolizes and valorize Anghet.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|提醒他要尊重。

| **Mang'ngo** 220419_001: 041922 PhD Field Notes; what do I do as a public administrator civically engaged; I think, I reflect on that thinking and I act. The triangulation continues. Participatory Action Research, Sociocultural Foundations pedagogical approaches include reading, reflecting, writing. In this case, the triangulation continues, in that from |
| **Respetu** be respectful. |
| **Mamahlao**: emotional Transforming cultural relations: intercultural translation zone; Innovation Black Chamber x GRK Admin (Executive Director White Anglo Saxon over 60; rural smalltown TX culture x urban Killeen culture; making meaning at DBE workshop with participants in understanding; supported by FAA civil rights; |
| **Mang'nge** First black female mayor presiding | **Mang'nge** **Respetu**, it doesn't matter, just be respectful to different people. That’s the way forward. [one thing I've noticed that has been lost in my own education is the explicit learning of how to understand the political dynamics of power in institutional workspace which is a vital skill for professional development--DML teaching the hidden curriculum of power structures of privilege.] | **Mang'nge** Conversation with son: identity construction; cultural values for perspective in emotional-social control…Inafa'maolek |
| **Mang'nge** [Public Hearing: same female/white; MB civic engagement prior to election, same tactic.] | **Mang'nge** **Intercultural Translation Zone: Teacher education a space for intercultural translation.** [w/o trust x] | **Mang'nge** 220506_001: 050622 Phd Field Notes. Similar to Johari's Window where's the open self, hidden self, the blind self, and the unknown self. In this case that knowledge, that window between {ecosystems}, remember these sub-ecosystems that we were talking about between different cultural groups. Instead of that wall this bridge is actually a window--not a square window, but a circular window. It has 4 quarters. |
Mamahlao: emotional notes; Hubris of Zero-so the idea of Mignolo, Hubris of Zero, the principle of coloniality; is that there are fundamental frameworks that create colonialism. Yes, it’s their history, the White Man's history of the Confederacy because of the representations at the County, the representations at the State Capitol…the monuments. We recognize that, and though a community may be predominantly White. The principle of Hubris of Zero means that Coloniality claims that it’s the only history. And it’s a history, a story, a narrative not to be contended with. And that's what creates the Anti-CRT movement that’s happening across White Communities because their seeing that the multicultural nature of history, because all the different people in their communities say, well…that's a bad history. Well, don't make our history bad because we're proud of our history. That's the

Mang'nge That space for learning and creating a common language of meaning-making between the two for success; there is that bond of teacher education; hence, the PhD in teaching, learning and culture and the opportunity for both of these individuals to communicate, create meaning, shared meaning, and understand each other for the success of an organization, and create social transformation.

Mang'nge Yes, there's an open, and a hidden and a blind, and unknown; but its from The Others perspective. This comes from my reading this morning in John, The Gospel. How Saul is used by Jesus; and this speaks to the Catholic faith identity of the researcher, how Saul is sent to Jerusalem to round up believers of Christ and bound them. Jesus goes to one of the Apostles, and he says..."go see this guy Saul, he's there." The Apostles said,"we heard about this guy, and he wants to persecute everyone who believes in you. You want to go to him? He said, "yeah, he's struggling right now. He's a believer. I'm gonna' make him a tool, and he needs you to go to him and tell him I sent you. He's gonna' be a tool for conversion and believing in Christ. He's gonna' claim Christ, and he's gonna' suffer the same pain he's out persecuting everybody for. People are going to see this and believe even more. What this guy will go through after being converted.
hubris point of zero. If you claim that's everyone's history. You claim that because that's your narrative because that's your history everyone has to accept the fact that it’s a good history, or it’s not. Especially if you ask the black people that were enslaved.

Mamahlao: emotional That's the problem with the ultra-Alt Right they call it of the White Community. The Nazis. That's how far that thinking is, the KKK. It’s not an understanding. We just don't want you to say that you can't succeed because we're the White people in power. And you can't succeed, that's what they say on FOX news; on what Critical Race Theory is. I was just watching something on YouTube last night. The newscaster, putting the people on the news saying, all the experts are saying, Critical Race Theory claims that you can't succeed. Minorities are complaining about Critical Race Theory because we're teaching the kids that they can't succeed because

| Mang'nge 220506_001: 050622 Phd Field Notes. Johari’s Window. Creating a space for intercultural translation zone I'm claiming, "Other's Window of Knowing". |
| Mang'nge That's my paraphrase of the reading, my interpretation as well. The Apostle goes to him, puts his hand on him and says, "hey…Jesus sent me, I'm here. I heard you saw him on the side of the road. He's here for you. Saul, at the moment, is blind; and literally, the scales fall off his eyelids, and he sees again. |
they are brown and not white. That's a twisting of it. Critical Race Theory is a legal framework that explains the racism, and the dynamics of racism as a structure that oppresses individuals that are not in dominant positions of power. That's what Critical Race Theory is, and there's a lot of scholarship out there about what it is. It's just that they don't like being told that, well your great-grandfather did some, your great-grandfather and your great-great-grandfather did some very bad things to people. And ya'll took everyone's land, Native Americans and Mexicans in Texas, African Americans you stole them from their places and sold them, enslaved them. Turn them into property.

| Mamahlao: emotional and the idea that, the reason why the republicans and the GOP, the conservative policy makers are fighting it 'cause they know there's liability involved. And that's where Critical Race Theory comes in. In a court of law, Critical Race Theory is legitimate | Che'lù Intercultural Translation Zone. That relationship we have with CC, he creates that space of understanding. | Mang'nge That blindness of the individual is a specific dimension in the perspective, related to Rossatto's perspective on Optimism; the blind optimism that comes from the Critical Consciousness Chart, that he created with his dissertation. To take away that "blindness of
argument, its proven. It’s what Dr. Martin Luther King used to prove; and Plessy vs. Ferguson was overturned based on Brown vs. Board of Education, was all based upon the notion of racism. The racism that created Un-Incorporated Territories that left our people in the middle of the Pacific property of the U.S. and Congress. That's Critical Race Theory.

knowing the other", Johari's Window is more about you and how your perspective is to the world--the windowpane to the world. Things that you want. Things that you know. Things you want people to see…the open self. Things you want to keep hidden from the world and hidden from other people. Then, from your perspective things you are blind to, but other people see. Then, from your perspective and others it’s what is unknown. The four quadrants.

Mamahlao: emotional They know that there are reparations down the road. They know in Congress that minority Democrats in power are looking to push a reparation agenda, to have those families, those institutions like The University of Texas, Harvard, Princeton, Yale, they're already vulnerable legally-not just politically, but legally vulnerable to not just giving back the property but paying reparations to the public. That's why they are

Mang'nge In Roque's Window of meta-Knowing the Other…in the open sense it’s what the Other wants you to know about them creates understanding. What The Other wants me to know about them. What the Other doesn't want me to know because they keep it hidden. Then what the Other, we know similar to the unknown, what the Other doesn't know, I don't know ("you don't know what you don’t' know"-Kcagle, CM-CoK/FB post), but
pushing back on Critical Race Theory, not because they're sensitive for their kids because they know there's a lot of money involved. The same way we talk about reparations for our generation, from World War 2. Because we said, okay America, the old argument for World War 2 Chamorro's is based on America getting Japan to surrender, and in the documents, America absolves Japan from war reparations. Meaning, you did a lot of bad things in the Pacific, you did a lot of bad things in Guam. You beheaded families, your family blown up in a cave [to M.A.]. So, because you absolved, this is Guam Government telling U.S. in the argument for reparations, because you absolved Japan, you accept that responsibility. Therefore, you owe us money. That's why the reparations took so long to pass through Congress because the Black Caucus, Underwood used to tell me this, the Black Caucus and the Mexicans would say…what about

most importantly it’s the blind dimension. Here in the blind dimension, it’s what the Other is blind to--about who I am, and what I know. Focusing on that "blindness" requires us to help the Other understand who we are, as minorities in a dominant space, that Other is blind to what we know. They don't know what we know. We have to share with them what we know. [+ you won, now you share--+-we share what we know] --and find those allies. Find those allies. This windowpane acts as a tool, a tool to understanding different cultures.
our reparations? Why are we giving Guam reparations? What about our reparations for slavery? What about our reparations for taking our land?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mang'nge 220506_002: PhD Field notes continued. This Roque's Window of Knowing the Other, as an intercultural translation zone. This perspective framework helps build trust. Requires risk, but works vice-versa, for the other to understand. Me and my group, but for me to understand the other's group as well. [other perspective checking]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mang'nge Because what we have now, everybody putting everything out there…and everybody divisive. How do we see through these walls? Those walls aren't walls. They're windowpanes to the Other's world--ecosystems, sub-ecosystems, and one big meta-ecosystem. The more we share about practices, beliefs, there's always going to be differences. The way forward is that mutual understanding grounded in frameworks of mediation-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mang'ne 220419_004: 041922 PhD Field Notes, which becomes the foundation for Inafa'maolek which becomes foundation and basic to that harmony in relations that guide the Public Administrator/the Civically engaged media activist, and the relationships with their community, with themselves, with their higher power.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mang'ne 20419_003: 041922 PhD Field notes; this concept of time and the management of it by an Indigenous researcher with an American hybrid background, move from urban cultural environments to rural; once again the researcher, one</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
and half years later, realizes the approach differing in this rural organizational market requiring a more laid-back Island-style approach, which is less intense. Being reminded by colleagues, the wife, Professor, the Executive Director himself; the intensity of the researcher who realizes at this point the INAFA'MAOLEK in this story. The harmony in the relations that have been causing disruption, it’s the management of time, and the releasing of negative relations that create distrust help build trust and cultivate trust—the seeds of those trust.

Mang'nge  Z0000016: 04012022
PhD Field Notes; City manager TG-El Paso asks, "how do you transform a city?", from the inside out begins with values of the leadership of the community. Of the people there. The creation of identity. The process…Verdunity. Comprehensive Land Use Plan process, City of Killeen. Killeen Starting from the ground up.
Mamahlao: emotional

220403_004: 040322 PhD Field 

Notes. What do you teach-curriculum, how we teach curriculum in light of Black Lives Matter extreme, and Anti-CRT extreme? The way forward is to recognize that third space. That intercultural curriculum that empowers inequity for those communities affected by it. Historical realities, socio-historical realities while allowing others to save face grounded in policy, public policy.

Chenchule why we have to get involved to help change all that. I want them to be curious. I want to share with them the realities of the world. I give them a blessing. I'm proud of them for asking those questions. [link to method--inquiry based analysis] Being curious, and they're learning.

Chenchule And the transforming of the human mind, body, and spirit of the researcher; going through bariatric surgery losing 80lbs six
months later. In this current date last week, being noted--starting at 345-265, that physical energy, that spiritual energy, the stamina to engage in relationships in a meaningful way. The Wife, those private moments. With the boss, just sitting down. Just having energy to do all these different things. In order to do that requires that transformation. I'm transforming. I'm transforming my own reality. I'm acting myself into a new way of thinking. Positive Deviance.

Che'lu 220413_001: 041322 Phd
Field Notes; post SD interview, reflection...How do you transform a city? The Culture. The culture that is practiced by a community, different community groups, made up of individuals. So, transforming the realities of those individuals in your community will transform everything else. Transforming their engagement. Transforming their media critical consciousness.

Che'lu Z0000021: 040222 PhD
field notes; conflicting
In this section, the researcher outlines patterns identified across three main categories: media and institutional discourse, public memory, and value systems:

In terms of media and institutional discourse, various instances involve discussions about cultural events and notable figures like Cinco de Mayo and Chamorro activist Angel “Anghet” Santos. The researcher also notes the use of specific civic engagement tactics, particularly in the context of public hearings and political campaigns. Furthermore, there's an acknowledgment of the influence of faith and religion on decision-making and perspective. The text also engages in critical discussions regarding historical representations, such as Confederate monuments, and their impact on public consciousness.

Turning to the aspect of public memory, several instances reference historical events and figures, underscoring their significance in shaping current narratives and perspectives. The importance of understanding different perspectives, especially in intercultural communication, is highlighted. Additionally, there's a recurring theme of remembering and acknowledging the complexities of historical events and their impact on marginalized communities.
Regarding value systems, the text delves into the concept of axiological parenting in the context of media literacy as a proactive, pro-child, decolonial pedagogical practice. The principle of Inafa'maolek (harmony) is repeatedly mentioned as a foundational guiding principle for civic engagement and community relations. The text also emphasizes the transformative aspect of personal growth and development, particularly in the context of physical health and spiritual well-being.

The observations underscore the importance of cultural awareness, critical consciousness, and intercultural communication in various aspects of civic engagement, media discourse, and personal development. These themes are interwoven into discussions about historical events, faith, cultural values, and decision-making processes. The text highlights the dynamic interplay between individual beliefs, community values, and broader social, political, and economic contexts.

When integrating the IMF into pedagogy and curriculum development for civic media, emphasizing the value of each principle becomes paramount in the learning process. For example, delving into the concept of Patgon allows teachers to explore its connection to Indigenous cultural competence and potentially incorporate language-learning opportunities. By introducing this idea, regardless of language prominence within each cultural community, the shared belief in family responsibility to all members can be emphasized as a duty everyone shares, whether they personally relate to it or not. Shifting the focus of lesson planning in this way goes beyond mere ice-breaking activities and mainstream cultural education approaches. This concept's application extends to considerations of civic responsibility and media use.
Next, we'll examine this same coded content through the lens of Artificial Intelligence (AI) word cloud programs.

*Observations Word Cloud-Notions of Transformative Critical Consciousness*

The word cloud effectively encapsulates the key concepts and themes related to transformative critical consciousness and the Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF). The prominence of words like "know," "critical," "window," "history," "people," and "perspective" suggests a strong focus on understanding, critical thinking, historical context, and intercultural awareness within this framework. The term "Window Blind Theory" likely signifies an emphasis on recognizing the limitations in our understanding of others, highlighting the importance of uncovering hidden perspectives. This graphic provides a visual representation of the central ideas underpinning the transformative critical consciousness approach and its application through the IMF.
The coding within the IMF framework, derived from the researcher's observational field notes, represents a significant advancement in intercultural theoretical applications. It underscores the ongoing need to catalyze transformative processes within communities. This necessitates the establishment of a well-founded space for translation, where individuals can comprehend the
diverse perspectives on history, power dynamics, desires, racial dynamics, and harmonious coexistence.

**CritCon Municipal Policy Makers Focus Group-Grass Roots & Grass Tops**

On March 7, 2022, the researcher-initiated contact with participants to coordinate the scheduling of the focus group session. A Microsoft Teams link was provided for the session, offering two potential dates (3/14 or 3/18, with the latter being selected). Ultimately, two participants engaged in the focus group discussion. The questions posed were structured as open-ended prompts, drawing from the framework of Discovery and Action Dialogues (DADs), as originally outlined by Lipmanowicz and McCandless in 2013. The dialogue encompassed the following inquiries:

1. How do you identify the presence of problem X?
2. How do you actively contribute to resolving this problem?
3. What obstacles hinder consistent action towards addressing the issue?
4. Can you identify individuals who frequently succeed in overcoming these barriers? This could be drawn from examples in your community, immediate surroundings, or personal experiences. What specific behaviors and practices contribute to their success?
5. Do you have any innovative ideas, inspired by our discussion thus far, for addressing the issue of media framing and public outcry?
6. To actualize these ideas, what steps need to be taken? Who should be brought in as volunteers or stakeholders?
7. Are there additional parties or stakeholders that should be involved in this endeavor?
The discourse within the focus group was subsequently analyzed, with patterns discerned in relation to media and propaganda beliefs, considerations of public memory, and underlying value systems. A sample of this transcription is provided in Appendix Chapter 4 for reference.

In accordance with the research protocol, a focus group session was conducted on March 18, 2022, involving two participants from the West Texas regional study area. Their contributions reflected facets of transformative consciousness. Nevertheless, the data also revealed a discernible inclination towards conformist and reformist dimensions of critical consciousness. Within the framework of the focus group, the primary objective was to establish a foundational understanding of the role of propaganda in shaping critical consciousness. This entailed a comprehensive examination of institutional communication patterns, public memory, and value-based systems, all situated within the context of the IMF framework. The behavioral practices identified below exhibit a discernible level of critical consciousness within the context of recognizing propaganda. These practices align with the conceptual dimensions of the IMF, as outlined in this study. Furthermore, the IMF conceptual framework sheds light on a distinct trend towards a specific degree of critical consciousness, as explicated in the accompanying memos:

1. The acknowledgment of media's coercive influence signifies a heightened awareness of its persuasive power in shaping public opinion and consciousness.
2. The recognition of dynamic shifts, akin to the monumental movements of tectonic plates, underscores an understanding of the seismic changes occurring within the media landscape and its broader societal impacts.
3. Addressing depictions and spectacles, particularly through an intergenerational lens, highlights parallels between parental generation concerns regarding MTV, Cable, Rap Music, and Violent Movies, and their potential influence on adolescent development within the historical context of Media Literacy. This proposition posits that addressing such concerns could potentially mitigate the shock factor and apathy towards current events experienced in their later years. This underscores a proactive approach towards media literacy and its role in critical consciousness development.

**IMF Color Code/Focus Group Transformative CritCon Findings illuminates the following transformative facets of critical consciousness:**

- There is an active involvement of decision makers, encompassing perspectives from both grass roots and grass tops.
- A demonstrated readiness among individuals to embrace change is observed.
- The pivotal role of community stalwarts, deeply entrenched and invested in the community, taking the lead, is emphasized.

While dimensions of Mang'nge and Chenchule' suggest a conformist perspective, all these notions support reformist modes of critical consciousness. The identified propaganda practices shared by participants illustrate a mediation framework inclined towards reformist tendencies. The peripheral notions of Mamah'lao and Mang'nge establish socialization practices that incorporate mainstream ideology with innovative approaches aimed at catalyzing change—albeit within the constraints imposed by institutional factors.
A significant insight gleaned from the participant interactions highlights the contribution of one individual, CJ, who not only responded to the media survey but also actively participated in the focus group discussion. This underscores the value of employing the Didactic Action Dialogue technique within the focus group setting. It allows for the organic emergence of critical consciousness as participants engage with probing questions, delving into the nuanced layers of propaganda's meaning and impact.

For visual representation, an example of the Focus Group coding system has been generated using Artificial Intelligence and can be accessed through this link: [https://www.wordclouds.com/](https://www.wordclouds.com/). This visual tool aids in the visualization and comprehension of the coded responses, offering a clear snapshot of the thematic patterns that emerged from the focus group discussion.
Indeed, the IMF Coding word cloud and the focus group discussions vividly highlight the prominence of media-centered practices. This stands in contrast to the IMF perspective outlined in the earlier example, where the concepts of Mang'nge and Mamahlao, representing sociological norms and emotions respectively, signify the presence of transformative critical consciousness.
Through this lens, these notions intersect with the AI-driven analysis, enriching the memoing process with a deeper layer of meaning. [media + people + think]

**Step 3 of the Positive Deviance (PD) method: The community discovers the presence of positive deviants:**

In Step 3 of the Positive Deviance (PD) method, the community identifies positive deviants through a systematic process. The researcher conducted a total of eight (8) comprehensive interviews, either online or in person, with a single PD group member in each of the three research communities: the U.S. Western Pacific Island, West TX, and Central TX. According to the PD methodology, these selected positive deviants (PDs) are individuals or entities who confront challenges and obstacles comparable to or even more severe than those faced by others in their respective communities. This includes minorities with low-income backgrounds, individuals transitioning from post-high school to early college/professional careers, as well as elite white individuals with medium- to high-income from various generations.

Subsequently, the researcher pinpointed distinctive practices that exhibit a positive correlation with improved outcomes, building upon the established common practices identified in Step 2. By employing baseline data benchmarks for civic and media engagement, the researcher identified specific PD behaviors. During the dissertation defense, these findings will be reviewed with the entire participant community through a community meeting format, conducted online. The presentation will be shared with group leaders first, followed by
dissemination to community members in each of the targeted markets: the U.S. Western Pacific Island, West TX, and Central TX.

**Ontological/Epistemological/Axiological: Individual Description of Research Participant**

**Interviews**

In the ontological, epistemological, and axiological dimensions, the researcher conducted individual interviews with participants using a variety of methods and technologies. The interviews took place on the following dates and were recorded through different means:

- PG: April 27, 2022 (via phone, voice recorded)
- JA: April 26, 2022 (in person, voice recorded)
- MB: April 13, 2022 (via TEAMS application, recorded)
- CJ: April 14, 2022 (via TEAMS application, recorded)
- WC: May 10, 2022 (via TEAMS application, recorded)
- SD: April 13, 2022 (via TEAMS application, recorded)
- LN: April 27, 2022 (via phone, voice recorded)
- JJ: April 12, 2022 (via TEAMS application, recorded)

The researcher utilized personal hardware including a MAC computer, an EPSON projector, an iPhone 6, and a personal voice recorder (handheld SONY) for transcribing the interviews. Originally, the interview sessions were scheduled for April 10-16. However, a participant reminded the researcher that this timeframe coincided with the Christian observance of Holy Week/Easter. Coordinating these sessions across different time zones (Chamorro Standard Time-ChST; Central Standard Time-CST for Central Texas; and Mountain Standard Time-MST for
West Texas) proved challenging due to the significant time difference, particularly when coordinating group data collection sessions between the U.S. Western Pacific Island setting and the two Mainland U.S. settings in Texas. For example, a video call scheduled for 9 am on a Friday in Texas (CST) translates to 2 am on Saturday in the Western Pacific Island (ChST), effectively making it a call into the future due to the time difference.

**Interview, 1st Step-Uncommon Practices: CONFORMING-delinking; REFORMING-rethinking; TRANSFORMING-relinking**

In the initial step of the interview process, three distinct categories of practices were observed: CONFORMING (delinking), REFORMING (rethinking), and TRANSFORMING (relinking). These Uncommon Practices signify community support strategies that hold the potential to catalyze transformative municipal policy-making processes. Civic and media practices played a pivotal role in shaping Positive Deviant (PD) behaviors, suggesting an educational/propaganda model for fostering Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML) critical consciousness. These practices, falling under the umbrella of Critical Consciousness, aid in discerning patterns of PD behaviors within the framework of IMF principles: CONFORMING (delinking), REFORMING (rethinking), and TRANSFORMING (relinking) practices. These behaviors serve as tangible manifestations of transformative critical consciousness.

In the final phase of interview transcription analysis, the researcher employed the ABCs of Propaganda Analysis framework with a personal reflection: Life History Analysis approach to scrutinize how familial and cultural values influence message interpretation (Hobbs & McGee, 2014). This coding process, based on earlier categorized civic and media engagement practices, was color-coded for clarity (media/institutional beliefs, public memory-remembering/forgetting,
Cultural beliefs play a pivotal role in shaping one's educational or propaganda perspective, and this study considered specific cultural group identifiers, such as INDIG/MINORITY status, gender, socio-economic status (DOMINANT/ELITE), U.S./American nationality, educational attainment (HS graduate or higher), U.S. military affiliations, and involvement in civic government leadership.

Furthermore, cultural group mediation practices were coded for their ontological, epistemological, or axiological implications. This entailed examining media/institutional beliefs, public memory (remembering/forgetting), and value systems. As a result, the codes shed light on ontological concepts in relation to public memory, epistemological concepts regarding media/institutional beliefs, and axiological considerations pertaining to value systems.

The subsequent section delves into patterns of civic and media activities across diverse cultural groups, identifying Signal Influencers (SI) based on coding derived from participant interviews. These interviews were meticulously transcribed and hand-coded in accordance with the data collection procedures outlined in Chapter 3. The analysis commences with the identification and color-coding of media and propaganda beliefs, notions of public memory, and value systems. Subsequently, memoing brings to light uncommon practices in civic and media engagement, offering a comprehensive view as presented in Table 4.4 below.

Table 4.4: Interview Coding & Memoing—Emerging Civic and Media Uncommon Practices.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Media and propaganda beliefs</th>
<th>Notions of public memory</th>
<th>Value systems</th>
<th>holistic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[private school institutional setting of neocolonial structural indoctrination]</td>
<td>Chenchule [IMF provides context of civic engagement formula/C&lt;bp x] -- subtraction factor for the negative occurrence required to transform [C = BP = SI]</td>
<td>[remembering axiological as transformational practice]</td>
<td>[TRANSFORMING-relinking practices for PD behaviors]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[agenda-making]</td>
<td></td>
<td>[remembering axiological as transformational]</td>
<td>[respect for other]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[establishing identity among like-minded peers]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The provided coding offers a comprehensive overview of various civic engagement practices, highlighting a diverse range of strategies employed by participants. Key patterns and themes include:

**Diverse Strategies for Civic Engagement:**
Participants employ a wide array of tactics, from participating in public hearings to advocating for or against specific projects. This diversity of approaches underscores the multifaceted nature of civic engagement.

**Empowerment and Advocacy:**
Many practices involve active participation in the political process, including supporting individuals running for office, assisting political campaigns, and challenging decisions made by City Hall. This reflects a strong commitment to advocacy and civic empowerment.

**Strategic Communication and Messaging:**
Several practices focus on effective communication and messaging, such as shaping rhetoric, delivering impactful public comments, and leveraging social media for information dissemination. This highlights the importance of strategic communication in civic engagement efforts.

**Navigating Challenges and Opposition:**
Participants exhibit resilience in the face of challenges, including opposition from elected officials. They demonstrate a willingness to assertively address those in power and, when necessary, employ civil disobedience as a strategic tool.

**Recognition of Structural and Cultural Influences:**
There is an awareness of the influence of structural factors, such as City Council policies, as well as cultural and familial heritage. Participants acknowledge the significance of effective administrative leadership and consider factors like language barriers.

**Political Empowerment and Office-holding:**
Some practices emphasize the potential for impactful change through running for elected office. This reflects a recognition of the transformative potential of holding political positions and collaborating with peers in decision-making processes.

**Ethical and Responsible Engagement:**
The text emphasizes the responsibility and privilege of engaging in critical conversations. Participants value constructive thinking, critical consciousness, and ethical conduct. They recognize the influence of visual and auditory stimuli on human behavior.

**Roots and Historical Perspective:**
The importance of acknowledging historical roots and personal interests is highlighted. This demonstrates an appreciation for the contextual factors that shape one's engagement in civic activities.

Overall, the findings showcase a rich tapestry of civic engagement practices, reflecting a deep commitment to advocacy, empowerment, and responsible political participation. Participants exhibit a strategic approach to navigating challenges and effectively communicating their
messages. Additionally, there is a strong awareness of the cultural, familial, and historical influences that underpin their engagement in civic activities.

**Interview-2nd Step, Life History Analysis**

In the second phase of the personal interview transcription analysis, the researcher applied the ABCs of Propaganda Analysis framework, specifically focusing on Life History Analysis, to investigate how an individual's family and cultural values shape their interpretation of messages (Hobbs & McGee, 2014, p.57). The entrenched cultural beliefs play a substantial role in determining one's educational or propagandistic perspective. Additionally, the researcher coded cultural group mediation practices for ontological, epistemological, or axiological factors, using the previously mentioned categories of media/institutional beliefs, public memory (remembering/forgetting), and value systems. Consequently, the codes reveal ontological considerations related to public memory, epistemological considerations regarding media/institutional beliefs, and axiological considerations pertaining to value systems.

These identified Positive Deviance (PD) behaviors suggest a propaganda model for Digital Media Literacy (DML) critical consciousness. This model builds upon the foundational insights garnered from civic and media patterns, encompassing media/institutional knowledge, notions of public memory, and value systems. Within this intercultural PD community, described earlier in terms of characteristics like INDIG/MINORITY status, gender distinctions, DOMINANT/ELITE socio-demographics with U.S./American nationality, at least a high school education, connections to the U.S. military, and involvement in civic government leadership roles.
For a visual representation of the Life History Analysis, refer to the word cloud generated by AI analysis in the link provided (https://www.wordclouds.com/). This word cloud encapsulates the influential factors that contribute to the evolution (or lack thereof) of values in the process of propagandistic meaning-making across this PD community.

Figure 4.9: Life History Analysis AI WordCloud
Money and the ability to provide for one's family emerge as prominent life values in participants' histories, exerting influence on the evolution of their values. These values, passed down through generations, are attributed to personal success. They contribute to the ABCs of Propaganda, a framework derived from the Personal Reflection/Life History Technique and the Institute for Propaganda Analysis (IPA) model (1937). These findings introduce new dimensions to the understanding of meaning.

The family and cultural values listed below have varying degrees of influence on individuals, with some reporting no identified change.

![Able-being, Change, Country of origin, Family, Get (acquire), Indifferent (mode of reacting to others' actions), Learning, Money, One, Opportunities, People, Say, See, Started (to begin acting), States (United States), Think, United (collaboration with others), Way (method), Will, Working, Years (acknowledging the time it takes)](image)

Figure 4.10: Life History Analysis-Family & Cultural Values

The provided values offer an outline of family and cultural values, each of which holds varying degrees of influence on individuals. Interestingly, some individuals report no identified change in response to these values. Here are some patterns and observations that emerge from this:
Diversity of Values: The listed values encompass a wide spectrum, ranging from economic considerations such as "money" to more relational aspects like "family," and even personal agency with terms like "get" and "started." Additionally, societal values like those associated with the "United States" are included.

Multi-faceted Influence: It's evident that each value is likely to exert a distinct influence on individuals. For instance, "Money" may greatly affect financial decisions, while "Family" could play a significant role in shaping interpersonal relationships.

Cultural Roots and Origin: The mention of "Country of origin" strongly implies a link to cultural heritage and perhaps traditions associated with one's place of birth or ancestry.

Personal Agency and Action: Values like "Get" and "Started" imply a proactive approach to taking action, suggesting an influence on individuals to initiate tasks or projects.

Emphasis on Collaboration: Values such as "United" and "Working" both suggest a collaborative effort, potentially indicating a cultural value placed on cooperation and joint endeavors.

Temporal Considerations: The inclusion of "Years" indicates an acknowledgement of the time it takes for certain processes or changes to occur, implying a cultural value of patience or long-term planning.
**Socio-political Influence:** Values like "States (United States)" indicate an awareness of political and geographic context, which could significantly influence perspectives on governance and identity.

**Modes of Interaction:** The term "Indifferent" implies a specific mode of reacting to others' actions, suggesting a cultural value related to emotional expression or interpersonal dynamics.

**Cognitive Processes:** Values like "Think" and "Say" point to cognitive processes and communication styles, indicating a cultural emphasis on thoughtful expression.

**Universal Values:** Some values, like "One" and "People," hold potentially universal significance, suggesting shared human experiences and interconnectedness.

**Adaptability and Change:** The presence of "Change" indicates a recognition of the dynamic nature of values and cultural influences, suggesting a value on adaptability.

In totality, the list provides a diverse set of values that likely play a significant role in shaping individuals' behaviors, decisions, and perspectives. It's important to note that each value may carry different degrees of influence depending on the individual and their specific cultural context. These socially constructed ideas shape the interpretation of family and cultural values. The influence of capital in economic development emerges as a significant factor in how individuals engage with civic opportunities. According to the Civic Efficacy formula, the
benefits must outweigh the costs, which encompass financial, relational, and personal considerations in this study.

Moving forward, this path to success is grounded in the struggles of participating in the democratic process. It involves working in solidarity with the community to acquire the values and principles that define the nation. It requires a determination to act, to speak, to reflect, and to learn despite structural challenges. This is how family and cultural values shape shared meaning in this study. The findings also suggest a re-evaluation of the traditional Civic Efficacy model to foster equity.

The way one's family and cultural values influence the interpretation of messages reflects the entrenched cultural beliefs that shape educational and propagandistic perspectives. Additionally, cultural group mediation practices were categorized as epistemological, ontological, or axiological, guided by media/institutional beliefs, public memory (remembering/forgetting), and value systems, respectively. Consequently, the codes illustrate epistemological considerations regarding media/institutional beliefs, ontological considerations related to public memory, and axiological factors pertaining to value systems.

**PD Behaviors from Uncommon Civic & Media Practices-PD Community**

The analysis of findings provides insight into the complex relationship between media literacy, civic engagement, and critical consciousness within the context of a trans-national community. It establishes a foundation for a novel approach to media literacy that aims to decolonize both new and traditional media frameworks. The findings illuminate Positive Deviance practices within this specific case study, delineated in three steps. Firstly, emerging
gerunds reflect transformative, reforming, and conforming perspectives of critical consciousness, as well as categories encompassing media/institutional beliefs, public memory, and value systems. The mediating framework adopts an Indigenous positionality, rooted in the researcher's familial connection to Aguon gi Mahetok in Talofofo, referred to as the Inafa'maolek Mediation Framework (IMF). This framework integrates epistemological, ontological, and axiological dimensions, offering a value-based approach to meaning-making in media literacy education. The decolonizing process (delinking, rethinking, and relinking) is a central aspect of this approach.

The study progresses towards the development of inter-culturally informed models for propaganda and civic media education curricula, aimed at fostering critical consciousness in both human and potentially Artificial Intelligence (AI)-based algorithmic systems. This contribution represents a significant advancement in the field of social sciences. Additionally, the study introduces a framework for analyzing civic efficacy, providing a foundation for future research to delve into the nuances of propaganda awareness education from an inter-cultural perspective. This aims to create spaces for meaningful cross-cultural communication and understanding.

The data collection process has brought to light a range of self-identified facets of Media/Institutional knowledge among participants.

These facets serve as the foundational bedrock for comprehending civic and media engagement practices, each representing distinct bodies of transformative knowledge. Among the observed practices, several noteworthy patterns emerge. Participants often prioritize the well-being of their siblings while navigating circumstances of constant movement, financial instability, and uncertainty about basic sustenance.
Diligently following all City Council policies and decisions is a common practice, reflecting a conscientious approach to civic involvement. Collaborating with individuals running for elected office emerges as a significant strategy, indicating a proactive engagement with the political process. Effective communication strategies play a pivotal role in assisting political campaigns, underscoring the importance of clear and persuasive messaging. Participants also frequently assume a role in shaping or editing rhetoric (messaging) to ensure their messages are conveyed effectively. Cultivating a strong identity in chen'chule (economic development) emerges as a prevalent practice, highlighting the recognition of economic empowerment as a catalyst for broader community well-being.

Engaging in community organizing and supporting community leaders are valued actions, indicating a commitment to collective efforts for positive change. Seeking consultation to navigate the advocacy process, including running public campaigns, garnering signatures, and fundraising, is a common approach, reflecting a strategic approach to mobilizing resources and support. Bringing issues directly to the voters and seeking their approval for proposed initiatives are recognized as impactful practices, signaling a commitment to democratic processes and community input.

Advocating for or against projects and challenging City Hall decisions are common forms of civic engagement, reflecting a willingness to challenge established norms for the betterment of the community. Additionally, conducting comprehensive research and citing relevant case law are crucial steps in informed advocacy, highlighting the importance of a well-informed approach to decision-making.
Cultivating strategic relationships and conferring with community leaders on strategy are important aspects of effective engagement, indicating a recognition of the value of collaboration and collective wisdom. Identifying influential community figures to advocate on one's behalf with those in power is a strategic move, demonstrating a nuanced understanding of political dynamics.

Participating in public hearings and delivering impactful public comments from the podium are significant forms of civic expression, showcasing a willingness to use one's voice to shape public discourse. Resiliently pursuing objectives, even in the face of opposition from elected officials, is a noteworthy trait, indicating a steadfast commitment to one's convictions. Assertively addressing those in power and employing strategic civil disobedience when necessary are recognized forms of advocacy, demonstrating a willingness to employ a range of tactics to effect change.

Understanding how to engage with law enforcement respectfully and effectively, thereby minimizing the potential for unfounded charges, is considered a valuable skill, highlighting a practical approach to navigating potentially contentious situations. Recognizing the potential for impactful change by running for elected office and securing a position that necessitates collaboration with peers is seen as an important avenue for civic influence, suggesting a strategic approach to achieving broader community goals.

Acknowledging the significance of effective administrative leadership and considering individual and familial cultural heritage, as well as potential language barriers, is regarded as important in the advocacy process. This recognition reflects a nuanced understanding of the role of cultural context in shaping administrative decisions and outcomes. Additionally,
acknowledging that professional experiences shape perceptions and seeking to foster relationships with individuals involved in legislative processes and administrative systems is a strategic approach. This indicates a proactive approach to building connections and leveraging professional expertise for advocacy efforts.

Conducting thorough research on City Council agenda items, especially those expected to be contentious, and disseminating relevant information via social media are recognized as effective communication strategies. This demonstrates a savvy approach to leveraging available platforms for information dissemination and community engagement. Embracing one's historical roots is valued for its connection to identity and heritage, underscoring the significance of understanding one's cultural context in advocacy efforts.

Identifying personal interests and understanding one's role within broader social movements in the media ecosystem is considered an important aspect of civic engagement. This recognition suggests an awareness of the broader social and media landscape in which advocacy efforts are situated. Serving as a political confidant to elected officials, being attuned to political pressure points for oneself and others, and knowing when to tactically withdraw to achieve broader goals behind the scenes are recognized as strategic political actions. This reflects a sophisticated understanding of political dynamics and a willingness to engage in behind-the-scenes advocacy.

Anticipating coordinated or circumstantial events with negative consequences that may be employed by others to subvert one's interests in the broader public narrative, particularly when others stand to gain from such tactics, is seen as an astute political awareness. This indicates a keen understanding of potential challenges and a proactive approach to mitigating
negative outcomes. Recognizing the weighty responsibility and privilege of engaging in critical conversations, fostering constructive thinking, and implementing critical consciousness is valued. This involves utilizing precise language to convey ideas accurately and offer constructive feedback. It also involves transcending limitations to consider perspectives beyond what is immediately apparent – to appreciate our shared humanity, understanding how we can be influenced by visual and auditory stimuli, and acknowledging that such susceptibilities reveal the malleability of human morals, ethics, and voting behavior. This reflects a thoughtful and introspective approach to advocacy, recognizing the broader implications of engaging in critical discourse.

Analysis and Pattern Identification:

The provided text offers a comprehensive overview of civic engagement practices, revealing a diverse array of strategies employed by participants. These practices form intricate patterns and themes. Participants employ a wide array of tactics, from participating in public hearings to advocating for or against specific projects. This diversity of approaches underscores the multifaceted nature of civic engagement. Many practices involve active participation in the political process, including supporting individuals running for office, assisting political campaigns, and challenging decisions made by City Hall. This reflects a strong commitment to advocacy and civic empowerment. Several practices focus on effective communication and messaging, such as shaping rhetoric, delivering impactful public comments, and leveraging social media for information dissemination. This highlights the importance of strategic communication in civic engagement efforts. Participants exhibit resilience in the face of challenges, including opposition from elected officials. They demonstrate a willingness to
assertively address those in power and, when necessary, employ civil disobedience as a strategic tool.

There is an awareness of the influence of structural factors, such as City Council policies, as well as cultural and familial heritage. Participants acknowledge the significance of effective administrative leadership and consider factors like language barriers. Some practices emphasize the potential for impactful change through running for elected office. This reflects a recognition of the transformative potential of holding political positions and collaborating with peers in decision-making processes. The text emphasizes the responsibility and privilege of engaging in critical conversations. Participants value constructive thinking, critical consciousness, and ethical conduct. They recognize the influence of visual and auditory stimuli on human behavior. The importance of acknowledging historical roots and personal interests is highlighted. This demonstrates an appreciation for the contextual factors that shape one's engagement in civic activities.

Overall, the findings showcase a rich tapestry of civic engagement practices, reflecting a deep commitment to advocacy, empowerment, and responsible political participation. Participants exhibit a strategic approach to navigating challenges and effectively communicating their messages. Additionally, there is a strong awareness of the cultural, familial, and historical influences that underpin their engagement in civic activities.

*The findings presented categorize a range of civic engagement practices self-identified by participants within the framework of Public Memory, focusing on aspects of remembering and forgetting.*
Each practice embodies a transformative essence, representing a way of being, and is situated within its original context. These practices encompass a diverse array of strategies, from addressing City Council meetings to nurturing intercultural spaces for inclusivity. Participants also utilize various media outlets and acknowledge the lasting impact of childhood experiences on their approaches. They exhibit a keen awareness of individual sensitivities and navigate political contexts with cultural sensitivity. Additionally, participants emphasize the importance of education, family connections, and personal narratives in their civic engagement efforts. This collection of practices sheds light on the multifaceted and deeply personal nature of civic engagement, rooted in individuals' unique experiences, values, and aspirations for community development.

Analysis and Pattern Identification:

The provided text revolves around the theme of remembering and the enduring impact of personal and collective experiences on civic and engagement practices. Key patterns and themes emerge:

Empowerment through Personal Narratives: Several participants emphasize the importance of owning one's story and experiences. This narrative ownership serves as a driving force behind their civic engagement efforts.
**Diverse Approaches to Engagement:** The practices outlined encompass a wide spectrum of approaches, from public speaking to intercultural facilitation, media utilization, and strategic political engagement.

**Family and Ancestral Influence:** Ancestral connections, family ties, and cultural heritage are recurrent motifs. Participants draw strength and motivation from their roots.

**Respect and Empathy:** Respect for others, valuing family bonds, and a commitment to treating others with kindness and consideration form a foundational ethos.

**Overcoming Adversity and Defying Statistics:** Several participants speak of defying statistical odds and persevering through challenges. This theme underscores a determination to forge their own path.

**Political Awareness and Preparedness:** Participants exhibit a keen understanding of the political landscape, advocating for comprehensive research on opponents and strategic engagement in political spaces.

**Vision and Leadership Development:** The cultivation of a clear vision for leadership roles emerges as a strategic focus, particularly within educational contexts.
Overall, highlights suggest an intricate interplay between personal experiences, familial and cultural influences, and civic engagement practices. It underscores the diverse approaches individuals employ to effect positive change within their communities.

Participants identified a range of Value System-based civic and media engagement practices, revealing their transformative potential.

These practices, classified as axiological (values), are integral to their approach to civic participation:

The practice of INAF'A'MAOLEK involves aiding others in preserving their dignity and reputation. This reflects a commitment to upholding the well-being and honor of individuals within the community.

Participants emphasize the importance of establishing a clear vision, purpose, and core values rooted in trust, honor, and mutual assistance. These values serve as guiding principles that motivate and inform their civic engagement efforts.

A significant theme is the shift in perception of others from adversaries to potential collaborators. This change in mindset demonstrates a willingness to work collectively towards common goals, transcending adversarial dynamics.
Empathy and compassion are recognized as pivotal in influencing one's perspective and approach to politics. Participants acknowledge the impact of personal background and resources on overcoming challenges, highlighting the importance of understanding and addressing the needs of the less fortunate.

Career manifestation is a strategic focus, especially for individuals less inclined towards direct political involvement. This involves identifying a clear career path and end goal, as well as gauging interest in political engagement among potential leaders.

Persistence and courage are valued qualities in the face of adversity. Participants exhibit a steadfast commitment to making a positive impact, even when met with challenges and sacrifices.

Community organization and advocacy emerge as influential practices. Establishing cultural community organizations, founded on integrity, camaraderie, and mutual support, serves as a platform for addressing public issues and expanding influence.

Setting positive life examples and working towards influencing or reshaping policies are key strategies for the betterment of struggling individuals. This demonstrates a commitment to leveraging personal influence for positive societal change.
Engagement with organizations or movements that challenge historical economic injustices, such as land rights, is another prominent practice. Fostering a strong sense of pride in cultural community organizations is central to advocating for economic justice.

Building relationships based on shared values is a fundamental approach to creating positive experiences and mutual understanding. This practice involves forming connections with community influencers who share similar value systems.

Advocating for initiatives that enhance quality of life and improve conditions for business owners is a strategic focus. This reflects a commitment to fostering a thriving community and a prosperous economic environment.

Balancing personal and professional actions is a critical consideration. Participants reflect on how their actions are perceived by others, striving for a pragmatic and experienced perspective while avoiding harm to others.

Empathy and prioritizing family emerge as core values in decision-making. This transition from a self-centered approach demonstrates an understanding of and compassion for the struggles of others.

Engaging with marginalized communities is recognized as a significant practice. Valuing their voices and ensuring they feel valued and heard is integral to creating an inclusive and equitable civic space.
The influence of cultural heritage on independence is acknowledged. Embracing traditional Catholic values while valuing independence, influenced by experiences in the United States, is central to personal growth and maturity.

Maintaining a steadfast commitment to integrity and the pursuit of doing what is morally right is an unwavering value. This ethical stance underscores the importance of upholding a strong moral compass in civic engagement.

Aspiring to be a good person is a foundational value for participants. Striving to be a decent, morally upright individual and making a positive impact in the world are central tenets of their civic engagement philosophy.

Drawing strength from humble beginnings is a source of resilience. Participants emphasize the importance of personal research and investigation for accurate understanding, highlighting the value of self-driven inquiry in their civic engagement efforts.

The highlights elucidate a range of civic and media engagement practices within the PD community. These practices serve as the axiological, epistemological, and ontological foundations for developing transformative critical consciousness.

In analyzing the text, several key patterns and themes emerge:
Empathy and Compassion:
- Many practices emphasize the importance of understanding and empathizing with the challenges faced by individuals, particularly those in less fortunate circumstances.

Vision and Purpose:
- Participants stress having a clear vision, purpose, and core values, including trust, honor, and mutual assistance, as motivational factors.

Advocacy and Influence:
- A significant portion of the practices involve advocacy, influencing policy, and effecting positive change in various spheres, such as economic justice and quality of life.

Resilience and Persistence:
- The text highlights the value of resilience, courage, and persistence in the face of challenges, reflecting a commitment to making a positive impact.

Community and Relationship Building:
- Practices center around community organization, relationship-building, and collaboration to effectuate change and support those in need.

Cultural and Personal Values:
- The influence of cultural and personal values, including notions of independence and traditional Catholic values, is prominently featured.
Ethical Decision-Making:
- Commitment to doing what is morally right and maintaining a strong ethical compass is a recurrent theme.

Empowerment and Advocacy for Marginalized Communities:
- Engaging with marginalized communities, valuing their voices, and advocating for their inclusion and representation is emphasized.

Overall, the text underscores a commitment to values-driven civic engagement, with participants employing a variety of strategies to effectuate positive change in their communities. The practices mentioned reflect a deep sense of empathy, resilience, and a strong ethical foundation. These principles form the bedrock for developing transformative critical consciousness within the PD community.

People + want + city + really + propaganda
Once again, "people" is a re-occurring theme among data collection tools: survey, focus groups, observations, and interviews.

**RE-THINKING: Self-Determination & Decolonizing Methodologies**
A Study in Decolonial Theory

Mignolo's (2011) elucidation of the history and emergence of decolonial thinking, along with its philosophical roots in colonality/modernity, provides a critical foundation for this dissertation. Central to this work is the concept of decoloniality, emphasized by scholars like Quijano (1991), who stressed the significance of "epistemic de-linking". Mignolo traces decolonial thought back to early Indigenous resistance in writings by figures such as Waman Puma de Ayala and Ottabah Cugoano in the 16th to 18th centuries. This counters the prevailing notion that colonality is an inherent part of modernity, as Mignolo argues that decoloniality too is a facet of modernity. Importantly, decolonial thinking disrupts the logic of colonality, shedding light on hidden facets of modernity often obscured by dominant Western narratives.

Mignolo distinguishes between post-colonial studies and decolonial thinking, asserting that the latter is rooted in a rich history of planetary decolonial thought rather than French post-structuralism. He underscores the significance of decolonizing the colonial matrix of power for fostering a new form of intercultural communication that allows for a genuine exchange of experiences and meanings. This new rationality, Mignolo argues, should be one that transcends provincialism, challenging the imposition of Western universalism on diverse cultural perspectives.

The role of mass media in perpetuating modernity's rhetoric is critiqued by Mignolo, who highlights how neocolonial independence movements during the Cold War merely altered the content rather than the terms of the conversation, maintaining the very essence of global capitalist hegemony. Mignolo advocates for a form of decolonization that aligns with pluri-versal aims, emphasizing the empowerment of other-thinking.
Mignolo's insights into the flawed nature of so-called imperial liberations, from one empire to another, resonate strongly. This perspective sheds light on instances like Guam's complex history, where transitions of governance from one imperial power to another did not necessarily equate to true freedom, challenging conventional notions of independence and revolution.

Furthermore, Mignolo's differentiation between post-colonial and decolonial modes of thinking, particularly within the context of critical theory, paves the way for a more nuanced understanding of Indigenous decolonial theory. This proposal posits the importance of grounding Indigenous decolonial theory in Native epistemology. Mignolo delves into the philosophical underpinnings of decolonial thinking, underscoring the epistemic colonial difference that existed in the perspectives of figures like Waman Puma and the Castilian chroniclers. This difference, though invisible to the Castilians, was a formidable barrier for Waman Puma, prompting him to write from a place of confrontation. Waman Puma's vision of a multicultural, inclusive government rooted in the colonial wound of Christianity is a powerful testament to the potential of decolonial thought. His proposal envisions a space of coexistence that transcends the colonial divide, resonating strongly with the theoretical Indigenous mediation framework of *inafa'maolek* in this study.

Similarly, Ottobah Cugoano's challenge to Enlightenment ideals in the late 1700s, as an ex-slave publishing his *Thoughts and Sentiments on the Evil of Slavery and Commerce of the Human Species*, exposes the West's blindness to the disposability of Indigenous and African peoples. This critique has far-reaching implications for understanding historical events, such as Pacific Islanders' experiences on Guam during Japanese occupation, and sheds light on the complexities of memory and justice in the aftermath.
Mignolo's discussion of the "decolonial turn" and Cugoano's unerring gaze towards a different perspective from the inception of colonality underscores the enduring relevance of decolonial thinking. This perspective aligns with the foundational principles of Indigenous decolonial theory, as depicted in Figure 1 in the Appendix.

In her work, "Decolonizing Methodologies," Dr. Linda Tuhiwai-Smith (1999/2012) advocates for an Indigenous approach to research. This process, however, necessitates a concurrent deconstruction of individual experience, particularly for Indigenous academics with complex ethnic identities. Tuhiwai-Smith's call for an Indigenous Research Agenda, focused on processes of decolonization, transformation, mobilization, and healing, resonates strongly with the quest for self-determination among Indigenous communities. Relatedly, Unaisi Nabob-Baba's (2006) exploration of reclaiming indigenous knowledge through decolonizing practices, rooted in both heart and mind, reinforces the imperative of decolonization in educational contexts. The process of inafa 'maolek offers an Indigenous framework for ontological curriculum development, aligning with the broader goals of decolonizing methodologies and emancipatory pedagogy. This journey, as articulated by Fasset & Warren (2007), emphasizes the ongoing process of identity development and the transformative potential of critical communication pedagogy.

*Propaganda*

Hammer & Kellner (2009) expound on Media/Cultural Studies in their work, "Media/Cultural Studies: Critical Approaches". This approach empowers students and citizens to critically engage with their culture and society. It emphasizes the importance of multiple
perspectives and aims to foster the ability to read, analyze, and reconstruct media, consumer, and digital culture. The text also traces the historical trajectory of media studies, highlighting its connections with government propaganda, corporate interests, and mass communications (xxxvi).

Stanley (2015) delves into the contemporary relevance of propaganda within democratic contexts. He defines political propaganda as the manipulation of political ideas, often rooted in flawed ideologies. This insidious practice, he argues, hinders democratic deliberation and undermines the very essence of collective reasoning for policy-making. While Stanley presents a critical view of propaganda's role in democracy, this dissertation contends that understanding these manipulative strategies is crucial for an informed public. In the right hands, propaganda can serve beneficial purposes in a democratic society.

The work of Edward Bernays, regarded as the pioneer of propaganda and public relations, is relevant to this discourse. Bernays emphasizes the significance of educators in understanding the relationship between academic ideas and the public. He posits that educators play a vital role in disseminating knowledge and shaping public opinion (1928, p.136). Similarly, Rev. Martin Luther King (1954) acknowledges the positive potential of propaganda in advocating for just causes. Propaganda serves as a crucial component in a pedagogy for decolonizing media literacy. It enables the creation of counter-hegemonic narratives that empower individuals and communities towards self-determination. This perspective is anchored in the work of thinkers such as Edward Bernays and W.E.B. Du Bois.

The historical development of mass communications, particularly in the post-WWII era, is integral to understanding its role in shaping democratic processes. Propaganda, as a tool for influencing public opinion, played a central role during World Wars I and II. Figures like Edward Bernays and Walter Lippman were instrumental in formulating strategies for shaping public
sentiment and social behavior. The Frankfurt School scholars, influenced by their observations of Nazi and U.S. propaganda, laid the foundation for critical communication studies. They introduced concepts like the "culture industry" and examined the ways in which media contributes to social control, manipulation, and ideological dissemination within corporate capitalism.

Marshall McLuhan's theory of "the medium is the message" highlighted the profound influence of communication forms on societal structures. This concept gains new relevance in the age of social networking, where media's impact extends to political, social, and economic realms.

Noam Chomsky and Edward Herman's research on the political economy of media, media imperialism, and corporate control of media underscore the threats to democracy posed by concentrated media ownership. Their critique of cultural imperialism and its role in disseminating Western culture globally holds particular significance.

In this dissertation, the intersection of meta-ethical hyper-globalization and de-colonization theory provides a platform for debating "universal ethics" versus ethical relativism. The call to respect and offer interpretations from diverse cultures challenges the dominance of Euro-centric epistemology, advocating for a more inclusive approach to knowledge construction.

Self-Determination

This study established an analytical framework, returning to the Indigenous Pacific-Islander concept of Inafa ‘maolek, which embodies the distinct axiology, ontology, and epistemology of Guam's Chamorro-Tao Tao Tano society. This framework stands in contrast to Western positivist research approaches. Inafa ‘maolek serves as a tool for mediation and repositions the epistemological core of pre-contact Chamorro, offering a unique lens for understanding
communication among the Chamorro people. This philosophy encompasses various cherished values in Indigenous-Oceania cultures:

**Respetu’** – Signifying deep respect for elders and other revered individuals within the family and community.

**Mang’nge** – A symbolic gesture of respect towards elders and figures of authority, often likened to a gentle touch of the nose to the back of a person’s right hand.

**Mama’hlao** – Describing the feeling of being shamefaced, embarrassed, or ashamed.

**Chen’chule** – Refers to the act of giving, often denoting a gift not tied to a specific event; (expected reciprocation).

**Che’lu** – Pertains to the significance of relationships with siblings.

**Påtgon** – Emphasizes the value placed on children and the collective responsibility for their upbringing (Aguon, K. in guampedia.com).

Aguon's conceptualization of Inafa’maolek is expanded upon by Underwood (2012), providing insights into pre-contact Chamorro beliefs, which highlight the pre-eminence of family authority, the importance of interdependence over personal independence, the inherent respect for social positions and situations, the wisdom associated with old age, and the idea of coexisting with nature rather than striving against it (p.17).

**An Indigenous Civic & Media Educational Research Framework towards Decolonizing Media Literacy**

The preceding theoretical considerations lay the groundwork for understanding the organization and analysis of the methodology, drawing from scholars such as Tuhiwai-Smith
Giroux (2014) contends that the United States comprises hyper-mediated communities, which uphold values of violence and military dominance as ethical imperatives to establish a social order favoring a particular class. He envisions a cultural remedy through innovative media practices that hold the potential to counter the prevailing hegemony of mega-corporate media institutions. Angela Davis epitomizes this idea by embodying the fusion of civic engagement and critical pedagogy through self-determination. According to Giroux, Davis is a Freedom Fighter who aligns herself with the oppressed, viewing social institutions (such as media, government, commerce, and policy) as part of the problem, tools of oppression that, when wielded by the subjugated masses, can become instruments of liberation. Critical literacy, essential for comprehending the world, demands educators to empower themselves to articulate opposition to a system bent on creating a public ripe for exploitation and social control.

Linda Tuhiwai Smith's study of Indigenous Pacific Islander-Maori thought proposes an agenda for Indigenous Research centered on self-determination (1999). This framework, akin to the ebb and flow of tides hitting and retreating from shore, encompasses elements of healing, decolonization, transformation, and mobilization. Each facet embodies diverse dynamics warranting thoughtful consideration. Any learning theory or pedagogy aiming to integrate Indigenous knowledge for the community's benefit must encompass Tuhiwai-Smith's Indigenous research agenda. The proposed framework's purpose is to propel self-determination within Native communities.

Navigation, another Indigenous concept, can be harnessed to advance learning theory for Indigenous students. Diaz & Kauanui (2002) examine the interplay of ocean, heaven, and land forces, offering a Native-style analysis and rhythm of politics. This metaphor, deeply rooted in the
seafaring traditions of Oceanic peoples, carries a profound history of Indigenous expression. It provides academic space for a shifting sense of Indigenous identity amidst nationalist agendas, globalization, and postcolonial conditions. Combining Indigenous-centered content with Native thought and English expression informs culture-transforming pedagogies that take into account these articulations as themes for student engagement and enlightening learning experiences.

Developing Indigenous learning theory involves mediating frameworks across various theoretical domains, from sociocultural to cognitive and behavioral. Navigating this terrain necessitates a multidisciplinary approach to communication.

Understanding one's position in time and space, as well as identifying the epistemological stance of the researcher, grounds meaning making in Native knowledge. Diaz (2011) uses the metaphor to illustrate the connection between the Native journey with the ocean and discourse theory. Grant & Giddings (2002) apply an Indigenous Pacific Islander Maori framework of whakapapa (genealogy) to bring order to social science methodologies. They contend that poststructuralism is rooted in the understanding that no one can stand outside the traditions or discourses of their time. This necessitates a shift towards more localized, problem-specific theories, rather than a quest for grand narratives.

As Stuart Hall suggests, meaning is open to interpretation by the audience. Grant & Giddings concur, emphasizing that meanings are multiple, unstable, and subject to interpretation. Discourse theory, in a Foucauldian poststructuralist context, views discourses as interrelated systems of social meaning that construct the objects they speak of. These discourses, in turn, establish boundaries on what can be imagined, thought, desired, said, and done. Grant & Giddings assert that truth, in this context, is a socially constructed historical entity, which gives rise to specific categories and entities that collectively police the boundaries of thought and action.
Interpretation and Discourse

Stuart Hall's "New Theory of Communication" (1973) challenges established assumptions regarding the production, circulation, and reception of media messages. In Hall's perspective, meaning is not fixed by the sender, messages are never entirely transparent, and the audience actively participates in interpreting meaning. Further, Wood (2003) astutely observes that Pacific Islands research, when based on Euro-American perspectives, often inadvertently reinforces Euro-American dominance, even when its intention is anti-hegemonic. Wood's analysis of Tuhiwai-Smith reinforces the assertion that distinct epistemological traditions shape how different native peoples perceive the world, organize themselves within it, pose questions, and seek solutions (Tuhiwai-Smith, 1999, p. 187-188 in Wood, 2003).

The audience actively engages in meaning-making, which is facilitated by cultural frameworks as mediational tools, rooted in epistemology. Gegeo & Watson-Gegeo, Meyer, & Salmond (cited in Wood, 2003, p. 355) highlight common features in the study of Native Oceanic Epistemologies, exemplifying how Indigenous epistemology guides the process of meaning-making. This aligns with the high context culture found in the classic field of human communications, where messages carry implicit meanings not explicitly stated; context imbues the message with significance. Simultaneously, the universalization of any particular Oceanic or regional epistemology appears equally implausible (Meyer, in Wood, 2003, p. 356).

Diaz (2011) further expounds on the broader purpose of articulating this knowledge as pedagogy, linked to fostering democratic citizenship identity as a counter to the prevalent colonial political status in Pacific territories. Self-determination emerges as a political endeavor in
Indigenous contexts. As a learning theory, self-determination diverges from Indigenous-based epistemology. Ormrod (2012) diagrams social-cultural learning theory relevant to various field perspectives, such as social cognitive theory and cognitive psychology. Whether a postcolonial approach to learning theory challenges contemporary viewpoints or offers an alternative narrative to social-culturalism remains a subject for exploration. Additional inquiries arise regarding the pertinence of multicultural curriculum design. Questions arise about the impact of interculturalism and how these concepts either advance or impede cultural imperialism in educational settings, schools, and communities.

In the context of critical indigenous qualitative research participants, Bishop (2005, cited in Denzin et al., 2008) contends that operationalizing autonomy as self-determination, when applying a kaupapa Maori research approach by and for Maori communities, encapsulates a sense of Maori ownership and active control over the future (p.45; p.440). In contrast, Bishop argues that self-determination is a relative concept, one that may be perplexing to non-indigenous individuals. She emphasizes that self-determination does not imply leaving indigenous populations alone, but rather, it calls on interested non-indigenous parties to allow native voices to emerge on their own terms. A crucial distinction in the definition of self-determination arises within an Indigenous-Interinstitutional relationship context of interdependence. This understanding asserts that individuals should be free to determine their own goals and make sense of the world in their culturally generated manner (Ibid). Young (2004, cited in Denzin et al., 2008, p.440-441) suggests that this is achieved through a cycle of conscientization, resistance, and transformational praxis, emblematic of indigenous community struggle.
Indigenous knowledge is fundamentally aligned with self-determination, serving as the vehicle for Indigenous people to reclaim and reassert their history, language, and cultural beliefs within curriculum (Deyhle, Swisher, Stevens, and Galván, 2008; Tuhiwai-Smith, 1999). While scholars continue to engage in passionate debates on terms like self-determination, inherent sovereignty, reserved rights, human rights, and treaty rights, there is no doubt that Indigenous peoples are entitled to all the mentioned forms of justice (McCarty et al., 2005, p. 2).

**IMF Framework: PD practices demonstrating transformative notions of critical consciousness (CritCon)**

The case study under examination illuminates civic and media practices as exemplars of Critical Consciousness (CritCon). These practices serve as empirical manifestations showcasing patterns of Positive Deviance (PD) behaviors, intrinsically linked to the foundational tenets of IMF (Conforming-Delinking; Reforming-Rethinking; Transforming-Relinking) practices for Positive Deviance behaviors.
Figure 4.12 Foundational tenets of IMF process - the CRITCON framework

Refer to Appendix Notes 3.2 for a comprehensive delineation of PD practices that vividly exemplify transformative facets of critical consciousness. The coding schema employed herein serves to underscore the distinctive nature of practices within this specific Positive Deviance community. It effectively identifies those PD practices that unequivocally embody transformative dimensions of critical consciousness.

Respetu'

Activists are often venerated and held in high esteem within the community. This signifies the diverse gradations and levels of respect accorded to one another. It is imperative for learners to receive instruction in the foundational principles governing social and proximal space, which
may be delineated in terms of low or high context cultures. These concepts are to be imbibed and internalized to refine one's proficiency in social language.

In navigating our contemporary decolonial milieu, characterized by the convergence of manifold cultures and values, it is incumbent upon us to recognize that irrespective of spatial or territorial boundaries, demonstrating respect towards individuals of diverse backgrounds is paramount. This, indeed, is the trajectory for progress.

Explicitly cultivating an understanding of the political dynamics of power within institutional domains is an essential skillset for professional advancement. Digital Media Literacy (DML) imparts insight into the concealed structures of privilege that underlie power dynamics. In this context, a novel narrative worth exploring pertains to the pluri-versal perspectives emanating from various cultures, each occupying its distinct perspective-space in the co-creation of meaning regarding historically significant political events.

Consider, for instance, the commemoration of Cinco de Mayo. There exists educational value in apprising both historically marginalized and culturally dominant students, irrespective of their geographic location, of the perspectives articulated by Mexican historians regarding the significance of Cinco de Mayo in shaping contemporary U.S. history. This extends to reflections on Confederate and Union-centered themes. Succinctly put, had the Mexican Army not thwarted the advancing French forces, the Confederate South might have garnered the resources required to potentially emerge victorious in the U.S. Civil War. It is worth noting that this narrative may evoke dissonance among present-day descendants of Confederate South families, as well as their counterparts holding contrary viewpoints.

While contemporary public discourse in Texas is centered on Critical Race Theory (CRT) and related policy proposals, both in favor and in opposition, at the state and municipal levels, it
is important to recognize that these meaning-making practices are imbibed from a fragmented ecosystem encompassing public pedagogy and implicit curriculum tools (e.g., family, culture, media), facilitated by institutional structures. Embracing this diversity, though inherently challenging, engenders a structured learning environment capable of accommodating the dynamic interplay of ideas, thus empowering learners at all levels to cultivate skills conducive to fostering intercultural community relationships built on harmony.

*Mang'nge*

*Mang'nge* signifies the cultural norms and value systems that underpin behavioral expectations within media and institutional belief systems, as per the framework of Inafa 'maolek Mediation Framework (IMF). An illustrative practice within certain cultural communities involves the mobilization and election of minority female leaders within predominantly monocultural public spheres. Within the realm of public policy, members of the dominant majority may employ strategic engagement tactics in municipal public meetings, a practice exemplified by constituents who invest considerable effort in researching and articulating prepared remarks on salient public policy matters.

The public value of learning civic engagement extends beyond mere participation; it encompasses critical reflection and action. Triangulation is evident in Participatory Action Research and Sociocultural Foundations pedagogical approaches, which involve processes of reading, reflection, and writing. Within the decolonial framework, this process further encompasses thinking, delinking, and relinking.
Another facet of Mang'nge pertains to the concept of public memory, involving the collective recollection (or lack thereof) of historical events and narratives. Establishing an Intercultural Translation Zone within teacher education demands a foundation of trust; this space allows for the cross-cultural exchange of meaning-making. Trust is the linchpin of this endeavor, without which such a space cannot exist. It provides the fertile ground for shared linguistic meaning-making, fostering success in intercultural communication and relationships.

The conceptualization of the "Other's Window of Knowing" provides an innovative theoretical perspective. Drawing parallels with Johari's Window, which encompasses the open self, hidden self, blind self, and unknown self, this framework introduces a circular window divided into four quarters. The focus lies on the blind dimension, particularly in the context of Rossatto's perspective on Optimism. It calls attention to the blind spots in understanding one another's perspectives, emphasizing the need to bridge this gap for mutual comprehension.

In the pursuit of shared understanding and collective vision, reciprocity in sharing perspectives is pivotal. It counters the prevailing narrative where dominant cultures have historically shaped educational agendas and influenced knowledge production. As the previously marginalized voices gain prominence, there is immense value in sharing alternate perspectives, ultimately fostering a richer understanding of intent and collective aspirations.

This "Window of Knowing the Other" serves as a tool for understanding diverse cultural meanings. It acts as an intercultural translation zone, affording an opportunity for mutual understanding and perspective-checking, thus dismantling divisive walls. The way forward lies in cultivating mutual understanding grounded in frameworks of mediation, such as Inafa'maolek, which emphasize respect and common social rules as individual mediated frameworks for making sense of the world.
**Mang'nge** encapsulates the social rules and value systems governing behavior. It rationalizes the economic and social impact of a researcher in a professional setting, particularly in relation to faith and religion. This aligns with the *Inafa'maolek* system of meaning-making, emphasizing harmony. This concept extends to the management of time, a dimension particularly salient for an Indigenous researcher navigating diverse cultural environments. It underscores the importance of adapting one's approach to align with the cultural nuances of a given context, ultimately contributing to the establishment of positive relations and trust-building. This approach, rooted in *Inafa'maolek*, forms the bedrock for effective community engagement and relationship-building within a public administration context.

**Mama'hlao (shame/humility)**

*Mama'hlao* as shame or humility also emphasizes the importance of recognizing privilege among dominant groups and the need to challenge and dismantle systems of oppression and inequality. This means acknowledging and confronting the ways in which dominant groups have benefitted from systemic racism and white supremacy, and actively working towards equity and justice for marginalized communities. This may involve difficult conversations and uncomfortable introspection, but it is crucial for moving towards a more just and equitable society. In terms of media and institutional discourse, *mama'hlao* calls for an honest and critical examination of the narratives and representations put forth by dominant groups. This requires interrogating the power dynamics at play and amplifying the voices and perspectives of marginalized communities. It also means being aware of how media and institutions perpetuate harmful stereotypes and promote
certain ideologies, and actively working to challenge and disrupt those narratives. *Mama'hlao* is a powerful value in promoting social justice and equity. It calls on individuals and institutions to recognize their privilege and power, and to actively work towards dismantling systems of oppression and inequality. It also highlights the importance of critical thinking and reflection in challenging dominant narratives and amplifying marginalized voices. By incorporating this value into our societal structures and practices, we can create a more just and equitable world for all.

*Mama'hlao*, encompassing both shame and humility, assumes a paramount role within civic and media practices, interfacing with media and institutional discourse space. This emotional dimension is profoundly influenced by socio-historical factors that shape the mediation process.

The concept of the Hubris of Zero, as articulated by Mignolo, underscores a fundamental principle of coloniality. It posits that certain entrenched frameworks perpetuate colonialism. This perspective is vividly evident in the historical narrative of the Confederacy, as reflected in the monuments present at Texas county courthouses, State Capitol, and U.S. military bases (i.e., Fort Hood redesignation to Fort Cavazos). The Hubris of Zero contends that this dominant narrative brooks no dissent, effectively monopolizing historical interpretation. These narrative dynamic fuels the ongoing Anti-Critical Race Theory (CRT) movement, particularly within predominantly White communities. Members of these communities’ grapple with a multicultural understanding of history, confronting narratives that challenge their cherished perspectives.

The issue at hand is the perversion of CRT by certain factions of the ultra-Alt Right, who equate it with a denunciation of White identity and an assertion that success is contingent upon race. This skewed interpretation misrepresents CRT, which fundamentally serves as a legal framework explicating the systemic nature of racism and its impact on those outside dominant power structures.
Furthermore, there is a palpable awareness within U.S. Congress of potential liabilities associated with CRT. The specter of reparations looms, as lawmakers recognize the potential legal vulnerability of institutions like The University of Texas, Harvard, Princeton, and Yale (Lee & Ahtone, 2020). The criticality of understanding these complexities in the context of educational curriculum is underscored, especially considering the charged debates surrounding Black Lives Matter and Anti-CRT movements. The imperative lies in recognizing and fostering a third space—a realm of intercultural curriculum—that empowers equity for communities historically affected by inequity; as well as reassurances to the historical dominant culture of power that injustice will not be reciprocated in an Inafaˈmaolek World Order.

In practical terms, the application of Mamaˈhlao values within intercultural translation zones, exemplified by the interaction between a Black Chamber civic organization and a municipal department administrator in a diverse urban central Texas context, is undergirded by a federal value system. This system upholds the significance of understanding and participating in the Disadvantaged Business Enterprise program, mandated by federal civil rights statutes. It is through such policy-driven initiatives that opportunities for transformational cultural relations are actualized.

Cheˈlu (sibling)

The salient concept of Cheˈlu (akin to siblinghood) underscores the pivotal role of familial dimensions in engendering communal development within an Intercultural Translation Zone. This bond of trust with an ally begets a fertile ground for mutual comprehension. The
question arises: how does one effectuate urban transformation? The fulcrum lies within the cultural milieu. This is the practice that characterizes distinct community cohorts, comprising discrete individuals engaged in didactic communion. Hence, the alteration of the lived experiences of these individuals within your community precipitates a ripple effect across the entirety of the social fabric. This encompasses a revolution in their participatory involvement and an evolution in their discerning faculty vis-à-vis media.

In the environment of this research, discordant epistemological paradigms have surfaced vis-à-vis the roles of the investigator and elected officials in the intricate navigation and harmonization of knowledge systems and value matrices. These systems of knowledge governance either serve as conduits or impediments to the project of self-determination, firmly rooted in critical decolonial epistemic frameworks. This transpires amidst the labyrinthine tapestry of omnipresent meanings and portrayals pertaining to both global and local iterations of neoliberal capitalism, specifically within the realm of economic developmental processes, which invariably steer the trajectories of civic and media engagements. The import of contextualizing the potential for reciprocal sense-making while simultaneously adhering to institutional norms is paramount, if only to eventually veer towards a reconfiguration of consciousness. This connotes that economic development initiatives spanning the expanse of the State and its sundry municipalities assume the role of conduits for fostering comprehensive opportunities in community and business development, even when statutorily mandated, for the collective welfare.

It is incumbent upon government leaders to be reminded not solely of the moral and social imperatives, but also the legal obligations, undergirding their involvement within the civic sphere, deploying media strategies for the betterment of a designated family-community nexus.
Chen'chule (gift/money--reciprocation)

The concept of Chen'chule (signifying the bestowal of gifts or monetary resources in reciprocation) elucidates the underlying ethos necessitating our engagement in the metamorphosis of cultural domains. Our objective is to cultivate inquisitiveness within learners, fostering a desire to apprehend the verities of the world. In this endeavor, we extend to them a benediction, deriving gratification from their audacity in posing inquiries that buttress inquiry-driven scrutiny. The substance of these interrogations holds paramount significance. It entails both cultivating a spirit of curiosity and imbibing knowledge concerning the civic modus operandi and media methodologies.

Chen'chule thus entails a transmutation of the endowment encapsulated within the human intellect, physique, and spiritual essence of those embroiled in the civic discourse. It underscores the intrinsic worth of individual well-being in fortifying sustained involvement and harnessing the persuasive potential wielded over a broad audience through social media platforms. This encompasses not only physical vigor but also spiritual vitality, constituting the wherewithal to engage in interpersonal connections in a substantive manner. It encompasses the requisite energy to partake in a diverse array of activities—drafting missives for advocacy, interfacing with constituents, conducting policy and issue analyses, fundraising, mobilizing communities, as well as strategizing and participating in an array of communication campaigns—to uphold the continuity of messaging. The execution of civic functions mandates the metamorphosis of individuals within a given community. We are in the throes of transformation. We are, in essence,
redefining our own veracity. Through action, we forge a path towards a novel cognitive paradigm—a manifestation of Positive Deviance.

*Patgon (children)*

The concept of Patgon pertains to the crucial aspect of child rearing and the incorporation of media in this context has discernible implications for civic and media engagement practices. This underscores the notion of Axiological Parenting, an approach predicated on the inculcation of values within child-rearing, whereby media literacy serves as an integral facet of a proactive, child-centric, and decolonialized pedagogical framework. For instance, the act of viewing YouTube content, both with and without parental controls, constitutes a deliberate effort in overseeing and regulating a child's usage and consumption time, thereby establishing necessary boundaries. The parent assumes the responsibility of vetting the content of videos, differentiating between those that are self-produced and those that are professionally generated, and accessible through specific streaming applications (e.g., Disney). It is imperative to acknowledge that the veracity of self-produced online videos exposes children to potential negative influences emanating from malicious entities, such as online predators, in addition to advertising materials targeting the child demographic. Simultaneously, this engagement provides the child, under parental supervision, with an opportunity to discern responsible content creators from those whose material poses a greater degree of risk.

*Researcher’s Insight*
This study delves into a critical issue: the dearth of research, curriculum, and pedagogy in civic and media education across diverse municipalities in Guam and Texas. This gap particularly pertains to the practices of civic education and propaganda employed by various cultural groups in engaging with municipal public policymaking. Notably, this study is conducted by an Indigenous social science researcher, shedding light on the practices of the dominant white culture.

Accessing this ecosystem proved relatively manageable; however, sustained involvement in the process presented its own challenges. Our research unveiled both the official and unofficial aspects, including hidden curricula, of the municipal public policy process, as well as civic and media education within this transnational context. It is intriguing to note that the Indigenous Minority participants held official positions within the municipal policy processes, representing the white dominant culture. While they individually acted as minorities within their communities, their official roles carried the responsibility of upholding the institutional neocolonial order in the governance of community and business affairs.

This case study represents a departure from conventional research on Indigenous/Minority populations, as it approaches the subject from a decolonizing perspective. It underscores the need to teach and learn about being a minority within spaces dominated by the majority culture in order to achieve self-determination. This unique approach calls for a curriculum and pedagogy explicitly rooted in this research area. To comprehend how to teach and learn civic and media education from this standpoint, we must first understand the policy ecosystem surrounding the civic media environment of the Indigenous/Minority individual, informed by the socio-historical context.

The concept of "Conforming to Transform" emerged as a pivotal indicator of success for this Positive Deviance community grappling with challenges such as poverty, fractured families, and foster care. Another subgroup maintained resilience against poverty, fortified by robust family
bonds and faith grounded in Christian values. Growing up alongside White community members and engaging in institutional community activities for professional, recreational, and educational purposes equipped this community with the skills needed to confront social obstacles, set objectives, and persevere toward attainment. This agency is encapsulated by the foundational knowledge, role of historical memory, and the value system that guides community decisions. By participating in activities aligned with the dominant social and cultural norms, these individuals learned how to build social capital and subsequently leverage relationships for the betterment of both them and others.

Positive Deviants consistently demonstrated empathy and compassion. This participant community internalized vision and purpose from a young age, even in the face of challenging circumstances. As part of their conformist mindset, they exercised advocacy and influence, beginning at home and extending into their experiences in public schooling and professional life. Through these actions, the community learned how to advocate for others' well-being and the greater good. When confronted with challenges in their careers, families, or personal lives, the community exhibited resilience and persistence in the face of influential powers. Deviants exhibited a positive and assertive approach to community and relationship building, identifying personal and group interests, and then synthesizing them with the interests of those in positions of power and influence. Participants also learned to identify and cultivate cultural and personal values that supported ethical decision-making. The overarching purpose of this Positive Deviance community was to empower and advocate for marginalized communities.

This research has unveiled pivotal insights into the realm of municipal civic media education, encompassing the following substantial contributions:
1. *Inafa*’maolek Mediation Framework:

   This framework has emerged as a foundational tool for comprehending civic media education, providing a structured approach to mediation within municipal contexts.

2. CRITCON Framework - Conforming-De-Linking/Reforming-Re-Thinking/Transforming-Re-Linking:

   The CRITCON framework, delineating processes such as Conforming, De-Linking, Reforming, Re-Thinking, and Transforming, Re-Linking offers a nuanced understanding of critical consciousness development. It unravels the dynamic nature of this process.

3. Civic and Media Best Practices within the Positive Deviance Approach (Conform to Transform):

   Within the Positive Deviance approach, the emphasis on 'Conform to Transform' signifies a powerful strategy for effecting positive change in civic engagement and media education. These contributions represent significant strides in comprehending and advancing municipal civic media education. They offer valuable frameworks and practices that hold the potential to inform and shape future research endeavors in this domain.

   Media/Institutional Knowledge

   The identified behavioral practices reflect a multifaceted approach to civic and media engagement among participants. They prioritize the well-being of their siblings while navigating challenging circumstances, including financial instability and constant movement. Participants
show a commitment to conscientiously following City Council policies and decisions, which indicates a strong sense of civic responsibility. Moreover, they actively collaborate with individuals running for elected office, demonstrating a proactive engagement with the political process.

Effective communication strategies play a pivotal role in supporting political campaigns and advocacy efforts. Participants emphasize the importance of clear and persuasive messaging, often taking on roles in shaping and editing rhetoric. The cultivation of a strong identity in *chen’chule* (economic development) highlights the recognition of economic empowerment as a catalyst for broader community well-being.

Additionally, engagement in community organizing and support for community leaders underscores a commitment to collective efforts for positive change. Seeking consultation to navigate the advocacy process, conducting comprehensive research, and citing relevant case law are indicative of a well-informed and strategic approach to decision-making.

Cultivating strategic relationships and conferring with community leaders are important aspects of effective engagement, demonstrating a recognition of the value of collaboration and collective wisdom. Participants also identify influential community figures to advocate on their behalf with those in positions of power.

Furthermore, participants actively participate in public hearings, delivering impactful public comments to shape public discourse. Their resilience in pursuing objectives, even in the face of opposition, reflects a steadfast commitment to their convictions. They also employ strategic civil disobedience when necessary, indicating a willingness to employ various tactics to effect change.
Understanding how to engage with law enforcement respectfully and effectively, thereby minimizing the potential for unfounded charges, is considered a valuable skill. Recognizing the potential for impactful change by running for elected office and securing a position that necessitates collaboration with peers is seen as an important avenue for civic influence.

Acknowledging the significance of effective administrative leadership and considering individual and familial cultural heritage and language barriers is vital in the advocacy process. This recognition reflects a nuanced understanding of the role of cultural context in shaping administrative decisions and outcomes. Additionally, acknowledging that professional experiences shape perceptions and seeking to foster relationships with individuals involved in legislative processes and administrative systems is a strategic approach. This indicates a proactive approach to building connections and leveraging professional expertise for advocacy efforts.

Conducting thorough research on City Council agenda items and disseminating relevant information via social media are recognized as effective communication strategies, showcasing a savvy approach to leveraging available platforms for information dissemination and community engagement. Embracing one's historical roots is valued for its connection to identity and heritage, underscoring the significance of understanding one's cultural context in advocacy efforts. Furthermore, participants identify personal interests and understand their role within broader social movements in the media ecosystem. This recognition suggests an awareness of the broader social and media landscape in which advocacy efforts are situated.

They also serve as political confidants to elected officials, showing their sophistication in understanding political dynamics. Participants are attuned to political pressure points for themselves and others, and they know when to tactically withdraw to achieve broader goals behind the scenes. In addition, participants demonstrate astute political awareness by anticipating
coordinated or circumstantial events with negative consequences that may be employed by others to subvert their interests in the broader public narrative, particularly when others stand to gain from such tactics.

Finally, participants recognize the weighty responsibility and privilege of engaging in critical conversations, fostering constructive thinking, and implementing critical consciousness. This involves utilizing precise language to convey ideas accurately and offer constructive feedback. It also involves transcending limitations to consider perspectives beyond what is immediately apparent, appreciating shared humanity, understanding how individuals can be influenced by visual and auditory stimuli, and acknowledging that such susceptibilities reveal the malleability of human morals, ethics, and voting behavior. This reflects a thoughtful and introspective approach to advocacy, recognizing the broader implications of engaging in critical discourse.

Public Memory

In examining the category of Public Memory, it becomes evident that participants find empowerment through the sharing of their personal narratives. They employ diverse approaches to engagement, showcasing a broad spectrum of tactics ranging from eloquent public speaking to skillful intercultural facilitation, adept media utilization, and astute strategic political engagement. Ancestral connections, tightly knit family bonds, and cherished cultural heritage emerge as recurrent motifs, acting as wellsprings of profound strength and motivation for participants. This foundational ethos places great emphasis on an unwavering respect for others, a genuine valuing of familial ties, and a steadfast commitment to treating individuals with kindness, consideration,
and empathy. Moreover, many participants share their experiences of triumphing over daunting statistical odds, illustrating an indomitable spirit in the face of challenges. This prevailing theme underscores their resolute determination to forge their own unique path. Additionally, participants demonstrate a strikingly acute understanding of the intricate political landscape, advocating for a rigorous approach involving comprehensive research on opponents and a strategic engagement in various political arenas. Within educational contexts, the deliberate cultivation of a lucid vision for leadership roles emerges as a central strategic focus, laying the groundwork for informed and effective leadership.

Value Systems

The value systems embraced by participants reveal a deep commitment to practices rooted in their core beliefs and principles. One such cornerstone practice is INAFA’MAOLEK, which involves not only preserving one's own dignity and reputation but also aiding others in doing so. This reflects a shared dedication to upholding the inherent worth and integrity of individuals within the community.

Additionally, participants place a strong emphasis on establishing a clear vision, purpose, and core values grounded in trust, honor, and mutual assistance. This deliberate focus on principled guidance underscores the importance of ethical frameworks in shaping their actions and decisions.

A noteworthy theme that emerges is a transformation in perspective. Participants transition from viewing others as adversaries to recognizing their potential as collaborators in shared goals and objectives. This shift signifies a move towards cooperative and inclusive approaches in civic engagement.
The pivotal role of empathy and compassion in influencing one's approach to politics is also acknowledged. This highlights the significance of understanding and empathizing with the experiences of others, particularly in the context of political decision-making and advocacy.

Career manifestation emerges as a strategic focus, especially for individuals who may be less inclined towards direct political involvement. This indicates a deliberate effort to make a meaningful impact through alternative avenues, reflecting a nuanced understanding of diverse paths to effecting positive change.

Values of persistence and courage are highly esteemed among participants, signaling a steadfast commitment to facing adversity with unwavering determination. This resilience is seen as a driving force behind their efforts to overcome challenges and bring about meaningful transformation.

Additionally, community organization and advocacy surface as influential practices, demonstrating a collective dedication to effecting positive change within the community. This highlights a shared belief in the power of collective action and community-led initiatives.

Setting positive life examples and actively working towards reshaping policies for the betterment of struggling individuals are identified as key strategies. This illustrates a proactive approach to addressing societal challenges, underscoring a commitment to creating tangible, positive impacts.

Engaging with organizations or movements that challenge historical economic injustices, such as advocating for land rights, emerges as another prominent practice. This indicates a commitment to rectifying systemic inequalities and advocating for a more equitable society.

Building relationships founded on shared values is considered fundamental, promoting
positive experiences and fostering mutual understanding among individuals. This emphasis on shared values serves as a foundation for collaborative efforts in effecting positive change.

Advocating for initiatives that enhance overall quality of life and improve conditions for business owners represents a strategic focus. This underscores a desire for sustainable progress and prosperity within the community, reflecting a long-term vision for growth and development.

Balancing personal and professional actions is deemed a critical consideration, emphasizing the need for ethical alignment in all endeavors. This reflective approach highlights a commitment to integrity and ethical conduct across all aspects of life.

The values of empathy and prioritizing family are identified as core principles in the decision-making process. This underscores the significance of familial bonds and compassionate consideration in shaping their actions and choices.

Engaging with marginalized communities is recognized as a significant practice, reflecting a commitment to inclusivity and a desire to amplify underrepresented voices. This inclusive approach underscores a commitment to equity and representation within the broader community.

Acknowledging the influence of cultural heritage on notions of independence is noted, emphasizing the importance of understanding the intersection between cultural identity and individual autonomy. This recognition of cultural context highlights a nuanced understanding of the factors that shape individual perspectives and values.

Maintaining a steadfast commitment to integrity and the unwavering pursuit of moral righteousness is identified as a foundational value. This emphasizes the importance of ethical conduct and a principled approach in all aspects of life.
Aspiring to embody the qualities of a good person is regarded as a fundamental value for participants. This collective aspiration reflects a shared commitment to positive character traits and virtuous action in their interactions with others.

Drawing strength from humble beginnings is acknowledged as a source of resilience. This recognition of the transformative power of perseverance and determination underscores a collective belief in the potential for personal growth and development, regardless of one's starting point.

During this study, various key terminologies and frameworks have been employed, including:

1. Civic Efficacy Formula 2023/Meaning
2. Other’s Window of Knowing
3. Municipal Policy “Sausage Making” Process
4. DML Curriculum
5. DML Pedagogy
6. Propaganda/Education DML Model

Initially, the primary objective was to investigate the influence of dominant white power culture on media and its impact on various communities. However, as the research progressed, the scope narrowed to an exploration of civic agency in the epoch of digital disinformation. The ultimate aspiration underlying this research is the realization of self-determination for all individuals, fostering an information environment of empowerment and autonomy. Furthermore, the principles of love, faith, and hope have been integral in guiding this study, underscoring their
significance in the pursuit of a just and equitable society. As a guiding light, pertinent scripture has been considered, providing a foundation of wisdom and insight in the pursuit of understanding and positive change.
CHAPTER V
Discussion & Conclusion

Introduction

RE-LINKING: People, Power, and Capital

In this section, we re-link the profound insights of Roger Silverstone (1999), shedding light on the intricate relationship between the media and the socio-political landscape. Silverstone posits a fundamental question: "Why study the Media?" Within this question, a critical dimension emerges--trust. Roger Silverstone's seminal work prompts us to contemplate the pivotal role of media in modern societies. Trust, as a cornerstone, is both the linchpin and litmus test for the effectiveness and credibility of media outlets. It becomes evident that trust is not merely an abstract concept but a dynamic force that permeates every facet of society's engagement with the media. This dissertation underscores the dual nature of media influence, as both a conduit for education and a potential vehicle for propaganda. It is within this dichotomy that the dialectics of power and capital find their nexus. Media, with its capacity to disseminate information, holds the potential to either enlighten or manipulate, contingent upon the intentions behind its use. In the age of information proliferation, insights into disinformation and misinformation become prescient since the inversion and convergence of media systems in the new media epoch. The deliberate dissemination of false information (disinformation) and the inadvertent spread of inaccurate information (misinformation) underscore the need for discernment in an era where truth and falsehood often intermingle while exasperated by the prolific technologies that put the power to
persuade the masses in the hands of any individual; a stark contradiction from the institutional-driven mass media market many of us grew up with. To comprehensively grasp the dynamics of media influence, the review of literature introduced us to pivotal models of propaganda. These models, espoused by influential thinkers like Noam Chomsky and Edward Bernays, provide distinct lenses through which we can analyze the interplay between media, power dynamics, and capital interests. Additionally, this dissertation calls attention to contemporary iterations of propaganda, reflecting the evolving landscape of media influence in the digital age.

In this intricate web of media, trust emerges as the linchpin that binds together the multifaceted interplay of people, power, and capital. Understanding these dynamics is paramount for navigating the complex terrain of modern media landscapes and their profound implications for society at large. This study reveals insights which serve as an indispensable foundation for dissecting and interpreting the intricate relationship between media, trust, and the socio-political fabric.

**Disciplines: A Multifaceted Exploration for CritCon**

In this section, we embark from the review of literature in Chapter II towards a comprehensive exploration of various academic disciplines, each offering a unique vantage point in the examination of critical socio-political and cultural phenomena. Thomas Sowell's (2023) incisive analysis of social justice fallacies serves as a foundational pillar in the realm of quantitative social sciences. Sowell's rigorous empirical approach exposes misconceptions and challenges prevailing notions surrounding social justice, providing a vital framework for critical inquiry. The intersection of artificial intelligence and the social sciences represents a frontier of
inquiry (Sedova, K., et.al., 2021; Mohamed, S. et, al., 2020). Examining the ethical and societal implications of AI technologies delves into questions of autonomy, bias, and the redistribution of power in an increasingly digitized world. Peter Thiel's (2023) multifaceted perspective, encompassing politics, science, faith, and economy, offers a compelling lens through which to scrutinize the complexities of diversity. Thiel's discourse challenges conventional narratives, inviting a nuanced dialogue on the intricate relationship between diversity and various spheres of human endeavor. Joseph Stiglitz's (2023) elucidation of a post-neoliberal global order constitutes a vital departure from conventional economic paradigms. This discourse seeks to redefine the contours of global governance, advocating for a more inclusive and equitable economic framework.

Within the realm of qualitative humanities, the concept of culture wars emerges as a focal point. This multifaceted phenomenon encapsulates ideological struggles within society, encompassing issues of identity, values, and societal norms. A qualitative exploration of culture wars unveils the intricate tapestry of contemporary socio-cultural discourse. Embedded within both quantitative and qualitative domains, the pursuit of social justice stands as a unifying thread. It transcends disciplinary boundaries, compelling scholars to grapple with questions of equity, fairness, and the pursuit of a more just society.

In the field of Indigenous Studies (INDIG), the Social Justice Framework-intercultural (SJ x SJF-intercultural) stands as a vital analytical tool. This framework offers a unique lens through which to scrutinize intercultural dynamics within the sphere of social justice. It facilitates a nuanced understanding of the complex interplay between social justice principles and intercultural contexts, shedding light on the intricate nature of equitable engagement across diverse cultural landscapes.
Within the realm of Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML), the Propaganda Model serves as a fundamental framework for comprehensive analysis. This model encompasses a range of critical components, beginning with the ABC's of Propaganda/Life Values. Here, we delve into CRITCON-Conforming-de-linking process, which involves a critical consciousness aligned with prevailing norms and values, offering insights into the underlying power dynamics within societal structures. Moving forward, CRITCON-Reforming-re-thinking process engages critical consciousness in the challenge and reform of existing norms and values, instigating transformative shifts within socio-cultural paradigms. Finally, CRITCON-Transforming-re-linking process represents the apex of critical consciousness, aspiring for transformative change that transcends established norms, ultimately fostering a more inclusive and just society.

Another crucial facet is Remembering Struggle, which pays homage to the historical struggles and challenges faced by marginalized communities. It underscores the significance of collective memory in the pursuit of social justice. Furthermore, delving into the socio-historical context provides a rich tapestry for understanding the intricacies of power dynamics, as well as the evolution of societal norms and values. Recognizing the agency of individuals within the broader social justice landscape brings to light the potential for transformative action at a personal level.

The examination of the intricate web of media devices and platforms, known as the Media Device Ecosystem, elucidates their role in shaping narratives and disseminating information, both within and across cultures. Additionally, the exploration of the intersection of artificial intelligence (AI) and decolonial theory within the AI De-colonial Theory (Project of Self-Determination) sheds light on the potential for AI to empower communities in their pursuit of self-determination. The concept of Decolonial and Colonial Dialectical Contradiction delves into the tensions and contradictions inherent in the struggle for decolonization, underscoring the unequal power
dynamics that persist. Not Equal further emphasizes the asymmetry in power and agency between colonial and decolonial forces, highlighting the imperative for equitable transformation. At its core, this section centers on CritCon towards Self-determination, underscoring the critical consciousness necessary for marginalized communities to assert their right to self-determination. Through this endeavor, communities reclaim agency and autonomy within the broader social, cultural, and political landscape.

The determination to engage in the civic media sphere, whether on an individual or group basis, hinges significantly on the categorization of information as either educational or propagandistic. This categorization is contingent upon the interpretation of epistemological, ontological, and axiological dimensions in the process. Before arriving at an overall assessment of its value, it is imperative to factor in the interplay of these elements. Thus, I propose a comprehensive approach, wherein the practice of Civics or Media is considered as a composite of Epistemological, Ontological, and Axiological values, divided by the significance of these practices in relation to the established values of my cultural group. This can be represented as $C$ or $M (E \times O \times A) / M = BP = SI/M$, ensuring that the potential benefits are equal to the combined influence of what my influencers convey and the meaning it holds within my cultural context.

This coding scheme has evolved since the literature review phase, culminating in the formulation of the Civic Efficacy formula advanced by Mihailidis (2014): $C < BP + SI$. Through the subsequent analysis and findings of this study, a distinctive education model for propaganda meaning making has emerged, founded on the principles of Positive Deviance and applied across diverse transnational Indigenous community spaces. The participants, all identifying with Indigenous or Native heritage, served as representatives of their respective cultural groups. The methodological framework established for this study, referred to as the Inafa’maolek Mediation
Framework (IMF), draws from the cultural concept of Inafa‘maolek within the Chamoru-Guam/U.S. Western Pacific Islander tradition. This framework underpins the examination of meaning-making processes within the context of Decolonizing Media Literacy.

**Discussion**

This discussion draws from additional sources that extend the review of literature in Chapter II, encompassing a diverse range of perspectives crucial to the field of social sciences and its interdisciplinary intersections. Henry Giroux, a prominent scholar, delivers a keynote address at ISLS 2023, emphasizing the intrinsic link between hope and political agency (Giroux, 2023). Giroux's discourse is further illuminated in a conversation with Moore and Hurley, underscoring the vital role hope plays in shaping political engagement (Moore & Hurley, 2022). Joseph Stiglitz, a leading economist, provides a special lecture on post-neoliberal globalisation, offering insights into the evolving global order (Stiglitz, 2023). Condoleezza Rice, a distinguished political figure, delves into the complexities of global power dynamics, particularly in relation to Russia, China, and conflicts of great magnitude (Rice, 2023). Thomas Sowell, a notable thinker, addresses the fallacies surrounding social justice, emphasizing the tangible consequences of misguided approaches (Sowell, 2023). Peter Thiel offers a critical perspective on diversity, reflecting on its evolution over three decades, providing a unique lens into the discourse surrounding inclusivity (Thiel, 2023).

The CSET/RICHDATA publications (Sedova, et.al, 2021) delve into the evolving landscape of disinformation campaigns in the age of Artificial Intelligence (AI). Part 1 introduces the RICHDATA framework, offering a comprehensive foundation for understanding and
mitigating the impact of disinformation. Part 2 expands on this by presenting a detailed threat model, providing critical insights into the vulnerabilities that emerge in the face of sophisticated disinformation campaigns. Additionally, Mohamed’s (2020) work on Decolonial AI serves as a significant contribution to the discourse surrounding artificial intelligence. The study posits decolonial theory as a vital foresight tool, illuminating the ethical and societal implications of AI technology within a broader socio-political context. By offering a critical perspective on the intersection of decolonial theory and artificial intelligence, the study adds a valuable dimension to the evolving discourse surrounding AI ethics and equity.

In the context of a Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML), these sources collectively offer a comprehensive panorama of contemporary debates and discussions within the realm of social sciences, ranging from political agency and post-neoliberalism to the intricate dynamics of disinformation campaigns and the ethical implications of artificial intelligence. Each source brings a unique vantage point, enriching the scholarly dialogue and contributing to a more nuanced understanding of the multifaceted challenges and opportunities that define the contemporary socio-political landscape.

We learn that education and propaganda are interchanging social constructs determined by cultural meaning in the form of civic and media practices, such as media/institutional knowledge (epistemological); public memory (ontological); or value systems (axiological). Most importantly, we learn there are significant symptoms of the problem addressed in this study: civic and media education across diverse municipalities on Guam and Texas are lacking research, curriculum and pedagogy, by modern Indigenous social science researchers of white dominant culture about how diverse cultural groups practice civic education/propaganda to engage in the process of municipal public policymaking. The salient point here is that understanding how these processes operate,
allows those not knowing how, the opportunity to learn and engage civic media systems to effect community transformation towards more democratic aims.

**AI + DML = CritCon**

The fusion of Artificial Intelligence (AI) and Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML) constitutes a critical nexus for understanding and shaping contemporary socio-political landscapes. This section delves into the convergence, highlighting various dimensions that comprise the critical consciousness (CritCon) paradigm.

**Institutionalism**

In this domain, we scrutinize the regulatory frameworks that govern the deployment and impact of AI and DML. Additionally, we explore the vital role of public administration and policy in navigating the complexities of these technologies. Understanding the multi-tiered nature of governance—federal, state, and local—provides insights into the intricate interplay of jurisdictional authority. Trust emerges as a linchpin, permeating every facet of society's engagement with AI and DML. Anyon's (2014) framework illuminates diverse modalities of decision-making, offering valuable insights into participatory practices. Drawing from personal experience, the researcher provides illustrative examples of Positive Deviance (PD) practices, offering a nuanced understanding of the practical intricacies involved. Moreover, we interrogate the democratic underpinnings that should underscore AI and DML practices, emphasizing the role of civic engagement in mobilizing meaningful participation. Strategies and programs designed to
foster civic engagement play a pivotal role in cultivating an informed and active citizenry. Cultivating leaders with values aligned with the greater good is an essential facet of democratic institutionalism. This subtopic delves into programs and initiatives aimed at nurturing ethical leadership within the realm of AI and DML. Acknowledging the potential for malevolent intent within any system, this element recognizes the necessity of human safeguarding against unethical practices.

**Civic Efficacy Formula**

Recognizing the multifaceted nature of influence, this subtopic identifies key influences that shape perspectives and behaviors within the realm of AI and DML. The family unit emerges as a foundational locus of influence, shaping values, attitudes, and approaches towards AI and DML. Cultural contexts wield significant influence, informing perceptions and norms surrounding the deployment of these technologies. Peer interactions and networks serve as potent conduits for the dissemination of values and practices, exerting substantial influence on individual behavior. Professional affiliations and contexts exert specialized influence, particularly within industries and sectors deeply impacted by AI and DML.

**AI/LLM in Disinformation: Axiology x Faith x AI**

This dimension probes the complex interplay between AI, Language Learning Models (LLM), and the dissemination of disinformation. Central to this exploration are axiological
considerations, faith-based perspectives, and the role of AI in mitigating the spread of false information.

Other's Window

The concept of 'Other's Window' invites a shift in perspective, encouraging stakeholders to view AI and DML through alternative vantage points. This approach fosters empathy and a deeper appreciation for diverse viewpoints in shaping policy and practice.

PD: Conforming to Transform

Positive Deviance (PD) takes on a transformative dimension, acknowledging that initial conformity may serve as a steppingstone towards broader societal transformation. This nuanced perspective recognizes the iterative nature of policy development and implementation.

Municipal Policy Process

Zooming in on the municipal level, this subtopic scrutinizes the policy-making processes within local government contexts. Understanding the intricacies of municipal decision-making offers valuable insights for effective and contextually relevant AI and DML practices.

Civic Practices
Civic practices encapsulate the tangible manifestations of participatory citizenship. This facet explores the diverse array of practices that individuals and communities engage in to shape their socio-political landscapes. Understanding the nuances of these practices is pivotal for cultivating an informed, engaged, and empowered citizenry.

**Media Practices**

Media practices represent a crucial terrain for the intersection of AI, DML, and critical consciousness (CritCon). Analyzing the ways in which media platforms disseminate information, narratives, and ideologies allows for a nuanced understanding of their impact on public discourse and societal perceptions. Recognizing the power dynamics inherent in media practices informs strategies for promoting equitable representation and information dissemination.

In this dissertation, the research methodology employed centers around the Indigenous Methodology-*Inafa ’maolek* Mediation Framework (IMF), focusing on the crucial process of de-linking, re-thinking, and re-linking the identified individual and community in relation to a given problem. This approach is fundamental in interrogating and reframing existing paradigms within the context of Indigenous studies. The data collection process is meticulously designed to align with the IMF, ensuring that it captures the intricate nuances of the problem at hand.

The findings of this research endeavor unveil a series of best practices in Positive Deviance (PD), shedding light on critical aspects of epistemology, ontology, and axiology. Within the realm of epistemology, the study delves into the interplay between media and institutional knowledge, elucidating how these facets influence perceptions and understandings. Ontologically, a deep dive into public memory provides valuable insights into the collective remembrance and historical
consciousness within Indigenous communities. Axiology, or the study of value systems, forms another significant dimension of the findings, offering a comprehensive understanding of the core values that shape Indigenous perspectives.

The dissertation also dedicates a substantial section to the imperative task of Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML). This multifaceted process involves a critical examination and restructuring of the prevalent media narratives to align with Indigenous worldviews. Decolonizing, as a foundational aspect, underscores the necessity of dismantling colonial frameworks and ideologies within media representations. The subsequent focus on media itself is pivotal, as it interrogates the roles, responsibilities, and ethical considerations of media in Indigenous contexts. Additionally, the facet of literacy, within the framework of DML, extends beyond conventional definitions, incorporating media literacy as a dynamic tool for empowerment and cultural preservation within Indigenous communities.

**IMF Patterns-Establishing DML Propaganda/Education Model**

\[ \text{DML: } C/M = BP = SI/M \]

Meaning matters. In DML contexts we create shared meaning when the family and cultural values shaping message interpretation are equal to the critical consciousness influencing civic and media activities, which are equal to the meaning of said across cultural groups \([C = BP = SI]\). I will act if the meaning is equal to the potential benefit and my peer influencers signal their meaning is congruent as well. So, in the original Civic Efficacy formula, we attach a variable of mediation.
Civic Efficacy: I will act if $C < BP + SI$ the cost is lower than the sum of my perceived efficacy (BP) and what my influencers signal they are doing [divided by mediating]. To be further applied to Decolonizing Media Efficacy: I will engage if $M/M = BP = SI/M$. We are sharing meaning of media activities which are equal to the potential benefit, and equally so, peer influencers signaling their meaning. Hence, as this formula relates to education or propaganda, we decide the meaning of civic and media activities as individuals with our social cultural group.

What does a propaganda/education model for DML critical consciousness look like: a dominant cultural norm which seeks to transform attitudes about public policy social cultural issues resulting in what is known as Not In My Back Yard (NIMBY), meaning making is determined by place intersecting among public spaces. Since NIMBY is considered a popular euphemism amongst political elite, the policy position is a ripe point of departure. Components of a DML model point to Artificial Intelligence (AI) applications contributing to research and development in the field of axiological algorithms, or value-based coding for enhancing humanization of Artificial General Intelligence (AGI) processing across the spectrum of human-based uses.

A DML propaganda/education model serves to counter one’s dispositions and beliefs, acting to counter cognitive dissonance features of pre-programmed online media consumption behaviors and AI. Doing so empowers mediated forms of meaning-making which advance a better understanding of propaganda/education. The aims of which are set to support Indigenous/minority/marginalized community transformation of neocolonial power structures, where conforming to transformational ends takes place to empower transformation of neoliberal public spaces such as the field of economic development with media promotes propaganda/education frameworks such as DML with a social justice bent. In this application,
community activist producing public education materials are deemed as propaganda by institutional actors from an economic development (ED) perspective. From the ED perspective of municipal government this field of knowledge remains reserved to indoctrinate public officials at the municipal, state, and federal echelons for the purpose of conforming to dominant meanings prevalent among institutions to advance commerce development (Texas Economic Development Council; 2022). As these activities for community and business development require public participation for specific projects and mandated public meetings involving the use of public resources (i.e., revenues, permits, land, and associated agreements); there exist potential for public officials and the general public to develop and apply DML communication strategies which enable an ability to see and understand how others in a given community (minority voices) interpret self/culture while engaging in processes of organizational transformation (or the resistance to such since deemed propagandist). The same holds true either way pointing to the value of developing intercultural translation zones (de Sousa Santos, 2014). The dominant cultural institutional actor sees activist groups as representing disruptive, marginalized/minority/”woke” cultural perspectives. However, teaching and learning how to create intercultural translators empowers bridge building in the realm of public policy that incrementally transforms divisive towards solidarity.

**DML: Transforming Civic Efficacy**

The concept of transformation serves as a redefining practice for Positive Deviance (PD) behaviors. Rooted in respect for diverse cultural groups and their individual perspectives and actions, it's essential to acknowledge the institutional viewpoint of activism. It recognizes that what
may be seen as corruption from one standpoint, might be viewed as an opportunity from another. Executing these practices necessitates strategic planning to establish leadership and secure the resources needed for the advancement of Decolonizing Media Literacy programs. An intrinsic aspect of this endeavor lies in understanding the extensive history of propaganda within mass media, stretching further back than commonly remembered. Its purpose is to prompt critical reflection from an early age.

The foundation of media and institutional knowledge, which shapes the interpretation of civic and media practices within educational curriculum content, centers on the establishment of common ground. Our approaches and interpretations stemming from media spaces play a crucial role in shaping our identities among like-minded peers. However, within institutional settings, if we fail to discern these distinctions, they perpetuate neocolonial structural indoctrination. Inadvertently, they may serve as apparitions of a distorted self-preservation when the meanings derived from an individual within the group no longer align with the dominant meaning structure. This underscores a pivotal point emphasized in this study: education and propaganda are fluid concepts contingent on the audience's interpretation process. When we internalize what we encounter through civic and media practices conveyed by communicators, the receivers of the message construe it as educational. Conversely, when we harbor doubts about the message or its source, it takes on the connotations of propaganda.

A crucial note on civic engagement, particularly in municipal, county, state, or federal settings, pertains to the role constituents play in the policy process. This encompasses the knowledge that informs the civic and media communications disseminated. Within this realm, every individual involved in organizational operations and planning administration holds a distinct role and function. From various participants across transnational locations, this study reveals a
common indication of the unique perspective held by City Management, acting as gatekeepers, in framing messages to safeguard the municipality's reputation.

Across various cultural groups within each community, individuals and groups play pivotal roles in applying media strategies to foster civic engagement. Additionally, this study sheds light on the role of higher education academia in the propaganda process. Serving as advocates, consultants, and subject matter experts, these activist-faculty members bolster the organizational movement's capacity to secure funding and establish credibility.

Regarding public memory, understanding an elected official's background during the public meeting agenda process holds significant value. This knowledge of a conforming political figure—for transformative ends—provides insight into the identity and style the elected official may adopt (conforming, reforming, or transforming). For instance, in a municipality in the Central Texas region, a representative found themselves with limited political support from colleagues, regardless of the validity or strength of their argument or policy research findings. In this case, the representative recalled a family event where a significant revelation occurred during a celebratory moment. Fast forward to the present, this same representative now strives to reveal significant information about others during Council or public meetings, demonstrating how public memory influences the policy process. Always prepared to pose challenging questions or address controversial issues with government officials, this approach has been observed among Indigenous Native Pacific Islander elected officials as well. The value of mamah'lao (shame/emotion) affords public officials the opportunity to "atone for their sins" in an alternative manner before private information is disclosed to the public. This dynamic differs in Central Texas and West Texas. While both cultures employ a similar strategy of catching individuals off guard, the strategy is perceived as more aggressive in the Texas-based settings.
This introduces the term *tai-mamah'lao* (no shame). In the process of self-actualization, these findings suggest a distinction among cultural groups regarding the value of preserving one's dignity. When an individual is not afforded the opportunity to correct their behavior by someone else, it is considered an act of no shame on the part of the member of the public revealing private information. In Indigenous Pacific Islander civic communities on Guam, it is considered more shameful to be identified as *tai-mamah'lao* (in one's actions toward another) than to be the one behaving contrary to expected social norms (*mang'nge*). This value is instilled early within families and passed down by elders. Recalling this notion of *tai-mamah'lao* proves to be an effective tool in public memory for civic and media engagement with actors possessing media and institutional knowledge.

Patterns of civic and media activities among cultural groups underscore the role of public memory (remembering/forgetting). The findings suggest a crucial distinction among cultural groups employing civic and media strategies across various socio-demographic characteristics. This encompasses ethnic backgrounds, faith, occupation, education, political leanings, and other factors. The difference lies in the frameworks applied towards psychographics, opening a discussion about the dimensions of remembering and forgetting as they contribute to one's decision to participate or abstain. Furthermore, this holds significance for those in power, influencing the political systems in a particular direction. For instance, one of the fundamental roles of government is to provide services to the public while distributing resources. This involves various forms of purchasing mechanisms governed by municipal, county, state, and federal statutes or ordinances. As decisions are made by administrators and elected officials to allocate resources for the public's benefit, the policy process is set into motion. From an Indigenous Native Pacific Islander perspective, the elected official must first secure funding via donors which support election
campaign efforts prior to broaching the topic of policy processes. This necessitates an entire system of philanthropy or gift-giving, donor cultivation as an industry identifying individuals, groups, families, trusts, organizations with the means to contribute to capital funding for operations, maintenance, and other campaign projects. The donors in the community vary across the spectrum of socio-economic power (high/middle income/low). When one gives a gift in Guam, we refer to this as Chen’chule with an expectation for reciprocation. The same holds true in the Texas settings.

According to the IMF, this notion encapsulates money/gifts/business-economic development. However, providing such requires adhering to the rules set forth by statutes or ordinances within a particular state, federal, or municipal campaign. There exists a hidden curriculum, if you will, that circumvents campaign finance limits and other regulations. In Guam’s Trial of the Century: News, Hegemony, and Rumor in an American Colony, Debeneditis (1993) describes the misinformation and disinformation devices employed by various civic actors concerning this notion of gift-giving. This led to the tragic suicide of a popular politician in Guam, Governor Ricky Bordallo in 1990. At the heart of this incident was a misinterpretation of the meaning behind a donor's gift to the Bordallo campaign.

To provide context, according to Mihailidis’ (2014) civic engagement formula Operationalizing Civic Efficacy: "I will act if C < BP + SI"—meaning the cost is lower than the sum of my perceived efficacy (BP) and what my influencers signal (SI) they are doing. This formula has been adopted and adapted to account for the negative occurrence of a practice. This signifies C < BP - SI. In other words, I will act if the cost is lower than the difference of my perceived efficacy (BP). Choosing not to take action indicates the subtraction factor for the negative occurrence required to move toward equity, represented as C = BP = SI. Here, the cost equals my perceived efficacy and what my influencers signal they are doing. Another factor to
consider is the value of the meaning-making process for the influencers added to this equation: \( C < BP + SI \times (\text{how IMF mediating}) / \text{divided by the individual's mediation (IMF)}. \) In Gov. Bordallo's case, it was evident that he did not align with the cultural framework of mediation applied to him. In an act of resistance, he made a political statement through his suicide. Therefore, \( C < BP + (-) SI \times \text{IMF} / \text{IMF}. \)

The negation of influencer group meaning when it aligns with the individual at the center of the decision to engage underscores the influence of the influencer in this process. Furthermore, when the meaning propagated by SI mediation frameworks contradicts the individual's perspective, the individual prevails over the influencer in the final factor of this formula. This means that the participant will engage if the cost is lower than the sum (or difference) of their perceived efficacy (BP) and what their cultural framework for meaning-making governs (IMF).

Civic and media activity patterns among various cultural groups emphasize the significance of influencers in determining the meanings of a given framework. Emerging from personal interviews, with regards to public memory, are the elements that constitute the process involved in constructing meaning-making space among cultural groups. As group members engaging in civic and media space plan courses of action within organizational systems, challenges inevitably arise. Intercultural translation zones offer a space of trust to share ideas, beliefs, and actions with others—with little to no judgment—with the aim of developing shared meaning on an equal footing. Participants in this study share a common theme of remembering struggle.

This includes not forgetting the challenges experienced with one another as conflicting actors and as colleagues facing the same struggle (often concurrently). For instance, regarding propaganda devices, the legitimacy of a given frame appears to increase in believability when the message is conveyed by an artist intimately familiar with the subject matter. In one instance, a
participant had a close working relationship with the researcher during a civic project they both played a role in. The prevalent organizational leadership narrative about this participant was one that interpreted their actions as self-serving. It was suggested that the participant sought to capitalize on their role in the project instead of serving the interests of the civic campaign. The participant's handling of funds for this project was brought to the researcher's attention, and the actions needed to cease. The researcher was responsible for managing the relationship on behalf of the project leadership. It becomes evident that when a messaging frame attacks the credibility of a subject, and that subject has a public reputation that aligns with this point (though blind to the subject), the frame aligns with the education model of believability (to the public). This is seen as propaganda to those who do not believe the imposed framing of the subject, their influencers, or their associated cultural group.

Conforming for Transformation: Interplay of Civic and Media Practices in Cultural Groups

Within various cultural groups, Civic and Media practices often intertwine with distinct value systems, particularly in the realm of public memory. This study has illuminated the axiological dimension as a transformative force. Diverse cultural groups interpret and respond to different value concepts in unique ways. As previously mentioned, the value categories highlighted in the IMF coding encompass harmony through respect, adherence to social norms, emotional considerations, acts of giving, familial relationships, and the significance of children. The juxtaposition of conforming for transformation underscores the intrinsic humanization that occurs when one anchors themselves in these values.
While each cultural group may anticipate specific outcomes tied to values like patriotism, this expectation can become convoluted when decoded through an alternative mediation code. Establishing a foundational understanding of values presents an opportunity for shared meaning and the cultivation of a collective identity. Among the diverse cultural groups participating in this study, the shared values embedded in their identities manifest through their roles as civic leaders in public spheres.

In the context of conveying a public identity, recalling these values—along with their associated meanings as anticipated by a specific cultural or sub-cultural group—shapes public memory and fosters relationships ripe for meaningful engagement.

Addressing the Original Inquiries

In Response to Research Question 1: Who and how are Indigenous-Minority members of the public engaging in the local government policy process across transnational settings?

The study sought to understand who among the Indigenous-Minority populace actively engages in the local government policy-making process across transnational settings, and the way they do so. Across these diverse transnational settings, the Indigenous-Minority individuals involved in the municipal policy-making process were primarily distinguished members of the civic leadership, many of whom had initially commenced their careers as minorities in lower-ranking public service roles. Notably, this cultural community also shared a significant connection to the U.S. military, encompassing roles as veterans, spouses, co-located individuals, or dependents.
These participants demonstrated a range of critical consciousness modes, namely conforming, reforming, and transforming, aligning with the principles of delinking, rethinking, and relinking in the context of decolonization. Their civic and media practices exhibited a spectrum of behaviors, some of which fell under the category of transforming critical consciousness. These practices were further classified into three dimensions: Media/Institutional Knowledge, Public Memory, and Value Systems.

MEDIA/INSTITUTIONAL PRACTICES

First, as it relates to media/institutional knowledge there are experiences which open a realm of knowledge applications which inform these PD behaviors of propaganda/education. This passage outlines a set of strategic actions and principles for individuals engaging in public discourse, advocacy, and governance. Firstly, it emphasizes a focus on prioritizing the welfare of others, underlining the importance of selflessness in public service. It advises individuals to define their roles within organizations, particularly in terms of messaging, and stresses active involvement in advocacy campaigns, which entails understanding the various elements and stakeholders involved.

Public speaking is identified as a powerful tool for conveying messages, especially when addressing those in positions of power. Strategic civil disobedience is suggested as an effective means of expressing dissent while maintaining a calculated approach.

Recognizing effective administrative leadership is deemed crucial, with an emphasis on understanding the cultural and linguistic backgrounds of individuals and communities. Continuous
reading is encouraged, as is an appreciation for the interplay between business and community development.

Engaging with law enforcement is emphasized, with a focus on effective communication to avoid unnecessary confrontations. Understanding how one's professional experiences shape their perception and building relationships within legislative and administrative systems are seen as essential.

Active involvement in social movements and political campaigns is advocated, with an emphasis on strategic planning and action. Building capacity among community leaders is underscored, as is the importance of relationship-building with fellow public servants to garner support for causes.

Finally, the passage encourages a proactive approach, asserting the importance of affirmative action. It concludes by suggesting that running for elected office is one of the most effective ways to actively shape policy and engage with the political process.
Figure 5.1: PD behaviors of propaganda/education-media/institutional knowledge

- Focus on helping others first.
  Within these organizations define your role as it pertains to messaging.
  Be involved with the elements, processes, and stakeholders for advocacy campaigns.
  Use public speaking opportunities to perform your message.
  Speak up to those in power, while applying strategic civil disobedience.
  Recognize effective administrative leadership; remember the history and ethnic culture of the individual and the family community they were raised in, as well as language barriers.

- Read.
  Understand the value of business and community building.
  Confront those in power with research-based policy problems and solutions.
  Expect and know how to respectfully engage with law enforcement effectively to avoid unrealistic charges.
  Realize your perception is shaped by your professional experiences so get familiar and build relationships with those involved in legislative processes and administrative systems.

- Join a social movement for advocacy or political campaigning, specifically get involved with strategic planning and actions.
  Help community leaders build capacity.
  Relationships matter, build them among fellow public servants to help galvanize support for you and your cause
  Assert the yes.
  The best way to counter-engage is run for elected office, win, and make them sit there and work with you every day.
  Conduct research on City Council agenda item presentations on strategic policy items, those going to be a controversial item; be a part of citizens gathering information, then start blasting it out on social media.

This passage provides a comprehensive set of strategies and principles for individuals engaging in public discourse, advocacy, and governance. It emphasizes selflessness, effective communication, strategic planning, and active involvement in both community and political spheres.
It is both a privilege and a responsibility to engage in critical conversations and cultivate constructive thinking. Fostering a sense of critical consciousness is paramount. It requires active implementation and the precise use of language for effective communication and feedback. Encouraging others to transcend the confines of immediate perceptions is essential. This highlights our shared humanity and vulnerability to influence from images, words, and even sounds. It underscores the malleability of people's morals, ethics, and voting history.

Figure 5.2: PD practices-navigating narratives & landscapes

This passage provides strategic insights for individuals navigating public narratives and political landscapes.

First, it highlights the importance of anticipating events that may be orchestrated or arise circumstantially, and which could have adverse effects on one's interests within the broader public narrative. This suggests a need for vigilance and proactive planning to safeguard one's interests.
The practices then emphasize the significance of self-awareness and situational awareness within the broader media ecosystem. Understanding one's own interests and discerning how they align with or diverge from larger social movements is crucial for effective navigation and engagement.

Additionally, the practice advises individuals to establish a close relationship with elected officials, positioning themselves as trusted confidants. This involves being attuned to political pressures, both on oneself and on others, and knowing when to strategically step back to advance collective goals. Collaborative work behind the scenes with allies is advocated to exert influence.

This opening offers a strategic framework for individuals seeking to navigate public narratives and political dynamics. It underscores the importance of foresight, self-awareness, and collaborative engagement with elected officials and allies to protect and advance one's interests in a broader societal context.

Next, as it relates to public memory there are notions of what we remember or choose to forget that inform the determination of propaganda/education.

PUBLIC MEMORY PRACTICES
Go and speak at City Council public meetings. Tell the public the other side of the story. People remember pain and trauma as a child, growing up will influence modus operandi. Recognize inspirational events featuring interactions with highly respected leaders and your family members; attend public events; visualize image/scenes to plant seeds; it's been a long journey. Remember your ancestor's Indigenous/Native connection. Remember your family connections and establish these relations as foundation to support family efforts to lead community development.

Create intercultural spaces to facilitate opportunity as given to everybody, people will be nicer to each other and understand each other better. Recognize how sensitive people are/are not in each space. Partisan politics have different cultural rules, yet both have in common the potential for intra-political conflict, prepare your background research on opponents and be prepared to use it. Tell people all the time, statistically we should not be where we are right now. Join growing social movements with similar interests to those in the community that are mutually beneficial; engage enough for them ask for help--don't offer help.

Use traditional and new media to remember-watch news channels, Facebook Live stream--just google it. Attend a school with strong public credibility; set vision early for future leadership roles, and keep it relatively close to your chest. Remembr/don't forget your story. Remember your/others keen interests. Don’t let anybody tell you who you're supposed to be. Nobody gets to tell you no, without at least hearing you out. Value family, reduce risk of harm to others, reflect on how to treat others based upon how you want to be treated; and demonstrate respect for others.
This passage emphasizes several key principles for personal and community development. First, it advocates for active civic engagement by participating in City Council public meetings and presenting alternative perspectives. It acknowledges the enduring impact of childhood experiences, particularly those involving pain and trauma, on one's approach to life.

The passage underscores the importance of recognizing and cherishing inspirational moments, especially interactions with respected leaders and family members. It also highlights the significance of attending public events and visualizing positive images to inspire progress.

Ancestral and familial connections are regarded as essential foundations for supporting family-led community development. Additionally, the creation of intercultural spaces is proposed to foster mutual understanding and kindness among individuals.

These practices urge an awareness of cultural sensitivities in various spaces, particularly within partisan politics. It emphasizes the value of thorough research on opponents and advocates for assertively using that knowledge when necessary.

The passage encourages individuals to remind themselves and others of their remarkable journey and achievements, even in the face of statistical improbability. Joining social movements aligned with community interests is recommended, with a focus on providing help when it is sought, rather than overwhelming with offers.

Utilizing both traditional and new media platforms, such as news channels and live streams, is proposed for staying informed and engaged. The text advises attending reputable educational
institutions and harboring early aspirations for leadership roles while maintaining a sense of humility and self-awareness.

The passage concludes with a powerful call to authenticity and empathy, emphasizing the importance of valuing family, minimizing harm to others, and treating others with the same respect one expects to receive.

This manuscript advocates for active civic engagement, personal growth, and community development through a combination of civic participation, recognizing personal journeys, nurturing connections, and embodying values of respect and empathy.

In the context of the IMF concept of Mang’nge, which pertains to public memory, there is a noteworthy sub-dimension that addresses how we and others remember or forget in accordance with social norms. This insight informs pedagogy by propelling alternative theoretical foundations for civic and media literacy education. The establishment of an Intercultural Translation Zone within teacher education is a critical step, as it necessitates a foundation of trust. Without this element, such a space cannot exist. This zone serves as a platform for learning and cultivating a shared language of meaning-making between individuals, forming a bond within teacher education. Consequently, one's educational expertise becomes the bedrock for fostering mutual interests, enabling individuals to communicate, create shared meanings, and comprehend one another for the betterment of an organization and the promotion of social transformation. This dynamic leads to a Positive Deviance reconfiguration of Johari’s Window (J. Luft, 1969; In Adler & Rodman, 2012, p. 218-219), establishing a unique perspective known as the "Window of Knowing the Other." This acts as a bridge across subaltern divides (Spivak, 1988).
Window of Knowing the Other

Much like Johari's Window, which encompasses the open self, hidden self, blind self, and unknown self, this concept delves into the interplay between ecosystems, specifically within various cultural groups. Instead of a wall, this is more akin to a bridge—a circular window divided into four quarters.

The notion of individual blindness is a distinct dimension within this perspective, drawing parallels to Freire’s concept of Optimism (Freire, et.al; 1998). It posits that true freedom challenges conventional knowledge transfer and advocates for a humanizing approach. Freire underscores the need for educators to engage with the media critically, recognizing its powerful influence. He emphasizes the urgency of subjecting media effects to rigorous debate, highlighting the ideological nature of communication. Freire also calls for an "epistemological consciousness" to navigate through biased messaging. This blind optimism is further developed through Rossatto’s Critical Consciousness Chart (2017; Appendix, Figure 11).

Johari's Window primarily focuses on self-perception and how one relates to the world—a window to the world. It encompasses what you know, what you choose to show (the open self), what you conceal (the hidden self), what you're unaware of but others see (the blind self), and what remains unknown (the unknown self). These four quadrants offer a comprehensive view.

In a deeper sense, the Window of Knowing the Other, the emphasis shifts to what the Other wishes to convey about themselves—their efforts to foster mutual understanding (or not). It addresses what the Other intentionally withholds, what remains hidden. Furthermore, it explores what the Other, much like the unknown in Johari's Window, is unaware of—areas of mutual unfamiliarity. Yet, the pivotal dimension is the blind quadrant. Here, the focus lies on what the
Other is oblivious to regarding our identity and knowledge. Bridging this gap necessitates an exchange where we, as minorities in a dominant space, illuminate what we know. This reciprocity is critical, especially considering the historical dominance of certain cultures in shaping educational agendas and knowledge production. As the silent minority increasingly becomes the majority of minorities, the value of sharing alternative perspectives grows. This window serves as a tool for comprehending diverse cultural meanings and, ultimately, fostering deeper understanding and collaboration.

*Other's Window of Knowing x IMF*

The *Window of Knowing the Other* operates as an intercultural translation zone firmly rooted in the *Inafa’maolek* Mediation Framework (IMF). This overarching perspective facilitates the cultivation of trust, albeit not without a willingness to take some risks. It's a reciprocal process, necessitating a mutual effort to comprehend each other's perspectives. This approach empowers us to engage in perspective checking, which is crucial given the current trend of information overload and growing divisions. We must learn to discern beyond apparent barriers, realizing that these so-called walls are more like transparent windows into the worlds of the Other—comprising ecosystems, sub-ecosystems, and a larger meta-ecosystem.

While sharing practices and beliefs, it's inevitable that differences will emerge. The path forward lies in achieving mutual understanding, which should be rooted in frameworks of mediation, exemplified by the *Chamoru* concept of *Inafa’maolek*. This approach emphasizes respect and adherence to shared social rules, recognizing that individuals/groups possess their own mediated framework for interpreting the world around them.

**VALUE SYSTEM PRACTICES**

Lastly, the methods demonstrated by value systems in this case study of PD behaviors indicates the practice of *mama’hlao*, (helping others save face) for propaganda/education.
Sympathize more than before. Caring for the unfortunate shapes point of view and politics.

Have a vision, purpose, and develop a preamble for self and organization grounded in agreed upon values identify core values building on trust, honor, and helping others with others-use values as motivation.

On the contrary, a transformative perspective challenges the individual to change the value of other as an opponent.

Manifest your career path. Show others a natural endgame you want for you, especially non-political people--who for the most part don't have any real political ambition. Identify who is ambitious or not ambitious. Discover which and how many people give a damn about politics.

Practice positive examples in life, and work to influence policy, or completely outright change it or get rid of it so that it would be softer upon the struggling human.

Pursue quality of life initiatives. Promote the ease of doing business for business owners with advocacy campaigns.

Your background and resources are necessary to get yourself out of challenging situations.

Persistence and courage. To always make a difference. Never giving up. Even when it is rough at times. Also, to believe--out of all the sacrifices, all the hard work there's always something good that will happen.

Start a cultural community organization that solves a public problem and expands influence; bring a bunch of people together to effectuate change, to help those in need.

Consider joining organizations/movements challenging historical economic injustice (i.e., land rights, Nationalistic Movement, strong pride for the Native National identity).

Sympathize more than before. Caring for the unfortunate shapes point of view and politics.

Develop passion empowering students and teachers through equitable opportunities in teaching and learning.

Establish a preamble calling others to act in solidarity from foundational points of integrity, comradery, general assistance as a cornerstone upon which the community unites in common; enhance community; and establish a constitution for the organization.

Establish relationships grounded in common value systems with community influencers; have positive experiences with one another and relating to foster donor cultivation.

See your actions from the personal side, and even the professional side to start seeing how people react negatively to your practices. Use the Window of Knowing - The Other knowing window.
These findings outline a set of principles and strategies focused on empathy, empowerment, community-building, and political engagement. The author emphasizes the importance of increased sympathy, particularly towards the less fortunate, and how this perspective informs both personal viewpoints and political stances. They highlight the significance of nurturing passion within educational settings, aiming for equity in teaching and learning opportunities for both students and educators. These findings underscore the need for a foundational preamble that calls for solidarity, integrity, camaraderie, and general assistance, which serves as the cornerstone of a united community. It also advocates for the establishment of relationships grounded in shared values with influential figures within the community, fostering positive experiences and donor cultivation.

The author encourages introspection, urging individuals to consider how their actions are perceived, both personally and professionally, and to employ the "Window of Knowing - The Other knowing window" to gain insights into others' perspectives. They stress the importance of utilizing one's background and resources to navigate challenging situations.

Persistence and courage are identified as essential qualities for making a meaningful impact, even in the face of adversity. The author emphasizes the belief that amidst sacrifices and hard work, positive outcomes will emerge. They propose the creation of a cultural community organization aimed at effecting change and assisting those in need.

The text advocates for engagement in movements addressing historical economic injustices, such as land rights and the promotion of Native National identity. It also stresses the
importance of articulating a vision and purpose grounded in shared values, using trust, honor, and assistance as motivational drivers.

Additionally, the transformative perspective challenges individuals to reconsider their view of opponents, suggesting a shift towards seeing them as potential allies for change. The author encourages a proactive approach to shaping one's career path and influencing policies to benefit struggling individuals.

The findings advocate for a multi-faceted approach that includes empathy, empowerment, community-building, and political engagement. It underscores the significance of shared values, compassion, and persistent action in effecting positive change and advocating for a better quality of life.

Current methods demonstrated by value systems in this case study of PD behaviors indicate public reactions to education/propaganda.
The PD practices revolve around a pragmatic and experienced approach to navigating interpersonal dynamics and conflicts. It advocates for maintaining one's values while also acknowledging the potential for wounds inflicted by others. Despite attempts to harm, the author advises not dwelling on the past but rather focusing on the present and future.

Empathy is considered crucial, but the text cautions against excessive sympathy, suggesting a balance between understanding others' perspectives and upholding personal values. The narrative emphasizes a commitment to non-harm, reflecting a set of core values that guide the author's interactions with others.

These practices address the challenge of handling value-attacking remarks, which are designed to elicit emotional responses. Rather than responding in kind, the author proposes a constructive approach: converting negative energy into positive action. This involves a process of re-engineering the situation to one's advantage, potentially leading opponents to lose support and credibility.

Furthermore, the findings introduce a concept of allowing time for those who have offended one's values to engage in a form of penance. This emphasizes the importance of acknowledging the emotional and psychological impact of their actions. It suggests that reconciliation may be possible, but it requires a genuine effort on the part of the offender.

The PD practices which are discovered suggest for a balanced and experienced approach to handling conflicts and challenges. It underscores the importance of maintaining personal values, even in the face of attempts to harm. Empathy is valued, but not to the point of compromising one's
principles. The text also provides a strategy for dealing with value-attacking remarks, emphasizing a constructive and forward-looking response. Overall, the narrative offers a nuanced perspective on navigating interpersonal dynamics with integrity and resilience.

Figure 5.7: PD Cultural Values-shifting family norms

These PD Cultural Values delve into a nuanced exploration of cultural values and societal shifts, particularly regarding the prioritization of individual needs versus communal well-being. Initially, it emphasizes the existence of individuals who do not have the traditional family support system. This challenges the notion of placing family at the forefront of one's concerns, suggesting a recognition of diverse life experiences.

The narrative then highlights a shift from an individual-centric mindset to a collective one, signifying a broader societal change. It articulates a transition from a self-focused perspective,
seeking to control personal circumstances, to a more community-oriented outlook, where consideration for others becomes paramount.

A noteworthy observation is made about the initial self-centeredness of certain individuals, who may be less attuned to the broader impact of their actions on others. This behavior is juxtaposed with the eventual transformation towards valuing family and extending support to others. This shift implies an evolution in perspective, possibly influenced by experiences and reflections over time.

The text also underscores the importance of actively engaging marginalized communities. It advocates for a participatory approach rather than didactic teaching, emphasizing the need to make these communities feel valued and included. The author draws on personal experience, having grown up in challenging circumstances, to empathize with the sense of neglect that can accompany such situations.

These findings navigate the complex terrain of individualism versus communal well-being. It acknowledges the diversity of family experiences and highlights a societal shift from self-centeredness to valuing family and considering the needs of others. Additionally, the text emphasizes the significance of inclusive engagement with marginalized communities, stressing the importance of making them feel valued and included. Personal experience lends depth to these observations, providing a lived perspective on the dynamics discussed.
Figure 5.8: PD evolving values for cultural + personal development

The provided graphic (above) reflects an individual's journey and evolution in their understanding of values, particularly within the context of cultural and personal development. Initially, the speaker highlights a traditional Catholic influence on their worldview, suggesting a conservative and structured framework for their beliefs and values. Upon immigrating to the United States, the speaker notes a significant shift in perspective, particularly regarding the appreciation of independence. This newfound value is seen as a pivotal aspect of their experience over nearly two decades in the U.S., indicating a transformation in their outlook and priorities. The speaker's sense of independence is closely tied to personal growth, maturity, and the development of qualities such as courage and persistence. These attributes are viewed as instrumental in effecting positive change and contributing to the speaker's sense of self-empowerment. Furthermore, the text underscores the speaker's capacity to extract meaningful insights from a range of experiences, including accomplishments, accolades, and challenges. These events are seen not only as markers of
achievement, but also as rich sources of learning and personal growth. They are integrated into the speaker's broader life narrative as valuable lessons.

In the study, findings portray a progression from traditional values rooted in Catholicism to a newfound appreciation for independence, catalyzed by the experience of living in the United States. This shift in perspective has had a profound impact on the speaker's personal growth, imbuing them with qualities like courage and persistence. Moreover, the speaker demonstrates a reflective and growth-oriented mindset, valuing both accomplishments and challenges as opportunities for learning and self-improvement.

Figure 5.9: PD Ethics-interpersonal communication

We can’t just trust their first-hand communication. Always do your own research and investigation to find out...is that really true what they’re saying about this-this-and that.

It’s being a decent human being, being a good person. It’s not being a piece of shit...pardon my French--want to be a good person--ultimately.

Decide to always try and do the right thing. One is always wanting to do the right thing, and make sure nothing could really get in their way doing the right thing. That story helps to encompass what one holds valuable in this world, in this life.
The provided graphic (above) emphasizes the importance of ethical conduct and integrity in one's actions. It underscores the value of consistently striving to do what is morally right, demonstrating a strong commitment to ethical behavior. This narrative encapsulates the individual's core principles and beliefs about what is meaningful in life. Central to this perspective is the notion of being a virtuous and upstanding human being, as opposed to exhibiting negative or harmful behavior. The speaker acknowledges the significance of embodying goodness and decency and expresses a desire to avoid engaging in behavior that goes against these principles.

Moreover, the text advises caution in accepting information at face value. It encourages independent research and investigation as a means of verifying the accuracy and truthfulness of statements made by others. This stance reflects a critical and discerning approach to information, highlighting the importance of seeking out reliable sources and avoiding undue credulity.

Overall, the text emphasizes a commitment to ethical conduct, a rejection of negative behavior, and a call for independent verification of information. It underscores the value of personal integrity and the pursuit of truth in one's actions and interactions with the world.

The driving force behind individuals' persistence was their deep appreciation for their modest origins. This profound gratitude provided Positive Deviants (PDs) with the endurance, resilience, and an unwavering determination to advocate for themselves. These epistemological, ontological, and axiological dimensions inherent in civic and media PD practices served as transformative tools, unlocking the underlying processes of meaning-making essential for interpreting education and propaganda.
Addressing RQ2: How and what do community leaders teach and learn about the local municipal policy-making process across transnational settings?

In examining how community leaders engage with and impart knowledge about the local municipal policy-making process within transnational contexts, it is imperative to first understand the diverse array of participants involved. These individuals embody a spectrum of leadership roles, ranging from elected county officials and representatives in economic development to executives overseeing city management communications. Additionally, some participants are closely linked to city council operations either through their role or as a spouse of a council member. Furthermore, others have affiliations with independent school district administrations, are candidates for county judge positions, or have served as chief of staff to a governor.

Each of these leaders brings forth a unique narrative, deeply rooted in their personal reservoir of public memory. This repository of experiences profoundly shapes how they engage in the civic public policy process through media. Moreover, it significantly influences their value system across various domains, including intrapersonal, interpersonal, intercultural, small group, public, and mass media/new media communication practices. These nuanced perspectives illuminate the multifaceted landscape of community leadership in the realm of municipal policymaking, particularly within the complex milieu of transnational settings.

U.S. Western Pacific Island

In the context of transnational locations, the participant from Guam and the Northern Marianas Islands underwent significant personal and professional growth catalyzed by early family trauma and formative adolescent years, which extended into the early college period. This
transformative journey led to a profound elevation of critical consciousness, marked by both a reforming and transforming outlook.

The participant's educational trajectory was shaped by an environment characterized by conforming ideologies, prevalent in their private Catholic high school. This educational setting underscored a distinct neocolonial and military influence, exemplified by the presence of the Junior Reserve Officer Training Corps-Navy, complemented by their role as a dedicated football player. This foundation later paved the way for involvement in student governance, eventually culminating in significant roles such as University Student Regent, advisor to a gubernatorial candidate, legislative staffer for a U.S. Territory Senator, and ultimately, their election as a Republican U.S. Territory Senator. Their journey further unfolded with a pivotal position as the Chief of Staff to the Governor of an island government within the U.S./Marianas Islands.

These diverse roles afforded the participant invaluable insights into a spectrum of concepts, strategies, and the intricacies of social networking within power and influence spheres. The participant gained a comprehensive understanding of decision-making processes, as well as expertise in business and community development. Alongside these capacities, they honed essential skills in operational and future planning, organizational management, staffing, coordination, reporting, and budgeting for a myriad of strategically aligned projects with stakeholders.

Embedded within this professional journey were deeply rooted values, instilled through character education and faith-based doctrine. These principles permeated various facets of islander society, encompassing government, military, non-profit/non-governmental organizations, media, and other institutions. The participant's active engagement in civic organizations played a pivotal
role in facilitating intergovernmental collaboration, enabling advocacy efforts, and advancing economic agendas at the local, regional, state, and federal levels.

As a community leader, the participant assumed the role of educator, imparting fundamental knowledge related to politics, knowledge management, and the overarching discourse patterns that underlie these domains. In this reciprocal process, leaders like the participant engage in continuous learning, gathering crucial information to enhance societal well-being and elevate quality of life within communities across different administrative tiers. This pursuit, however, takes place within a competitive market dynamic, where resources are sought after not only at the local level but on a global scale. This perspective aligns with Indigenous Native governance, where democracy intertwines with self-determination through a capitalist framework.

Within the unique landscape of an U.S. Un-incorporated Territory, a distinct mode of non-self-governing power prevails, characterized by a neocolonial cultural imperialism. In this context, dominant forces shape the educational and propagandistic narratives, often influenced by minority interests that align with overarching U.S. Federal agendas (Aguon, R.; 2005). This dynamic has perennially defined the socio-political landscape, reaffirming the intricate interplay between power, culture, and education.

**West Texas**

In a border community of West Texas, situated within a tri-state region, community leaders are tasked with the dual role of teaching and learning about life on the periphery while concurrently perpetuating neocolonial forms of neoliberalism. This case study encompasses three participants, consisting of two males and one female, all hailing from minority Native or Indigenous/Asian-Pacific Islander cultural backgrounds. While two of the participants lack direct military affiliations,
they reside in a community characterized by a significant military presence. One participant briefly attended West Point (though did not graduate), while another, a Filipina doctoral student, is married to a U.S. Federal representative. Additionally, she serves the local Independent School District as a Central Office-District level administrator, reporting to the senior leadership of the district and board. The West Point-affiliated participant is the spouse of a sitting City Council Representative and a former legislative staffer for a City Council Representative. The participant of Hispanic-Native ancestry has also served as a legislative staffer for a City Council Representative, and currently holds a position in the City Manager's Communications team.

These city leaders actively engage in both instructing and absorbing knowledge about the municipal public policy process. They serve as educators, offering insights into the political culture, the dynamics of power, and effective strategies for navigating the legislative process alongside their peers. This education extends to understanding key individuals and how to effectively engage with them. In cases where alignment is challenging, leaders seek strategies to minimize their influence on the broader policy objectives of those entrusted with positions of influence.

Integral to their training is an immersion in the legal and ethical philosophy that underpins the values and ideologies of capitalism and democracy. The language and knowledge domains of community and business development are imparted against the backdrop of public scrutiny and competing political interests. The process involves a multifaceted approach encompassing advocacy, agenda-setting, comprehensive research and policy updates, as well as the crafting of narratives and communication strategies to anticipate potential strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats.
Building support, both administrative and legislative, necessitates the engagement of public interest, the drafting of legislation, and the hosting of public meetings or town halls, whether legally mandated or voluntary. Additional components involve organizational tours and visits, press briefings, presenting legislation and outlining its budgetary implications, identifying revenue streams and associated costs for program implementation, as well as discussions and applications of Robert's Rules of Legislative Procedure. The process culminates in voting, the codification of ordinances, and subsequent stages of implementation, education, administration, management, and evaluation of outcomes. Adjustments may be made as required, within a dynamic ecosystem comprising diverse ideas and cultures, all working collaboratively to effect change for the broader community while addressing underlying value systems through debate, deliberation, and democratic voting.

Figure 5.10: The Municipal Policy/Sausage-Making Process

Two of the study participants boast backgrounds in legislative staffing for municipal governments. Their close collaboration with the researcher, combined with their comprehensive knowledge of
parliamentary procedures, significantly contributed to successful outcomes, particularly in relation to the City Manager and several City Council Representatives.

The researcher's extensive field experience spans from 2012 to 2020, encompassing roles as a doctoral student, PhD research/teaching assistant, secondary education reading teacher in a charter school, business development in the private sector, legislative staffer for a city council, adjunct faculty member, U.S. Federal Service-Partnership participant, and Deep Web researcher for a mass shooting survivor's legal case. This diverse array of experiences has enriched the researcher's understanding of the complexities and nuances inherent to the municipal policy-making process in West Texas.

Central Texas

In the Central Texas region, four participants played integral roles in this study. Among them were two distinguished City Council Representatives from different municipalities (both female), a candidate for County Judge who also served as an appointee to the local Economic Development Corporation board (male), and a senior executive within the City Economic Development Corporation of a separate municipality. These community leaders served as vital sources of information for the researcher, both during and after the study. Notably, two of the participants identified as Indigenous Native Pacific Islanders, and all maintained a connection to the U.S. military.

The practices of-The "Sausage Making" process and "How do you beat City Hall?" emerged from the West Texas context and found resonance in the Central Texas region as customary approaches This “Sausage Making” process akin to a metaphor meaning what it takes to make harmony of ingredients, or “Inafa‘maolek”, among institutional governments
communicating about the public policy making process as administrative officials at various levels of governance. The researcher, acting as a participant in the political operations, gained firsthand experiential knowledge. This unique socio-cultural perspective enriched the study by providing qualitative data intertwined with this distinctive regional viewpoint. This transformative experience for the researcher, originating from the Islander setting, afforded an insider's insight into political operations. Prior to embarking on this PhD journey, the researcher actively engaged in political operations, serving as a Political Director for a U.S. Presidential Campaign in the Western Pacific, as well as in roles spanning business development, media broadcasting/executive responsibilities during the media convergence of the 2000s, Speaker of the Legislature, committee staff duties, media communications, Public Information Officer, graduate and undergraduate student, advertising agency producer, gubernatorial campaign officer, University Foundation capital campaign manager, Senatorial candidate, Student Government member at the University, K-12 teacher, and higher education adjunct faculty member specializing in Communications. Of paramount significance is the realization that throughout this process, the researcher came to uncover common intercultural ground bridging neoliberal and social justice-oriented cultural perspectives. This resulted in the creation of *inafa'maolek* intercultural zones spanning various communication dimensions (intra-, inter-personal, small group, intercultural, public, media, new media).

Within the confines of the Sausage Making process, these community leaders epitomized the challenges encountered within a dominant cultural space. Conforming represents the initial step in this dynamic process. Fundamental knowledge constructs permeate throughout, as evidenced by the coding referenced in the findings. Community leaders in Central Texas, akin to their counterparts in this transnational setting, are immersed in the intricacies of the sausage
making process. The amalgamation of democracy for civic participation encompasses campaigning, as well as the execution of government initiatives. This includes the evaluation of various policies and programs, all while navigating the intricate landscape of legislative and administrative processes, which constitute the calendars of numerous organizations. These organizations are comprised of individuals, often overlapping in different levels of a single ecosystem. Each is a congregation of peers disseminating information with specific agendas, meticulously planned and coordinated as leadership engagements. Membership is based on social capital, whether through paid donations or volunteer contributions, necessitates dues and invitations conveyed through various communication channels, facilitated by a diverse range of staff members (paid or volunteer, contingent upon the organization's capacity). This is a reciprocal process, where community leaders teach and learn from those occupying senior leadership positions, immersing themselves in the rhythms of a performance manifested in events and marketing activities. These public engagements serve as platforms for social networking and interactions with influential figures in the realm of economic development.

A cornerstone of what community leaders teach and learn centers around the orchestrated effort in the field of economic development. In this location, as in others, there is a concerted endeavor to train public officials of diverse backgrounds, each contributing to the broader goals of community and business development. During this study, the researcher attained certification from the State of Texas in the public administrative functions of a state-funded higher education institution through a Basic Economic Development Course. The curriculum also intersects with a sincere commitment to various Civil Rights era programs implemented at both federal and state levels (e.g., Equal Employment Opportunity, and Civil Rights Programs of the Federal Aviation Administration, specifically the Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) program). These
initiatives seek to allocate government purchasing opportunities to minority- and women-owned businesses.

Community leaders delve into dominant frames, anticipated norms, strategies, and concepts essential for sustaining the requirements of the governing system. This is achieved through inter-strategic planning and coordination throughout the implementation phase. These objectives inform message construction and efforts to manage the public sphere of communications within a diverse media ecosystem. This is where the value of meaning-making in education/propaganda becomes paramount. Driving the policy process at municipal, state, and federal levels are the interests and agenda items meticulously selected to justify the allocation of time, energy, and resources to specific projects within a given period, typically a fiscal year. Throughout this study, the Central Texas participants were actively engaged in the decision-making process at the local/municipal level. By adhering to cultural expectations set by the dominant class, these minority community members were entrusted with the privilege of representing public interests. The official narrative, shaped by mediation from those in power and their influencers, carries a predetermined tone intended for public endorsement. Deviating from this narrative aligns one with the propaganda efforts of those seeking to challenge established power bases.

The researcher's field experience spans from 2020 to the present, encompassing roles as a Doctoral Candidate, City Airport Business Manager, and currently, Marketing Director/Defense Contractor to the Commanding General Public Affairs Office overseeing four states and five military installations. This breadth of experience has equipped the researcher with a comprehensive understanding of the complexities and nuances inherent to the municipal policy-making process in Central Texas.
Addressing RQ3: What meanings of critical consciousness towards civic engagement are socially constructed across municipal localities and intercultural groups over time? Why?

The construction of meanings surrounding critical consciousness (CritCon) is a socially contingent process deeply rooted in the cultural values, attitudes, and beliefs of various groups, both in relation to themselves and others. In this investigation, the preservation of power necessitates cultural agents to safeguard their way of life from perceived threats, including events, groups, or the interpretations of such events within the public sphere. An illustrative example can be found in the recent educational policy discussions during the 88th Texas Legislative Session (Texas Legislature Online, 2023) surrounding topics like Diversification, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) and Critical Race Theory (CRT) in K-12 and higher education. These pedagogical approaches and programs are viewed by some as emblematic of progressive, socially “woke” conscious education. Conversely, those advocating for legislation on these subjects perceive them as a manifestation of racist sentiments within the dominant Anglo culture. The endeavor to create space within education for foundational sociocultural principles in democratic curriculum and content development is met with resistance from varying viewpoints. The way forward lies in a shared commitment to economic development for social justice, as evidenced by programs like the Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (Federal Aviation Administration, 2023) initiatives.

While the essence of CritCon remains consistent, the tools and mediums through which it is conveyed undergo transformation. As Marshall McLuhan famously asserted, "the medium is the message" (McLuhan, 1964). This implies that civic engagement, throughout history, has been a tool employed to influence society and establish governance within our capitalist-centered
democratic society in America, and the broader global north/west. The meaning attributed to civic engagement evolves alongside communication technologies, giving rise to individualized sub-ecosystems of mediums. Ideas are now reinforced through Artificial Intelligence (AI) coding and virtual reality systems akin to digital marketing techniques/disinformation (Sedova, K., et.al, 2021). Navigating through the cacophony of market-bubbles necessitates sophisticated digital and traditional media strategies to effectively communicate messages of education/propaganda and establish meaning in a noisy ecosystem. CritCon in the context of civic engagement serves as the bedrock for understanding power dynamics when public distraction is no longer tenable.

Intriguingly, concerns about the perceived threat posed by CritCon are particularly prominent in Texas, primarily within the locales participating in this dissertation. Both West Texas and Central Texas have been intimately entwined with dominant white settler colonialist communities established on Native Lands. Conversely, in the Western Pacific setting (Guam-Marianas Islands), the framing of the Other embraces reformative and transformative forms of consciousness. Based on the findings interpreted through the proposed framework (IMF), ideations of this nature represent robust avenues for inquiry and analysis of socio-historical context, particularly for this Positive Deviant. This individual embodies a transformative critical consciousness rooted in Native perspectives. Their journey from conformity to reformation and eventual participation as a de-colonial actor is emblematic of this process.

De-colonial: It is important to emphasize the hyphen (-) as it underscores the distinct separation involved in the de-colonizing endeavor. This process involves the critical steps of de-linking, re-thinking, and re-linking inherent to the de-colonial turn.
In the initial stages of reformation, experiences of mentorship with de-colonial influencers played a pivotal role in shaping and sustaining these practices. The emphasis lies on creating a foundation for future generations to "learn + teach" the de-colonial way. Crucially, this setting fosters an openness to CritCon for oneself and others. In this context, the American-White culture, along with Asian Americans and other Pacific Islanders, represent the Other. These systems of cultural nationalism and preference significantly influence public policy considerations, shaping the agenda-setting process. It is pertinent to acknowledge that programs like DEI or CRT are openly deliberated within the public sphere of education, though formal district-level policies may not reflect this to the same extent. Rather, the narrative is often structured by and for community life. The presence of Native perspectives in any given space holds profound implications for place-making and the mediation of public memory processes. In Central Texas, the dominance of the Native White community in public policy eclipses the remnants of Indigenous/Native American cultural interests. A similar dynamic prevails in the Western Pacific, where Native Islanders govern the space, even as the influences of American Democracy and capitalism persist. While the actors may change, the system endures, as do the privileges associated with one's position in society and their role in the market. The Western Pacific setting emerges as a space where transformative critical consciousness is widely embraced. The Positive Deviant Community in this context identifies best practices that can be scaled for Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML) programming in other locations.

These constructed meanings of CritCon in the context of civic engagement underscore the vital role of civic media literacy education in empowering democratic participation. An audience equipped with the skills to discern meaning beyond individual predispositions embodies a form of
consciousness that transcends individual, small group, or cultural boundaries, moving toward a more holistic humanization. It signifies a collective sharing of power.

**Study Limitations**

The exploration of Artificial Intelligence (AI) and Social Networking Sites (SNS) applications offers a rich area for investigation. This includes specific practices and market tactics for implementing communication strategies, contingent on appropriate funding and established evaluation criteria. These practices encompass activities such as account creation, safeguarding consumer data privacy rights, and employing digital marketing tools (e.g., click-through rates, percentage of engaged media, and IP source tracking, as well as mobile geofencing digital tactics). Additionally, considerations extend to the realm of Traditional Media within Over The Top (OTT) platforms like Netflix, Hulu, and Amazon Prime, as well as the Gaming sphere (e.g., Xbox).

The funding allocated for this project imposed limitations on adopting a longitudinal study design. It also influenced the ability to offer incentives or compensation for both participants and peer researchers involved in the study.

**Future Implications**

The future of AI lies in the wisdom embedded within cognitive and ethical algorithms, poised to shape innovation in the coming millennium. This encompasses the development of algorithms and applications, with a focus on implementing, evaluating, and scaling DML
programs. Furthermore, there is substantial potential for the adoption and adaptation of the IMF framework within INDIG communities.

Policy Recommendations for Municipal-Centered Civic Education and Self-Determination:

Considering the evolving educational policy landscape, particularly in more conservative states where funding for content and pedagogy emphasizing social justice-oriented public policies like CRT and DEI may face challenges, it is imperative to establish a resilient public-private partnership. This collaboration should be focused on providing essential resources to support community-based civic education programs, targeting young adults, post-high school individuals, minorities, Indigenous communities, and members of dominant cultural groups. These initiatives should be designed to empower democratic citizenship education, both in virtual spaces and real-world forums, with a special emphasis on fostering self-determination.

The researcher has diligently developed a robust DML curriculum and a pedagogical framework that places significant emphasis on media literacy and civic participation. This program is purposefully constructed to equip participants with the knowledge and skills required for active engagement in the municipal public policy process. Guided by DML Curriculum Standards, it delineates clear objectives and goals, aligning seamlessly with the core principles of DML Pedagogy. By focusing on the intersection of self-determination and municipal public policy, this community-driven initiative is envisioned as a potent platform for diverse groups to come together, learn, and actively participate in shaping their own destinies within the democratic framework.

DML Curriculum Standards
The DML (Decolonizing Media Literacy) Curriculum Standards outlined in this dissertation serve as a comprehensive framework for cultivating civic engagement and media literacy proficiency in students. These standards, adapted from the work of Doherty and Peters (1980) and further refined in Ornstein et al. (2011), establish clear objectives to guide the educational process.

The System Goal is to ensure that students possess the knowledge and practical skills required to engage meaningfully in civic processes and navigate media landscapes effectively. This encompasses a deep understanding of conventional language, technology, and operations within the realm of social sciences, aligning with the Program Goal.

Within the curriculum, Course Goal 1 emphasizes the classification of civic and media practices based on established cultural knowledge, public memory, and value systems. To meet Instructional Goal 1.0, students are expected to adeptly differentiate social media posts on social networking platforms into categories of conforming, reforming, and transforming.

Moving on to Course Goal 2, students are tasked with comprehending and discerning fundamental processes related to education and propaganda. This includes the critical skill of distinguishing between colonial and decolonial meanings in various media sources. Instructional Goal 2.1 emphasizes the application of the ABCs of Propaganda, with particular attention to dimensions of meaning.

Course Goal 3 shifts the focus towards the empowerment of individuals for active participation in democratic processes. Students are expected to categorize elements contributing to civic efficacy, thereby equipping them to engage effectively in civic affairs. Instructional Goal 3.1 introduces a decision-making framework, wherein students evaluate whether to take action
based on a comparison of perceived efficacy, influence from trusted sources, and the perceived cost associated with such action.

By adhering to these well-defined goals and objectives, the DML Curriculum Standards provide a structured and comprehensive approach to developing civic engagement and media literacy competencies in students. This framework equips students with the essential knowledge and skills to navigate the intricate landscapes of civic participation and media consumption within the broader context of social sciences.

DML Pedagogy Principles

The DML (Decolonizing Media Literacy) Pedagogy Principles, adapted and refined from the work of Lankshear and McLaren (1993), offer a profound framework for shaping learners' engagement with the world. This pedagogy underscores the imperative for learners to actively construct their understanding of the world, emphasizing that knowledge is not merely received but achieved through their own efforts. Importantly, this process is rooted in their individual experiences, needs, circumstances, and aspirations, as well as their inherent capacity for meaning-making. The historical and cultural milieu is depicted as a malleable, evolving reality that is continually shaped by human agency, influenced by ideological representations of reality.

Likewise, learners are challenged to forge connections between their lived experiences and the broader context of reality. They are encouraged to envision the potential for novel interpretations of reality, thereby committing themselves to crafting a history that is enabling and rejuvenating. This endeavor is portrayed as a collective, collaborative undertaking wherein the perspectives and values of all participants hold significance. Learners recognize the pivotal role of
both new and traditional media in this shared venture, understanding that media competence is instrumental in actively co-construction and reconstructing lived relationships and practices.

In the post-literacy phase, learners engage in a media-assisted exploration of generative themes, particularly delving into the concept of "Western culture" as defined by prevailing dominant and minority cultural narratives. The objective is to transcend and challenge these conceptions, promoting a more inclusive and equitable understanding.

Central to this pedagogy is the recognition that the prevailing myths perpetuated by dominant and minority discourses serve to oppress and marginalize learners. However, these myths are not insurmountable. Through transformative action, learners can transcend these limiting narratives, armed with a new language and fresh interpretations of democracy-centered civic participation.

Moreover, learners are urged to operationalize Civic Efficacy elements, empowering them to actively participate in democratic processes. This involves discerning when the perceived efficacy of their actions outweighs the potential costs, all while considering the influence of their trusted sources and mediating factors.

In essence, the DML Pedagogy Principles encapsulate a transformative approach to education, empowering learners to critically engage with the world, challenge prevailing narratives, and actively shape their own understanding and participation in democratic processes. This pedagogy embodies a commitment to fostering informed, empowered citizens capable of effecting positive change.

Conclusion
Re-Linking to an Inafa’maolek World Order

This dissertation embarks on an ambitious mission visualized in DML Mapping (Table, 4.1): to envision and enact an Inafa’maolek World Order where self-determined individuals actively participate in the democratic processes of the United States of America. Central to this vision is the implementation of an extensive U.S. media literacy project, one that not only imparts critical thinking skills but also nurtures trust among The American People in their governmental institutions.

At the core of this strategy is the goal to leverage how different cultures engage with civic processes using the media for social change. Navigating the course requires a beginning destination, a coordinated effort buttressed by a stabilized point of departure, towards a forward destination; such has been laid out in this study. To chart this course, it is imperative to consider the potential trajectories that the nation may embark upon. These range from the aftermath of neoliberalism, the looming threat of fascism, to the challenges posed by near-peer adversaries in global competition. These potential futures not only serve as a backdrop but also provide an azimuth guiding our prospective endeavors.

The CRITCON framework, anchored in Indigenous epistemologies and the fundamental task of trust-building, serves as the cornerstone of this research. A key practice elucidated in this study demonstrates the value of communicating education/propaganda. CRITCON represents a multifaceted approach to comprehending and countering disinformation. This involves embracing Other's Knowing, a concept deeply embedded in Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF) principles and integrating them within the CRITCON framework. Through this integration, we aim to establish harmonious relationships and foster trust within the broader community.
The building blocks of counter-disinformation techniques are expounded upon, drawing from the adopted and adapted RICHDATA Pyramid, a disinformation model in the age of Artificial Intelligence (Sedova, K., et.al., 2021). This encompasses the comprehensive RICHDATA Framework and Techniques for digital marketing or disinformation, these communication practices which includes stages such as (R)econnaissance, (I)nfrarstructure development, (C)ontent creation and (H)ijacking, (D)eployment, (A mplification)-spread and engagement/(T)rolling, and (A)ctualizing; including a crucial feedback loop. Moreover, the CRITCON Model provides additional insights into epistemological, ontological, and axiological PD practices, which are indispensable for effectively spreading and engaging in counter-disinformation efforts. Various stages of counter-disinformation techniques are meticulously detailed, along with their far-reaching implications. This encompasses the intricate coding processes, their practical application, and a concerted effort towards raising awareness, education, and instigating a call-to-action public communication campaign.

The purpose underlying these techniques and strategies is threefold. Firstly, to establish robust regulatory measures, including the formulation of policies, identification of disinformation sources, and enforcement mechanisms. Secondly, to pinpoint and effectively counter nefarious actors operating within the disinformation landscape. Lastly, to foster a pro-human ethos, grounded in faith, Inafa’maolek Mediation Framework (IMF), and other pertinent perspectives, as a steadfast bulwark against disinformation campaigns. This dissertation is poised to provide a comprehensive roadmap towards realizing the vision of democratic public participation and trust-building within the civic affairs of the United States.
Institutional frameworks play a pivotal role in upholding, adapting, and reshaping cultural signifiers; these constructs encapsulate values that underpin our nation's cherished democratic ideals. A critical insight, as we advance towards our conclusion, lies in our capacity to empathize with and comprehend the diverse perspectives through which individuals define themselves. Within the milieu of organizations dedicated to bolstering Indigenous reform of neocolonial power dynamics within the backdrop of prevailing cultural norms, one finds oneself positioned as a constituent element of this transformative endeavor.

These dynamics crystallize within the realm of public policy formulation, notably in instances exemplified by NIMBY (Not In My Back Yard) community advocacy scenarios. These situations necessitate a nuanced process of constructing meanings in the development of municipal environments that cater to the diverse cultural mosaic. An alternate narrative serves to bestow decolonial significance upon representations of neoliberal metamorphosis in the public domain. The instrumentalization of neoliberal propaganda and educational mechanisms, both as catalysts for economic development and instruments to inculcate civic leaders with a pro-development outlook, is manifest. It is conceivable to envisage the potential for the deployment of Artificial Intelligence technologies equipped with axiological algorithms, affording the means to channel conformist behavior towards transformational objectives.

The transformation of the public sphere calls for a fundamental restructuring deeply embedded within the institutional framework, rooted in human values. From the standpoint of institutional stakeholders, community activists and their educational resources are often perceived through a propagandistic lens. This study provides evidence that effective engagement requires a degree of alignment with institutional structures to bring about meaningful change—an essential insight drawn from this research. Nevertheless, these institutional actors tend to view activists as
disruptors. This prevailing institutional viewpoint characterizes the educational materials of community activists as propagandistic, reflecting a reciprocal sentiment held by those on the opposing side of this shared semantic divide. The path towards decolonization evidently traverses through the domain of the neocolonial.

CONCLUSIVE REFLECTIVE REMARKS

This research lays the groundwork for subsequent inquiries, with a primary focus on substantiating the importance of constructing organizational and community infrastructures that bolster civic efficacy in the pursuit of self-determination. While the study narrowly addresses Guam's quest for self-determination, it acknowledges the persistent challenges stemming from U.S. judicial decisions impacting Native Indigenous-only plebiscites, a facet deserving further exploration. The central concern is not merely voter participation but the extent of manipulation inherent in public media campaigns, notably in shaping perceptions of candidate qualities. In the current milieu of civic media evolution, the rising trend of pop culture figures seeking political office underscores the urgency of adopting the pedagogical frameworks proposed in this study. Without such support, media-centric communication campaigns will continue to exert influence on community self-determination. Guam's intermittent attention to political self-determination underscores the need for a nuanced understanding of the value and costs associated with policies addressing political education and decolonization within the United Nations Commission on Decolonization context. Despite historical alternatives for political status, comprehensive, long-term public education curricula are notably absent. "Decolonizing Media Literacy" charts a
progressive course, offering a distinctive approach tailored for a community grappling with the intricate dynamics of colonization, capitalism, and Indigenous nationhood identity.

Decolonizing Media Literacy contributes to the understanding of civic engagement within Mexican American/Chicano communities, emphasizing practical implementation strategies. Grounded in an axiological approach, especially relevant in the Hispanic cultural context, it underscores the necessity for enhanced coordination at the national, regional, and state levels. Latin@-based organizations advocating for policy changes on critical community issues highlight the imperative for a synchronized and digitally adept public outreach strategy. Recognizing the financial implications of this endeavor, there is a call to develop capital campaigns to support the efforts of Hispanic organizational stakeholders nationwide.

The primary intention of this study was not to draw comparisons among cultural communities situated across the transnational locations under investigation. However, upon reflection, it becomes imperative to consider potential mutual learning in subsequent publications. At a surface level, the Guam community could gain insights into the value of U.S.-based municipal governance systems institutionalized in the West Texas and Central Texas settings. Conversely, these Texas-based locations stand to benefit from Guam's experiences in advancing voter engagement and fostering civic agency. This examination reveals that perceived threats to sovereignty serve as catalysts for civic empowerment. For example, the Central Texas dominant majority community expresses concerns about minority powers influencing counter-hegemonic policies, posing challenges to conservative nationalist aspirations.

Interpersonal dynamics serve as the driving force behind community agendas, both internally and externally. The management of these relationships is crucial, particularly when considering their cultural significance. In a profound sense, the concept of Inafa’maolek
significantly contributes to this comprehension by highlighting the importance of reciprocity. It underscores the maintenance of harmonious relations through a mutual process of meaning-making, conveyed through gestures, language, and symbols that embody shared power. Unfortunately, this nuanced understanding often eludes institutionalized actors within these settings. To this point, where the Root word - *maolek* meaning good, experienced transformation of mediation in a move termed as “first affix”. Here *fa’maolek* - the fa' means to make something happen- in this case make it good. Then, a “second affix” where "a" added becomes *afa'maolek*. A is a reciprocal marker. We are doing it to each other. Two or more people are making it good for each other. Finally, a “third affix” is "in" added becomes *inafa'maolek*. It nominalizes the action and makes a noun out of a verb. *Inafa'maolek* is the action of making it good for each other. A glue in society noting the value of reciprocity which is the key function here (Underwood, 2023. Personal Interview.).

Once again, Indigenous knowledge emerges as a beacon of salvation for humanity. In the current convergence of artificial intelligence innovations with digital media within a new era of propaganda, there arises a pressing necessity to scale holistic frameworks for meaning-making. These frameworks, encompassing axiological, epistemological, and ontological dimensions, are essential for the betterment of humanity. Their essence lies in being rooted in knowledge systems that transcend mere technological logic.

Values matter. Relationships matter. This study brings forth notable contradictions, particularly emphasizing the significant role of media as a tool of propaganda, beyond the determination of education as propaganda. Decolonizing Media Literacy (DML) delves into the foundations of these structures, elucidating their objectives in activating information to empower, protect, inform, influence, and even manipulate domestic and global audiences. The framework
employed to describe mediation as a pivotal aspect of this process also holds the potential to inform actors with less-than-benevolent intentions, as perceived by institutional leaders. We must anticipate such operations and prepare the public domain.

In scrutinizing the interactions of powerful entities engaged in the processes that shape policy, a collision of cultures unfolds within the meaning-making domain, amalgamating SocioCultural Foundations of Education and Government institutionalism. The journey undertaken by minorities in positions of power is a nuanced exploration of their negotiation with, and utilization of, power dynamics. Fear often accompanies unfamiliarity, and this is not an indictment but a recognition of the enculturation embedded in familial upbringing that shapes cultural identities—comprising experiences that mold our bodies, minds, ideas, beliefs, words, and actions. The crux lies in bridging these differences, for this is a narrative entrenched in power dynamics. Developing a pedagogy of shared power is inherently challenging, given the diverse manifestations of power that influence our navigation, creation, and harmonious coexistence with those in power. It is imperative to acknowledge the existence of nefarious actors who seek to control what eludes their understanding, resisting knowledge that challenges their in-group belief systems. Minorities in power become unwitting contributors to dominant neocolonial mechanisms designed to uphold and perpetuate power structures across various dimensions. In this context, the issue is not merely racism but, fundamentally, an issue of power. These intricate systems involve the ostentatious display and artful manipulation of power within community relationships.

There is a need for Media regulation which governments continue to grapple with. As a wild animal requires domestication (i.e., goya I karabao’), and government licenses are required for guns, driving, or fishing the same is recommended for media use particularly the identification of user accounts related to data privacy and social media use for vulnerable community members.
(elderly and youth included). Advocacy in this regard remains paramount. Harkening to Native Wisdom, Our Mahetok family oral history on Guam shares a truism from Ta’ta, Joaquin Campos Cepeda Castro Aguon giya Talo’fo’fo:

\[ Ti’fa’ga’ga hamyu’, yan Ti’fa’ga’ga ‘yu. \]

(Don’t treat others like animals/monsters, and don’t treat me like an animal/monster.)

Again, the value of protecting our children and social fabric draws on the knowledge of our ancestors. In closing, tools of technology continue to act as colonial vestiges of oppression for all mass publics by means of social control (self-imposed with entertainment buttressed with digital algorithms). The masses have inverted media control away from institutions supported by a rapidly evolving digital innovation market. As such, in the words of our 17th century Guam-Chamorro Chief Hurao:

\[ Manmetgot-na hit ki ta hongge ya sina ta apatta hit ginen ini na taotao hiyong siha ya ta na’ta’lo tatte i minagof yan i minaolek lina’la’-ta. (Hurao, 1671) \]

(We are stronger than we think! We can quickly free ourselves from these foreigners! We must regain our former freedom!)

Hurao articulated decolonial thought from the Native Pacific Islander perspective, as documented by Spanish Missionaries in the 17th century. Mignolo (2011) traces the roots of decolonial thought to early Indigenous resistance, finding expression in the writings of figures like Waman Puma de Ayala and Ottabah Cugoano in the 16th to 18th centuries. The collective call for liberation resonates across time and persists today. To hold power accountable, it is imperative to leverage the tools wielded by those in positions of governance, emphasizing the crucial need for enhanced democratic participation within institutions. The current era demands a departure from insular media bubbles, urging us to engage in broader communication networks. Throughout history,
communication tools have been wielded as weapons to secure the consent of the governed by social leaders across local, regional, state, national, and global ecosystems. Yet, unlike any other period, the masses now wield unprecedented control over content. Simultaneously, their personal digital data, a consequence of media consumption behavior, generates wealth for others, and their ideas are mirrored back to them devoid of critical examination. In this context, a responsibility emerges to educate the masses, akin to Plato's Allegory of The Cave. As we collectively emerge from the confines of the cave, the symbiosis of human and machine learning reshapes our imaginative landscape.
REFERENCES


BBC. (2016). Brazil’s Dilma Rousseff fights for her political survival.


https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7wm1IRLRQAk


Chapter 110. Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for English Language Arts and Reading Subchapter C. High School. §110.31. English Language Arts and Reading, English I (One Credit), Beginning with School Year 2009-2010. 


---(2018). 60x30EP. A Baseline Understanding of El Paso's Educational Attainment as it Relates to the 60x30TX Strategic Plan. Tweet by CREEED El Paso on Twitter. 5/30/18, 2:44 PM. creeed.org/uploads/6/8/1/…

creeed.org/uploads/6/8/1/…

creed.org/uploads/6/8/1/…

pic.twitter.com/EUJ9o0Edd6.


Gainer, J.S. (2010). Critical Media Literacy in Middle School: Exploring the politics of
http://www.tikkun.org/tikkundaily/2015/05/26/educated-hope-and-the-promise-of-democracy/
---(2015b). Education and the Crisis of Public Values: Challenging the Assault on Teachers, Students, and Public Education (2nd ed.). Peter Lang, NY.
---(2014). K-12 Content Standards and Performance Indicators.
Guam Department of Education (n.d.) Curriculum Information. Guam Education Board.
https://sites.google.com/a/gdoe.net/gdoe/
https://www.gdoe.net/District/Department/5-Curriculum-Instruction/1359-State-Strategic-Plan.html


Hershey, M. R. (2009). What we know about voter-ID laws, registration, and turnout. PS: Political Science & Politics, 42(01), 87-91.


Hobbs, R. (2011). “What a Difference Ten Years can Make: Research possibilities for the future of media literacy education”. School of Communication and Theatre, Temple University,


--Power point provided by Ben Fresquez, United Way—IGNITE Initiative Coordinator. El Paso County, TX.


---(2006b). Teacher Education in the Pacific Islands: New Landscapes and Challenges—Where are we going? APERA Conference, Hong Kong.


Ogunniyi, M. (2007). Teachers’ stances and practical arguments regarding a science


### KEY NOTIONS OF DECOLONIAL THEORY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Coloniality of Power</strong></td>
<td>“His (Saldivar) essays continue to show that de-colonial thinking is the pluri-versal epistemology of the future; an epistemology that de-links from the tyranny of abstract universals (Christians, Liberals or Marxists).” Saldivar contends delinking, “…is not just a question of the Americas for people living in the Americas, but it is the darker side of modernity and the global reach of imperial capitalism” (Mignolo, 2007, p.159).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Colonial Matrix of Power</strong></td>
<td>“Four interrelated domains: control of economy (land appropriations, exploitation of labor, natural resources); control of authority (institution, military); control of gender and sexuality (through socio-cultural factors such as family, education); and control of subjectivity and knowledge (epistemology, education, and formation of subjectivity)” are necessary to deconstruct (Mignolo, 2007, p.156).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Decolonial Critical Theory</strong></td>
<td>“An epistemic perspective from racial/ethnic subaltern locations…[analyzing/contextualizing] beyond the way traditional political-economy paradigms conceptualize capitalism as a global or world system” (Grosfoguel, 2007, p.212).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Decolonization of Knowledge</strong></td>
<td>“Modern epistemology,” Castro-Gomez proposes, “was historically founded on the assumption that it is obtained from a zero-point-of-observation”, meaning that historical observation was achieved through use of an unbiased observational point that allows for an historical continuum to exist from both points of it that is “transparent, disincorporated from the known and untouched by the geo-political configuration of the world in which people are racially ranked and regions are racially configured…”; of course, this is far from the truth (Mignolo, 2007, p. 162; 2009, p. 2). Such an assumption must be challenged, leading to its deconstruction and defeat.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Coloniality of Knowledge</strong></td>
<td>According to Mignolo (2007), [this] “…is precisely the affirmation of the zero point and the success in silencing or relegating other epistemologies to a barbarian margins, a primitive past or a communist or Muslim evil” (Mignolo, 2007, p. 162).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Modernity/Coloniality</strong></td>
<td>According to Mignolo (2007), is “The assumption that there is not modernity without coloniality, that coloniality is constitutive of modernity…” (Mignolo, 2007, p.164). That is to say that modernity is coloniality, and vice-versa (Mignolo, 2007, p.162).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Border Thinking**            | According to Mignolo (2007), “Subjectivities and knowledge in the colonial and ex-colonial world are as important and are divergent from European experiences…” (Mignolo, 2007, p.164). “… From
these subjectivities, experience, religions, histories, everyday life, emerged border thinking and de-colonial liberating projects,” rests a clear division of “knowing” (Mignolo, 2007, p.164).

**Pluriversal:**
According to Mignolo (2007), “A truly universal decolonial perspective cannot be based on an abstract universal (one particular that raises itself as universal global design), but would have to be the result of the critical dialogue between diverse critical epistemic/ethical/political projects towards a pluri-versal as oppose to a universal world” (Grosfoguel, 2007, p. 212).

**Geo-politics of Knowledge (Dussel, 1977) and Body-politics of Knowledge:**
According to Mignolo (2007), the “locus of enunciation” and “location of the subject that speaks”; “ethnic/racial/gender/sexual epistemic location and subject”; “who is speaking as well as the geopolitical and body-political epistemic location in the structures of colonial power/knowledge from which the subject speaks”, are critical to deconstruction (Fanon, 1967; Anzaldua, 1987 as cited in Grosfoguel, 2007, p. 213).

---

**Figure 1: Key Notions of De-colonial Theory**

**Figure 2.3: Framework of Analysis**

---

385
Figure 3: Indigenous Mixed Methodologies & Methods Model
Figure 4: Approach & Type-Methodology
(Adopted and adapted from Morse, 1991, Types of Designs Using Notation System; Creswell, et.al, In Tashakkori & Teddlie, 2003, p. 168.)

Figure 5: Decision Matrix-Mixed Methods Design
(Decision Matrix for Determining a Mixed Methods Design, Creswell, et.al, In Tashakkori & Teddlie, 2003, p. 171.)
Figure 6: ConTri Design Type

Figure 7: ConTrans Design Type
(Adopted and Adapted from Creswell, et.al, In Tashakkori & Teddlie, 2003, p. 179.)
Figure 8: Proposed Visualization of the Indigenous Concurrent Transformative/Triangulation Design
Data Results Compared/Combined Data Interpretation
(Adopted and Adapted from Creswell, et.al, In Tashakkori & Teddlie, 2003, p. 181.)
PHASE 1 - Administration (Concurrent)
December 2020 - May 2021: Proposal Defense; IRB approval; planning, organizing, staffing, coordinating, reporting, and budgeting for project

PHASE 2 - Implementation
May 2021 - December 2021: data collection; transcribing; coding

PHASE 3 - Analysis, Writing, & Defending
January 2022 - May 2022

Figure 9: Overall Timeline
In essence, *inafaʻmaolek* involves the following Indigenous-Oceania values: “*Respetu’* – the provision of respect afforded to our elderly and others significant individuals within the family and community; *Manginge* – an expression of respect given to elders and persons of authority; likened to a kiss, this expression of reverence is displayed by the motion of a slight touch of the nose to the back part of a person’s right hand; *Mamahlao* – to be shamefaced, embarrassed or ashamed; *Chenchule* – present (money) donation, thing that is given away, gift not specifically associated with any particular event; *Che’lu* – Relationships with siblings; *Påtgon* – Children are valued and raising them is everyone’s responsibility” (Aguon, K. in guampedia.com).

**CRITICAL CONSCIOUSNESS (Coding Categories Diagram)**

*CONSCIENTIZAÇÃO—CONCIENTIZACION*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Magical Consciousness “CONFORMING”</th>
<th>Naive/Pseudo Consciousness “REFORMING”</th>
<th>Critical Consciousness “TRANSFORMING”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>påtgon</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>che’lu</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>chenchule</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>mamahlao</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>manginge</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>respetu</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Naming
- What is the problem?
- Should things be the way they are?

### Problem Denial
- Overt denial
- Problem avoidance
- Circumstances define how to feel
- Angry
- False dependency/victim

### Survival Problems
- Poor physical state/health
- Poverty
- Insufficient work
- Lack of work
- Money as end in itself
- Accept a dehumanizing world

### Oppressed Deviates from Ideal Expectations
- Oppressed not like oppressor
- Oppressed not meet oppressors’ expectations
- Horizontal aggression
- Misdirect anger
- Demanding

### Individual Oppressor Deviates from Ideal Expectations Individual
- Oppressor violates laws
- Oppressor violates norms

### Rejection of Oppressor/Self Peer Affirmation
- Rejects modeling oppressor
- Seeks to maintain ethnicity
- Seeks to affirm uniqueness
- Knows truth history (Zinn)
- Healthy Anger

### Transform Systems
- Procedures > people
- Seeks to change oppressive system
- Name and deconstruct hegemonic systems: whiteness, patriarchy, capitalism
- Multiple literacies
- It is possible to re-humanize the world
- Historical commitment
- Evolving epistemological journey
- Human praxis that produce demystification
- Education as liberatory praxis

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Magical Consciousness “CONFORMING”</th>
<th>Naive/Pseudo Consciousness “REFORMING”</th>
<th>Critical Consciousness “TRANSFORMING”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflecting</td>
<td>Magical Consciousness “CONFORMING”</td>
<td>Naive/Pseudo Consciousness “REFORMING”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Why are things as they are?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Whose interests are served?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Who benefits from it?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Why are we studying?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What is education for?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Education does not transform the world.”</td>
<td>“Education reform systems and transform at individual level.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 11: Rossatto’s Critical Consciousness Chart (2012)
Appendix B-Research Notes

**Note 1:** STEP 2-online + real life + observations + interview

protocol-observation of civic and media engagement

structured on-line media tracking--propaganda in civic engagement

--remembering x forgetting

OBSERVATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Real Life</th>
<th>INDIG-MIN/DOM Group Opinion Leader</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(1 hour/participant)</td>
<td>[PROPAGANDA-REM/FOR]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CIVIC PARTICIPATION

+

INDIG-MIN/DOM Group Opinion Leader

[PROPAGANDA-REM/FOR]

MEDIA LITERACY PRACTICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>On-Line</th>
<th>INDIG-MIN/DOM Group Opinion Leader</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(1 hour/participant)</td>
<td>[PROPAGANDA-REM/FOR]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CIVIC PARTICIPATION

+

INDIG-MIN/DOM Group Opinion Leader

[PROPAGANDA-REM/FOR]

MEDIA LITERACY PRACTICES

**Note 2:** PARTICIPANTS

INDIG-MIN Group-Opinion Leader (OL)
A. INDIG
B. Asian Pacific Islander
C. Hispanic
D. Low-socioeconomic
E. Post High School
F. Early College
G. Early Career Professional
H. Intergenerational
   1. 19+
   2. 32+
   3. 45+
   4. 65+
SubTL: 11

WHT-DOM Group-OL
A. White
B. Elected Official
C. City Management
D. Business
E. Media
F. Education
G. NPO/NGO
H. Intergenerational
   1. 19+
   2. 32+
   3. 45+
   4. 65+
SubTL: 11

*pick (1) participant from all 3 markets to compose sample group of PD's..TL: 22 participants

*Gender consideration

Note 3: INTERVIEW PROTOCOL-per participant
DAD's

For data collection/analysis:
record audio
transcribing
coding
memoing

+ Media Literacy ?'s-inquiry survey (who/what/when/where/why/how)

+ CritConse Chart ?'s
Questionnaire

Note 4: How identify propaganda characteristics and measure?
Remembering X Forgetting


(p.163) Table 2, Questions for Analyzing Propaganda

[interpretation + meaning making]

Message: what key information and ideas are being expressed?
Techniques: what symbols and rhetorical strategies are used to attract attention and activate an emotional response? what makes them effective?
Means of Communication and Format: How does this message reach people, and what form does it take?
Representation: How does this message portray people and events? What points of view and values are activated?
Audience Receptivity: How may people think and feel about the message? How free are they to accept or reject it?

Source: Media Education Lab (2018)


fiction x non-fiction "truth"

ABC's of Propaganda Analysis-personal reflection: Life History Analysis-examination of how one's family and cultural values shape message interpretation (p.57)

Institute for Propaganda Analysis (IPA), 1937

Propaganda Process: design; implementation; and effectiveness
dissemination of opinions and ideas on behalf of propaganda effort (Lasswell, 1938)

Advocacy for what we believe in-education x advocacy for what we don't believe-propaganda (Bernays, 1923, p.212)...In Hobbs, et.al (p.58)

[detection]
Note 6: Life History Technique (p.62): what life values they hold now, how differ from what held in past, what influences in home, church, neighborhood, or economic status or political teaching have created differences between current beliefs and past. (Miller, 1941)

"Although, it is perhaps inevitable that we will accept propaganda that suits our personal interests and reinforces our identity, the processes of selecting, filtering and assessing propaganda can be made more intentional and mindful through personal reflection." (p.62)

Note 7: (p.62-63) ABC's of Propaganda (1936, IPA) x Core Principles of Media Literacy Ed (NAMLE, 2007)

Ascertain
Behold
Concern
Doubt
Evaluate
Find the Facts
Guard

Note 8:

"media literacy teaches students "how they can arrive at informed choices that are most consistent with their own values" and how to "become aware of and reflect on the meaning that they make of media messages, including how the meaning they make relates to their own values" [INAFA'MAOLEK]

key concepts of media literacy---ABC's of Prop/NAMLE's core principles

(4) "people use their individual skills, beliefs and experiences to construct their own meaning from media messages; [INAFA'MAOLEK]

interpretations of messages
--our own x people different from us (intercultural)
--to recognize & resist propaganda


GAP: "a well-cited study by Wineburg, McGrew, Breakstone, and Ortega (2016) shocked audiences with the conclusion that school-aged students were unable to differentiate between false and legitimate information. They cautioned: "Whether [the Internet] will make us smarter and better informed or more ignorant and narrow-minded will depend on our awareness of this problem and our education response to it" (Wineburg, et al., 2016, p.5), (In...p.95)

evaluate outcomes of media literacy
CritConsc?
"examining students' abilities to ask their own questions may offer fresh insights into the potential of media literacy practice to improve students' critical thinking."

before x after--Media Learning

evaluate concepts focused on in ?'s

RQ: what key critical consciousness concepts do Positive Deviant's (high and effective civic and media use-group members) ask questions about?

self-assessments---values

media learning outcomes

inquiry model

negotiate meaning across contexts

**Note 10:** Research Design:

participants view a commercial media sample

survey (analyze media): What ?'s come to mind while you watch this media?
List questions here: (as many or few)
# your questions

Instrument Development-organize and analyze ?'s

2 codebooks (code name/definition with inclusion and exclusion criteria/example ?'s)
1. ML concepts
2. CritConsc concepts

**Note 11:** Validity & Reliability

Qual approach x quan

--review by scholar: incorporate feedback in revision process

No time limits to complete ?'s or viewing media

Instrumentation (p.102)
Codes of Propaganda Process x content

ML Concepts-------------- ABC's Propaganda
Note 12:

Coding for Critical Consciousness
1- conforming
2- reforming
3- transforming

[frequency]

Note 13: Discussion: how messages make meaning

Gap: Teacher Education programs + training

Medium sample (traditional x new media)---online x real life

self-assess x valid assessment of habits of inquiry and ability to critically analyze, evaluate, and create media messages (Schilder et al, 2016, p.111)

Note 14: Open Coding (Babbie, 2011, p.426-7)--manually
-memoing (code notes); theoretical notes; operational notes

-unit of analysis (civic and media engagement practices)--concept

-propaganda (remembering and forgetting)

-organize concepts and categories

-use theoretical framework to determine data analysis (data breakdown into parts, closely examine, compare for similarities and differences

-concept mapping

*qualitative analysis of quantitative data---survey

--coding of responses/coding scheme
**Note 15:** [Validity x Credibility-"whether you are measuring what you say you are measuring"]

- "coding scheme, appropriate for theoretical concepts in study" + research purpose
- code with detail

Reliability--whether measurement or observation technique would yield the same data if possible to measure or observe the same thing several times independently.

- coding categories: "every bit of information fit into one category"
  - no more than one category per bit
  - no bits that fit into no category (p.451)

**Note 16:** Data Analysis PD

Content Analysis (p.356)--procedures

1. develop operational definitions of key variables in inquiry-coding
2. develop plan for data collection, analysis and evaluation
3. What to observe? (which days?/hours?)

Units of analysis [Indigenous cultural group opinion leaders x Dominant cultural group opinion leaders]--units of observation

- compare civic x media engagement
- sample: remembering x forgetting propaganda

Analyze--civic and media literacy practices ("observational units")

Unit of Analysis--remembering and forgetting propaganda (classify)
Classify each civic engagement and media literacy practice by its propaganda features and the degree of remembering and forgetting of propaganda associated with it. (p. 359)

**Note 17:** Unit of Analysis--sampling strategy--include everything you need to observe.

Design sample: what groups to observe?

period of study? (# of days)

during which hours of each day will researcher observe?

How many Civic Engagement and Media Literacy practices to observe and code for analysis?

How many hours of observation needed total?

(i.e., Jan. 21, 2021; City Hall-CM meet, 10a-Noon)

Observe WHITE/DOM groups x Interview INDIG/Minority

**Note 18:** Sampling Techniques----stratified sampling (GU/EP/CoK) x stratified random x systematic sampling analysis

Clustered Sampling (INDIG/DOM/CivicEng/MediaLit)

observational unit: civic engagement and media literacy practices

unit of analysis: propaganda (remembering and forgetting)

**Note 19:** Data Analysis
Content Analysis=coding operation (p.361) + conceptual framework

**Note 20:** Nonprobability Sampling: researcher select PD x community implement

(p.207) Purposive/Judgmental Sampling--studying deviant cases

"Field researchers are often particularly interested in studying deviant cases-in order to improve their understanding of the more usual pattern." (p.207, Babbie 2011)

x **Snowball Sampling:** each person interviewed may be asked to suggest people for interviewing.

**Note 21:**

How is dominant cultural group a PD community?

---by allowing INDIG/Minority members into dominant group participation in municipal policy process.

--PD Community--overcoming challenges x PD members of community (made up of DOM + INDIG/MIN)

**Note 22:** Quota Sampling: units selected into sample based on prespecified characteristics, so that the total sample will have the same distribution of characteristics assumed to exist in the population being studied.
Transformative mixed methods design (p.231-238, Creswell, 2014--see citation on Blackboard 4-8

**Note 23:** Reason to choose: developing an understanding of needed changes for a marginalized group.

**Note 24:** Expected outcomes: a call for action

**Note 25:** Convergent strategy-collecting QUAL+quan data concurrently x sequential

-civic & media engagement

--propaganda (remembering x forgetting)

**Note 26:** Civic Participation [C<pb+∑I]

Media Literacy (?)'s-type based on ML concepts/Propaganda + CritConscChart (analysis)

Propaganda [remembering x forgetting]

survey of PD's

**Note 27:** Validity of Finding--validation--Triangulation: ----data analysis (Denzin, 1978)

-methods TRI (QUAL+quan+INDIG)

-TRI of sources (OBSRV/INT/SURV)
- Theory TRI (INDIG-DECOL, Tuhiwai-

Smith/COMMPropaganda, Chomsky/SJEDR of

policy making, Anyon)

Note 28: triangulation through multiple analysis: using different observers, interviewers, analyst to compare and check data collection and interpretation

Note 29: (Ritchie, et al, 2014)

BB, 5-2 (citation)

Member validation take research evidence back to research participants/study population to determine if meanings or interpretations assigned are recognized and confirmed.

Note 30: Are there dominant cultural groups in power, in each community (GU/EP/CoK), that include INDIG-Minority member civic and media engagement to remember or forget (CRIT-CONSC Chart--survey + ML?'s for evaluation) propaganda?
TABLE 1: Survey Coding/propaganda identification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Respect</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PG</td>
<td>Information expressed by local politicians isn't always accurate. Some politicians focus on their own agendas. Why can't the politicians go to the experts (city staff, economic developers etc) for talking points.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mingana</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONFORMING</td>
<td>REFORMING</td>
<td>TRANSFORMING</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CJ</td>
<td>Over time, it has become the ad that changed the direction in which American political ads were heading and what they would eventually evolve into as emotional propaganda.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PG</td>
<td>Why can't reporters interview other people that might have a different POV. It gives the article/newscast more credibility. As for social media, there's no stopping people from posting inaccurate statements. Why don't more people stand up and speak the truth. I would except that I can't due to my job. I have to remain neutral.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The ad is portraying the threat of nuclear war if President Johnson's opponent is elected instead of him.

evokes an emotional response by appealing to family values and what is at stake.

to evoke an emotional response to the possible consequences of Johnson losing the election.

eventually images of a mushroom cloud explosion elicits anxiety and triggers troubling thoughts of what is to come.

The message may be interpreted as fear mongering at its core.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mamahlao: emotional</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CJ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Audience Receptivity: Many people definitely have received this message and are
embracing the thought that CRT should not be taught in public schools, however, it isn’t nor has it ever been taught there.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PG</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Giving out inaccurate information shows up in the media and these types of comments can hurt our image when trying to recruit businesses.

What points of view and values are activated?

Negativity and anyone or any company looking to relocate to Killeen could be discouraged because there are other options in the region.

Audience Receptivity: How may people think and feel about the message?

Most people will accept the message unless they are actively involved in the community and know the real truth.

How free are they to accept or reject it? They will accept the message because no one is addressing the other POV. Sometimes it's better not
to counter any negative comments because it becomes an unnecessary battle.

CJ

The threat of nuclear war and its effect on the country, including our children (daisy girl), is what the candidate (Johnson) is protecting us from.

LN

Technique: Social media and Politicians attacking tenure of professors

Message: People that are advocating to defund the police are against the police

Audience

Receptivity: the people aren’t buying it anymore

Che'lu

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PG</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Representation: How does this message portray people and events? When done in a non-productive way, the image that portrays our community can be quite negative.
All one has to do is look to surrounding communities and you will not see the same rhetoric from their elected officials.

The ad features a young girl picking daisies in a field. She symbolizes innocence and the Juxtaposition from the little girl counting daisy petals in a field to a missile launch countdown and LN Representation: anyone teaching CRT are against white America.

Table 1.2: Survey Respondents Inquiry Coding (p.12)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IMF CODING</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Respect</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Why can't reporters interview other</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Question 1</td>
<td>Question 2</td>
<td>Question 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Why don’t more workers protest against the low wages? (LN)</td>
<td>Why don’t people research more before taking a stand on an issue? (LN)</td>
<td>Did the creators of this ad feel any remorse or concern for the impact this commercial had, not only in the campaign but also on American politics as a whole? (CJ)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>people that might have a different POV? (PG)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

410
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mamahlao: emotional</th>
<th>• Was the nuclear threat as imminent as this ad suggests? Or was it more of a strategic tactic to create fear in order to win? What are the long term effects of this propaganda? (CJ)</th>
<th>• Why don't more people stand up and speak the truth? (PG)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chenchule</td>
<td>• How high are gas prices going to get? (LN)</td>
<td>• How absurd is the notion that not paying police officers is what defund the police means? (LN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Che'lu</td>
<td>• Why don't churches help the masses more? (LN)</td>
<td>• The perpetual weight loss and gain, how does it affect</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
the health of the consumer? (LN)

Why isn’t there more education on what CRT is? (LN)

Table 2.1: IMF Color Code/Focus Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respeti</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jj: you can also say the proliferation of bias media reporting, you know, all the way from traditional television to social media with misinformation.</td>
<td>what needs to be done to make it happen? Who do we bring in for volunteers? Bring in the people that are influential.</td>
<td>CJ: that's a really tough nut to crack</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
sir. To crack that problem, and it would involve a lot of effort and just completely switch our way of thinking.

JJ: I'm not the person they trust that's going to bring them information, to correct them. The only thing they're going to do is find it by themselves, by those credible people that they listen to... changes their mind, and I think that's sad to see.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Memebers</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING (or not)</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JJ: I mean at their age, but they're also targeting me. The advertisements.</td>
<td>JJ: I mean, I'm not tackling the issue of misinformation directly any way of my daily life.</td>
<td>what needs to be done to make it happen? Who do we bring in for volunteers?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CJ: But what we don't take into consideration is that perhaps these media outlets are the ones creating the issues if that makes sense.</td>
<td>CJ: And in my opinion that's just not how as a society-we should be at this point. But like Jeremy said, we are unfortunately at this point learning how to tackle it. But instead learning how to coexist with it. That might be a different approach to solving this issue.</td>
<td>• bring in decision makers, grass roots and grass tops.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CJ: it’s the kids, those are the ones getting-- those are the ones getting</td>
<td>It takes a lot of getting beat up.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effected by these messages, cause nobody wants to be the guy that is correcting everybody all the time. [media as bully]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JJ: proliferation of bias media reporting. CJ: But what we don't take into consideration is that perhaps these media outlets are the ones creating the issues if that makes sense. CJ: You know what I mean, so there's always going to be this sort of fallout for this message.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JJ: I like to think, personally, is that this current City Manager went out with a massive propaganda campaign on all the issues, on all the great things the city's doing, and it works. I got to hand it to the city, the way that they're handling their issues ...they do a 5 in 5. Those are small ways that you can correct the issues. We all work in government.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who else needs to be involved?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• people who have roots here. Who are steeples of the community being the ones that need to step it up.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
that the media is trying to put out there.

problem of media framing and public outcry.

JJ: Has convinced them that COVID is wrong. That there's tracking devices.

ugly and the good, and most people think about government doing only the ugly.

Mamahlao: emotional

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| CJ: You know what I mean, so there's always going to be this sort of fallout for this message that the media is trying to put out there. | what needs to be done to make it happen? Who do we bring in for volunteers?
  - the most difficult part, seeing, showing people that there is a problem. | You got to take a look at |
JJ: I don't think I personally do anything to solve the problem other than complaining or vent, but I think to answer your question--what you're driving at is, I mean I do all my fact checks.

- CJ: The way the masses are reacting to an issue.
- CJ: At this point its all about, its not really about getting accurate information out there. Its about being the first to quote-unquote break a story. Its about getting the most likes. Its about getting the most views. Its about rallying up people the most.

CJ: So much media, so many things that aren't proven and can't be proven, and it would be completely exhausting.

who else needs to be involved?

people willing to see change.

Chenchule

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>who else needs to be involved?</td>
<td>JJ: I'll draw from something</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
JJ: the industry of media, and journalist. Those type of people have to be involved because the industry is not going to change by itself. Its not going to do it by any outside group coming and telling them that they are wrong. Because they sell ads. That's how everyone gets paid.

JJ: You know if you look at fox news and cnn…they're the competing democratic-republican platform news outlets.

JJ: I think that's the larger problem, just the empathy of people not giving a crap. Just accepting it as a daily part of our lives.

JJ: And if you look at the statistics today on COVID, we still have that small percentage of people that are not ever going to get the vaccine because they do not trust the sources of media that our city government has done well. I remember I used to scream at the top of my lungs…look, we're taking body shot after body shot of misinformation from different media sources in town.

CJ: …little victories, they…you eat the elephant one bit at a time right. So if you have a campaign to go out there and talk about not the bad, but the good it could
information that they are receiving. The political rhetoric they are receiving from people, ex-Presidents and what not.

help combat the negativity that’s out there.

The misinformation, just the bad press. We've all worked for the City, and we've seen some shifts from how the message is put out there.

Some shifts toward the positive, and some shifts toward the negative but actually taking those steps [shifting terrain, tetonic plates moving] is a really big step.
JJ: JJ: another personal experience of mine just recently, was I had received a $200,000 grant for CDC to target misinformation in the El Paso region around COVID. We spend probably around $80K on media, direct targeting, door to door, prima doras, and what we did realize is that these people are not the movable middle of individuals that
Che'lu

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JJ: …there's not much more you can do without a tremendous amount of resources, and community building--I guess Coalition building to some extent.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Patgon

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JJ: I think it ties into Milo's description of teachers dealing with students that</td>
<td>CJ: another way we can see that there's an issue coming up cause kids shouldn't be asking about political ads, kids should be asking about other things--</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
only want to be TikTok.
cartoons, sports, and things like that.

CJ: it's the kids, those are the ones getting--those are the ones getting effected by these messages, by this alternative facts--the misinformation that's out there. That's another issues, that another way we can see that there's an issue coming up 'cause kids shouldn't be asking about political ads, kids should be asking about other things--cartoons, sports, and things like that.

CJ: I think going back to your whole field of study Roque, I think we need to endoctrine our kids maybe, not necessarily at the Elementary level but the high school level as to the importance of civic engagement and government roles. But not only that, but
how the media is not reality. I have a teacher friend of mine who is completely done and doesn’t want to teach anymore because he goes around and asks all his kids what you want to do when they grow up…and all of them say they want to be tick tock stars…I want to be you-tubers. Nobody wants to be doctors anymore, lawyers, they don't want to be President. They are more focused on that aspect of the media. Not necessarily new, but more focused on their phone, and just entertainment. They see that people are doing dances and lip syncing for millions of dollars…and that's the easy way out for them. So if there was a way we could possibly teach them real world consequences of reality, the separation between media and real life [representation: spectacle + intergenerational +}
parents generation said the same thing about MTV/Cable/RapMusic/Violent Movies, impact on adolescent development in Media Literacy history...

I think that would start to address the issue so that later on once they reach the real world there won't be so much of a shock, and they won't be so apathetic to what's going on around them.]

Notes 3.1: Interview Coding & Memoing-Emerging Civic and Media Uncommon Practices

* my parent's legacy [remembering]…

* We were told back in 1979, don't go down there that's where they sold slaves. So, we would see this market house, that symbol of what happen to our ancestors [public memory-remembering-identify-sense/meaning of space-intercultural translation zone]--most black people didn't go downtown. They didn't do anything downtown because of that symbol.

* my earliest memories of knowing--no matter how much money you had, or what you have material-wise…is that you were just as good as anyone else, and to treat everybody the same. No matter what their economic status. [remembering axiological as transformational practice]

* As a result of that, I kept building and building in different political circles until I became my own person. [self actualize] Not just an operative in the shadow of a principal.
They flipped it on me. Told me I'm the reason that Chief looking for a new job. Even though two years ago, before I was even on Council, He was applying for Police Chief in Palestine, and definitely in Temple. I don't know how I'm the reason he wants to find another job, but I'm being blamed for it. [constituent role in policy process]

I give the citizen a whole list of questions. I want to know details about this. When I go to get the other side of the story [DML]…when I'm asking question, I can recall details from the citizen.

What Chief and CM don't like is that I will do the same thing with the Police Department. I don't do it necessarily on the dais. I'll send them emails. I'll call. I'll have in-person meetings with them [channels of civic engagement].

I chose the next best thing, in my opinion, which was journalism. It was there I started to be more cognizant of politics, world news, everything really going on, especially locally. [plotting]

CJ: it was like an old Mexican man with a cowboy hat, by like a dirt road. Then it had pictures of the actor Matthew McConaughey and Penelope Cruz. It said, we don't want old dusty El Paso. It had a picture of the man we want. We want hip El Paso. It had the picture of the actor. It had a whole bunch of very negative language, but it was at that point that I realized--oh my God, this is--this piece of propaganda is very misleading, very inaccurate [NIMBY--meaning making, place x space].

The recipe to success: shut your mouth, fall in line. Conform, do good in school, and things will be granted on to you. That's a very interesting [dominant cultural norm].

To paint the picture that I was running from my debt, that I did not pay, that was the false narrative being put out there. That because WC did not pay, he was being sued, [legitimacy of frame the more intimate a portrait one knows to paint. i.e., WC had close working relationship with raa in 2002 gubernatorial election. The popular frame about WC among organizational leadership was one that interpreted the meaning of WC's action as self-serving. He was looking to make money off the campaign/candidate. WC handling of cash on behalf of campaign was brought to raa attention--need to cease, raa responsible for managing relationship on behalf of candidate. believeability]

I don't know where it began. I do have some images that are still resonated in my brain [remembering], in my memory [public memory] that may have inspired looking in that direction.
* Specifically, Ricardo J. Bordallo, my dad shaking his hand at the Customs booth, on what we know of as Labor Day. All I remember was this straw hat, he was in a white t-shirt...he was seated, he had his glasses on. My dad said, "hey boy, this is the Governor..." He was a really big guy--of course I was just a child. That left an impression, an indelible mark in my mind. [plotting course]

* Because politics, and misconception, and misunderstanding about that framework because it was tied to a vendor; very loud and strategic in pin-pointing problems. [institutional perspective of activist]

* 13th birthday, we're all sitting there at my little birthday gathering during my home visit. I was in foster care, we had-- supervised home visits. We're all sitting there talking, and one of the rules was--were not going to sit here and watch TV. No TV on. You have to actually interact as a family. She was mad at my step-dad at the time, and she said..."you know why he treats all of you different? Because he's not your father. She goes through, and tells two of my sisters who their Dad is. Tells the other sister that he is her father. She looks at me, and says I don't know who your dad is. It could be one of three different guys. Holy shit...happy birthday, my mother's a whore. [rep remembers event where mom makes "big reveal" during celebratory moment, appears now to aim for big reveals on others during Council/public meetings]

* By the time my third sister was born--I was only 4 years old, but I distinctly remember being home alone. [rep alone on the dais], in the mobile home, without her there.

* One persons evil action, can be another persons saving grace. [one persons corruption is another's opportunity].

* [AI applications-axiological algorithms]

* They were walking around with that, spreading--it really open my eyes to how far someone will go to get what they want. Of course it was taken completely out of context. They went back and found the actual study [role of higher ed academia in propaganda process]--the actual power point slide.

* I've met some of the most caring people that work for the City, and I've met some of the ugliest people that are "activist" in this role, and its very disheartening to see that's the way it really is; but unfortunately, that really is the way it is.[institutional perspective of activist]

* CJ: They're trying to influence our actions and thoughts in a negative way by trying to paint this picture [role of CM gatekeeper perspective in framing messages]...of the administration and the Council--of these monsters, these evil people, these racists.
* CJ: "emotional propaganda"...what we were just touching on...basically, propaganda utilizes your emotions to accomplish their goal. Going back to the "Daisy Ad", fear was the strongest emotion they felt they needed to utilize in order to sway the American public to vote for Lyndon Johnson. [history of propaganda in mass media goes further back than we remember].

* They were showing them, "hey! The City's not all bad. We actually have a better place. The City helped me out with this. This kind of stuff. Emotional Propaganda--only thinking about the few, not thinking about the bigger issue [tai-mamah'lao].

* I started getting my feet wet in elementary school through elected office. I don't remember my parents ever even encouraging it. It wasn't spawned from their nudges [rethinking at an early age]

* That was when I felt, in my mind, if I had a marquee moment in my life. That was a defining moment. The day I arrived at my house. When I got the call that the house was burning, and a series of events that lead up to rolling up, seeing my dad without his shirt...in shock, glazing into the flames, and three giant-ass fire trucks there. I take off my shirt, and I give it to my dad because he made it out of the house barely, with enough time to save his life. Fortunately, he didn't get burned. He was sleeping when the flames were engulfing the ceiling on top of him. My mom had to sit on his chest, and pound him to make him wake up. He survived. Almost nothing else did. Most of our memories went down with the fire. [remembering struggle]

* Chenchule [IMF provides context of civic engagement formula/C<bp x ]--subtraction factor for the negative occurrence required to transform [C = BP + SI] Operationalizing Civic Efficacy: I will act if C < BP + SI the cost is lower than the sum of my perceived efficacy (BP) and what my influencers signal they are doing [x mediating]. (p.69)

* They message out that they're there to help. They're about helping the teachers. Like salary increases, and promoting that. [institutional actor seems activist as disrupting]

* I started to realize, okay its not as easy--I mean its easy to do that kind of work, but the implications, the ramifications are hard to deal with. I started to become less idealistic, more pragmatic, and experienced in my ways. Then truly hit home when I became the victim... [the way the other perceives and acts upon the self].of these propaganda, character assassination attempts.
Then, thereafter I went into business for myself. Just was a survivor, and continued to build up my reputation through my writing, thinking, and ability to contribute in other ways—where I wasn't like a little bitch just hiding behind a desk. Like you, in the Underwood days, when we get dirty, but we can also contribute cerebrally. People in positions of power and influence like that. They saw it as a total package [ability to see and understand how others interpret self].

It hurt my family. It hurt me, and in reflection... I don't want to do that to anybody [x CJ…same value + respect for other]. I don't want them to go through that kind of an assassination of one's character, true or not. It's not consistent with my Catholicity—if you want to call it.

041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ: After I got my undergraduate degree, I wanted to break into journalism here in El Paso. I wanted to start writing, working for the newspaper, maybe a news station. In my contacts I came across Dr. Noe. I met former Representative Noe. Picking his brain, and getting to know him. He decided he wanted to give me a job. He was looking for a new aide, and I--our paths crossed, and I started working for him. From there I started getting more involved, more educated and more informed on the issues. As a journalist you try to understand both sides of the story, but you're always biased. I always thought the government was the big bad evil government--empire, right? From STARWARS, but after working for the Rep. I come from a Democratic family, the Rep was Republican--I was aware of this. I told myself, can I do this? Can I work for a Republican? Something told me to give the man a shot. See what things are like. Working with him really opened up my eyes tremendously to both sides of the issue. Not even both sides of the issue. We don't live in a black and white world. We live in a gray world. There's tremendous amounts of gray area. His perspective on a lot of things really opened up my eyes. While I was a lot more liberal for certain topics and issues. I find myself slightly more conservative now. I would say that government spending is a really big issue for me to consider. It's a bigger issue for me--that I think about now. At first I was like, well we have the money why don't we just do it? Now seeing that the people who pay the taxes, especially at a municipal level, are people like my parents. The majority of them are people like my folks who have a fixed income. Don't make a lot of money. So they want their dollar spent wisely. We need to make wise choices in order to spend that dollar wisely. I really changed my view on that. I wouldn't--I don't want my money being spent on things that are unnecessary. Only going to benefit the few. Everybody pays that money. Not just a few vocal people. The few ankle-biters, the few that can
rally a small percentage of the population--signatures. That's what working with Dr. Noe did for me.

* CJ: personally, I'm not fond of this purpose. I personally think that progress is a good thing. Building that structure will actually benefit the City. I don't mean the city government--the City of El Paso, the city as a whole. I think would benefit the region. It would bring in tourist dollars, it would bring in more tax revenue. It would benefit everyone really--in my opinion. [economic development perspective]

* That's who the propagandist are--in my opinion. [community activist public education materials deemed as propaganda by institutional actors]

* 041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ: in this case, in a sense, they did beat city hall, but in another sense they really didn't because they didn't completely kill the project. They really didn't beat anyone. For the most part it's a really good analogy, but in another sense it's not because--let's take another issue. Take that "Lost Dog" issue. That was another, on the West side--that was in a sense--you did beat City Hall. But, who was City Hall at that time? There was a lot of support from "City Hall", from the Council. So you didn't really beat them, they kind of won. [chapter sub-title …how do you beat city hall?]

* We had people leaving the city to go to a restaurant in another city to go buy liquor without all the rules. That was one of the reasons. We wanted to be able to recruit more restaurants, and we did. [propaganda/educational devices applied for economic development]

* 041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ: In this case it would be the activist. The folks that have an agenda, they're willing to do anything they have to, or they can to get their agenda across. Whether it's hurt people, hurt people's livelihoods--whole reputations. Hurt community's perception of an organization. They don't care. They're the ones doing--they don't want this arena built here. They want to preserve these buildings. They don't care what they have to do in order to do it. That's who the propagandist are--in my opinion. [community activist public education materials deemed as propaganda by institutional actors]

* 042722 PhD Study-PG Interview [strong in ch'en'chule across dimensions as native pacific islander female participant-neoliberal/economic development]

* PG: then when you ordered your drink you had to either show your card, or they took your name…and they had your card on file. They had to research it, look it up, then you could buy an alcoholic beverage. Liquor stores were non-existent. So, what community leaders did is we hired a consultant, to go through the
process of trying to legalize the sale of alcohol by the drink. Which means you can go to a restaurant and you no longer have to do the membership registration, as well as the ability to sell beer and wine. Which is now expanded to liquor stores. That consultant was able to run a public campaign, and garner enough signatures and we raised enough money. We took the issue to the voters, and they approved both initiatives.

* Yes, it was definitely a quality of life initiative. Even if you don’t support the consumption of alcohol, it was just the ease of doing business for restaurant owners, and now we have restaurants—you can drink or not drink, it doesn't matter which side of the issue you support. [neoliberal transformation of public space]

* 051022 PhD Interview-WC2: But then, I get on the board. Then I see real power. Oversight over millions, people in positions effected by decisions that we make. Doors opening all around you outside of that boardroom. It was a very awakening experience if you will, and that further fed my desire to effectuate change. This time in a political arena much bigger than student government. I think that was I starting to venture into that authority. [conforming as a means to transformational ends]

* I became his political confidant, and then political pressure was applied to me and I had to pull back. That's how --Onedera became the young adult leader, but I was still very quietly supplying Angel with a lot of political rhetoric. That was '98. [indigenous transformation of neocolonial power structure]

* PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413: I ask questions. If you came to me and said, 'Councilwoman MB, I have this problem in my neighborhood…we've got feral cats attacking people, but Animal Control won't come out and do anything. When they do…when they do, they just come out and take them to the shelter for a few days. Then they bring them all back here to the neighborhood again. Then they're attacking everyone. My gosh I'm so sorry to hear about that, that's awful. Let me get some more information from you. Where do you live? What street is this on? When was the last time Animal Control was contacted. [constituent role in policy process]

* It taught me how to expand my network beyond the village boundaries of Barrigada--where I was always safe. A bunch of thugs, a lot of drug dealers, but I was safe among thieves. Now were dealing with the guys outside the borders. It was kind of survival, but it was great for me because I built a network--of friends that were genuine, who knew me for who I was [establishing identity among like-minded peers]. There's no
agenda, as a matter of act, if they knew there was an agenda it probably would not work out very nice for me. [agenda-making]

* 051022 PhD Interview-WC2: This is within--for the most part within a homogenous community of Islanders, predominantly Chamorro at FD [private school institutional setting of neocolonial structural indoctrination]. So it wasn't like it was one race or another. It was more class than it was ethnicity. That was kind of an uphill battle. I was not of the same breed. I don’t know how to put it.

* my earliest memories of knowing--no matter how much money you had, or what you have material-wise...is that you were just as good as anyone else, and to treat everybody the same. No matter what their economic status. [remembering axiological as transformational practice]

* [TRANSFORMING-relinking practices for PD behaviors]

Notes 3.2: PD Practices demonstrating transformative notions of CritCon

* PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413 Moving around all the time. No money. Not knowing what I'm eating really giving up my food to make sure my sisters were eating and getting full. Raising them my whole life. Taking care of my mom my whole life.

* PhD Study-Interview-SD2022-04-13 Via TEAMS Persistence and courage. To always make a difference. Never giving up. Even when it is rough at times. Also, to believe--out of all the sacrifices, all the hard work there's always something good that will happen. My passion is empowering students and teachers through equitable opportunities in teaching and learning.

* 051022 PhD Interview-WC2 When I started the Islander Foundation, it was really meant to bring a bunch of people together to effectuate change, to help those in need. It’s even inherent at the time, in the preamble--which read something like: know ye young men, know he all man, that we the founders of IFIL (spelled out…Islander Foundation...); hereby establish, integrity, comradery, general assistance as a cornerstone upon which we unite in common; enhance ourselves; and through which we establish this constitution for IFIL. That was my preamble. So, you can see that integrity, general assistance, comradery; those are all the three key elements that was driving what I was doing at that time.

* There are many examples in my life where I try to influence policy, or completely outright change it or get rid of it. So that it would be softer upon the struggling human.
* WC: In 1996, I graduated from FD. Angel Santos is my second cousin. His family and my family are very close blood related; his dad and my dad are first cousins. So, I would go to the family get-togethers. When the movement was starting, I was approached by them to participate. At the time I think I was a Senior, and in my head, I was like--fuck no. Why would I want to join an agrarian--very agrarian based, very unrefined. At the time I wasn't getting from the rhetoric. There wasn't a whole lot of in the media. It wasn't politically laden. It was agrarian. It was a movement of people who weren't going to college, didn't have gainful employment…at least from what I saw. Who were looking to go occupy lands that were theirs I would think--to live off the land. I was not interested in that.

* I started talking with him in 1997. '94 I started picking up on this Nationalistic Movement, if you will. Nationalism. Really strong pride for the Chamorro Nation.

* He was going to hand deliver that to Janet Reno at the time. We spent a lot of time when he was at Harvard getting to know each other, laughing, feeling him.

* PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413 It was following everything that they did. I knew we had a bunch of Council member that didn't read--I love Shirley Fleming, apparently Fleming told everybody that she knew the material, she did her reading all morning. So knowing that most of them didn't know the material, and I could download the information myself. I started doing that, and I would just go and speak. Even if they didn't listen to me. The public knew the other side of the story.

* PhD Study-Interview-SD2022-04-13 Via TEAMS I think that if this kind of opportunity is given to everybody, people will be nicer to each other and understand each other better.

* 051022 PhD Interview-WC2 Then in '98 he decided to run for Governor. Well, shortly after the Harvard experience he was running for Governor. He asked me to be his Young Adult leader and I accepted, but more important than that for me. I was his "shadow rider". I was Angels' Chief Policy rider at the time, and strategist. I'm just this young motherfucker from UOG, then Harvard. I was not part of any serious movement. I was just a guy with a head on his shoulders who took advantage of--he would come to my house in the middle of the night, and four large towering massive men surround the house at all four corners while he's in the room with me pounding away
his rhetoric. Angel would supply almost all the rhetoric. My role was to inspire the rhetoric or to edit it so he's not calling MB a naked whore. It just wasn't proper. Things like that.

I became his political confidant, and then political pressure was applied to me and I had to pull back. That's how --Onedera became the young adult leader, but I was still very quietly supplying Angel with a lot of political rhetoric. That was '98. [indigenous transformation of neocolonial power structure]

* **042722 PhD Study-PG Interview [strong in ch'en'chule across dimensions as native pacific islander female participant-neoliberal/economic development]** PG: then when you ordered your drink you had to either show your card, or they took your name…and they had your card on file. They had to research it, look it up, then you could buy an alcoholic beverage. Liquor stores were non-existent. So, what community leaders did is we hired a consultant, to go through the process of trying to legalize the sale of alcohol by the drink. Which means you can go to a restaurant and you no longer have to do the membership registration, as well as the ability to sell beer and wine. Which is now expanded to liquor stores. That consultant was able to run a public campaign and garner enough signatures and we raised enough money. We took the issue to the voters, and they approved both initiatives.

* [education/propaganda interchangeable]

* Yes, it was definitely a quality-of-life initiative. Even if you don’t support the consumption of alcohol, it was just the case of doing business for restaurant owners, and now we have restaurants-you can drink or not drink, it doesn't matter which side of the issue you support. [neoliberal transformation of public space]

* **041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ.** in this case, in a sense, they did beat city hall, but in another sense they really didn't because they didn't completely kill the project. They really didn't beat anyone. For the most part it’s a good analogy, but in another sense its not because--let's take another issue. Take that "Lost Dog" issue. That was another, on the West side--that was in a sense-you did beat City Hall. But, who was City Hall at that time? There was a lot of support from "City Hall", from the Council. So you didn't really beat them, they kind of won. [chapter sub-title ...how do you beat city hall?]
* **PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413** The City decided that the property owner should be responsible, citing case law from the 1800s. While they're discussing this one night, Mrs. Fleming invited up another person to speak. He had been the person who caused her to bring this item forward. The Mayor-Segarra, allowed him to come up and speak. Then she says, Mrs. Brown is here and she would like to say something. Can Mrs. Brown come up and speak?

* Now I kinda whisper to Rivera saying Mrs. Fleming wants me to speak. I might need somebody to back her up. Would you mind if I speak. No, of course, I'll support you speaking. I get up to the podium, and she's saying that she'd like to let Mrs. Brown speak. Jose says no. I asked him why not? He told me its not a public hearing.

* I'm standing there at the podium. You can watch this on a hundred news channels, or probably my Facebook Live stream--its still up. If you just google it. Anyway, the Mayor kept telling me no. I kept insisting, and demanding to know why. I knew what my rights were. I knew what the procedures were of the Council. He eventually told me that I had to leave. In that process the Sgt. Of Arms put me in a control hold, and tried to escort me out, but ask me to collect my belongings while both my hands were behind my back.

* I was already mad at him. I was yelling at him to lighten up and loosen his grip on me. Then he told me, "it was okay that he was hurting me--keep moving." I kind of lost my shit on him a little bit, even though I was still walking, and cooperating, I was yelling at him. "What are you talking about--telling me, that its okay for you to hurt me…" Growing up in an abusive household--no. You don't tell somebody who's not resisting, 'it's okay, just keep going'. He told me gather my belongings.

* You can't see me. It's funny, I'm showing you. I have both my hands behind my back. He is telling me to gather my stuff. I'm leaving. I'm more than willing to leave--I'm going to go. I'd love to gather up my belongings. You need to let go of my hand. Can't really gather your stuff with someone holding two hands behind your back. I don't know if I was supposed to gather it with my mouth or my feet, or whatever. I also didn't want to try and bring my arm around. You've got me in a control-hold, and if I start to pull my arm around…now, I'm resisting. I wasn't going to let him get me wrapped up in a resisting charge.
* As I'm going back-n-forth with him, telling him I want to get my stuff, I need you to let go of my arm...he continues, "mrs. Brown, gather up your belongings." Judge Mark Kimble, who is behind, stood up and told the officer, "Officer I order you to place this woman under arrest for disturbing the peace." They put me in cuffs, and they took me to jail. Pissed me off, instead of suing them I decided the best way to get my revenge--to get up on the Council and make them sit there and work with me every day.

* 051022 PhD Interview-WC2 To me, those are things that you have to train your self to do because its so easy to adopt that other side. I don't think that's a Western trait at all. I think that's reinforced because of our culture, and how we--especially now in the CNMI, there's a stronger feeling of INAFAMAOLEK and saving face here. Yeah, there are a few crazies out here, but by and large these guys are very sensitive to each other--very sensitive. Where they try not to inflect harm or pain upon one another, even their own enemy. That's how sensitive these people are out here. Not like Guam, any--every opportunity in the Democrat circles that I've been in--that's a modus operandi; but not in Republican circles. At least not in the ones I've been in. Certainly not in my Republican circle here, but that's not to say we don't have it. I have an excellent green room black ops team. It'll be coming out. I don't wake up ever day thinking how I can annihilate somebody on the other side. That's now how I roll.

* WC: as a young idealistic fuck, I was out for blood. Hey, I could do this. I'm brilliant. Let me take out that bitch--write this down, boom-boom-boom. Just completely cut you up in a million pieces with my pen. That was easy for me at the time. It wasn’t until I started--saw it from the personal side, and even the professional side...started seeing how people react negatively to that. Almost disgust depending on how vile your write up is. I didn't like that. I didn't like people reacting like, that is so dark, and dirty, evil. I started to realize, okay its not as easy--I mean its easy to do that kind of work, but the implications, the ramifications are hard to deal with. I started to become less idealistic, more pragmatic, and experienced in my ways. Then truly hit home when I became the victim... [the way the other perceives and acts upon the self]...of these propaganda, character assassination attempts. There had been many. It hurt my family. It hurt me, and in reflection... I don't want to do that to anybody [x CJ...same value + respect for other]. I don't want them to go
through that kind of an assassination of ones character, true or not. It's not consistent with my Catholicity--if you want to call it. I'm a terrible Catholic--that much I know about Christianity. The pinnacle was when I became the fuckin' victim of that shit. From the UOG thing to little stupid jabs on the radio about, "oh, he's acting like a little boy who lit his house on fire, and then put it down with a hose, and said..'look at me, I'm the hero." I mean those little fuckin' stupid cunt-ass remarks like that. Those were designed--engineered to evoke an emotional response. It did, but I channeled that. Instead of hitting them back, I channeled that into positive energy, and I re-engineered that shit to my favor. They lost more support, and lost face to the point where they came back begging for me to accept their apology, as late as a year and a half later for something so stupid, but yet so emotionally traumatic to my family. So I accepted RL's apology almost a year and a half later because of that. She understood, as a human being that value I maintain, and that mortal wound you attempted to inflict would now be forgotten even though it was furthest from achieving the kind of result that you had desired, or engineered it to achieve. It didn't, but you lost a friend for life.

* PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413 MB: I grew up so fast. When I was in college, I was in foster care. I had empathy for people. I just didn't have sympathy. I didn't have family. The whole family first thing didn't matter. It was me first. Take care of me, and what do I need. What's going to get me where I want to be. I think that's the biggest change--when I was younger, 'till now. It went from being about me…how do I control the situation happening to me--specifically. I don't care how it affects other people. Its all about me. Now, its family first, but helping the other people also.

* MB: part of we need to do to engage marginalized communities, and not try to teach them. Reach out to them, get them involved, make them feel like they are important. I know as somebody who grew up in a poverty situation, then in foster care. You feel neglected by the world. People don't want to come in and talk to you. Politicians don't come talk to you. The leadership does not come talk to you. If they're not interested in you, why should you be interested in them.

* PhD Study-Interview-SD2022-04-13 Via TEAMS The culture dictates that to--very traditional Catholic-way of thinking. Coming here to the United States, and learning about independence.
valued that a lot. I think that's one of my biggest take-aways--living here for almost 20 years in the
United States. My sense of independence, and really allowing me to grow more and increase my
level of maturity, and lift up that sense of courage and persistence, to make a difference. The
accomplishments, the accolades…even the challenges have become really meaningful learning
experiences for me--and life experiences--life learning lessons.

* 051022 PhD Interview-WC2: interesting. I always knew at FD, and it might have even been
inherent in my earlier years. I believe my classmates and peers were saying that I was saying this
since I was in middle school. That I wanted to be Governor. I was going to be a Governor, and I
just kept saying it. To some I didn't say it. My career path was starting to manifest itself. So they
saw it as a natural end-game for them, these are non-political people. Keep in mind these are
people in the public school system who for the most part didn't have any real political ambition. I
could go through my entire roster and tell you who was ambitious or not ambitious. I would say 9
1/2 out of 10 of those people never gave a damn about politics. I was probably the only one who
had a keen interest in it. I don't know where it began. I do have some images that are still
resonated in my brain [remembering], in my memory [public memory] that may have inspired
looking in that direction. Specifically, Ricardo J. Bordallo, my dad shaking his hand at the
Customs booth, on what we know of as Labor Day. All I remember was this straw hat, he was in a
white t-shirt…he was seated, he had his glasses on. My dad said, "hey boy, this is the
Governor…" He was a really big guy--of course I was just a child. That left an impression, an
indelible mark in my mind. [plotting course]

* 041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ Especially coming from my background you don't really have
the resources to get yourself out, you kind of dig yourself into a hole--a hole, into a hole…until
you can finally dig yourself out. Specifically, the City Manager. Say anything you will about him,
him personally, his personality--his demeanor, say what you want--that's him. As far as it goes,
him running the city, him actually doing what he's supposed to do. I think he does a good job. I
think his heart is in the right place. Sometimes his words aren't in the right place, but his heart is
definitely in the right place. I think from him coming from a similar background, I didn't grow up
nearly as poor as he did. We did have sort of a similar background--being Latinos, both having
Mexican parents. None of our parents speaking English. In this country, I can sympathize with what he wants to accomplish, and what he wants to--his end goal. His end game, but from working with the Reps office, and now the administration, I sympathize a lot more than I did before. As opposed to when I was a college student, right. I was writing stories for my college paper, or just for the class. I went for the pobresitos of the world, and now everybody has issues that we look at. That's really shaped m point of view and my politics.

* I decided I wanted always to try and do the right thing. I always wanted to do the right thing, and make sure nothing could really get in my way doing the right thing.

* I think that story helps to encompass what I hold valuable in this world, in this life. Its being a decent human being, being a good person. Its not being a piece of shit…pardon my French--I want to be a good person--ultimately.

* PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413 They wouldn't put presentations on certain items, intentionally because they knew it was going to be a controversial item. They did not want citizens gathering information, particularly citizens like me who were going to go through and research it, then start blasting it out on social media.

* MB: yes. My great-great grandmother is Native American, and then, actually I did a DNA test…my DNA test says that I'm primarily Easter Indian, Native American, and Inuit. Then, I've got a little bit of DNA from the Orkney Islands (?), and Easter Europe.

* It's been a long journey. I tell people all the time, statistically I should not be where I am right now. I've never liked statistics. I had to take that damn class twice. It bored me the first time, and I didn't finish it. I won't let anybody tell me who I'm supposed to be. Nobody gets to tell me no, without at least hearing me out. It's a lot of insight into how I am on the dais.

* PhD Study-Interview-SD2022-04-13 Via TEAMS What kept me going was I appreciated my humble beginnings. That has helped me to have the stamina, the resilience, not giving up, and the desire to fight for myself. I can't just trust their first-hand communication. I always have to do my own research and investigation to find out…is that really true what they're saying about this-this-and that…With that privilege I take it to heart that its my responsibility to hold critical conversations, to hold constructive thinking. To hold critical consciousness. To implement that.
To use the right words in order to communicate correctly, and provide feedback. To help think outside of the constraints of this only what they see. Just how human we are. How we can be swayed by images and words. By different sounds. To me, all that proves is that people can be swayed. People's morals, people's ethics, people's voting history.

Appendix Chapter 4

Table 4.5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chenchule</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| MB: Killeen City Council  
April 5 Meeting: live video  
12. PH-22-021  
HOLD a public hearing and consider an ordinance requested by Public Hearing on Item 12/13  
13. PH-22-022  
HOLD a public hearing and consider an ordinance requested by | Item 13: step 2 of process; rep recommends staff better educate citizens of process…CM public hearing requirement.  
New mayor following parliamentary procedure | First black female mayor presiding |
| [legal system x council x parliamentary procedure x policy process]…MB counters for R1…designation in lieu of request…17. PH-22-026  
HOLD a public hearing and consider an ordinance requested by | MB submit KEDC structuring presentation for future meeting | MB: move to postpone, PUD pending. |
| 18. PH-22-027  
HOLD a public hearing and consider an ordinance requested by | [Public Hearing: same female/white; MB civic engagement prior to election, same tactic.] | |
| Public Hearing: constituent repeatedly, same person returns to podium on agenda items, | | |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chenchule</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 23. DS-22-040  
Discuss Downtown Property Improvements--challenges  
[transformational culture]--downtown revitalization director: downtown and N. Killeen; BRE/Recruitment/branding/placemaking/engaging partners/Attracting business development…EDC work comparison. | | |
MB: "telling people what they have to do with their property'; murals ok, improve aesthetics to attract people; court route, liens, city collection efforts; council talked about EDC for downtown x revitalization director, CM questioned…

IBCC: appreciate having event;

LN at City Council, April 5: IBCC request for alcohol services, "Culture on the Square"…for action: intro speaker "we have a good working relationship"
LN: check IDs in other locations, security checkpoint; thank for bringing event to city

[manning approached by former mayor to run for council to support developer interest] Planning Dir: on Chamber Pres project for rezoning; "encourages" development

Respetu

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>220419_006: 041922 PhD Field Notes; the value of listening; this morning Georgetown Chamber of Commerce Breakfast Links; met Professor Media civic Engagement from Southwest University; female, need to look her up; reach out to her/send her an email; about my presentation/project; have coffee; listening a major component in building those relationships.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>220419_005: 041922 PhD Field Notes; the difference between civic engagement and civic participation was the actual sincere genuine building and communication among individuals dedicated to solving those social ills; verse participation as perfunctory.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>220405_003: 040522 PhD Field Notes, Department of Aviation-Killeen meeting with Georgetown Chamber of Commerce program coordinator appearing white anglo-saxon minority female, mid to late twenties-early 30s at the most; revealing today in presentation about aviation and business development opportunities partnership. Hispanic descent on the mother's side carrying the Father's side looks. &quot;They don't know that I'm Hispanic. I like to show them something besides all the bad things they hear.&quot; Foster kids in the family. High socio-economic Belton resident. Work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
through college, first generation. Want to make it better. Passionate. Foster brothers and sisters, several, five/six, emotional. Wanting to help those disadvantaged in community. Pointed out presentation diversity and inclusion.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>220405_002: 040522 PhD Field Notes, continued...sausage-making.</td>
<td>Through the power of getting to know those most influential members of a region, of a community--of a regional community. Any community. Those influencers, according to Rogers' Diffusion of Innovation, are the ones that first get it. So, as it agreed in marketing circles, that Diffusion of Innovation begins with those influencers. It may start with online, but that online world is fed, and is a translation of, that social reality.</td>
<td>220419_013: 041922 PhD Field Notes. Inafa'maolek. Harmony. Circles. Language. Language Circles. Harmony in one language circle affects the ecosystem of language circles, therefore establishing positive transference versus negative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Z0000009: March 26 Alvarado TX Fix the Dang Roads Program, Maple Street Wastewater line and road Reconstruction, Mayor Jacob Wheat. Interesting municipal name localize municipality program. Locals name it &quot;Fix the Dang Road&quot; (Country Culture).</td>
<td>220419_002: 041922 PhD Field Notes: my relationship with time; the urgent/important; the executive management level; the business development level; the responding urgency; supervisor snap-snap-snap-snap-snap-snap...the urgent, sky is falling different from, when accepting the executive management role; the management of time; the urgency reduces in a well-managed ecosystem, in a management framework; time management reduces the stress and anxiety, and the tension for those to engage in the community processes; in conversation with department heads, fellow colleagues, conversations in public meetings required by Federal/State/Local law; its more a conversational, the sense of being by the researcher in the moment, and building relationships in the</td>
<td>20419_003: 041922 PhD Field notes; this concept of time and the management of it by an Indigenous researcher with an American hybrid background, move from urban cultural environments to rural; once again the researcher, one and half years later, realizes the approach differing in this rural organizational market requiring a more laid-back Island-style approach, which is less intense. Being reminded by colleagues,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Z0000014: 032922 PhD Field Notes; making copies of family tree; Aunt Beatrice</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
department. Different from the now-now-now-now.

- 220407_001: 040722 PhD Field notes; building trust

- 220406_002: 040622 PhD Field Notes. Remembering networking, remembering social relationship, remembering names, remembering status of individuals in an organization, in a community; remembering affiliations; remembering school; remembering where we went to college; remembering sports we played; Commissioner Salado.

- Z0000019: 040122 PhD Field Notes; Chamorro Association of Central Texas; first time meeting fascinating remembering culture, history, fanhogue Chamoru; elders, younger generation, cultural night; liberation fair/liberation festival planning; Robert's Rules of Orders; fanhogue Chamoru; Kuentos Chamoru.

- Z0000015: 032922 Victoria TX Aunt Mimi; Family Wisdom, 2 butter knives forming crucifix; Mama Cuca/Papa Grande telling Uncle Gummy-Grandma Lala's brother when the storms coming to make sign of the cross in the direction of the storm, say prayers, Aunt Mimi now on her porch does the same with other knives and puts it in the direction of the front of the house, the back of the house that the storm is coming.

- 220419_001: 041922 PhD Field Notes; what do I do as a public administrator civically engaged; I think, I reflect on that thinking and I act. The triangulation continues. Participatory Action Research, Sociocultural Foundations pedagogical approaches include reading, reflecting, writing. In this case, the triangulation continues, in that from a decolonial framework the thinking, the delinking, the relinking.

- Z0000016: 040122 PhD Field Notes; City manager TG-El Paso asks, "how do you transform a city?", from the inside out begins with values of the leadership of the community. Of the people there. The creation of identity. The process...Verdunity. Comprehensive Land Use Plan process, City of Killeen. Killeen Starting from the ground up.

### Mamahlao: emotional

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>220406_01: 040622 PhD Field notes. Remembering social connection; different groups remembers the networking/relationships. For example, Chamorro</td>
<td>During the interview meeting, before the interview began the participant knew an elderly Native Chamorro veteran and the wife, Professor, the Executive Director himself; the intensity of the researcher who realizes at this point the INAF'A'MOLEK in this story. The harmony in the relations that have been causing disruption, it's the management of time, and the releasing of negative relations that create distrust help build trust and cultivate trust—the seeds of those trust</td>
<td>220403_004: 040322 PhD Field Notes. What do you teach-curriculum, how we teach curriculum in light of black lives matter extreme, and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Association, FT, remembering his relationship to GCC. LG, part of civic process…remembering the networking. The Executive Director of Aviation, remembering the lynch mob when asking did I know any good hit men, in reference to the African American attorney, female creating delays in his project timeline for federal grants. Remembering hit men, remember hit men in reference to his hesitance…to share, "should I really say it, I don't know if I should say it"."cause in the good ole' days we can say that, he at least puts it out when he talks to me…looks at me, and whispers under his breath [in his office near front door], says…do you remember when/do you know any good hit men? In reference to taking out that minority. As in, in the good ole' days there'd be a hangin' for a negro woman…for a negro period causing problems for a white man, for this white political leader.

• 220403_001:040322

remembering Walmart Shooter-Hispanic 23 killed; speaker at Round Rock Economic Development pulls out weapon/camera-room predominately White Anglo Saxon, minorities shocked.

• Z0000010: The Eyes of Texas are Upon You. Neighborhood Watch sign, Alvarado TX municipality, North Texas. South of Fort Worth. Cowboy Hat, black & white, male, white, shades, Texas Ranger looking Cowboy watching over his country.

introduced us to a circle of friends. The participant, former candidate, began in introduction to these individuals began to teach them about the civic process at the county level and the city level, and the good ole' boy club, going back seven generations in Coryell County that he is a part of, yet still an outsider. Not in the bandwagon as an insider, will run as Justice of the Peace in the next election.

Z0000022: 040222

remembering Tinala Katne-Uncle Joe

Anti-CRT extreme? The way forward is to recognize that third-space. That intercultural curriculum that empowers inequity for those communities affected by it. Historical realities, socio-historical realities while allowing others to save face grounded in policy, public policy.

• 220403_003: 040322

PhD field notes; Hubris of Zero-so the idea of Mignolo, Hubris of Zero, the principle of coloniality; is that there are fundamental frameworks that create colonialism. Yes, its their history, the White Man's history of the Confederacy because of the representations at the County, the representations at the State Capitol…the monuments. We recognize that, and though a community may be predominantly White. The principle of Hubris of Zero means that Coloniality claims that it's the only history. And it's a history, a story, a narrative not to be contended with. And that's what creates the Anti-CRT movement that's happening across White Communities because their seeing that the multicultural nature of history, because all the different people in their communities say, well…that's a bad history. Well, don't make our history bad because we're proud of our history. That's the hubris
point of zero. Is you claim that's everyone's history. You claim that because that's your narrative because that's your history everyone has to accept the fact that it's a good history, or it's not. Especially if you ask the black people that were enslaved.

That's the problem with the ultra-Alt Right they call it of the White Community. The Nazis. That's how far that thinking is, the KKK. Its not an understanding. We just don't want you to say that, you can't succeed because we're the White people in power. And you can't succeed, that's what they say on FOX news; on what Critical Race Theory is. I was just watching something on YouTube last night. The newscaster, putting the people on the news saying, all the experts are saying, Critical Race Theory claims that you can't succeed. Minorities are complaining about Critical Race Theory because we're teaching the kids that they can't succeed because they are brown and not white. That's a twisting of it. Critical Race Theory is a legal framework that explains the racism, and the dynamics of racism as a structure that oppresses individuals that are not in dominant positions of power. That's what Critical Race Theory is, and there's a lot of scholarship out there about what it is. Its just that they don't like being told that, well your
great-grandfather did some, your great grandfather and your great-great grandfather did some very bad things to people. And ya'll took everyone's land, Native Americans and Mexicans in Texas, African-Americans you stole them from their places and sold them, enslaved them. Turn them into property.

And the idea that, the reason why the republicans and the GOP, the conservative policy makers are fighting it 'cause they know there's liability involved. And that's where Critical Race Theory comes in. In a court of law, Critical Race Theory is legitimate argument, its proven. Its what Dr. Martin Luther King used to prove; and Plessy vs. Ferguson was overturned based on Brown vs. Board of Education, was all based upon the notion of racism. The racism that created Un-Incorporated Territories that left our people in the middle of the Pacific property of the U.S. and Congress. That's Critical Race Theory.

They know that there are reparations down the road. They know in Congress that minority Democrats in power are looking to push a reparation agenda, to have those families, those institutions like The University of Texas, Harvard, Princeton, Yale, they're already vulnerable legally—not just politically, but legally vulnerable to not just giving back the
property, but paying reparations to the public. That's why they are pushing back on Critical Race Theory, not because they're sensitive for their kids because they know there's a lot of money involved. The same way we talk about reparations for our generation, from World War 2. Because we said, okay America, the old argument for World War 2 Chamorro's is based on America getting Japan to surrender, and in the documents America absolves Japan from war reparations. Meaning, you did a lot of bad things in the Pacific, you did a lot of bad things on Guam. You beheaded families, your family blown up in a cave [to M.A.]. So because you absolved, this is Guam Government telling U.S. in the argument for reparations, because you absolved Japan, you accept that responsibility. Therefore, you owe us money. That's why the reparations took so long to pass through Congress because the Black Caucus, Underwood used to tell me this, the Black Caucus and the Mexicans would say...what about our reparations? Why are we giving Guam reparations? What about our reparations for slavery? What about our reparations for taking our land?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chenchule</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• 220419 _010: 041922 PhD Field notes.</td>
<td>• 220419 _008: 041922 PhD Field Notes. What do I do?</td>
<td>• And the transforming of the human mind.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
business gets done. Turning nothing into dollars. The working of humans together in a team setting, individuals with different talents and abilities, skills. Have the same focus, energy and commitment reciprocated by that entity fosters, cultivates action of that organization of human beings towards a common purpose.

220419_009: 041922 PhD Field Notes; un the pre-bid meeting for GRK procurement Taxiway B. In attendance the Director, Engineer, Project Engineer-Garver, Procurement officials--two from the city, three guest representatives from different potential bidders. One of the bidders, in remarks about the kind of gravel, and being brought up and going through the specs and the questions; one of the contractors, potential bidders who had previously done work and stated later that his firm had built the original airport. The Executive Director knew this, and had that institutional history, that knowledge. Being around for 16 years/15 years in that airport. The potential bidder makes a remark, if ya'll want we'll…pull up a truck and we'll fill yours too. We'll fill your truck too. There were laughs and chuckles, but there was also no remarks saying, hey that's inappropriate. Even in jest.

220405_001: 040522, PhD field notes-observation. Today, the Executive Director, Department of Aviation. He actually asked if I knew any good hit men, in reference to minority female deputy City Attorney causing delays in legal

As a public administrator? I plan. POSCRB. I plan. I'm planning, organizing, staffing; I'm coordinating. I'm reporting, and I'm budgeting. But the R is also researching. Continuing…remembering…remembering the past, forgetting the past. The researcher over the weekend, dealing with past of his own Godson challenging him with all the angst and anger, as being abandoned by the researcher's brother. The researcher remembering this, experiencing this, while going through this dissertation, gives the researcher the realization of that conflict for peace that is required, the peace of the researcher to foster that reflective thinking because without it the researcher is distracted. Doesn't have the mental energy, space in his mind—the mindfulness to reflect on those priorities, and those (job, business), those opportunities that are a priority to the individual seeking to effect social change.

220412_003: 041222 PhD Field notes meeting with Acalle, VFW, teaching researcher about the difference in American Legion and VFW. Different cultural groups eligibility, membership based upon service in war; American domestic wars versus Foreign Wars; also participant actively involved in economic development opportunities as a board member of the EDC, and personal business development goals.

220410_001: 041022 PhD Field Notes; Forney TX; the language of power; tongue-fu; in the discourse analysis of the body, and spirit of the researcher; going through bariatric surgery losing 80lbs six months later. In this current date last week, being noted—starting at 345-265, that physical energy, that spiritual energy, the stamina to engage in relationships in a meaningful way. The Wife, those private moments. With the boss, just sitting down. Just having energy to do all these different things. In order to do that requires that transformation. I'm transforming. I'm transforming my own reality. I'm acting myself into a new way of thinking. Positive Deviance.
review of departmental budget/legal documents previously approved by former Deputy Assistant City Attorney assigned to the department. Previously, the actual City Attorney had jurisdiction/portfolio of departmental cases with the Department of Aviation and handled problems. However, the smallest, tiniest errors, any other documents—these are not usual/normal. These should not be taken two weeks to review causing delays in municipal policy process. The announcements required in the grant assurances of FAA Grant Funding, Public Announcements, and the announcements with a short timeline that projects are on for procurement, and awarded to begin construction at certain periods in adherence to federal government deadlines from FAA.

researcher in an organizational context there are actors and narratives of discourse that are questioned by the researcher to surrounding institutional actors; this agreeable conflict occurs amongst adversaries challenging notions of power amongst each other, and within the organizational structure.

- Z0000018: 040122 PhD Field Notes: economic development Copperas Cove Chamorro Asian-Asian-Pacific Islander Association; entrepreneurs creating, cultivating, and transferring wealth.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Che'lu</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Continuing this part 3; the researcher meeting the faculty member about civic engagement related to the dissertation. Well, that's networking, and yes in this new digital age there's this whole concept of digital networking. Social networking. Its all based upon, not the augmented reality version, but the face to face reality of the networking of going out and knowing people; because that’s where the information is coming from. Even the source</td>
<td>220420_001: 0420-2022 PhD Field Notes. Leadership is a relationship with self, one's intrapersonal communication. If one is not able to communicate with one's self this represents an epistemological (media/education/institutional beliefs-culture), ontological (public memory), and axiological (values) dilemma. [over-rating western meanings of leadership...competitive x collaborative]</td>
<td>220413_001: 041322 PhD Field Notes; post SD interview, reflection...How do you transform a city? The Culture. The culture that is practiced by a community, different community groups, made up of individuals. So transforming the realities of those individuals in your community will transform everything else.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
of, there can be this source of networking if its legitimate to the degree of the relationship and the trust that is provided by the individuals engaging in communication. Whether it’s a post, a like or private messaging; instant messaging via a social networking site. Still though, there's a distinction between that fundamental, and there's a value, to that fundamental opportunity to meet and greet, and get to know--and build relationships, create deals, provide jobs to a community for an organization.

- **220407_002: 040722 PhD Field notes** department of aviation conversation with Maintenance Manager; remembering DBE background; consultant connection pressure; loss of funding; the impetus for funding for DBE program in budget; to avoid racist perceptions about the airport in doing business for minority chamber groups.

- **220412_001: 041222 PhD Field Notes; Killeen, TX** meeting with GCU business development rep; community outreach discussing Walmart Shooter gun ownership in TX; sharing researcher's role in Walmart Shooting Case; GCU rep mentions the problem is dehumanization of society where media is desensitizing community members to see individuals as human.

- **Z0000021: 040222 PhD field notes; conflicting epistemologies; the role of the researcher, the role of elected officials in navigating and balancing out value systems grounded in critical decolonial epistemological frameworks while navigating the pluriversalality of neoliberal capitalism (i.e. economic development processes).**

**Patagon**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Even so, to this point, the researcher shares a story that the other day, last week wife and I were sitting having dinner when our son and daughter was there. The youngest boy, youngest girl, and Roque Boy responds</td>
<td>• The researchers is listening to country music all the time in these rural settings. Same as he did with the San Antonio radio setting to pick up on hip-hop culture. He's picking up on rural culture, in Central Texas. Even though he has a Texas identity. 4th</td>
<td>• <strong>220419_012: 041922 PhD Field Notes. Home. Daughter-Lele’. Parenting.</strong> Axiological Parenting. Parenting with</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
with a twang in what he was saying. He said something with a twang. We just cracked up laughing. It was the first time he ever used that Texas Twang, and daddy's always playing--the kids are driven crazy...Alexa, play George Straight. Alexa, play artist similar to George Straight. He's learning from Father's Pedagogy. Father's pedagogy practices. Bringing home, now he's learning how to assimilate, enculturation. Acculturation for me, and enculturation for the kids.

- Z0000008: 032622 PhD Field notes previous conversation regarding property tax values in Central TX and our current, children's generation not being able to afford the prices of homes in the coming future attributed to DBE Consultant KS.
- Z0000007 [03-77]: PhD field note March 26 driving to Dallas seeing the development around me on the I35 corridor reflecting on participant general public member telling me about how, sharing with me how much economic growth in is happening in the area; given the property values now and the exponential we're seeing year over year after COVID in terms of the Central Texas economy.

Generation, Texan on the Mom's side; same thing he did in Guam. In listening to local music, being a cultural assimilator to American Culture. The Chamorro culture and American culture, learning how to program that in a media setting and succeed at it. Well, now that the researcher is taking that same approach, and is here always listening. The Wifes' always asking…why am I listening, why am I listening? She thinks its about somebody. Its not about somebody. Its everybody. I'm learning everything through the music. I'm learning the sound. The talk. The twang, the sayings. The don't sayings. The topics, the themes, the tropes. All through the public pedagogy of music that's coming through a podcast. Which used to come through--still comes through the radio but its my demand. What I want. George Straight, specifically is highly regarded brand so that's culturally accepted; so to speak, and talk and dress…the cowboy boots, the hat. Even my Indigenous father call it goofy.

- 220406_003: 040622 remembering bullying; children's story; teaching values
- 220403_005: 040322. I choose to believe, inform, make a decision. Teach how to learn not what to learn. YouTube, Media literacy…story of Alejandra watching two guys on youtube, question about chemicals in sandbox; places to go, sources of information.

Imagine the growth which will continue if on the same trajectory that our children will experience, and the property values of those homes; how that could price our children out of the market. That’s why personally I’m looking for ten acres. So I can have property for the kids to sustain them, and how important it is for this current values using media literacy as a part of proactive, pro-child, decolonial pedagogical practice.
generation to prepare our children for the future. And what that future looks like. Utopian. Dystopian. Giroux, labels it as an Authoritarian Regime. Always talking about a new language that needs to happen. A Dystopian Future… with fascism fueled by the far-right-alternative right White Supremacist movement across the U.S., the World, Europe included.

IMF Color Code

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I do my best to build a relationship with anyone willing to do that</td>
<td>220505_004: 050522 PhD Field Notes. That was a protest challenging the anti-CRT legislation that was going through special session that Abbot had called.</td>
<td>220516_002: 051622 PhD Field Notes. Chamorro activist that idolize and valorize Anghet. Our job is to be respectful.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Where we could brief and discuss projects, and then mutiny occurred, I was excluded from any meetings involving any business operations, business matters, finances; expected to do the budget while my staff--Billing Specialist was reclassified to Office Assistant.</td>
<td>220505_003: 050522 PhD Field Notes. More and more I realize that I'm a part of this process of the institution, and my own struggle in navigating it, in resisting the institutional rules and regs in my life style choices; in my parenting, philosophy, in issues with my son with his school… teaching them about government and rules.</td>
<td>220516_001: 051622 PhD Field Notes. remind him about how he has to be respectful be respectful.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approached MW, brought up the overhearing of the disagreement about the--my name being involved in discussion, door open, yesterday morning--or the day before yesterday which would have been Monday.</td>
<td></td>
<td>It doesn't matter, just be respectful to different people. That's the way forward, [one thing I've noticed that has been lost in the my own education is the explicit learning of how to understand the political dynamics of power in institutional workspace which is a vital skill for professional development--DML teaching the hidden curriculum of power structures of privilege.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>220505_004: 050522 PhD Field Notes. Cinco</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mang'ngge

CONFORMING

- 220516_002: 051622 PhD Field Notes.
- Connect that with my son, and where does this whole story fit in with his presentation. **Talking like that in a white community there's going to be consequences. People are going to find out--not trying to scare you, but you need to be aware. Keep yourself alert in social situations. It's good you learn about activism, social justice, critical consciousness. [that's my own aside] If you're going to talk like that there's going to be consequences. You need to be aware, and as a parent I have to make sure you know--understand what you're learning--as you're curious, [epistemological curiosity, Freire 1970]; their quest for knowledge…epistemological curiosity that's what we call it.

- Wife comes back up here again, and starts talking again about going back to Guam. Opportunities are here, but you have to deal with the "cultural diversity". You have to deal with a mix of white folk. On Guam we have racism too, but its brown-on-brown [white/haole as minority in Pacific Islands]. Our island versus everyone else outside the island; village to village; chamorros and filipino, chamorros to micronesians, chamorros to haoles…everyone against haoles. Its different when

REFORMING

- 220516_002: 051622 PhD Field Notes. Point is, then my middle school daughter started asking about bullying.

- searching for your identity [researcher de-linking, re-thinking, and with this framework learning to re-link to new culture of military with fresh perspective]

- protest challenging the anti-CRT legislation

- 220505_006: 050522 PhD Field Notes. Navigating cultural identities. My identity in mixed company with others to maintain social capital.

- 220505_011: 050522 PhD Field Notes. You won it, specifically meaning that…they won the confederacy, they won the Nation in the Revolution; the land from the Mexicans, but now

TRANSFORMING

- 220523_002: 052322 PhD field Notes.
- Intercultural Translation Zone; Teacher education a space for intercultural translation
- That space for learning and creating a common language of meaning-making between the two for success; there is that bond of teacher education; hence, the PhD in teaching, learning and culture and the opportunity for both of these individuals to communicate, create meaning, shared meaning, and understand each other for the success of an organization, and create social transformation

- 220506_001: 050622 PhD Field Notes. Jahari's Window. Creating a space for intercultural translation zone I'm claiming "Roque's Window of Knowledge". Similar to Johari's Window where's the open self, hidden self, the blind self, and the unknown self. In this case that knowledge, that window between {ecosystems}, remember these sub-
you're at the top of that hierarchy. That white man in the way back, invisible, far away the invisible hand of Adam Smith.

he ended up in a circle with a bunch of shitkickers pounding away at his face

learned about the historic memory of this one corner downtown, where a young black man was hung for sleeping with a white woman.

Although well meant, well intended, protecting the castle.

An example is the Tailwind issue, "not worried about it". With CC, it was, "what do we need to do? What are your recommendations?" Well, processes, SOPs the facilitate problem-solving issues with tenants we have.

The same system that the manager was setting up with admin, communication, and leadership, and pre-mutiny/pre-Boss' Day…because the Ops Manager was accustomed to being the head honcho influencing things, manipulated the situation and created—where everyone's being a victim to that.

I always have reoccurring things all the time, plus things that pop up.

When HR told me to write her up for being insubordinate; HR was recommending since I was doing everything textbook, and I knew what I was doing, said LG--the HRG, not KR.

with the diversification movement happening and the outspoken far right-supremacist-alt right movement; the media coverage during the course of this study, and those observations and patterns there's resistance to minority diversification—has to be mandated, statutorily--city, state, local--share in the economy of all. We all need resources to function and participate in this democracy, and self-determination at the center; it doesn't matter if you're left or right--the purpose of this study is to identify that path forward; to create intercultural translation zones amongst those different cultural groups. When I say, "you won it, now you have to share it…okay, you won it, you have it, now you have a responsibility to share it, and we all have a say in that direction—hence the civic engagement."

I understand this culture of harmony that you're creating.

ecosystems that we were talking about between different cultural groups. Instead of that wall this bridge is actually a window—not a square window, but a circular window. It has 4 quarters.

…because the Ops Manager was accustomed to being the head honcho influencing things, manipulated the situation and created—where everyone's being a victim to that.

I always have reoccurring things all the time, plus things that pop up.

When HR told me to write her up for being insubordinate; HR was recommending since I was doing everything textbook, and I knew what I was doing, said LG--the HRG, not KR.

with the diversification movement happening and the outspoken far right-supremacist-alt right movement; the media coverage during the course of this study, and those observations and patterns there's resistance to minority diversification—has to be mandated, statutorily--city, state, local--share in the economy of all. We all need resources to function and participate in this democracy, and self-determination at the center; it doesn't matter if you're left or right--the purpose of this study is to identify that path forward; to create intercultural translation zones amongst those different cultural groups. When I say, "you won it, now you have to share it…okay, you won it, you have it, now you have a responsibility to share it, and we all have a say in that direction—hence the civic engagement."

I understand this culture of harmony that you're creating.

Yes, there's an open, and a hidden and a blind, and unknown; but its from The Others perspective. This comes from my reading this morning in John, The Gospel. How Saul is used by Jesus, and this speaks to the Catholic faith identity of the researcher, how Saul is sent to Jerusalem to round up believers of Christ, and bound them. Jesus goes to one of the Apostles, and he says'…"go see this guy Saul, he's there." The Apostles said, "we heard about this guy and he wants to persecute everyone who believes in you. You want to go to him? He said, "yeah, he's struggling right now. He's a believer. I'm gonna' make him a tool, and he needs you to go to him and tell him I sent you. He's gonna' be a tool for conversion, and believing in Christ. He's gonna' claim Christ, and he's gonna' suffer the same pain he's out persecuting everybody for. People are going to see this, and believe even more. What this guy will go through after being converted."

That's my paraphrase of the reading, my
interpretation as well. The Apostle goes to him, puts his hand on him and says, "hey... Jesus sent me, I'm here. I heard you saw him on the side of the road. He's here for you. Saul, at the moment, is blind; and literally, the scales fall off his eyelids, and he sees again.

That blindness of the individual is a specific dimension in the perspective, related to Rossatto's perspective on Optimism; the blind optimism that comes from the Critical Consciousness Chart, that he created with his dissertation. To take away that "blindness of knowing the other", Johari's Window is more about you and how your perspective is to the world—the window pane to the world. Things that you want. Things that you know. Things you want people to see—the open self. Things you want to keep hidden from the world, and hidden from other people. Then, from your perspective things you are blind to, but other people see. Then, from your perspective and others its what is unknown. The four quadrants.

In Roque's Window of meta-Knowing The Other...in the open sense its what the Other wants you to know about them creates understanding. What The Other wants me to know about them,
What the Other doesn't want me to know because they keep it hidden. Then what the Other, we know similar to the unknown, what the Other doesn't know, I don't know ("you don't know what you don't know" - Kcagle, CM-CoK/FB post), but most importantly it's the blind dimension. Here in the blind dimension, its what the Other is blind to—about who I am, and what I know. Focusing on that "blindness" requires us to help the Other understand who we are, as minorities in a dominant space, that Other is blind to what we know. They don't know what we know. We have to share with them what we know. [+ you won, now you share—+—we share what we know]—and find those allies. Find those allies. This window pane acts as a tool, a tool to understanding different cultures.

220506_002: PhD Field notes continued. This Roque's Window of Knowing The Other, as an intercultural translation zone. This perspective framework helps build trust. Requires risk, but works vice-versa, not only for the other to understand, Me and my group, but for me to understand the other's group as well. [other perspective checking]
Because what we have now, everybody putting everything out there...and everybody divisive. How do we see through these walls? Those walls aren't walls. They're window panes to the Other's world—ecosystems, sub-ecosystems, and one big meta-ecosystem. The more we share about practices, beliefs, there's always going to be differences. The way forward is that mutual understanding grounded in frameworks of mediation-inafamaolek, with respect, everyone has their own mediated framework to make sense of the world.

Mamahlao: emotional

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>220516_001: 051622 Phd Field Notes.</td>
<td>220505_005: 050522 PhD Field Notes. Once again, the private ethics become public. The example of my son, private conversations leaking in the public and he gets in trouble (raa3), what happens?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mummering under his breath</td>
<td>I have to explain to him the different spheres; that's important for DML because even in this sharing of me on social media about the historical background and significance of Cinco de Mayo, which has taken over public memory just to be a party. It's really about remembering that Civil War connection, but for me—as someone who is in this position in rural Texas; if I were to post something like that, well that would put me in with a bunch of other people that necessarily—it's not good</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My concern was that he was being bullied, but after today when I brought it up to him.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Today, after seeing the way the CC was distant from me, from public, and the way LI, PG, LS were just watching me stand next to JP.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>So we can go pass this, but it continues to perpetuate itself, and with the budget function being taken away...here I am, going up for a promotion and these responsibilities being taken away.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
perpetuated by you or its being done under you and you don’t know it, by your underlings.

* This passive-aggressive bullying military commando style barking orders at people that…meetings to disenfranchise a manager, disempower, disassembly of his division; to pretend that the resources are being given when they're really not.

* For the most part they think about MW, but really thinking about their own power and influence to run things there, and they just don’t have total capabilities—even though they're good and able to pull it off—if they don't have the expertise, know what they're doing…they have expertise in other places, and we could learn from that and share.

* She was going to move, not by being forced…’cause they know that's wrong what they did to her…and KH, making her cry all the time, and moving her in the off-site position, as part of the plan, bragged about it all the time…the antics and the drama between the ageism exhibited by the Ops Manager, persistently engaged in an ineffective negative manner resulting in the Executive Asst. crying on several occasions…many witnesses, including staff on the third floor.

* We just write it off as her being emotional. Its those triggers that are done by the abuse. The verbal abuse, the psychological abuse. That's the passive-aggressiveness of it. The verbal abuse, the whispering, the social isolation, the social ostracization, the group-think that is rewarded, and anyone divergent from that excluded. So not inclusive, not true diversity from the outside.

for my business. Not good for the entity I work for. I have to make that decision to say, "ok, who can I share it with that is private--it’s a private conversation--not going to be public." Everybody puts things public. Part of the problem we need to recognize, and find a solution is that…what the private ethics were—and I say this at the very beginning of my literature review, is that private ethics are becoming now public ethics. Those private sentiments; people's ideas, belief, and culture that's practiced behind close doors and in closed communities, now everybody knows because the private has become public. [Tai-mamahlo]

* I wanted to see if there was an opening for that cognitive decline is being take advantage of, or was he making a cognizant decision--critically aware decision about his actions and his involvement in the political machinations of the organization that appear to exclude a minority--in an organization that has minorities, even though there are minorities in the management structure, to the third floor, but also the Operations Manager claims Mexican descent--speaks no Spanish, or aside from being married to a Mexican.

* Was he being bullied or was it him?

* I'm still here reflecting…actual remember to recall the conversation, and I know what I felt and what I've been through…tonight, thinking--bringing it up to my wife…with everything added up plus him and the whole city attorney-aviation/pender?/you
Same thing with the DBE program. On the outside, but the core its not. That's the violation. FAA-wise, EEO, the obstacles and challenges created by these programs, and discriminations, and these ideas, actions, and words…they created a system that systematically, a program, a form of thought and culture that systematically disassembled the business division around the DBELO, and transferred that to another person; excluded the DBELO from these meetings where these finances are being kept and those deals are being worked out--took all that function away from the DBELO/The Business Manager to the trusted Operations Manager who is the source of the bullying and manipulation at the very start of it all.

**Chenchule**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>220516_001: 051622 PhD Field Notes.</td>
<td>220516_002: 051622 PhD Field Notes</td>
<td>220516_002: 051622 PhD Field Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• going through special session</td>
<td>• I started sharing with him the history of Texas, and the Mexicans and why there's so much tension with Mexicans in Texas and white people. It used to be part of Tejas, and all the western territory Then, I started getting into this idea of incorporation and un-incorporation that define the people of Guam as a non-self governing people--makes us unincorporated.</td>
<td>• why we have to get involved to help change all that. I want them to be curious. I want to share with them the realities of the world. I give them a blessing. I'm proud of them for asking those questions. [link to method--inquiry based analysis] Being curious, and they're learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>220505_001: 050522 PhD Field notes.</td>
<td>220505_001: 050522 PhD Field notes.</td>
<td>220505_001: 050522 PhD Field notes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In other ways, in terms of facilitating the economic development and the business development of the community across different communities.</td>
<td>• Executive Director, yesterday staff meeting in discussing City Attorney Pender (African American, young female) said, &quot;especially her…we're already gonna' hear it, but</td>
<td>• I was sharing with my son about consequences--Dr. Martin Luther King, he needed white people to help, and he died pushing that cause. Dr. Martin Luther King, Malcom X, Ghandi…JFK, and on</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
coming from her--when she's right, she just really-really keeps on, and we're not speaking terms.

- When discussing issues with him, he gets the management process.
- The previous Accounting Specialist doing budget for GRK, PG, she resigned--2 weeks notice after doing it questionably after requesting for vacation...and then getting vacation approved two weeks, and the giving a letter of resignation.
- KR apparently went, in my communications with her, confidential as an employee, went to the HR Director and told them I was going to be sending documents, asking her to transfer documents to the new HRG outlining my pay disparity and request for compensation after my first year.
- As much as it seems, if there's no documented record of me, serving, and doing this commendable service, recognizing, or a letter saying we're going to get you these resources; a commitment that we're going to get you the resources; communication is going to be effective, and I've asked for a raise.
- They've done it to Kandy..., the Executive Secretary by asking us to--MW and JP; MW, JP, KH...all exhibiting the same discourse patterns about KH; the same thing with PG and JP and that whole situation...MW exhibiting the same discourse patterns as JP.
- I thought MW was being manipulated, I was

Guam a man named Angel Santos. You know him? You don't know him? Look him up. They call him Anghet--Chamorro activist. I knew him, worked alongside him, worked with him and his people--even buried him. He challenged the system, and it killed him.

- 220505_008: 050522 PhD Field Notes. Identifying interests amongst those platitudes, sub-ecosystems.
- 220505_001: 050522 PhD Field notes.
- I'm in this capacity where I'm facilitating, I'm coordinating, I'm planning, I'm organizing, I'm coordinating, reporting, budgeting. The role that I'm at, at the airport, the researcher; I'm a part of that social change process, including my relationships that are extending to the political realm, to turn Texas blue--not purple, blue. Specifically, here in Bell County with LN and that relationship--going from airport extending into political, and how recruiting this Local IQ firm that work in aviation, even KWTX--talking with them.

[Rbordallos corruption case involving Chenchule x bribes]

- Between the phd, parents, kids, wife--overnights, people sick, switching the cars/vehicles; meeting with different partners helping their interests along, being involved in the community, business development--I'm out.
concerned because of cognitive decline.
- I was talking to him, watching over all looking on to see, "what's going to happen?".
- He finds that I know what I'm talking about in previous conversations.
- He was trying to remember what it was about, he said its between them two.

Che'lu

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>220516_001: 051622 Phd Field Notes.</td>
<td>I was only speaking casually to him, and there was a whole slew of people there: MW, Alvin next to them, CC was there--stayed distant from me, didn't walk with me to carry the stuff but met me in the elevator; doesn't respond to my phone calls, he express concerns that I'm not being taken seriously.</td>
<td>220505_002: 050522 PhD Field Notes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>stabbing of a young Mexican boy in high school-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Getting her to move from the Accounting Specialist position to the Office Assistant, to apply for that to make room for PG.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Intercultural Translation Zone. That relationship we have with CC, he creates that space of understanding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any ideas that are contrary to that, or any person who is divergent in their thinking, or different in their cultural ways…they attack, and they attack each other. It’s a cannibalization.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Patgon

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>220428_001: 042822 Phd Field Notes.</td>
<td>MW tried to make it right by having a pow-wow with her…she came and told him, she wanted the job after all.</td>
<td>220428_001: 042822 Phd Field Notes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching them about government, and how things get reported, and the racial dynamics.</td>
<td>The Executive Director of Aviation called me a foreigner, literally in talking about the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
family drama that happens in the organization; specifically between the Ops Manager and myself there's always a little in-fighting and..."in American families it's like that, I don't know about foreign families...". I shared with him, "even in foreign families we have in-fighting too."

220505_010: 050522 PhD Field Notes. In reference to my travel through Georgetown, Belton, Williamson, Bell County--confederate soldier out front, the protests that have happen during the course of this study; the observations, the signage, the red star, confederacy, all public signage red; engrained in the public memory; nothing downtown about no cinco de mayo--what we choose to forget.

- 220516_001: 051622 Phd Field Notes.
  - Me sharing with him about my experiences growing up in a white community.
  - dominant white communities my son's going to these schools
  - want him to be aware of how to live and function
  - have a life in these communities that are white

- 220516_002: 051622 PhD Field Notes.
  - Point is, then help the kids understand what to do in a bullying situation in predominantly white communities. [exist as a privileged structure for any culture]
  - If you're being physically attacked when they say bad racist things to you--but if its coming with a physical attempt to create
going to believe you. Not everybody is going to feel the same way as you. To them you're being disrespectful. The word gets out. Most of the people are going to clap for you, but people go out and go out into their world…and, most of the community is white, most of that classroom was white, your teachers white, your principal's white. Your principal's boss--the Superintendent is white. The Superintendent's boss--the Council, ISD…they're white…and they're elected by white people. That's the way democracy works--majority rules. There's not enough minorities around here, and not just this small little town. It's the whole Central Texas region. It's the whole state, it's most of the Nation. Who might have a problem with what you're saying and your ideas--no matter how respectful your language is and your intentions are, harm for your life. You fear for your life. Then, you have permission to defend yourself, but you have to make sure people know so you can protect yourself [raa-middle school/jr high-prince george VA county bullying incident--reports to history teacher to avoid frame of blame from white male aggressor]. Predict its going to come; do your best to prevent it; and protect yourself when it does happen.

IMF Color Code

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respectful</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>032522</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[making sausage]: ExDir AvN managing IBCC relationship-planning, strategizing, assessing outcomes of behavior for hostility</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Membrane</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>032522</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture of Aviation x Culture of Political Economy; innovation blinds wisdom of experience; individual groups struggling to navigate community transformation with over dependance on</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Conversation with son: identity construction; cultural values for perspective in emotional-social control…Inafa'maolek</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
innovation/tech. Role of researcher as bridge.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mamahlao, emotional</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Transforming cultural relations: intercultural translation zone; Innovation Black Chamber x GRK Admin (Executive Director White Anglo Saxon over 60; rural smalltown TX culture x urban killeen culture; making meaning at DBE workshop with participants in understanding; supported by FAA civil rights.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chenchuld</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DBE training and workshop: Public memory triggered by socio-historical context of consultant using discourse of native/indigenous and black slaves culture clash--involuntary immigrants in decolonial context.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Che'Tu</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Role of researcher to follow and observe participants leading the way at GRK; family; &quot;art of doing nothing&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>patgon</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>032122PhDFieldNotes-Observation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0321</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Observations Email-w/Interview Coordination Dates; offer to continue focus group with individual interviews during questioning.

"making the sausage": communications strategic sharing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>022322FieldNotes-Observation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Respetu</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Mung/ne</strong></th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Risk of white perspective:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Rationalize: economic and social impact of researcher in professional environment, to keep perspective, role of faith/religion; inafa'inaolek systems.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>forgetting ones place</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic duties/opportunity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>available to all, not all</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>heard/seen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Mamahlao; emotional</strong></th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• response of m/blk audience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>elected official, 50+...&quot;live it&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apologetic post event with</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>family and reflection:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>internalization of colonizer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>by researcher framework</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>influences processing of</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>observations and field</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>experiences as dissertation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>research implementation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fresh on conscious of</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>researcher, in writing mode.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[phone call with LN-254f].</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[delink-rethink-relink]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Chenchule</strong></th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economic development training</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question from audience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(minority f-FL): SBE for</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>minority…Speaker: all minority/female equal, opportunity for all diversity for family and community</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
16:42--TRANSCRIPTION BEGINS

JJ: roque so…frame that, what problem are we talking about? The civic engagement, or lack of, or the way the media plays a role in forming or framing issues?

Raa: yes, yes, exactly.

JJ: that's the short of it, how the media frames certain topics. How they show their biases. You know if you look at fox news and cnn…they're the competing democratic-republican platform news outlets. You know you can hear the same issue from both stations framed in a completely different way. Is that, is that, am I on the right thread here, or…

Raa: yeah sure, what are your thoughts Camillo?

CJ: So I guess, you asked how do we know when there's a problem right? How do we identify that there's a problem.

Raa: yeah

Cj: to me, its just public input right. Public backlash. The way the masses are reacting to an issue. That's the way I would see that there's an issue because they've…touching on what Jeremy said, those two stations that are both on the extreme part of the spectrum right. So then, there's a public outcry from either end, whether it’s the far right or far left. And we see that there's an issue right. But what we don't take into consideration is that perhaps these media outlets are the ones creating the issues if that makes sense.

Raa: so media framing and public outcry, that's when we know the problem exists.

JJ: you can also say the proliferation of bias media reporting, you know, al the way from traditional television to social media with misinformation. I think for me is where the red flags pop up is the mediums in which they're used to disseminate their message. I mean I got my kids looking at my youtube and political ads come up, and they're like--"cause I watch political ads and they're seeing this stuff and then I get questioned from my kids…"like oh, why are they saying this guy does bad things? Or this woman did this? I mean at their age, but they're also targeting me. The advertisements.

Raa: Camillo, anything on that?
CJ: he said it perfectly. We tend to think that the media only effects us right. Its only us. Its our youtube account. And its targeted for us, but then there's collateral damage you can say when it comes to other members of the public that don't outcry, that don't have a voice just yet. You know what I mean, so there's always going to be this sort of fallout for this message that the media is trying to put out there. And what Jeremy said, it’s the kids, those are the ones getting--those are the ones getting effected by these messages. by this alternative facts--the misinformation that's out there. That's another issues, that another way we can see that there's an issue coming up 'cause kids shouldn't be asking about political ads, kids should be asking about other things--cartoons, sports, and things like that, I guess, what Jeremy said.

Raa: next question, how do you contribute effectively to solving that problem?

JJ: I don't think I personally do anything to solve the problem other than complaining or vent, but I think to answer your question--what you're driving at is, I mean I do all my fact checks. I look for my own information. If there's a topic of interest for me I go an search multiple references. I do my homework on it. By and large most people don't. I mean, I'm not tackling the issue of misinformation directly any way of my daily life. I don't take it upon myself to inform people that I think are misinform. Unless its in general conversation. I think that's the larger problem, just the empathy of people not giving a crap. Just accepting it as a daily part of our lives.

CJ: that's a really tough nut to crack sir. To crack that problem, and it would involve a lot of effort and just completely switch our way of thinking . How we view information and how we view the media, and how we view even ethics at a certain point. At this point its all about, its not really about getting accurate information out there. Its about being the first to quote-unquote break a story. Its about getting the most likes. Its about getting the most views. Its about rallying up people the most. And in my opinion that's just not how as a society--we should be at this point. But like Jeremy said, we are unfortunately at this point learning how to tackle it. But instead learning how to coexist with it. That might be a different approach to solving this issue. 

22: 52

JJ: …there's not much more you can do without tremendous amount of resources, and community building--I guess. Coalition building to some extent.

Raa: what prevents you from doing this, or doing these actions all the time to do something about it?

CJ: Its exhausting. It would be exhausting I guess you could say. There's just so much information out there. So much media, so many things that aren't proven and can't be proven, and it would be completely exhausting. That’s the way I see it.

JJ: I would say that there is not personal motivation to do it. At the extent that it needs to be done correctly. Don't have the bandwidth, time, money, or resources to tackle it. I think at the self level I'm aware that there's a problem. I'm aware that there's issues with media, but for me its just where do you prioritize your time. You have all these other excuses or reasons…I'm a dad, I got kids, I got a job. I got my own hobbies, and volunteer stuff. I think a lot of has to do with I understand the harm. I understand the potential, what it could do in the long term, but, its never been appropriately addressed by anybody. Everyone just thinks they lose credibility in the media. And for them that’s fine.

CJ: It takes resources when, not necessarily monetary. It takes time. It takes a lot of effort. It takes a lot of getting beat up, cause nobody wants to be the guy that is correcting everybody all the time. [media as bully] The most uncomfortable person in the room is the guy who is always right. So he, there's a litany of things that would prevent someone from doing that. If there were going to do it they would have to do it for the sheer desire to want to tackle that issue.

Raa: do you know anybody who is frequently able to solve the problem and overcome those barriers? If you think about examples in your community, your surroundings? Or your own personal experience? What behaviors, practices made that success possible?
J: I'll draw from something that our city government has done well. I remember I used to scream at the top of my lungs... look, we're taking body shot after body shot of misinformation from different media sources in town. And I remember I used to tell the then City Manager, and the current one... we gotta get our message out. I like to think, personally, is that this current City Manager went out with a massive propaganda campaign on all the issues, on all the great things the city's doing, and it works. I got to hand it to the city, the way that they're handling their issues... they do a 5 in 5. Those are small ways that you can correct the issues. We all work in government. We've all seen the ugly and the good, and most people think about government doing only the ugly. They also need to be corrected, and I think a little bit of that can be a successful model for anybody. I do that in my personal organization that I work now, a non-profit. We go out there, and we do stories and stuff and try to explain, and make our pitch. Set the facts straight on issues.

CJ: ... little victories, they... you eat the elephant one bit at a time right. So if you have a campaign to go out there and talk about not the bad, but the good it could help combat the negativity that’s out there. The misinformation, just the bad press. We've all worked for the City, and we've seen some shifts from how the message is put out there. Some shifts toward the positive, and some shifts toward the negative but actually taking those steps [shifting terrain, tectonic plates moving] is a really big step. How many people just lay down and take it. How many people used to do that. How many people still do that, and its not unique to El Paso. Its unique to our society.

Raa: do you have any ideas that would work, given our discussion so far to help solve the problem? That problem of media framing and public outcry.

CJ: I think going back to your whole field of study Roque, I think we need to endoctrine our kids maybe, not necessarily at the Elementary level but the high school level as to the importance of civic engagement and government roles. But not only that, but how the media is not reality. I have a teacher friend of mine who is completely done and doesn't want to teach anymore because he goes around and asks all his kids what you want to do when they grow up... and all of them say they want to be tick tock stars... I want to be you-tubers. Nobody wants to be doctors anymore, lawyers, they don't want to be President. They are more focused on that aspect of the media. Not necessarily new, but more focused on their phone, and just entertainment. They see that people are doing dances and lip syncing for millions of dollars... and that's the easy way out for them. So if there was a way we could possibly teach them real world consequences of reality, the separation between media and real life [representation; spectacle]... I think that would start to address the issue so that later on once they reach the real world there won't be so much of a shock, and they won't be so apathetic to what's going on around them.

J: another personal experience of mine just recently, was I had received a $200,000 grant for CDC to target misinformation in the El Paso region around COVID. We spend probably around $80K on media, direct targeting, door to door, prima doras, and what we did realize is that these people are not the movable middle of individuals that wanted to be vaccinated. They were the 5-7% that were going to be hardliners, and that was their choice. And if you look at the statistics today on COVID, we still have that small percentage of people that are not ever going to get the vaccine because they do not trust the sources of media information that they are receiving. The political rhetoric they are receiving from people, ex-Presidents and what not. Has convinced them that COVID is wrong. That there's tracking devices. It'll get you sick, it gives you the virus. And what it made me realize, and I may be cynical coming into this... is that I am not their trusted communicator. I'm not the person they trust that's going to bring them information, to correct them. The only thing they're going to do is find it by themselves, by those credible people that they listen to... changes their mind, and I think that's sad to see. I think it ties into Milo's description of teachers dealing with students that only want to be TikTok. I have to limit my children on YouTube. My daughter sits there and does faces and stuff, that's what their culture has become. They're distracted. They don't care about the issues. They care about the 30 second clips in front of their small screens. That they hold in their hand all day.

Raa: what needs to be done to make it happen? Who do we bring in for volunteers?

J: We start with people that are trusted in the community, organizations that are credible that people trust. Got to bring in decision makers, grass roots and grass tops.

CJ: you need to bring in the people that are influential. We need to get in the grass roots and grass tops, people that are policy makers. You need to bring in people in the media, but the thing is we all have to be on the same page. We all have to realize, first off, that there is an issue. And then attempt to fix it. That's the most difficult part, seeing.
showing people that there is a problem. You got to take a look at the elephant by taking a step back. A lot of people don't see this as an issue. All they see is their bottom line, and all they see is their agenda. So in order to tackle it, we first need to let them know that there is an issue. Then bring them all on board, and see how we can address it.

Raa: who else needs to be involved?

JJ: the industry of media, and journalist. Those type of people have to be involved because the industry is not going to change by itself. Its not going to do it by any outside group coming and telling them that they are wrong. Because they sell ads. That's how everyone gets paid.

CJ: people from the community. People don't want to hear somebody, who is not a member of the community, that they're wrong. Nobody wants to hear that. So we need people who have roots here. Who are steeples of the community being the ones that need to step it up.

JJ: you also need motivation and people willing to see change.

In analysis, the notions of remembering and forgetting in public memory thought do not emerge. Conversely, the identification of discourse patterns representing value systems and institutional beliefs are significantly patterned. Taking this analysis, further the next step turns to coding with IMF.

Civic and media practices are categorized as notions of Critical Consciousness that contribute to the identification of patterns of PD behaviors in contextual relation to principles of IMF: CONFORMING-delinking; REFORMING-rethinking; TRANSFORMING-relinking practices for PD behaviors.

II. IMF Color Code

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respectful</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>learning about this community.</td>
<td>articulation. One person told me its difficult for me to be in a standing crowd here...because my English is not the best in that group setting, but if they were to go to my group setting which is Islanders they would feel out of place because their language barrier is not--it's the opposite effect.</td>
<td>articulation. One person told me its difficult for me to be in a standing crowd here...because my English is not the best in that group setting, but if they were to go to my group setting which is Islanders they would feel out of place because their language barrier is not--it's the opposite effect.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>people knowing who I am. Wanting to know about me.</td>
<td></td>
<td>running for office</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>looking for that one position that the community says, I am fit for...to be elected on.</td>
<td>talking about it and coming to a consensus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 years serving our great Nation.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I do know what's going on.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>have longer standing.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mindfulness</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Utilizing…understanding the words, how do use it.</td>
<td>talking to community leaders.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

468
Understanding the English language,
• presenting evidence
• Using the words, say no to jail.
• supporting our own community,
• protecting our own interests

The City Council meeting…watching it, at time participating in it.
• defining as, having the ability to process

CONFORMING | REFORMING | TRANSFORMING
---|---|---
• getting my name out there.
• talking to the folks,
• struggling on this beautiful Island.
• communicating to one another.
• trying to understand the residences
• not providing me with facts.
• going to get expensive.
• Since then I wanted to see more changes in our city because the citizens are looking at changes.
• taking care of our community
• coming to Jesus…but its more of awakening.
• learning a lot about MySpace.
• meeting people that is what they call "gray area"
• Circumventing or trying to get around the rule.
• voting process. Vote no for the jail. That’s what their advertisement would be called, to sway.
• Not having the opportunity to live life to its fullest

Mamahlao;
emotional

CONFORMING | REFORMING
---|---
• going to raise your taxes so don't vote for it
• the marketing of it.
• selling point
• So learning that, getting--after retiring into the political world (if you were to say), running for office…I had to mind my professionalism, and quality of life. My p’s and q’s.
• voting record
• today where I’m actually living my life with as much opportunity that is there.
• trying to go ahead and get that to where the individual understand what a voter--your vote means.
• Voting me, you are hiring me.

Chenchule

CONFORMING | REFORMING | TRANSFORMING
---|---|---
offering my experiences and journeys to other islanders, and anybody who comes over and says, "hey, this is what I'd like to do…what's your thoughts?" Yeah. I'll provide it. Its sharing that information so they can either adjust how one's own lifestyle is… or take exactly what I've gone through, and put it part of their life so it doesn't happen to oneself; or take it so it can be achieved at a higher level.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Che'lu</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>getting the news, and reporting</td>
<td>mind-set changing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Make sure you have enough funding to pay for the roof over your head</td>
<td>walk, my stance, or just my outlook.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>taking care of the family, paying bills, Living paycheck to paycheck</td>
<td>understanding how they were developing what they would call the internet.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>getting out</td>
<td>Saying hello, learning how to talk to tourism.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>developing my personal portfolio</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Am I still looking at continuing serving the community?</td>
<td>bettering my self</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>going to college. Maybe you might want to think about going into the military. So, I chose the military. One thing I knew, I'm a trouble-maker in my youth. So, I needed to get the discipline if I am going to a different environment. understanding the residences and what they are going through, and understanding how would I benefit from helping that group of residents. Be it challenges, issues, or just being present for whatever they need, events democrat hiding behind a republican name. going back to the consumer or the residents. You bring a challenge to me</td>
<td>continuing serving the community volunteering.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patgon</td>
<td>working grave yard shift.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Going to high school, seeing my friends, wanting to go to college or going into the military…wanting to do something bigger and better.</td>
<td>What would it be like if I could provide mentorship to my kids' friends and their families, more so than it is providing my experience to them.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
if homes are going up in a small community.

220427_001: 042722 Phd Field Notes, interview LN--PhD Study Interview

IMF Color Code

Respetu

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>core values you formulate what it means because they've already done all the other work telling you what it is, my parent's legacy [remembering]…</td>
<td>Wearing your hair</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mng'anye

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>That's what's going to happen there.</td>
<td>make me very aware of my surroundings.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>honoring my parents.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mamahlao; emotional

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>behind the scenes making it up the them--was marrying this guy.</td>
<td>trying to influence them to lead us to believe, what they're trying to get us to believe that,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>being accountable for your actions going to happen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>is little white old ladies were going to be calling the police because they hear stuff outside…they were too busy because people were outside, fighting or there was no police officer because people didn't back the blue. That kind of thing is propaganda. We were told back in 1979, don't go down there that's where they sold slaves. So, we would see this market house, that symbol of what happen to our ancestors [public memory-remembering-identify-sense/meaning of space-intercultural translation zone]--most black people didn't go.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
downtown. They didn't do anything downtown because of that symbol.
- Whatever it is that their showing, you should be fearful.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chenchule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>CONFORMING</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- LN: well for the media it sells stories. It keeps them going, it keeps-- and whether its good or bad, it sells stories.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- They were talking about &quot;back the blue&quot; for instance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Back the Blue…the republican party used that slogan--back the blue…in their marketing through social media, and TV and ads</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Che'lu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>CONFORMING</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- That was in 2020. I was running for office, and I was asked, &quot;why won't I say, that I back the blue?&quot;; of course I back the blue…Ii believe in law and order</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- They even use signs and symbols showing if you need help.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Patgon</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>CONFORMING</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- As a threat, and I'm looking at my son, I remember looking at him and thinking...&quot;he could be Treyvon Martin&quot;.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• being productive citizens of these United States.

• difference that I could see, not just everybody else.

• And that right there, knowing that people would see my son and think he was a threat...immediately really push me into putting my son even more so, in the limelight of--things, so people could meet him--people that weren't black.

• He's been exposed to those type of things in hoping with that...I hope it has altered someone's attitude about young black men.

Respetu

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PhD Study-Interview-SD 2022-04-13 Via TEAMS</td>
<td>PhD Study-Interview-SD 2022-04-13 Via TEAMS</td>
<td>For my parents to stop working.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• not really recommending solutions</td>
<td>• For my parents to stop working.</td>
<td>• doing what is true, and honest, and kind, and compassion to others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Without fully understanding the truth because they receive information through the feed of their members</td>
<td>• back in the Philippines, believe it our not I was--timid, hard to express my thought because of the higher-up...the hierarchy. In terms of you always have to respect your elders</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• walking on egg shells</td>
<td>• Here in the United States I could proudly say I did everything on my own hard work--didn't ask for favors, didn't ask</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• He sat there Tuesday <em>listening to us</em> telling him all of that--with specific examples, and did not tell us that the Chief is interviewing. Then he goes on in his email to say I've known for several days; however, I didn't think the local media would be asking questions about it so soon.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• having that open line between Council, department heads/directors is beneficial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• his interest are more self-centered and greedy. I still believe that most of society is not like that, and most of society makes sure we are improving everything for everyone.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• doing a pretty good job of getting the message across that they want.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• stopping a project. Just completely stopping &quot;progress&quot; from happening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I never wanted to be put in that <em>compromising situation</em> where I would test my morals and values for the sake of my child or my wife.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>051022 PhD Interview-WC2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• From there I was <em>minding my behavior</em>, and then when I got to FD there was a forced conformance, in my opinion, not by the school. But because of my own intrinsic motivation to please my father and do well for my family. I was <em>coming into FD</em> as that poor local</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>051022 PhD Interview-WC2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• I was <em>challenging him</em>, not on how he carried himself, but on the fact that he was disconnected. His approach to governance was through his lens, and his lens only. I had very very fundamental differences with that. <em>They were moving to remove him</em>. Sort of like a recall, if not impeachment by the board for misconduct, etc. I was not a big part of that. I don't believe in that shit. He was voted in, but they actively went after him, and he resigned. So Ray Tenorio and the Student Body insisted that I feel the</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>042722 PhD Study PG Interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• I do not have a college degree, but what I have is basically OJT. Very hard working, dedicated--every job I ever held, which isn't much. I've always risen to Senior Management. A lot of that is because of my <em>dedication</em>. Got</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
boy--if you want to break out the violin. I cut my long hair short, sat towards the front. Realized, that almost instantaneously that was not the prevailing culture there. The culture of discipline and focus was not the FD culture. At least when I first started. First of all I consider myself a very bad boy coming in from Untalan, given the experiences I had growing up. So to conform and cut my hair, sit in the front, and sit up right, and use nice language. That was a big stretch for me. I was willing to do that, and I did. I joined the Junior ROTC program, and the beast came out.

I was leaning over to this guy named Marcelo Artero. He said, "what did you do this summer?" I said, "I went to teen night and met this girl…showed him a picture, and he was like, "wow. She's really pretty." Then the boys in the back said, "who's that?!...Sirena, that bitch." That's it, that's when the vacancy. I was not interested in the position. By the way, right before that, Ray was running again. We finished our first term, and Ray was going to run for reelection. I wanted to be the President of the Student Government. I thought I had a bigger vision for the University, and I disagreed with his style of leadership as well. He's very autocratic. Very different from my style. I was announcing my intention to run for President, then my colleague at the time. Dr. Carmen Garrido, now, wanted Ray for personal reasons. She wanted the guys head on a fuckin platter. She was passionately moving to decapitate this guy. I basically said, okay, fuck it I'm not that interested in being President for that reason. Obviously you're a lot more passionate about the position than him, taking him down than I am, I'm chasing the position not the guy.

Anyway, they wanted me to serve as Student Regent. Back to the Student Regent, I didn't want it 'cause I didn't believe that you should concurrently hold two title concurrently. I thought it was disingenuous to the process. What those two positions were designed to do. One was Vice President of SGA, and the Student Regent had a different role. I interpreted that role. The way I did, sometimes in conflict. Despite the philosophic internal battle. They insisted that I take it, and I did. I wanted to--stuck around, and let somebody run, but they allowed me--I don't know if I ran for Student Regent. I think I did and got reelected. That's when I started to see--first of all, Student Government, I started do see the policy changes at that level. Because Ray was aggressive.

that from my mom and dad.

051022 PhD Interview-WC2

I don't know what M. Heath was--Caucasian. White. Definitely not Chamorro. That statement set off a fire ball in me. I became an influencer in great part because of that posture of the University, as made manifest through its CFO who is Caucasian. I had no regrets for it. All it did was empower me to feel like I could bring an entire institution to its knee, as a student regent and as a human being because it must be made to be sensitive to the needs of the people.

It wasn't until he turned his attention to the political world, where he was fighting corruption at the time. Alleged corruption. He was fighting for the rights of Indigenous people. He was fighting against the military establishment. All those things appealed to me.
Untalan boy came out. I said, "what the fuck did you say...ha?" Then the whole class froze. So, they had that pretty boy in the front who cut his hair short. Mama's boy, cute as fuck, fit but small. Then all of a sudden that conformed image of good catholic school boy was thrown out the window when this nasty ass guy from the village said, "what the fuck did you say?"

These guys were big. These were big fuckin' kids. I didn't give a shit. The point is I think that was kind of a moment for all of us as we started to--beginning of freshman year--to find out who in the fuck was who in the room. Who were the alphas, and who were the ponies? I didn't do that to do that. I did that in a very hasty reaction because my blood pressure went through the roof. Just talking about this girl I really liked.

- Without, what I would consider kissing ass or licking dick, and shit...I didn't even

He saw things I obviously didn't, and I was very prescient. I liked what we were doing. It was big stuff.
- What the fuck...I didn't say that to him, but that's how it felt. So bad. I was incensed by it. So incensed that that's how I started IFIL. I said fuck you in my head. Fuck you, and you're one man only decision. That is such an insensitive posture that I'm going to break it. I'm going to bend this institution to lick the floor of any man or woman who is suffering, who has been trounced upon so you are at their mercy. Not the other way around. That's how I look at it. So incensed bro.
- Being a genuine communicator. Being a genuine communicator when you talk to someone. I think that's largely why I am where I'm at. I can communicate because my conscious, my brotherly Christian--is clean. My ulterior motive is not there. I think that's what allowed me to come where I'm at in my political career. People say, Wil's good, he's clean. If he commits you got him. He's good for his word. He can execute on command. He doesn't look at it, and how he can fuck you over. He doesn't look at the dark side of that blade. That can come back to cut us in the future. That's not his style. If anything you have a soldier, a warrior for life on your side. You don't have to worry if he's going to cut your throat.
- As a result of that, I kept building and building in different political circles until I became my own person. [self actualize] Not just an operative in the shadow of a principal. I became my own principal. When I lost the last election, I assumed again the veil of an
know these guys. I just shut my mouth. I did really well in aptitude, and I was becoming physically fit, and disciplined--never gave lip, and I got promoted. Became the most decorated cadet at the end of my freshman year. I was the only to have won every possible ribbon you could in a single year that freshman year. That's when I realized, fuck, you can actually be something significant around here, and end up being the big man on campus.

- I do what I need to do, now. But that does not come naturally to me. Like it does operatives like CB. They walk around and engineer political character assassination of certain actors. My value is, a treasured value for me, as I teach my kids…to try and maintain that sense of--I want to call it integrity, but it's more a Christian-brotherly love integrity towards one another. That's how I look at it, to try operative because I was hired to be Chief of Staff, but in the forthcoming chapters I will assert myself again as my own principal in the next gubernatorial election. Either with the full intent to win--its always with the full intent to win, but either with a viable shot at Adelup, or simply playing the role of disrupter. So that my ideas can be translated, and brought into their agenda--the winning team's agenda.
and...as much as they hit me and hurt me, to try not to want to retaliate, with equal if not more vice. That's a new value that I picked up because I've seen it in my line of work.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ming'ne (propaganda model of DML critical consciousness)</th>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PhD Study-Interview-SD 2022-04-13 Via TEAMS</td>
<td>PhD Study-Interview-SD 2022-04-13 Via TEAMS</td>
<td>PhD Study-Interview-SD 2022-04-13 Via TEAMS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• my calling to be an educator, to be a teacher.</td>
<td>• “what am I going to do? I don’t know how to teach.”</td>
<td>• What kept me going was I appreciated my humble beginnings.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Looking for Filipino teachers, Chinese teachers.</td>
<td>• journey of teaching in the United States, they get push-back from implementing--what's supposed to be, effective programs.</td>
<td>• That has helped me to have the stamina, the resilience, not giving up, and the desire to fight for myself.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• &quot;America's looking for teachers you might want to take a look at it...&quot;; I did not receive it very well</td>
<td>• I don't think the sense of reasoning was correct.</td>
<td>• I can't just trust their first-hand communication. I always have to do my own research and investigation to find out...is that really true what they're saying about this-this-and that...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Racial profiling...yes. highly influenced by opinions coming from the Teacher Federation about, like the District-Central Office people, leaders like me and there are many others. We don't know what we're doing. We're doing it all wrong.</td>
<td>• They don't have the proper experience, and proper skill to be in such position--based on my direct experience with their decision making.</td>
<td>• With that privilege I take it to heart that its my responsibility to hold critical conversations, to hold constructive thinking.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• meaning the Federation is having somebody come in from the outside do the training, and EPISD is not investing correctly.</td>
<td>• much negativity coming from them.</td>
<td>• To hold critical consciousness. To implement that. To use the right words in order to communicate correctly, and provide feedback. To help think outside of the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• they're going to be on you Complaints from their members without investigating thoroughly</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• some groups of people in their members to--who are not performing.

• constraints of this only what they see.

Just how human we are. How we can be swayed by images and words. By different sounds. To me, all that proves is that people can be swayed. People's morals, people's ethics, people's voting history.

PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413

• I saw the look on his face, and I know he does this thing...even there on the dais. When you have more observations to do, this is what I want you to observe. I had someone point this out to me.

When we're in the midst of a discussion, and it comes time for me to have the floor. I start bringing in facts that are contrary, or at least bring into a question an item that we're on. That make it appear Council members may not approve that agenda item. There will be, either the Mayor or City Manager who somehow try to shift the conversation toward a personal attack at me. DNK, as I'm speaking, calling a point of order on me. DNK telling me to stay on the agenda item. When I'm literally reading a contract, reading the words off the Contract--and she's telling me to stay on agenda. What it does--it draws the rest of the Council's attention away all the details we just discussed. Gets them caught up in this drama,

PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413

• You should be asking the hard questions.

• Our Communications Department, as a whole has improved. JF had done a great job at revamping

• It's not so much a communication issue with the Comms Department, from the City Manager down to the Council. Chief Kimble's a finalist for this Sheriff position in Clark County, a County up in Washington. It hit the Channel 6 news on Thursday. On Friday, our local KDH is asking questions to see--Manager, Comms Department--everybody--police department, anyone they can think to call.

• Apparently, I, by myself, as a single Council member--I am the sole reason our Chief of Police is looking for another job.

• MB: Cagle accused me last night of--creating a toxic working environment for Chief of Police. I have violated the

PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413

• They wouldn't put presentations on certain items, intentionally because they knew it was going to be a controversial item. They did not want citizens gathering information, particularly citizens like me who were going to go through and research it, then start blasting it out on social media.

• MB: yes. My great-great grandmother is Native American, and then, actually I did a DNA test...my DNA test says that I'm primarily Easter Indian, Native American, and Inuit. Then, I've got a little bit of DNA from the Orkney Islands (?), and Easter Europe.

• It's been a long journey. I tell people all the time, statistically I should not be where I am right now. I've never liked statistics. I had to take that damn class twice. It bored me the first time, and I didn't finish it. I won't let anybody tell me who I'm supposed to be. Nobody gets to tell me no, without at least hearing me out. It's a
| Charter by telling Chief what to do, and escorting an employee to HR. In the midst of him--need some context here, we were talking about Chief's employment. Several of the Council members--"if he doesn't want to be here, that's fine." KC-CM was trying to get him to stay. What is it going to take to keep you here. If we have to pay you more than I get paid, that's fine with me. That might be fine with you, but that's not going to fly with the Council. It's not going to fly with the Officers beneath you. Who we're telling..."we don't have the money to increase your pay, we're going to more than double the Chief's pay."
| Sister 1 had been playing—you now those little plastic pink plates you can get at the Dollar Tree right. Little toy ones. She had been playing with one of those. Sister 2 ripped it out of her hands. She was probably 18 months by this time, we had been there for about a year. Sister 1 was upset. I took it away from her--from Sister 2, and kinda' bopped her on the head with it, and said, "don't...don't do that. That was bad. No." Gave it back to Sister 1. Sister 2 started crying, and my foster mom came in. I told her what happened. I got put over her knee, got hit with a belt. I got to stand in the corner from before lunch time, it was between breakfast and
| Where everybody's pointing fingers at me. Now they've all forgot all the details we just discussed. They're still thinking about drama, and they miss everything.
| I become a regular. Everybody recognizes me. This is probably why Jose is so annoyed with me. I would--I would just show up at every meeting, and speak when it was public hearing. Up until 2019 there was no rule, no law, nothing in Open Meetings that required a governing body to allow citizens to speak at a meeting unless it was a public hearing required by law.
| I did learn a lesson really young, to not take things away from people--not rip them out of their hands.
| They flipped it on me. Told me I'm the reason that Kimble's looking for a new job. Even though two years ago, before I was even on Council, He was applying for Police Chief in Palestine, and definitely in Temple. I don't know how I'm the reason he wants to find another job, but I'm being blamed for it.

[constituent role in policy process]

lot of insight into how I am on the dais.
Starting at lunch time… I watched everyone else eat lunch, I got no lunch. It was dinner time. I watched everyone else eat dinner, and I got no dinner. Then, I was finally able to leave the corner when it was time to go to bed. I tell you what. I never hit anyone on the head with anything again.

- I give the citizen a whole list of questions. I want to know details about this. When I go to get the other side of the story [DML]… when I'm asking questions, I can recall details from the citizen. What Chief and CM don't like is that I will do the same thing with the Police Department. I don't do it necessarily on the dais. I'll send them emails. I'll call. I'll have in-person meetings with them [channels of civic engagement]. Ask them, "can you please explain to me why x- y-and z….apparently, because I sat there with the two of them, the two of them and me…asking them why something was happening, and just saying, "I don't know if I agree with it". That was me telling the Chief how to run the department.

- it's not strong mayor. Council-City Manager, we're a home rule city. That's the technical name for it. We're a home rule city. Where the City Council is in charge. The City Manager is there to be the administrator to make sure what the City Council says is happening in the City. They Mayor is there to run the meeting, and go to other events and
meetings on behalf of the City. They still can't make any decisions for the City.

• Go to college, get married. We start moving around, we finally land here in Killeen. I knew, I already had experience -- California, I traveled up and down California and up into Washington. Up into Utah, and into Nevada.

Professionally, getting people to sign petitions and register to vote. Believe it or not you can make money doing that.

• It was August 2018, right before my anniversary. I went to workshop that was talking about the lateral sewer lines. They were talking about the sewer lines, who was responsible for expansion, and who's paying between $10-25K to fix sewer lines. They were under the pavement in the road. There was a fight over should the city be responsible, the homeowner-developer be responsible.

• I had a good cot. My cot was right next to the window. I'd sit there in the window and watch out, and literally be up until 2-3 in the morning. Looking out the window, staring at the sky. Trying to figure out what the fuck was going on in life.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ</th>
<th>041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ</th>
<th>041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I chose the next best thing, in my opinion, which was journalism. It was there I started to be more cognizant of politics, world news, everything really going on, especially locally. [plotting]</td>
<td>Around the time I was doing my undergraduate degree, was around the time the Lincoln Center debacle was going on. Of course, I only got one side of that story right. We always get the activist side of the story. We don't get the other side. That's when I started getting a little more involved in civics, and my local community.</td>
<td>Especially coming from my background you don't really have the resources to get yourself out, you kind of dig yourself into a hole—a hole, into a hole…until you can finally dig yourself out.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CJ: It was like an old Mexican man with a cowboy hat, by like a dirt road. Then it had pictures of the actor Matthew McConaughey and Penelope Cruz. It said, we don't want old dusty El Paso. It had a picture of the man we want. We want hip El Paso. It had the picture of the actor. It had a whole bunch of very negative language, but it was at that point that I realized—oh my God, this piece of propaganda is very misleading, very inaccurate [NIMBY—meaning making, place x space]. The worst part about it, you can't hold anybody liable for this. Who do you hold accountable for it—know what I mean?</td>
<td>the main influence is age. As we age, we gain more wisdom. The former Representative had a big influence on me. One of my current bosses, the City Manager, also has a lot of influence on me. Not only those individuals, but my family. Family and working, and being able to provide.</td>
<td>Specifically, the City Manager. Say anything you will about him, him personally, his personality—his demeanor, say what you want—that's him. As far as it goes, him running the city, him actually doing what he's supposed to do. I think he does a good job. I think his heart is in the right place. Sometimes his words aren't in the right place, but his heart is definitely in the right place. I think from him coming from a similar background, I didn't grow up nearly as poor as he did. We did have sort of a similar background—being Latinos, both having Mexican parents. None of our parents speaking English. In this country. I can sympathize with what he wants to accomplish, and what he wants to—his end goal. His end game, but from working with the Reps office, and now the administration. I sympathize a lot more than I did before. As opposed to when I was a college student, right. I was writing stories for my college paper, or just for the class. I went for</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
the pobresitos of the world, and now everybody has issues that we look at. That's really shaped my point of view and my politics.

- I decided I wanted always to try and do the right thing. I always wanted to do the right thing, and make sure nothing could really get in my way doing the right thing.
- I think that story helps to encompass what I hold valuable in this world, in this life. It's being a decent human being, being a good person. It's not being a piece of shit...pardon my French--I want to be a good person--ultimately.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>PhD Interview-<strong>PG</strong></th>
<th>PhD Interview-<strong>WC2</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>042722</td>
<td>Now we're actually signing NDAs, non-disclosure agreements, on projects that we're working on. That’s been a very common practice over the last few years.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>051022 PhD Interview-<strong>WC2</strong></td>
<td>There was definitely some context to the experience in terms of going through school, riding in a low-rider--bringing my cultural norms to a private school setting. Certainly did not have its advantages in my opinion. Maybe a slight advantage when it came to dating, but definitely almost always at a disadvantage compared to your peers. For different</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Then Junior year-Senior year...I hold the line on National Honor Society. I start a Bowling Club, that was my outlet for reaching into the world outside of Father Duenas and private school. I started a tri-partied school league, tri-school league bowling. FD, ND, Academy...it was nice, but it didn't have the umphf..., and I was</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WC: interesting. I always knew at FD, and it might have even been inherent in my earlier years. I believe my classmates and peers were saying that I was saying this since I was in middle school. That I wanted to be Governor. I was going to be a Governor, and I just kept saying it. To some I didn't say it. My career path was starting to manifest itself. So they</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
reasons...this is "Chamorro on Chamorro-isms".

- I started to realize that I was one of the smarter kids in the room. Academics was not difficult for me. That allowed me a lot of things--afforded me to fuck around and still get good grades. I did a lot of that. I started to wise up. I joined ROTC. I shut my mouth. I was able to maintain that image. The recipe to success: shut your mouth, fall in line. Conform, do good in school, and things will be granted on to you. That's a very interesting [cultural norm].

It applies to the world in which I operate. Which is in the Pacific Region, it may not apply state-side. I could share examples in how that doesn't necessarily work.

Because I was using that image and profile to sharpen my self-control. I was rising through the ranks in the Father Duenas Junior ROTC program.

- WC: Two weeks prior to the general election, my first time running...I don't know who--actually I do. CB said he put out the story in the media about me begin sued by the University of Guam for debt owed. I couldn't act fast enough to--I let the courts play itself out. The courts did vindicate me, but after the election, and that's an example of using factual information as a

really good at bowling at the time. So I started a club, for which I was excellent in and I invited people to join. So I opened it up the subsequent season to an all-island bowling league, and holy...shit, did the lid blow off on that one. People from Southern--at the time there was no Southern. There was Oceanview, GCC, GW...I had all the motherfuckin' rifraf...that was kinda cool because it helped me navigate. Now these guys don't know me as the local boy from Barrigada, the village, the long hair, the low rider. Now, I'm that guy from FD. Pretty boy, probably viewed as a social elitist...blah, blah, blah, blah, blah. saw it as a natural end-game for them, these are non-political people. Keep in mind these are people in the public school system who for the most part didn't have any real political ambition. I could go through my entire roster and tell you who was ambitious or not ambitious. I would say 9 1/2 out of 10 of those people never gave a damn about politics. I was probably the only one who had a keen interest in it. I don't know where it began. I do have some images that are still resonated in my brain [remembering], in my memory [public memory] that may have inspired looking in that direction. Specifically, Ricardo J. Bordallo, my dad shaking his hand at the Customs booth, on what we know of as Labor Day. All I remember was this straw hat, he was in a white t-shirt...he was seated, he had his glasses on. My dad said, "hey boy, this is the Governor..." He was a really big guy--of course I was just a child. That left an impression, an indelible mark in my mind. [plotting course]
form of propaganda to influence the minds. To paint the picture that I was running from my debt, that I did not pay, that was the false narrative being put out there. That because Wil Castro did not pay, he was being sued. [Legitimacy of frame: the more intimate a portrait one knows to paint, i.e., WC had close working relationship with raa in 2002 gubernatorial election. The popular frame about WC among organizational leadership was one that interpreted the meaning of WC’s action as self-serving. He was looking to make money off the campaign/candidate. WC handling of cash on behalf of campaign was brought to raa attention--need to cease, raa responsible for managing relationship on behalf of candidate believeability] He is not acknowledging his debt, that's kind of the false narrative.

- control. Power. I think at the time it would be one more seat that they would lose in the Legislature. I don’t recall if it was 8-7, if it was it would be in-material to the majority. I think it might have been. I don't have the facts and figures in front of me, but what was at stake was a voting seat in the Legislature. Which means they would not just lose a seat, but Republicans would gain a seat.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING-delinking</th>
<th>REFORMING-rethinking</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING-relinking practices for PD behaviors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>being able to afford going anywhere else other than the west side of town in El Paso</td>
<td>trying to convince me to believe in what they're saying in order to vote to keep them in power, or keep them in a position of influence that can effect legislation or policy. understanding of what's out there in the world.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>trying to persuade me that they are sincere, or actually concerned about a certain topic: to secure votes, to be liked; to change people's perception mainly. Try to convince people of something. statistically speaking looking at political trends; you'll have republican and democratic presidents flip-flopping.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>being a father, a citizen, and a veteran.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PhD Study-Interview-SD 2022-04-13 Via TEAMS**

My life in the Philippines was challenging. It was difficult. There were a lot of moments of poverty.

Now, I realize going back then

Seeing poverty, and I've done mission work too

Interesting stories

Because politics, and misconception, and misunderstanding about that framework because it was tied to a vendor

very loud and strategic in pin-pointing problems,

[institutional perspective of activist]

The culture dictates that to--very traditional Catholic-way of thinking. Coming here to the United States, and learning about independence. I valued that a lot. I think that's one of my biggest take-aways--living here for almost 20 years in the United States. My sense of independence, and really allowing me to grow more and increase my level of
• Then, start trying to convince Council members to side with the citizens opinion before they got the information.

• It was fun. I love the aspect of it—talking to people. Understanding the basics of what I was asking them to do. It's always great when its just us, "hey can you sign this petition to put it on the ballot?" Start explaining it. "I don't think I really want to, I don't agree—that's fine if you don't agree with it. Give everyone else the chance to vote on it by signing this—literally, all your doing is asking to put it on the ballot.

Everyone gets a say. If it makes it to the ballot, you can vote no.

• Mb: its hard to make it appear as if they're helping…not only the person they're speaking it to…everybody around them. They

Maturity, and lift up that sense of courage and persistence, to make a difference.

• The accomplishments, the accolades…even the challenges have become really meaningful learning experiences for me—and life experiences—life learning lessons.

PhD Study-Interview
MB-20220413

MB: I was born to a teenage mother still in high school. She was 17 when she had me. She tells me all the time I'm her favorite child. The oldest of four girls. I'm her favorite because she had me on purpose. I didn't know until I was 13—I have a different father than my other three sisters. My mom doesn't know who the guy is. She was mad at my step-dad at the time, and she said…"you know why he treats all of you different? Because he's not your father. She goes through, and tells two of my sisters who their

PhD Study-Interview
MB-20220413

MB: I grew up so fast. When I was in college, I was in foster care. I had empathy for people. I just didn't have sympathy. I didn't have family. The whole family first thing didn't matter. It was me first. Take care of me, and what do I need. What's going to get me where I want to be. I think that's the biggest change—when I was younger, 'till now. It went from being about me…how do I control the situation happening to me—specifically. I don't care how it affects other people. Its all about me. Now, its family first, but helping the other people also.

• MB: part of we need to do to engage marginalized communities, and not try to teach them. Reach out to them, get them involved, make them feel like they are important.
appear to make it mean, "this is educational, and for your good. The betterment of your self, not only your self--the community around you also."

Dad is. Tells the other sister that he is her father. She looks at me, and says I don't know who your dad is. It could be one of three different guys.

Holy shit…happy birthday, my mother's a whore.

[rep remembers event where mom makes "big reveal" during celebratory moment, appears now to aim for big reveals on others during Council/public meetings]

- Lives with my grandparents, from what my Mom tells me. Then, she got pregnant for my sister. My grandfather kicked them out. She moved in with a man that was abusive, an alcoholic, and a coke addict. By the time my third sister was born--I was only 4 years old, but I distinctly remember being home alone [rep alone on the dais], in the mobile home, without her there. She had divorced my first step-dad by that point. He was so abusive. Like put her in the hospital abusive.

- because he instructs all the people who follow Nation of Islam. On how they should view and perceive reality, and other people. Through those teachings if you want to be part of the Nation, you have to

know as somebody who grew up in a poverty situation, then in foster care. You feel neglected by the world. People don't want to come in and talk to you. Politicians don't come talk to you. The leadership does not come talk to you. If they're not interested in you, why should you be interested in them.
adopt, an accept--and not question, any of those teachings. Screw That! Those Mason Members are going to present their information through that lens to me.

- Raa: what influences have created a difference between your current beliefs and the past?

MB: got married, had kids. My foster dad--my dad I call him. He's the person I chose to call dad. He had very strong family values, and we weren't even his kids. After 4 years, being there, I started to figure that out. That its not just all about me, and there are good people.

041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ

• After being with a Rep, and now working in administration. With the administration, I comprehend a lot of people. I sympathize with them. I understand what being a public servant really is. What it is in working for the government. Your salary being paid by taxpayer dollars. You have a sense of duty to them. We're also human beings. I also see that. I also see everybody being dragged through the mud. I see peoples livelihood, people's
reputation being attacked simply because they work for the government. Not because anything they did, but the simple fact they work for the government.

- It goes back to the Facebook stuff. It's just misinformation. From that I realize, and having that it came from a journalist whose supposed to be researching that kind of stuff--supposed to be trying to fact check. He wasn't doing any of that. He's just like...what are they going to do about this? Why did they send this? Well first off I don't even know what that is. I've never seen that before. Let me look it up. We research it. It's inaccurate, by then the story has been run. People's minds have been changed. They kind of moved on to the next thing. I was at that point. How inefficient the media is here.

- One persons evil action, can be another persons saving grace. [one persons corruption is another's opportunity]. They want to ensure--they want to discredit the City. They want to use this information to make this City and the proponents of the head, but I can't remember his name. He was carrying around this poster that the El Paso del Sur group kinda threw together. Where it had some slides from the Glass Beach Study. I don't know if you remember this poster, where it was basically saying that the Glass Beach study was racist. They were saying that nobody wanted an old Mexican around. They only wanted young-hip beautiful people around. They were walking around with that, spreading--it really open my eyes to how far someone will go to get what they want. Of course it was taken completely out of context. They went back and found the actual study [role of higher ed academia in propaganda process]--the actual power point slide. They show, they demonstrated that these images and this verbiage--this language was taken completely out of context. Only utilized to hurt the City, and hurt proponents of the Arena, but by then the damage was done. It was already too late. People were already upset about this poster that was completely modified in order to fit their agenda.

- That little poster that was a very interesting piece of propaganda that was hurtful, not
arena seem like horrible people, satan-worshiping, baby killing pedophiles. Like the Qanon people. That’s basically what they are trying to accomplish--in my opinion.

- CJ: They get to the people's emotions. Specifically with the words, they make sure they get a rise out of you. They always get a rise. I could go back to the "Daisy Ad" on this one. Its that whenever you're trying to sway somebody to change their opinion--you go for emotions. You want to draw something. Sometimes they do positive ones. They do--a lot of positive political ads used to be ran--I remember seeing specifically, some from Ronald Reagan--really, really heartwarming, heartfelt--positive ads. Then to evoke fear--like the "Daisy Ad" that’s another emotion that’s very effective into swaying people. You utilize their fear of nuclear war--of nuclear winter.

- People's political parties can change if the right heartstring is plucked.

- [AI applications-axiological] just to the City's agenda--getting the arena through, but for the publics perception of what we really think. What the City and the employees--administration, what we really think about the community. Its not like that at all. I've met some of the most caring people that work for the City, and I've met some of the ugliest people that are "activist" in this role, and its very disheartening to see that’s the way it really is; but unfortunately, that really is the way it is. [institutional perspective of activist]

- CJ: They're trying to influence our actions and thoughts in a negative way by trying to paint this picture [role of CM gatekeeper perspective in framing messages]…of the administration and the Council--of these monsters, these evil people, these racists. These elitist that only want to hurt people. We always think of these big bad government, big bad corporations, and they're only out to hurt people--they kill puppies. Things of those nature--you know what I mean.

- CJ: "emotional propaganda"…what we were just touching on…basically, propaganda utilizes
your emotions to accomplish their goal. Going back to the "Daisy Ad", fear was the strongest emotion they felt they needed to utilize in order to sway the American public to vote for Lyndon Johnson. [history of propaganda in mass media goes further back than we remember].

- It could also be positive, like I said--another positive heartwarming ad; and we can go back to the City--in another form of propaganda, where the City had a bunch of little short videos showing that the people "displaced" by the City. They were showing them, "hey! The City’s not all bad. We actually have a better place. The City helped me out with this. This kind of stuff. Emotional Propaganda--

- only thinking about the few, not thinking about the bigger issue [tai-ma-ma-hla]

- Now, I understand the Republicans have a different points of view, different values. Not all of them obviously. Some of do--can be good people, and some of them are genuinely good, doing good work for their people. I empathize with everyone.
• I say 7 out of 10 were upper middle to higher on the socio-economic rung. 2-3 of us were just run of the mill local boys from middle class families, with a working parent in the government—nothing fancy.

Then I graduate. Top of the food chain, scholar-athlete. I didn't make top 10, but I was in the 13. JROTC commanding officer. Second team all island. I didn't think I needed to push for college, so I didn't. I was thinking I was just going to go to UOG, and I did.

That's because my parents, I think, my parents were not college generation people. They never went to college. They didn't advocate for me to go to some of the better schools. My sister went to UOG, she made a great living living off of that experience. I was like…hey, if I killed FD, and UOG is non-competitive. I'm just walk through UOG as an accountant. That was my game plan until that fall, first semester, at UOG when the house burned down.

Mid-term, fall semester 1992--this guy who's coming off the top of the food chain…that would be me. House burns down, and my whole life is upside down.

• As I started going through elementary and middle I saw the value of student council, in terms of being popular. I saw being popular as an interesting means to an end, in terms of being popular through election. It was an opportunity to be popular in ways I couldn't otherwise be popular. I couldn't be that popular, tall, dark complected guy from Barrigada…wasn't working in my favor. I realized I could contribute through my aptitude, and sure enough my peers gave me that privilege. I started getting my feet wet in elementary school through elected office. I don't remember my parents ever even encouraging it. It wasn't spawned from their nudges. [rethinking at an early age]

To me, those are things that you have to train yourself to do because it's so easy to adopt that other side. I don't think that's a Western trait at all. I think that's reinforced because of our culture, and how we—especially now in the CNMI, there's a stronger feeling of INAFAMAOLEK and saving face here. Yeah, there are a few crazies out here, but by and large these guys are very sensitive to each other—very sensitive. Where they try not to inflict harm or pain upon one another, even their own enemy. That's how sensitive these people are out here. Not like Guam, any—every opportunity in the Democrat circles that I've been in—that's a modus operandi; but not in Republican circles. At least not in the ones I've been in. Certainly not in my Republican circle here, but that's not to say we don't have it. I have an excellent green room black ops team. It'll be coming out. I don't wake up ever day thinking how I can annihilate somebody on the other side. That's now how I roll.

WC: as a young idealistic fuck, I was out for blood. Hey, I could do this. I'm brilliant. Let me take

• WC: by attempting to convey to the community that I am not a responsible citizen worthy of

I had to claw my way up just to get mine over the years. I almost never did it at the expense of others. I think that’s something kind of interesting…endemic in our culture, in terms of saving face—whether its your own, or those that you walk with.

I had to claw my way up just to get mine over the years. I almost never did it at the expense of others. I think that’s something kind of interesting…endemic in our culture, in terms of saving face—whether its your own, or those that you walk with.
being elected into the
Guam Legislature.

- WC: for the purpose
  of influencing votes
  against me, either not
to vote for me by
discouraging
supporters of mine.
- WC: they used
adverbs and
adjectives. They
switched out parts
of the story that were
out of order--this was
years ago. Meaning,
they weren't like
linear, factual--they
omitted certain words
and symbols that
would paint a more
accurate truth, a
comprehensive truth.
They selectively used
certain words that
would reinforce the
image they were
trying to put out
there.
- WC: the exact
meanings I felt were
literal. Like, "not
responsible"; "being
sued"…those were all
truthful, factual, but
the implied
meanings—the words
were taken together,
actually
communicated
something
differently. "Someone
who is irresponsible,
not worthy of being
elected". That's kind
of what I was getting
from that. So, if
someone doesn't pay
their debt, refused to
pay, has defaulted.
Then naturally, you
would say…equals,
someone not worthy
of your vote. So the
use of words and

That's when I realize
that the shit is real.
Like, the struggle is
real. I could tell you,
with one hand, who
came to help my
family, and how it
destroyed my father
emotionally and
psychologically. He
just completely
flipped out. That was
when I felt, in my
mind, if I had a
marquee moment in
my life. That was a
defining moment. The
day I arrived at my
house. When I got the
call that the house was
burning, and a series
of events that lead up
to rolling up, seeing
my dad without his
shirt…in shock,
gazing into the
flames, and three
giant-ass fire trucks
there. I take off my
shirt, and I give it to
my dad because he
made it out of the
house barely, with
enough time to save
his life. Fortunately,
he didn't get burned.
He was sleeping when
the flames were
engulfing the ceiling
on top of him. My
mom had to sit on his
chest, and pound him
to make him wake up.
He survived. Almost
nothing else did. Most
of our memories went
down with the fire.
[remembering
struggle]
- That was a defining
moment. I went from
being an accounting
major right out of--
right upon enrollment

out that bitch--write
this down, boom-
boom-boom. Just
completely cut you up
in a million pieces
with my pen. That
was easy for me at the
time. It wasn't until I
started--saw it from
the personal side, and
even the professional
side…started seeing
how people react
negatively to that.
Almost disgust
depending on how
vile your write up is. I
didn't like that. I
didn't like people
reacting like, that is
so dark, and dirty,
evil. I started to
realize, okay its not as
easy--I mean its easy
to do that kind of
work, but the
implications, the
ramifications are hard
to deal with. I started
to become less
idealistic, more
pragmatic, and
experienced in my
ways. Then truly hit
home when I became
the victim... the way
the other perceives
and acts upon the
self]...of these
propaganda, character
assassination
attempts. There had
been many. It hurt my
family. It hurt me,
and in reflection…[x
CJ...same value +
respect for other]. I
don't want to do that
to anybody [x

495
symbols to elicit a reaction that would adversely effect the election specifically in the case of this Senatorial Candidate.

• WC: no. I would say no, not at all. He had an ulterior motive, and most citizens don't have an ulterior motive when they go into the booth. They attempt to make an informed decision based on what's available to them. Whereas this propagandist with the ulterior motive, although the common interest is still like responsible people have an ulterior motive to negatively effect that perception. People don't share that common interest. They don't walk around saying how can I fuck over Wil Castro?

I was a declared accounting major. I knew what I wanted to be when I grow up. So to speak--and I couldn't pursue that anymore because I needed to pay for my education.

• Newer values, stronger values now that are new--novel, I've always been a compassionate person towards others when they're emotionally distraught. Something--when someone is suffering you feel that way for them. I've also developed a different kind of compassion in terms of not wanting to break out the sword and annihilate my enemy, simply because there's an agenda.

• Then, thereafter I went into business for myself. Just was a survivor, and continued to build up my reputation through my writing, thinking, and ability to contribute in other ways--where I wasn't like a little bitch just hiding behind a desk. Like you, in the Underwood days, when we get dirty, but we can also contribute cerebrally. People in positions of power and influence like that. They saw it as a total package [ability to see and understand how others interpret self].

with my Catholicity--if you want to call it. I'm a terrible Catholic--that much I know about Christianity. The pinnacle was when I became the fuckin' victim of that shit. From the UOG thing to little stupid jabs on the radio about, "oh, he's acting like a little boy who lit his house on fire, and then put it down with a hose, and said..'look at me, I'm the hero.' I mean those little fuckin' stupid cunt-ass remarks like that. Those were designed-engineered to evoke an emotional response. It did, but I channeled that. Instead of hitting them back, I channeled that into positive energy, and I re-engineered that shit to my favor. They lost more support, and lost face to the point where they came back begging for me to accept their apology, as late as a year and a half later for something so stupid, but yet so emotionally traumatic to my family. So I accepted RL's apology almost a year and a half later because of that. She understood, as a human being that value I maintain, and that mortal wound you attempted to inflect would now be forgotten even though
it was furthest from achieving the kind of result that you had desired, or engineered it to achieve. It didn't, but you lost a friend for life.

Chenchule

[IMF provides context of civic engagement formula/C ^ BP x ]-- subtraction factor for the negative occurrence required to transform

[C = BP = SI]

Operationalizing Civic Efficacy: I will act if $C < BP + SI$ the cost is lower than the sum of my perceived efficacy (BP) and what my influencers signal they are doing by mediating. (p.69)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING-practices</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>It was planting the seed, and get ahead</strong></td>
<td><strong>kept working hard, learning, absorbing everything I could. Watching everything I could.</strong></td>
<td><strong>I'm working in the District now. I've spent like two years in the corporate world.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PhD Study-Interview-SD 2022-04-13 Via TEAMS</td>
<td>PhD Study-Interview-SD 2022-04-13 Via TEAMS</td>
<td>PhD Study-Interview-SD 2022-04-13 Via TEAMS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>working in the Philippines, I spent like two years in the corporate world. Thinking that's the answer to my dream--personally and also the dream I have for my family, not capable of doing things.</strong></td>
<td><strong>You will often hear them saying, &quot;you have to. You have to study very hard because that's the only way you can get out of poverty.&quot;</strong></td>
<td><strong>They message out that they're there to help. They're about helping the teachers. Like salary increases, and promoting that.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hiring teachers for math and science; not giving it an opportunity to have the District run programs as it should be.</strong></td>
<td><strong>We're bringing in new stuff that does not work.</strong></td>
<td><strong>&quot;we're not going to let the District cheat you from your salary.&quot;; &quot;We're going to demand for an increase, and we guarantee that they're going to give you a salary increase.&quot;</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
here in the District, slower
- There are things that escape in the process of communication and discussion in meetings—again it’s a push and pull of power.
- Another one is getting less. There is something that has to decrease. When you take something from here, something is going to get less—somewhere.
- Sustaining membership. They get monies out of the members. They need to continue living.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- I spend literally hours going over each agenda item. Then going back and researching what it actually says.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- MB: I was one of the people in California circulating that petition. When I landed here I ended up making friends with a couple people who were very in dept to the city government. One night they invited me to come over to their place, they could write out a speech for me to come speak at the budget hearing that was coming up. This is back in 2015, 2016—something like that. I was open to meet with them. I told them nobody’s going to write my speech for me. I will speak. Show me what</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- The City decided that the property owner should be responsible, citing case law from the 1800s. While they're discussing this one night, Mrs. Fleming invited up another person to speak. He had been the person who caused her to bring this item forward. The Mayor-Segarra, allowed him to come up and speak. Then she says, Mrs. Brown is here and she would like to say something. Can Mrs. Brown come up and speak?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Now I kinda whisper to Rivera saying Mrs. Fleming wants me to speak. I might need somebody to back her up. Would you mind if I
the issue is. I will figure it out from there.

That was it. I was hooked. It was the budget. It was jacked up, it was a fucked up budget. That was right around the time we were still $8 million--we were in the process, that's where it was, we were in that stage where we went from being okay...to AF telling us we were $8 million short. That whole audit thing--we're not missing $8 million...it was $8 million of mismanaged money. When I was looking through the budget I could see all these areas. Where things were being mismanaged. I would write out everything I had to say. It was the first time--that year was the first time I went toe-to-toe with Dan Corbin. Dan Corbin also came in to speak on the budget. Remember...it was the year they tried to close the libraries for a year.

- He was the former mayor, he came in to this budget meeting and walked up to the podium, looks up at the Council members and Mayor. He said, "you have a problem with your budget, you need to move some money around. Don't worry I wrote a revised budget for you. I'm going to present it to you. Give you this budget so you know how to move the money around so you can take care of what you want.

He handed this sheet out to the 7 Council Members, the Mayor, and the public speak. No, of course, I'll support you speaking. I get up to the podium, and she' saying that she'd like to let Mrs. Brown speak. Jose says no. I asked him why not? He told me its not a public hearing.

I'm standing there at the podium. You can watch this on a hundred news channels, or probably my Facebook Live stream--its still up. If you just google it. Anyway, the Mayor kept telling me no. I kept insisting, and demanding to know why. I knew what my rights were. I knew what the procedures were of the Council. He eventually told me that I had to leave. In that process the Sgt. Of Arms put me in a control hold, and tried to escort me out, but ask me to collect my belongings while both my hands were behind my back.

I was already mad at him. I was yelling at him to lighten up and loosen his grip on me. Then he told me, "it was okay that he was hurting me--keep moving." I kind of lost my shit on him a little bit, even though I was still walking, and cooperating, I was yelling at him. "What are you talking about--telling me, that its okay for you to hurt me..." Growing up in an abusive household--no. You don't tell somebody who's not resisting, 'it's okay, just keep going!" He told me gather my belongings.
never saw it. I did an Open Records Request (ORR) so I had it. I was still offended--he thought just because he's the former Mayor, he could walk in and control how the Council voted, control what to Council did with their budget. Then it was more than the budget, I was hooked.

• giving their perspective of history

You can't see me. It's funny, I'm showing you. I have both my hands behind my back. He is telling me to gather my stuff. I'm leaving, I'm more than willing to leave--I'm going to go. I'd love to gather up my belongings. You need to let go of my hand. Can't really gather your stuff with someone holding two hands behind your back. I don't know if I was supposed to gather it with my mouth or my feet, or whatever.

I also didn't want to try and bring my arm around. You've got me in a control-hold, and if I start to pull my arm around...now, I'm resisting. I wasn't going to let him get me wrapped up in a resisting charge.

As I'm going back-n-forth with him, telling him I want to get my stuff, I need you to let go of my arm...he continues, "mrs. Brown, gather up your belongings." Judge Mark Kimble, who is behind, stood up and told the officer, "Officer I order you to place this woman under arrest for disturbing the peace." They put me in cuffs, and they took me to jail. Pissed me off, instead of suing them I decided the best way to get my revenge--to get up on the Council and make them sit there and work with me every day.
After I got my undergraduate degree, I wanted to break into journalism here in El Paso. I wanted to start writing, working for the newspaper, maybe a news station. In my contacts I came across Dr. Noe. I met former Representative Noe. Picking his brain, and getting to know him. He decided he wanted to give me a job. He was looking for a new aide, and I--our paths crossed, and I started working for him. From there I started getting more involved, more educated and more informed on the issues. As a journalist you try to understand both sides of the story, but you're always biased. I always thought the government was the big bad evil government--empire, right? From STARWARS, but after working for the Rep. I come from a Democratic family, the Rep was Republican--I was aware of this. I told myself, can I do this? Can I work for a Republican? Something told me to give the man a shot. See what CJ: In this case it would be the activist. The folks that have an agenda, they're willing to do anything they have to, or they can to get their agenda across. Whether its hurt people, hurt people's livelihoods--whole reputations. Hurt community's perception of an organization. They don't care. They're the ones doing--they don't want this arena built here. They want to preserve these buildings. They don't care what they have to do in order to do it. That's who the propagandist are--in my opinion. [Community activist public education materials deemed as propaganda by institutional actors]

CJ: yeah…that project is just--I don’t know. To me its going to be dead. I don't know how they're going to get out of it, but a $180 million wasn't enough back then. Definitely wasn't enough when they were trying to build it. Definitely not going to be enough now. There's no way in hell they're going to build that type of facility for that amount of money.
things are like. Working with him really opened up my eyes tremendously to both sides of the issue. Not even both sides of the issue. We don't live in a black and white world. We live in a gray world. There's tremendous amounts of gray area. His perspective on a lot of things really opened up my eyes. While I was a lot more liberal for certain topics and issues. I find myself slightly more conservative now. I would say that government spending is a really big issue for me to consider. It's a bigger issue for me--that I think about now. At first I was like, well we have the money why don't we just do it? Now seeing that the people who pay the taxes, especially at a municipal level, are people like my parents. The majority of them are people like my folks who have a fixed income. Don't make a lot of money. So they want their dollar spent wisely. We need to make wise choices in order to spend that dollar wisely. I really changed my view on that. I wouldn't--I don't want my money
being spent on things that are unnecessary. Only going to benefit the few. Everybody pays that money. Not just a few vocal people. The few ankle-biters, the few that can rally a small percentage of the population--signatures. That's what working with Dr. Noe did for me.

- You come across a lot of folks who want to bully their way to getting what they want.
- CJ: personally, I'm not fond of this purpose. I personally think that progress is a good thing. Building that structure will actually benefit the City. I don't mean the city government--the City of El Paso, the city as a whole. I think would benefit the region. It would bring in tourist dollars, it would bring in more tax revenue. It would benefit everyone really--in my opinion. [economic development perspective]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>042722 PhD Study-PG Interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PG: here in Killeen we had moved from Germany where I was working for civil service.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>042722 PhD Study-PG Interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Knowing that I was going to probably have to take a pay cut.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PG: again, are you talking about making a cultural</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>042722 PhD Study-PG Interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[strong in chen'chule across dimensions as native pacific islander female participant-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Then the average annual salary for somebody with my experience was, at that time, was literally half of what I was making in Europe—for this market. Then I had to start looking, actually worked full-time temporary job in Austin. I made that commute everyday for like three months. PG: well define propaganda, is it marketing for a cultural community. PG: to capture the sales of alcohol, and keep them here in the community; versus those dollars leaving the community, and the potential opportunity of securing more restaurants. change? A political change? PG: it was to help us become, to put on us on a even competitive level with other cities within the area. Because if you had to go buy liquor in another city, then why not collect the sales tax revenue here in our own city. We had people leaving the city to go to a restaurant in another city to go buy liquor without all the rules. That was one of the reasons. We wanted to be able to recruit more restaurants, and we did. PG: I truly feel like they were being as transparent without going super public until we had to--we had to get on the ballot. I think they were very transparent with the people they were talking to. They explained the current alcohol rule for sale and consumption. They said this is what we want to do. This is how much its going to cost. This is how the outcome is going to benefit the community if we get the voters to pass it. Those were the talking points when they went to businesses requesting for funding. neoliberal/economic development] PG: then when you ordered your drink you had to either show your card, or they took your name…and they had your card on file. They had to research it, look it up, then you could buy an alcoholic beverage. Liquor stores were non-existent. So, what community leaders did is we hired a consultant, to go through the process of trying to legalize the sale of alcohol by the drink. Which means you can go to a restaurant and you no longer have to do the membership registration, as well as the ability to sell beer and wine. Which is now expanded to liquor stores. That consultant was able to run a public campaign, and garner enough signatures and we raised enough money. We took the issue to the voters, and they approved both initiatives. [education/propaganda interchangeable] Yes, it was definitely a quality of life initiative. Even if you don’t support the consumption of alcohol, it was just the case of doing business for restaurant owners, and now we have restaurants--you can drink or not drink, it doesn't matter which side of the issue you support. [neoliberal transformation of public space]
### 051022 PhD Interview-WC2

- I start to **build a solid base of friends outside of FD/private school network, and the village.** I thought it was a coming of an age…that **reinforces this notion from elementary, of being popular in different ways. Where I can make a difference.** It was never about power yet, because **I didn't understand what true power was, or influence**—influence in a certain way. Not in terms of moving and getting resources to benefit me. So that political construct was not real in my mind yet.

- But then, I get on the board. Then I see real power. Oversight over millions, people in positions effected by decisions that we make. Doors opening all around you outside of that boardroom. **It was a very awakening experience** if you will, and that further fed my desire to effectuate change. This time in a political arena much bigger than student government. I think that was I starting to venture into that authority. **[Conforming as a means to]**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>051022 PhD Interview-WC2</th>
<th>051022 PhD Interview-WC2</th>
<th>051022 PhD Interview-WC2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Then <strong>middle school I was going off the beaten path to speak. I was becoming a very delinquent young adult.</strong> Although still my aptitude was intact. I was admitted into the National Junior Honor Society in 7th grade, and kicked out shortly thereafter for fighting three times in the 8th grade at the beginning of the school year. This Filipina advisor, who was awesome—she was a great advisor. She didn't spare the compassion and guidance rod. I mean she spared it on me, and took out the other rod and whipped the shit out of me…in terms of saying, &quot;you no longer have any honor. You're out of NJHS.&quot; That was kind of a rude awakening…first, I was embarrassed. Second, I realized I had something actually taken away from me. I never had something given and taken away so abruptly, so cold. I was like shit—that hurt. <strong>[Indigenous transformation of neocolonial power structure]</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Then in '98 he decided to run for Governor. Well, shortly after the Harvard experience he was running for Governor. He asked me to be his Young Adult leader and I accepted, but more important than that for me. I was his &quot;shadow rider&quot;. I was Angels' Chief Policy rider at the time, and strategist. I'm just this young motherfucker from UOG, then Harvard. I was not part of any serious movement. I was just a guy with a head on his shoulders who took advantage of—he would come to my house in the middle of the night, and four large towering massive men surround the house at all four corners while he's in the room with me pounding away his rhetoric. Angel would supply almost all the rhetoric. My role was to inspire the rhetoric or to edit it so he's not calling MB a naked whore. It just wasn't proper. Things like that. I became his political confidant, and then political pressure was applied to me and I had to pull back. That's how --Onedera became the young adult leader, but I was still very quietly supplying Angel with a lot of political rhetoric. That was '98. <strong>[Indigenous transformation of neocolonial power structure]</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>[Conforming as a means to]</strong></td>
<td><strong>[Conforming as a means to]</strong></td>
<td><strong>[Conforming as a means to]</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
transformational
ends
way I was working at the same time.

| Che'lu |
|---|---|---|
| **CONFORMING** | **REFORMING** | **TRANSFORMING** |
| JJ-2022-04-12 via TEAMS |
| • helps to bring everyone together, or at least make you feel--as the audience, this guy sees the world the way you do. |
| PhD Study-Interview-SD 2022-04-13 Via TEAMS |
| • Everybody meaning all the stakeholders: students, teachers, principals, assistant principals, custodians, district leaders, district staff...they only think about themselves. |
| PhD Study-Interview-SD 2022-04-13 Via TEAMS |
| PhD Study-Interview-SD 2022-04-13 Via TEAMS |
| • I think that if this kind of opportunity is given to everybody, people will be nicer to each other and understand each other better. |
| PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413 |
| • I ask questions. If you came to me and said, "Councilwoman MB, I have this problem in my neighborhood...we've got feral cats attacking people, but Animal Control won't come out and do anything. When they do...when they do, they just come out and take them to the shelter for a few days. Then they bring them all back here to the neighborhood again. Then they're attacking everyone. My gosh I'm so sorry to hear about that, that's awful. Let me get some more information from you. Where do you live? What street is this on? When was the last |
| PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413 |
| • It was following everything that they did. I knew we had a bunch of Council member that didn't read--I love Shirley Fleming, apparently Fleming told everybody that she knew the material, she did her reading all morning. So knowing that most of them didn't know the material, and I could download the information myself. I started doing that, and I would just go and speak. Even if they didn't listen to me. |
time Animal Control was contacted.

- [constituent role in policy process]

The public knew the other side of the story.

**041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ**

- most citizens want the very thing they are fighting

**041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ**

- These relationships that I met with all these people--relationships I built with all these people I met throughout the years. Those are the biggest influences.

**042722 PhD Study-PG Interview**

- PG: I definitely want to say for more of a grass roots effort. So you're not going to see a lot of television, or media ads. You're going to see a lot of business leaders talking to their business leaders, talking to their employees, and then just kind of word of mouth kind of marketing.

- PG: what drives that is competition. Competition between whoever I'm working with and their competitors, or competition between a company choosing to locate in Killeen versus Temple, Belton, Waco, Copperas Cove. The past everything was mainly driven by...here's our assets, we think you should locate here. Although it was still competitive, the confidentiality back then just wasn't as important as it is today.

**042722 PhD Study-PG Interview**

- PG: media ads are important, but I think that whenever you get community leaders and residents to support any kind of initiative, I just think there's more value in that. Not just having a rogue group of people going out and trying to do something, but you have a larger community supporting an initiative for the whole.

**051022 PhD Interview-WC2**

- And then, I wanted to continue and participate,
I had to build my own friendships. Build my own credibility. Build my own reputation academically, physically. Maybe some of that background gave me that "Chip on the Shoulder" that I had, and I thought I had all the way through grad school. That I needed to prove something, and I needed to do something about it. That was always the fuel to my fire. In terms of needing to prove myself against a group of people that weren't my peer group. Nobody that I grew up with, nobody that I grew up with went to FD.

Then, of course I built my friends, my friendships...through the years, and walked away with my own little group of influencers.

It taught me how to expand my network beyond the village boundaries of Barrigada--where I was always safe. A bunch of thugs, a lot of drug dealers, but I was safe among thieves. Now were dealing with the guys outside the borders. It was kind of survival, but it was great for me because I built a network--of friends that were genuine, who knew me for who I was [establishing identity among like-minded peers]. There's and make a difference. I wasn't all caught up in the Student Government thing, it wasn't my wheelhouse. I wanted to do something to help other victims of fires, but I felt that was too narrow in scope. Even though the story of how I didn't get much help, is a story unto itself.

In an nutshell. The series of events that lead up to me asking for help, and not getting the kind of help I thought I deserved, or needed as a human being, as a student. A starving student, wasn't there. I started a student organization called IFIL. Basically, IFIL was designed to provide general assistance to those in need, and I was President. We were so active in the community, that we became student organization of the year. As a result of that I met a man named Ray Tenorio--whom you know. Who asked me to run as a Senator on his slate. I never met the man in my life. I liked that he was determined, and I liked that he took the time to invite me to join his organization. So I accepted. I won big. I was a high vote getter. This was UOG politics...in the relative scheme of things its nothing, but then again, at the time it was everything for me.

When I started the Islander Foundation, it was really meant to bring a bunch of people together to effectuate change, to help those in need. Its even inherent at the time, in the preamble--which read something like: know ye young men, know he all man, that we the founders of IFIL (spelled out...Islander Foundation..); hereby establish, integrity, comradery, general assistance as a cornerstone upon which we unite in common; enhance ourselves; and through which we establish this constitution for IFIL. That was my preamble. So you can see that integrity, general assistance, comradery; those are all the three key elements that was driving what I was doing at that time.

There are many many examples in my life where I try to influence policy, or completely outright change it or get rid of it. So that it would be softer upon the struggling human.

WC: In 1996, I graduated from FD. Angel Santos is actually my second cousin. His family and my family are very close blood related, his dad and my dad are first cousins. So I would go to the family
no agenda, as a matter of act, if they knew there was an agenda it probably would not work out very nice for me. [agenda-making]

get-togethers. When the movement was starting I was approached by them to participate. At the time I think I was a Senior, and in my head I was like--fuck no. Why would I want to join an agrarian--very agrarian based, very unrefined. At the time I wasn't getting from the rhetoric. There wasn't a whole lot of in the media. It wasn't politically laden. It was agrarian. It was a movement of people who weren't going to college, didn't have gainful employment...at least from what I saw. Who were looking to go occupy lands that were theirs I would think--to live off the land. I was not interested in that.

- I started talking with him in 1997. '94 I started picking up on this Nationalistic Movement, if you will. Nationalism. Really strong pride for the Chamorro Nation.
- He was going to hand deliver that to Janet Reno at the time. We spent a lot of time when he was at Harvard getting to know each other, laughing, feeling him.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Via TEAMS</th>
<th>Via TEAMS</th>
<th>PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413</th>
<th>PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Who are not really performing for the benefit of the students, for the full benefit of the students…to continue to become educators in the classroom.</td>
<td>started teaching, it just came out naturally.</td>
<td>Every Wednesday they have their Staff Meeting. I've been told he has different Staff Members role playing the Council—ask questions like the Council Members. I've been told at each one of these meetings he tells Staff, if you don't know the answer just say &quot;I don't know.&quot; You better know you're shit. MB will know it. She's going to ask you the hard questions.</td>
<td>Moving around all the time. No money. Not knowing what I'm eating really giving up my food to make sure my sisters were eating and getting full. Raising them my whole life. Taking care of my mom my whole life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persistence and courage. To always make a difference. Never giving up. Even when it is rough at times. Also, to believe out of all the sacrifices, all the hard work there's always something good that will happen. My passion is empowering students and teachers through equitable opportunities in teaching and learning.</td>
<td>I started teaching.</td>
<td>There's a day burn into my memory at 4 years old. Very vivid—good recall for being 4 at the time. We were home, right after this had happen… I was jumping on the bed in the middle of the hallway with them. My mom came in—she was mad at me, slapped</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
me on the ass and told me not to jump on the bed anymore. Because if I fall, I'm going to hurt myself. Then, the people are going to come take me away from her. The people are going to come and take us all away. I was 4, and I did not understand what that meant. It was kinda scary, but jumping on the bed was more fun.

I climbed back up on the bed, and started jumping on the bed again. It was the most amazing ironic...as I'm jumping on the bed, CPS literally comes in and picks us up, carries us to a white vehicle. They had waiting outside. Put us in the car, my mom is screaming and she has two people literally holding her back. She's screaming and crying as me and my two sisters (Sister 1 and 2) are being put into this car. Not knowing what the hell is going on. All I can think is...I was jumping on the bed. Then, they drive us away.
I grew up. The school I went to it was lower income. Nobody was really engaged. I always had advantage over my peers.

- I always told myself I always wanted to do the right thing, and I never wanted to choose between doing the right thing and doing what's best for my family. So, I chose not to have a family.

This is within--for the most part within a homogenous community of Islanders, predominantly Chamorro at FD [private school institutional setting of neocolonial structural indoctrination]. So it wasn't like it was one race or another. It was more class than it was ethnicity. That was kind of an uphill battle. I was not of the same breed. I don't know how to put it.

Going into FD was a challenge to me. Fortunately, I was raised with a mom who took a lot of stock in my education--in terms of reinforcing that as I was growing up in the early years. The aptitude was there, so I was able to hold my own. I wasn't just like a low, middle, dumb-ass Chamorro kid with no income; and no real physical advantage over my peers. I was shorter almost all the time.

---

### 051022 PhD Interview-WC2

- This is within--for the most part within a homogenous community of Islanders, predominantly Chamorro at FD [private school institutional setting of neocolonial structural indoctrination]. So it wasn't like it was one race or another. It was more class than it was ethnicity. That was kind of an uphill battle. I was not of the same breed. I don’t know how to put it.

### 051022 PhD Interview-WC2

- Going into FD was a challenge to me.
- Fortunately, I was raised with a mom who took a lot of stock in my education--in terms of reinforcing that as I was growing up in the early years. The aptitude was there, so I was able to hold my own. I wasn't just like a low, middle, dumb-ass Chamorro kid with no income; and no real physical advantage over my peers. I was shorter almost all the time.

### how one's family and cultural values shape message interpretation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PARTICIPANT</th>
<th>VALUES-NOW</th>
<th>VALUES-DIFFER</th>
<th>INFLUENCES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| WC:         | I like to think I'm still consistent in my belief of being a man of your word. I still have a certain sense of loyalty to those certain things outside my | WC: as a young idealistic fuck, I was out for blood. Hey, I could do this. I'm brilliant. Let me take out that bitch-- | ● Family
|             | way. I still have a certain sense of loyalty to those certain things outside my |             | ● Faith |
family. Newer values, stronger values now that are new--novel, I've always been a compassionate person towards others when they're emotionally distraught. Something--when someone is suffering you feel that way for them. I've also developed a different kind of compassion in terms of not wanting to break out the sword and annihilate my enemy, simply because there's an agenda. It's hard for me to do that, even now. I do what I need to do, now. But that does not come naturally to me. Like it does operatives like CB. They walk around and engineer political character assassination of certain actors. My value is, a treasured value for me, as I teach my kids…to try and maintain that sense of--I want to call it integrity, but it's more a Christian-brotherly love integrity towards one another. That's how I look at it, to try and…as much as they hit me and hurt me, to try not to want to retaliate, with equal if not more vice. That's a new value that I picked up because I've seen it in my line of work.

(48:20)

The other value I picked up, that I really honed after college actually came in the last 6-10 years is the value--don't know if it's a value, trade maybe? Being a genuine communicator. Being a

write this down, boom-boom-boom. Just completely cut you up in a million pieces with my pen. That was easy for me at the time. It wasn't until I started--saw it from the personal side, and even the professional side…started seeing how people react negatively to that. Almost disgust depending on how vile your write up is. I didn't like that. I didn't like people reacting like, that is so dark, and dirty, evil. I started to realize, okay its not as easy--I mean its easy to do that kind of work, but the implications, the ramifications are hard to deal with. I started to become less idealistic, more pragmatic, and experienced in my ways. Then truly hit home when I became the victim... [the way the other perceives and acts upon the self]...of these propaganda, character assassination attempts. There had been many. It hurt my family. It hurt me, and in reflection...I don't want to do that to anybody [x CJ...same value + respect for other]. I don't want them to go through that kind of an assassination of ones character, true or not. It's not consistent with my Catholicity--if you want to call it. I'm a terrible Catholic--that
genuine communicator when you talk to someone. I think that's largely why I am where I'm at. I can communicate because my conscious, my brotherly Christian--is clean. My ulterior motive is not there. I think that's what allowed me to come where I'm at in my political career. People say, Wil's good, he's clean. If he commits you got him. He's good for his word. He can execute on command. He doesn't look at it, and how he can fuck you over. He doesn't look at the dark side of that blade. That can come back to cut us in the future. That's not his style. If anything you have a soldier, a warrior for life on your side. You don't have to worry if he's going to cut your throat.

To me, those are things that you have to train your self to do because it's so easy to adopt that other side. I don't think that's a Western trait at all. I think that's reinforced because of our culture, and how we--especially now in the CNMI, there's a stronger feeling of INAFA'MAOLEK and saving face here. Yeah, there are a few crazies out here, but by and large these guys are very sensitive to each other--very sensitive. Where they try not to inflect harm or pain upon one another, even their own enemy. That's how sensitive these people are out here. Not like Guam, any--every opportunity in the Democrat circles that much I know about Christianity. The pinnacle was when I became the fuckin' victim of that shit. From the UOG thing to little stupid jabs on the radio about, "oh, he's acting like a little boy who lit his house on fire, and then put it down with a hose, and said.'look at me, I'm the hero." I mean those little fuckin' stupid cunt-ass remarks like that. Those were designed--engineereed to evoke an emotional response. It did, but I channeled that. Instead of hitting them back. I channeled that into positive energy, and I re-engineereed that shit to my favor. They lost more support, and lost face to the point where they came back begging for me to accept their apology, as late as a year and a half later for something so stupid, but yet so emotionally traumatic to my family. So I accepted RL's apology almost a year and a half later because of that. She understood, as a human being that value I maintain, and that mortal wound you attempted to inflect would now be forgotten even though it was furthest from achieving the kind of result that you had desired, or engineereed it to achieve. It didn't, but you lost a friend for life.
I've been in--that's a modus operandi; but not in Republican circles. At least not in the ones I've been in. Certainly not in my Republican circle here, but that's not to say we don't have it. I have an excellent green room black ops team. It'll be coming out. I don't wake up every day thinking how I can annihilate somebody on the other side. That's now how I roll.

So when she apologized she atoned, and I don't hold her in such negative regard. I appreciate that the human in her, to say, I fucked up it was wrong. I should've stopped it. I saw it coming. I did not write it, but I saw it coming. I didn't stop it.

PG: the values that I have that have transpired over my career is the importance of transparency.

PG: in the past, even up to now there's certain things that have to remain confidential. There's certain things I can't talk about professionally, and I can't talk about those things in my personal life. Back when I first started working here, you could talk amongst peers. You could talk among the business community about things that were going on. Confidentiality was important, but it wasn't as large of an issue then, as it is now. Now we're actually signing NDAs, non disclosure agreements, on projects that we're working on. That's been a very common practice over the last few years.

PG: what drives that is competition. Competition between whoever I'm working with and their competitors, or competition between a company choosing to locate in Killeen versus Temple, Belton, Waco, Copperas Cove. The past everything was mainly driven by…here's our assets, we think you should locate here. Although it was still competitive, the confidentiality back then just wasn't as important as it is today.

CJ: I came up with this thing I used a lot when I was a youngster. I decided I wanted always to try and do the right thing. I always wanted to do the right thing, and make sure nothing could really get in my way doing the right

CJ: they're extremely different…I feel like I'm a lot more sympathetic, empathetic towards everyone. The old me would have chastised any Republican who walked in front of me.

CJ: the main influence is age. As we age, we gain more wisdom. The former Representative had a big influence on me. One of my current bosses, the City Manager, also has a lot of influence on me.
thing. Sometimes, as men, providers for our families, we're the patriarchs of our families. We have to provide for them regardless. Sometimes in this socio-demographic that we're in its not exactly viable to be able to provide for them. So, sometimes men do questionable things to provide for their families. They do things that they perhaps, are not morally right or even legal. I always told myself I always wanted to do the right thing, and I never wanted to choose between doing the right thing and doing what's best for my family. So, I chose not to have a family. In the sense of having children. That's what I chose. I never wanted to be put in that compromising situation where I would test my morals and values for the sake of my child or my wife. I chose not to have a family, of course things are different. I have a significant other now, and of course I have my father and my sister to worry about, but ultimately my values are just--I want to do what's right. I want to do what's best. What I feel is best. I don't want to do any harm to anyone. I don't want to wish ill to anyone, only wish well. I don't want to use tactics that will harm anyone.

For instance, today outside the shop my significant other called me and she said...there's a patron out there, he's a homeless guy. He's

Now, I understand the Republicans have a different points of view, different values. Not all of them obviously. Some of do--can be good people, and some of them are genuinely good, doing good work for their people. I empathize with everyone. As opposed to not empathize with people--who are better off than me, or people with different political views...or people who even offended me at one point. Now, I'm a lot more sympathetic to all of it.

Not only those individuals, but my family. Family and working, and being able to provide. More realizations of how the media works, use words. These relationships that I met with all these people--relationships I built with all these people I met throughout the years. Those are the biggest influences.
hanging out in front of the shop. He's asleep, and we're not getting customers 'cause he's out there. I said okay, I didn't think, "hey, call the police". We all know how that ends. There's other ways other than calling the police in order to solve an issue. So, what I did…I drove out there, saw him asleep, very calmly, friendly, I spoke to him…"hey, do you want a cigarette? Yeah, I'll smoke a cigarette. I spoke to him. I spoke to him for about a good 10 minutes. We had a conversation, mostly nonsense. The poor man seemed very mentally ill. I told him…"look man, I would really appreciate it if you could just move on from here. We have a business we're running. It is what it is, but the customers don't want to come in 'cause you're out here. He spoke to me for another 5 minutes. I asked him his name. He told me his name. He went on his way. There was no police call. There was no punches thrown. There was no yelling, being hurtful--anything. I spoke to the man like a human being, which he is, and he understood that I--I hope he understood that I empathized with his situation. I offered him some money. I even offered him a beer. He declined, and he went on his way.

I think that story helps to encompass what I hold valuable in this world, in this life. Its being a decent
human being, being a good person. It's not being a piece of shit...pardon my French--I want to be a good person--ultimately.

MB: family first. Always family first. Honest. Integrity, and always stand up for people that can't stand up for themselves. MB: I grew up so fast. When I was in college, I was in foster care. I had empathy for people. I just didn't have sympathy. I didn't have family. The whole family first thing didn't matter. It was me first. Take care of me, and what do I need. What's going to get me where I want to be. I think that's the biggest change--when I was younger, 'till now. It went from being about me...how do I control the situation happening to me--specifically. I don't care how it affects other people. Its all about me. Now, its family first, but helping the other people also.

Sd: life values. I'm thinking. Persistence and courage. To always make a difference. Never giving up. Even when it is rough at times. Also, to believe---out of all the sacrifices, all the hard work there's always something good that will happen. My passion is empowering students and teachers through equitable opportunities in teaching and learning. Its very important not to give up, and always try to instill thoughtful exchange. How the dialogue always build that conversation. Paulo Freire has said, in conversation and dialogue Sd: back in the Philippines, believe it or not I was--timid, hard to express my thought because of the higher-up...the hierarchy. In terms of you always have to respect your elders. You can't question. The culture dictates that to--very traditional Catholic-way of thinking. Coming here to the United States, and learning about independence. I valued that a lot. I think that's one of my biggest take-aways--living here for almost 20

Sd: this is another thing I will give to the United States, or America...making me see that opportunities are there. Its up to the individual--how you are going to use it. I could not believe that I was able to get promotion---going back to my professional career. How I started in the Philippines, I was able to get out and come to the United States. It was very fast. I was able to build myself to where I am now. I still continue to build myself. The accomplishments, the accolades...even the challenges have become
that's when your able to encourage empowerment, and also share empowerment, or build empowerment with others. You know how to maintain ---calm--- individual, then its your responsibility to ensure you do that.

<p>| Years in the United States. My sense of independence, and really allowing me to grow more and increase my level of maturity, and lift up that sense of courage and persistence, to make a difference. Really meaningful learning experiences for me--and life experiences--life learning lessons. America has provided me those opportunities, and again with a sense of independence. If I was still in the Philippines I would not be able to reach this same level of success. The opportunities are not laid out easily and equally in the Philippines. If you don't have access to influential people in the Philippines, you will not be able to move upward or forward, and progress. Here in the United States I could proudly say I did everything on my own hard work--didn't ask for favors, didn't ask for sweetheart deals. Nope. I can cleanly say, I did it all correctly. |
|---|---|
| JJ: happiness. Contentment. Compassion. Responsibility, being a father, a citizen, and a veteran. Someone that cares about other people. I think responsibility to be engaged. Those are the values that I would say off the top of my head. JJ: I don't necessarily think they differ, I think I have a more enlightened view of issues. I've experienced ups and downs, personally I've seen trends--upwards, backwards, left or right. I think just with age and experience it gives me a different perspective on issues. When I was young I used to believe the death penalty was actually good. Now I've learned that people makes mistakes, and the government sometimes get it wrong. I now have changed my perspective on it. JJ: I would say this dramatic shift, for me it's the shift in cultural beliefs. As a generation, when I grew up my family was poor. We had government subsidies. I also believe that creates a crutch for people. I think it should be a safety net. Not a pool to jump in and hang out in. I think that’s sort of how I've changed the way I see things just because I've become a little bit more cynical. I've had a lot more failures in my adult life that have dramatically changed the way I operate. Out of necessity. That doesn't mean that the values that I hold have changed much. Just the way I interpret them or see them. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LN:</th>
<th>When I was married, my ex-husband he really valued money over everything else, and that experience...I don't value money like that. My parents didn't value money. I'm not saying they didn't value it, they didn't worship it. They didn't worship it. He worshiped it. Above everything that's all he wanted money, money, money. Right now, its so crazy 'cause he has all the money; he has a great deal of it, and he's a very wealthy man, and he's unhappy. With me, if I have .50 cents or $500k, you would never know which one of them I got, or anything in between because I am the same.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JA:</td>
<td>I still keep that old saying...a penny saved, is a penny earned. That life value...look to goals--short term and long term goals because during those goals there's going to be changes. There's going to be challenges, and most definitely there's going to be rewards for whatever one individual does. I'm a standing example, of when I'm a teenager I wanted to be in the military and retire in the military, so I don't need to work after 39 years old...I can travel the world and go see...well, no. I'm retired...but I'm not seeing the world because there's changes, challenges going on. The other part was, what would happen in my young adult life what it would be like if I had a college education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>When I was married, my ex-husband he really valued money over everything else, and that experience...I don't value money like that. My parents didn't value money. I'm not saying they didn't value it, they didn't worship it. They didn't worship it. He worshiped it. Above everything that's all he wanted money, money, money. Right now, its so crazy 'cause he has all the money; he has a great deal of it, and he's a very wealthy man, and he's unhappy. With me, if I have .50 cents or $500k, you would never know which one of them I got, or anything in between because I am the same.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>...at a young age is different in comparison to its more of my wife and I, of 32 years. whether it benefits our lifestyle, where we live; and whether or not it will benefit me to help the community, one way or another...be it good, or indifferent. It wouldn't be bad, because I wouldn't do it. It would be indifferent because my views would be different than your views. The intent is there. The end state is there. We need to get here, how do we get here, you would want to go around the forest...I'm a straight arrow.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix B-Chapter 4

Patterns of Transformative Critical Consciousness behaviors in community

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONFORMING</th>
<th>REFORMING</th>
<th>TRANSFORMING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>what needs to be done to make it happen? Who do we bring in for volunteers?</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. bring in decision makers, grass roots and grass tops.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>who else needs to be involved?</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• people who have roots here. Who are steeples of the community being the ones that need to step it up.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First black female mayor presiding

[Public Hearing: same female/white; MB civic engagement prior to election, same tactic.]

Rationalize: economic and social impact of researcher in professional environment, to keep faith/religion; inafa'maolek systems.

“We love you Debbie”: first speech as Mayor.

Family, sorority, church and city staff support; mentors thanks—alliances

Committee members; LULAC

Thank Segarra for leadership

“One thing to read about history, another to make history”

Transparent

Accountable

As your mayor, city staff hold me accountable

“To bring harmony”

Work collectively

Empowered by diversity [x rural narrative of Killeen]

great culture tenets; CEO—“take care of patients and staff, money will come”; “5-10 rule” culture; “my pleasure” culture at Chick-Fil-A; “little things with big impact on culture”; simple philosophies to imitate;

agent of transformation during pandemic crisis management for future org development with customer-centered experience philosophy; experience informs perspective of brand;

hardwiring: a culture of service;
Humanization of org culture needs to be explicitly taught-curriculum development DML Value of caring

McClane’s Children Hospital/BSW-Advent/Darnell PediatricTemple, TXBSW misinformation pandemic social mediaChamber tour KCC leadership dayAdvent CEO-DEI; social consciousness; DE&I council-data driven health care plans...mission: “senior leaders build relationships-network”[idea generation]

How can we change approach? Wall of heroes-PICU lobby [remembering]

Tx historical marker-not forgetting original hospital Knowing the network connections (Director of Philanthropy), access; meet donor needs and passions; knowledge sharing;

research studies on giving-data;

researcher remembering NICU experience...donor passion of grateful patients;

Conversation with son: identity construction; cultural values for perspective in emotional-social control...Inafa’maolek

Transforming cultural relations: intercultural translation zone; Innovation Black Chamber x GRK Admin (Executive Director White Anglo Saxon over 60; rural smalltown TX culture x urban killeen culture; making meaning at DBE workshop with participants in understanding; supported by FAA civil rights;

220419_013: 041922 PhD Field Notes, Inafa'maolek. Harmony. Circles. Language. Language Circles. Harmony in one language circle affects the ecosystem of language circles, therefore establishing positive transference versus negative

- 220419_004: 041922 PhD Field Notes; the triangle, the vertices of God-Self-and Other; help maintain perspective in the framing of situations as chaotic as they come to us in the management of affairs which provides discernment; You and God in one corner. You and the Other (wife, co-worker, kids, colleague, boss); and 220419_013: 041922 PhD Field Notes, Inafa'maolek. Harmony. Circles. Language. Language Circles. Harmony in one language circle affects the ecosystem of language circles, therefore establishing positive transference versus negative.

- 220419_004: 041922 PhD Field Notes; the triangle, the vertices of God-Self-and Other; help maintain perspective in the framing of situations as chaotic as they come to us in the management of affairs which provides discernment; You and God in one corner. You and the Other (wife, co-worker, kids, colleague, boss); and You and You. Which becomes the foundation for Inafa'maolek which becomes foundation and basic to that harmony in relations that guide the Public Administrator/the Civically engaged media activist, and the relationships with their community, with themselves, with their higher power.

- 220419_003: 041922 PhD Field notes; this concept of time and the management of it by an Indigenous researcher with an American hybrid background, move from urban cultural environments to rural; once again the researcher, one and half years later, realizes the approach differing in this rural organizational market requiring a more laid-back Island-style approach, which is less intense. Being reminded by colleagues, the wife, Professor, the Executive Director himself; the intensity of the researcher who realizes at this point the INAFA’MAOLEK in this story. The harmony in the relations that have been causing disruption, it’s the management of time, and the releasing of negative relations that create distrust help build trust and cultivate trust—the seeds of those trust.

- 220419_001: 041922 PhD Field Notes; what do I do as a public administrator civically engaged; I think, I reflect on that thinking and I act. The triangulation continues. Participatory Action Research, Sociocultural Foundations pedagogical approaches include reading, reflecting, writing. In this case.
the triangulation continues, in that from a decolonial framework the thinking, the delinking, the relinking.

- Z0000016: 04012022 PhD Field Notes; City manager Tommy Gonzalez-El Paso asks, "how do you transform a city?", from the inside out begins with values of the leadership of the community. Of the people there. The creation of identity. The process…Verdnunity. Comprehensive Land Use Plan process, City of Killeen. Killeen Starting from the ground up.

- 220403_004: 040322 PhD Field Notes. What do you teach-curriculum, how we teach curriculum in light of black lives matter extreme, and Anti-CRT extreme? The way forward is to recognize that third-space. That intercultural curriculum that empowers inequity for those communities affected by it. Historical realities, socio-historical realities while allowing others to save face grounded in policy, public policy.

- 220403_003: 040322 PhD field notes; Hubris of Zero-so the idea of Mignolo, Hubris of Zero, the principle of coloniality; is that there are fundamental frameworks that create colonialism. Yes, its their history, the White Man's history of the Confederacy because of the representations at the County, the representations at the State Capitol…the monuments. We recognize that, and though a community may be predominantly White. The principle of Hubris of Zero means that Coloniality claims that it's the only history. And it's a history, a story, a narrative not to be contended with. And that's what creates the Anti-CRT movement that's happening across White Communities because their seeing that the multicultural nature of history, because all the different people in their communities say, well…that's a bad history. Well, don't make our history bad because we're proud of our history. That's the hubris point of zero. Is you claim that's everyone's history. You claim that because that's your narrative because that's your history everyone has to accept the fact that it's a good history, or its not. Especially if you ask the black people that were enslaved.

That's the problem with the ultra-Alt Right they call it of the White Community. The Nazis. That's how far that thinking is, the KKK. Its not an understanding. We just don't want you to say that, you can't succeed because we're the White people in power. And you can't succeed, that's what they say on FOX news; on what Critical Race Theory is. I was just watching something on YouTube last night. The newscaster, putting the people on the news saying, all the experts are saying, Critical Race Theory claims that you can't succeed. Minorities are complaining about Critical Race Theory because we're teaching the kids that they can't succeed because they are brown and not white. That's a twisting of it. Critical Race Theory is a legal framework that explains the racism, and the dynamics of racism as a structure that oppresses individuals that are not in dominant positions of power. That's what Critical Race Theory is, and there's a lot of scholarship out there about what it is. Its just that they don't like being told that, well your great-grandfather did some, your great-grandfather and your great-great grandfather did some very bad things to people. And y'all took everyone's land, Native Americans and Mexicans in Texas, African-Americans you stole them from their places and sold them, enslaved them. Turn them into property.

And the idea that, the reason why the republicans and the GOP, the conservative policy makers are fighting it 'cause they know there's liability involved. And that's where Critical Race Theory comes in. In a court of law, Critical Race Theory is legitimate argument, its proven. Its what Dr. Martin Luther King used to prove; and Plessy vs. Ferguson was overturned based on Brown vs. Board of Education, was all based upon the notion of racism. The racism that created Un-Incorporated Territories that left our people in the middle of the Pacific property of the U.S. and Congress. That's Critical Race Theory.

They know that there are reparations down the road. They know in Congress that minority Democrats in power are looking to push a reparation agenda, to have those families, those institutions like The University of Texas, Harvard, Princeton, Yale, they're already vulnerable legally-not just politically, but legally vulnerable to not just giving back the property, but paying reparations to the public. That's why they are pushing back on Critical Race Theory, not because they're sensitive for their kids because they know there's a lot of money involved. The same way we talk about reparations for our generation, from World War 2. Because we said, okay America, the old argument for World War 2 Chamorro's is based on America getting Japan to surrender, and in the documents America absolves Japan from war reparations. Meaning, you did a lot of bad things in the Pacific, you did a lot of bad things on Guam. You beheaded families, your family blown up in a cave [to M.A.]. So because you absolved, this is Guam Government telling U.S. in the argument
for reparations, because you absolved Japan, you accept that responsibility. Therefore, you owe us money. That's why the reparations took so long to pass through Congress because the Black Caucus, Underwood used to tell me this, the Black Caucus and the Mexicans would say…what about our reparations? Why are we giving Guam reparations? What about our reparations for slavery? What about our reparations for taking our land?

And the transforming of the human mind, body, and spirit of the researcher; going through bariatric surgery losing 80lbs six months later. In this current date last week, being noted--starting at 345-265, that physical energy, that spiritual energy, the stamina to engage in relationships in a meaningful way. The Wife, those private moments. With the boss, just sitting down. Just having energy to do all these different things. In order to do that requires that transformation. I'm transforming. I'm transforming my own reality. I'm acting myself into a new way of thinking. Positive Deviance.

- 220413_001: 041322 Phd Field Notes; post SD interview, reflection…How do you transform a city? The Culture. The culture that is practiced by a community, different community groups, made up of individuals. So transforming the realities of those individuals in your community will transform everything else. Transforming their engagement. Transforming their media critical consciousness.

Z0000021: 040222 PhD field notes; conflicting epistemologies; the role of the researcher, the role of elected officials in navigating and balancing out value systems grounded in critical decolonial epistemological frameworks while navigating the pluriversalality of neoliberal capitalism (i.e. economic development processes).


- 220516_002: 051622 PhD Field Notes. Chamorro activist that idolize and valorize Anghet.
- Our job is to be respectful.

220516_001: 051622 Phd Field Notes.

- remind him about how he has to be respectful
- be respectful.
- It doesn't matter, just be respectful to different people. That's the way forward. [one thing I've noticed that has been lost in the my own education is the explicit learning of how to understand the political dynamics of power in institutional workspace which is a vital skill for professional development--DML teaching the hidden curriculum of power structures of privilege.]

220505_004: 050522 PhD Field Notes. Cinco de Mayo. Mexican-American Pacific Islander in rural south remembering what Mexican historians note about the value of Cinco de Mayo to the U.S. history as it is today.

220523_002: 052322 PhD field Notes.

- Intercultural Translation Zone; Teacher education a space for intercultural translation. That space for learning and creating a common language of meaning-making between the two for success; there is that bond of teacher education; hence, the PhD in teaching, learning and culture and the opportunity for both of these individuals to communicate, create meaning, shared meaning, and understand each other for the success of an organization, and create social transformation.

- 220506_001: 050622 Phd Field Notes. Jahari's Window. Creating a space for intercultural translation zone I'm claiming "Roque's Window of Knowledge". Similar to Johari's Window where's the open self, hidden self, the blind self, and the unknown self. In this case that knowledge, that window between {ecosystems}, remember these sub-ecosystems that we were talking about between different cultural groups. Instead of that wall this bridge is actually a window--not a square window, but a circular window. It has 4 quarters.

- Yes, there's a open, and a hidden and a blind, and unknown; but its from The Others perspective. This comes from my reading this morning in John, The Gospel. How Saul is used by Jesus; and this speaks to the Catholic faith identity of the researcher, how Saul is sent to Jerusalem to round up believers of Christ, and bound them. Jesus goes to one of the Apostles, and he say's..."go see this guy Saul, he's there." The Apostles said, "we heard about this guy and he wants to persecute
Everyone who believes in you. You want to go to him? He said, "yeah, he's struggling right now. He's a believer. I'm gonna' make him a tool, and he needs you to go to him and tell him I sent you. He's gonna' be a tool for conversion, and believing in Christ. He's gonna' claim Christ, and he's gonna' suffer the same pain he's out persecuting everybody for. People are going to see this, and believe even more. What this guy will go through after being converted.

That's my paraphrase of the reading, my interpretation as well. The Apostle goes to him, puts his hand on him and says, "hey...Jesus sent me, I'm here. I heard you saw him on the side of the road. He's here for you. Saul, at the moment, is blind; and literally, the scales fall off his eyelids, and he sees again.

That blindness of the individual is a specific dimension in the perspective, related to Rossatto's perspective on Optimism; the blind optimism that comes from the Critical Consciousness Chart, that he created with his dissertation. To take away that "blindness of knowing the other", Johari's Window is more about you and how your perspective is to the world--the window pane to the world. Things that you want. Things that you know. Things you want people to see...the open self. Things you want to keep hidden from the world, and hidden from other people. Then, from your perspective things you are blind to, but other people see. Then, from your perspective and others its what is unknown. The four quadrants.

In Roque's Window of meta-Knowing The Other...in the open sense its what the Other wants you to know about them creates understanding. What The Other wants me to know about them. What the Other doesn't want me to know because they keep it hidden. Then what the Other, we know similar to the unknown, what the Other doesn't know, I don't know ("you don't know what you don’t’ know"-Kagle, CM-CoK/FB post), but most importantly it’s the blind dimension. Here in the blind dimension, its what the Other is blind to--about who I am, and what I know. Focusing on that "blindness" requires us to help the Other understand who we are, as minorities in a dominant space, that Other is blind to what we know. They don't know what we know. We have to share with them what we know: [+ you won, now you share--we share what we know]-and find those allies. Find those allies. This window pane acts as a tool, a tool to understanding different cultures.

220506 002: PhD Field notes continued. This Roque's Window of Knowing The Other, as an intercultural translation zone. This perspective framework helps build trust. Requires risk, but works vice-versa, not only for the other to understand. Me and my group, but for me to understand the other's group as well. [other perspective checking]

Because what we have now, everybody putting everything out there...and everybody divisive. How do we see through these walls? Those walls aren't walls. They're window panes to the Other's world--ecosystems, sub-ecosystems, and one big meta-ecosystem. The more we share about practices, beliefs, there's always going to be differences. The way forward is that mutual understanding grounded in frameworks of mediation-mafa'maolek, with respect, everyone has their own mediated framework to make sense of the world.

220516 002: 051622 PhD Field Notes

- why we have to get involved to help change all that. I want them to be curious. I want to share with them the realities of the world. I give them a blessing. I'm proud of them for asking those questions. [link to method--inquiry based analysis] Being curious, and they're learning.

220505_002: 050522 PhD Field Notes.

- Intercultural Translation Zone. That relationship we have with CC, he creates that space of understanding. 

LN: Things that I've read have all kept me pretty grounded that what I'm doing, and what I'm valuing is the better of that.
my earliest memories of knowing--no matter how much money you had, or what you have material-wise...is that you were just as good as anyone else, and to treat everybody the same. No matter what their economic status. [remembering axiological as transformational practice]

And that right there, knowing that people would see my son and think he was a threat...immediately really push me into putting my son even more so, in the limelight of--things, so people could meet him--people that weren't black.

He's been exposed to those type of things in hoping with that--I hope it has altered someone's attitude about young black men.

offering my experiences and journeys to other islanders, and anybody who comes over and says, "hey, this is what I'd like to do...what's your thoughts"? Yeah, I'll provide it. Its sharing that information so they can either adjust how one's own lifestyle is...or take exactly what I've gone through, and put it part of their life so it doesn't happen to oneself; or take it so it can be achieved at a higher level.

042722 PhD Study-PG Interview

- I do not have a college degree, but what I have is basically OJT. Very hard working, dedicated--every job I ever held, which isn't much. I've always risen to Senior Management. A lot of that is because of my dedication. Got that from my mom and dad.

042722 PhD Study-PG Interview

- I do not have a college degree, but what I have is basically OJT. Very hard working, dedicated--every job I ever held, which isn't much. I've always risen to Senior Management. A lot of that is because of my dedication. Got that from my mom and dad.

051022 PhD Interview-WC2

- I don't know what M. Heath was--Caucasian. White. Definitely not Chamorro. That statement set off a fire ball in me. I became an influencer in great part because of that posture of the University, as made manifest through its CFO who is Caucasian. I had no regrets for it. All it did was empower me to feel like I could bring an entire institution to its knee, as a student regent and as a human being because it must be made to be sensitive to the needs of the people.

- It wasn't until he turned his attention to the political world, where he was fighting corruption at the time. Alleged corruption. He was fighting for the rights of Indigenous people. He was fighting against the military establishment. All those things appealed to me.

PhD Study-Interview-SD
2022-04-13
Via TEAMS

- What kept me going was I appreciated my humble beginnings.
- That has helped me to have the stamina, the resilience, not giving up, and the desire to fight for myself.
- I can't just trust their first-hand communication. I always have to do my own research and investigation to find out...is that really true what they're saying about this-this-and that...
- With that privilege I take it to heart that its my responsibility to hold critical conversations, to hold constructive thinking. To hold critical consciousness. To implement that. To use the right words in order to communicate correctly, and provide feedback. To help think outside of the constraints of this only what they see.
- Just how human we are. How we can be swayed by images and words. By different sounds. To me, all that proves is that people can be swayed. People's morals, people's ethics, people's voting history.

PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413

- They wouldn't put presentations on certain items, intentionally because they knew it was going to be a controversial item. They did not want citizens gathering information, particularly citizens like me who were going to go through and research it, then start blasting it out on social media.
MB: yes. My great-great grandmother is Native American, and then, actually I did a DNA test...my DNA test says that I'm primarily Easter Indian, Native American, and Inuit. Then, I've got a little bit of DNA from the Orkney Islands (?), and Easter Europe.

It's been a long journey. I tell people all the time, statistically I should not be where I am right now. I've never liked statistics. I had to take that damn class twice. It bored me the first time, and I didn't finish it. I won't let anybody tell me who I'm supposed to be. Nobody gets to tell me no, without at least hearing me out. It's a lot of insight into how I am on the dais.

Especially coming from my background you don't really have the resources to get yourself out, you kind of dig yourself into a hole--a hole...until you can finally dig yourself out.

Specifically, the City Manager. Say anything you will about him, him personally, his personality--his demeanor, say what you want--that's him. As far as it goes, him running the city, him actually doing what he's supposed to do. I think he does a good job. I think his heart is in the right place. Sometimes his words aren't in the right place, but his heart is definitely in the right place. I think from him coming from a similar background, I didn't grow up nearly as poor as he did. We did have sort of a similar background--being Latinos, both having Mexican parents. None of our parents speaking English. In this country. I can sympathize with what he wants to accomplish, and what he wants to--his end goal. His end game, but from working with the Reps office, and now the administration. I sympathetic a lot more than I did before. As opposed to when I was a college student, right. I was writing stories for my college paper, or just for the class. I went for the pobresitos of the world, and now everybody has issues that we look at. That's really shaped my point of view and my politics.

I decided I wanted always to try and do the right thing. I always wanted to do the right thing, and make sure nothing could really get in my way doing the right thing.

I think that story helps to encompass what I hold valuable in this world, in this life. Its being a decent human being, being a good person. Its not being a piece of shit...pardon my French--I want to be a good person--ultimately.

WC: interesting. I always knew at FD, and it might have even been inherent in my earlier years. I believe my classmates and peers were saying that I was saying this since I was in middle school. That I wanted to be Governor. I was going to be a Governor, and I just kept saying it. To some I didn't say it. My career path was starting to manifest itself. So they saw it as a natural end-game for them, these are non-political people. Keep in mind these are people in the public school system who for the most part didn't have any real political ambition. I could go through my entire roster and tell you who was ambitious or not ambitious. I would say 9 1/2 out of 10 of those people never gave a damn about politics. I was probably the only one who had a keen interest in it. I don't know where it began. I do have some images that are still resonated in my brain [remembering], in my memory [public memory] that may have inspired looking in that direction. Specifically, Riccardo J. Bordallo, my dad shaking his hand at the Customs booth, on what we know of as Labor Day. All I remember was this straw hat, he was in a white t-shirt...he was seated, he had his glasses on. My dad said, "hey boy, this is the Governor..." He was a really big guy--of course I was just a child. That left an impression, an indelible mark in my mind. [plotting course]

The culture dictates that to--very traditional Catholic--way of thinking. Coming here to the United States, and learning about independence. I valued that a lot. I think that's one of my biggest take-aways--living here for almost 20 years in the United States. My sense of independence, and really allowing me to grow more and increase my level of maturity, and lift up that sense of courage and persistence, to make a difference.

The accomplishments, the accolades...even the challenges have become really meaningful learning experiences for me--and life experiences--life learning lessons.
MB: I grew up so fast. When I was in college, I was in foster care. I had empathy for people. I just didn't have sympathy. I didn't have family. The whole family first thing didn't matter. It was me first. Take care of me, and what do I need. That's going to get me where I want to be. I think that's the biggest change--when I was younger, 'till now. It went from being about me... how do I control the situation happening to me--specifically. I don't care how it affects other people. Its all about me. Now, its family first, but helping the other people also.

MB: part of we need to do to engage marginalized communities, and not try to teach them. Reach out to them, get them involved, make them feel like they are important. I know as somebody who grew up in a poverty situation, then in foster care. You feel neglected by the world. People don't want to come in and talk to you. Politicians don't come talk to you. The leadership does not come talk to you. If they're not interested in you, why should you be interested in them.

[TRANSFORMING-relinking practices for PD behaviors]

051022 PhD Interview-WC2

To me, those are things that you have to train your self to do because its so easy to adopt that other side. I don't think that's a Western trait at all. I think that’s reinforced because of our culture, and how we--especially now in the CNMI, there's a stronger feeling of INAFAMAOLEK and saving face here. Yeah, there are a few crazies out here, but by and large these guys are very sensitive to each other--very sensitive. Where they try not to inflect harm or pain upon one another, even their own enemy. That's how sensitive these people are out here. Not like Guam, any--every opportunity in the Democrat circles that I've been in--that's a modus operandi, but not in Republican circles. At least not in the ones I've been in. Certainly not in my Republican circle here, but that's not to say we don't have it. I have an excellent green room black ops team, It'll be coming out. I don't wake up ever day thinking how I can annihilate somebody on the other side. That's now how I roll.

WC: as a young idealistic fuck, I was out for blood. Hey, I could do this. I'm brilliant. Let me take out that bitch--write this down, boom-boom-boom. Just completely cut you up in a million pieces with my pen. That was easy for me at the time. It wasn’t until I started--saw it from the personal side, and even the professional side...started seeing how people react negatively to that. Almost disgust depending on how vile your write up is. I didn't like that. I didn't like people reacting like, that is so dark, and dirty, evil. I started to realize, okay its not as easy--I mean its easy to do that kind of work, but the implications, the ramifications are hard to deal with. I started to become less idealistic, more pragmatic, and experienced in my ways. Then truly hit home when I became the victim... [the way the other perceives and acts upon the self] of these propaganda, character assassination attempts. There had been many. It hurt my family. It hurt me, and in reflection... I don't want to do that to anybody [x CJ...same value + respect for other]. I don't want them to go through that kind of an assassination of ones character, true or not. It's not consistent with my Catholicity--if you want to call it. I'm a terrible Catholic--that much I know about Christianity. The pinnacle was when I became the fuckin' victim of that shit. From the UOG thing to little stupid jabs on the radio about, "oh, he's acting like a little boy who lit his house on fire, and then put it down with a hose, and said, 'look at me, I'm the hero." I mean those little fuckin' stupid cunt-ass remarks like that. Those were designed--engineered to evoke an emotional response. It did, but I channeled that. Instead of hitting them back. I channeled that into positive energy, and I re-engineered that shit to my favor. They lost more support, and lost face to the point where they came back begging for me to accept their apology, as late as a year and a half later for something so stupid, but yet so emotionally traumatic to my family. So I accepted RL's apology almost a year and a half later because of that. She understood, as a human being that value I maintain, and that mortal wound you attempted to inflect would now be forgotten even though it was furthest from achieving the kind of result that you had desired, or engineered it to achieve. It didn't, but you lost a friend for life.

PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413

The City decided that the property owner should be responsible, citing case law from the 1800s. While they're discussing this one night, Mrs. Fleming invited up another person to speak. He had been the person
who caused her to bring this item forward. The Mayor-Segarra, allowed him to come up and speak. Then she says, Mrs. Brown is here and she would like to say something. Can Mrs. Brown come up and speak?

Now I kinda whisper to Rivera saying Mrs. Fleming wants me to speak. I might need somebody to back her up. Would you mind if I speak. No, of course, I'll support you speaking. I get up to the podium, and she saying that she'd like to let Mrs. Brown speak. Jose says no. I asked him why not? He told me its not a public hearing.

I'm standing there at the podium. You can watch this on a hundred news channels, or probably my Facebook Live stream--its still up. If you just google it. Anyway, the Mayor kept telling me no. I kept insisting, and demanding to know why. I knew what my rights were. I knew what the procedures were of the Council. He eventually told me that I had to leave. In that process the Sgt. Of Arms put me in a control hold, and tried to escort me out, but ask me to collect my belongings while both my hands were behind my back.

I was already mad at him. I was yelling at him to lighten up and loosen his grip on me. Then he told me, "it was okay that he was hurting me--keep moving." I kind of lost my shit on him a little bit, even though I was still walking, and cooperating, I was yelling at him. "What are you talking about--telling me, that its okay for you to hurt me…" Growing up in an abusive household--no. You don't tell somebody who's not resisting, 'it's okay, just keep going'. He told me gather my belongings.

You can't see me. It's funny, I'm showing you. I have both my hands behind my back. He is telling me to gather my stuff. I'm leaving. I'm more than willing to leave--I'm going to go. I'd love to gather up my belongings. You need to let go of my hand. Can't really gather your stuff with someone holding two hands behind your back. I don't know if I was supposed to gather it with my mouth or my feet, or whatever.

I also didn't want to try and bring my arm around. You've got me in a control-keep, and if I start to pull my arm around…now, I'm resisting. I wasn't going to let him get me wrapped up in a resisting charge.

As I'm going back-n-forth with him, telling him I want to get my stuff, I need you to let go of my arm…he continues, "mrs. Brown, gather up your belongings." Judge Mark Kimble, who is behind, stood up and told the officer, "Officer I order you to place this woman under arrest for disturbing the peace." They put me in cuffs, and they took me to jail. Pissed me off, instead of suing them I decided the best way to get my revenge--to get up on the Council and make them sit there and work with me every day.

041422 PhD Study-Interview-CJ
• CJ: in this case, in a sense, they did beat city hall, but in another sense they really didn't because they didn't completely kill the project. They really didn't beat anyone. For the most part it’s a really good analogy, but in another sense its not because--let's take another issue. Take that "Lost Dog" issue. That was another, on the West side--that was in a sense--you did beat City Hall. But, who was City Hall at that time? There was a lot of support from "City Hall", from the Council. So you didn't really beat them, they kind of won.

042722 PhD Study-PG Interview [strong in chen'chule across dimensions as native pacific islander female participant-neoliberal/economic development]
• PG: then when you ordered your drink you had to either show your card, or they took your name…and they had your card on file. They had to research it, look it up, then you could buy an alcoholic beverage. Liquor stores were non-existent. So, what community leaders did is we hired a consultant, to go through the process of trying to legalize the sale of alcohol by the drink. Which means you can go to a restaurant and you no longer have to do the membership registration, as well as the ability to sell beer and wine. Which is now expanded to liquor stores. That consultant was able to run a public campaign, and garner enough signatures and we raised enough money. We took the issue to the voters, and they approved both initiatives.
• [education/propaganda interchangeable]
Yes, it was definitely a quality of life initiative. Even if you don't support the consumption of alcohol, it was just the ease of doing business for restaurant owners, and now we have restaurants—you can drink or not drink, it doesn't matter which side of the issue you support. [neoliberal transformation of public space]

051022 PhD Interview-WC2

- Then in '98 he decided to run for Governor. Well, shortly after the Harvard experience he was running for Governor. He asked me to be his Young Adult leader and I accepted, but more important than that for me. I was his "shadow rider". I was Angels' Chief Policy rider at the time, and strategist. I'm just this young motherfucker from UOG, then Harvard. I was not part of any serious movement. I was just a guy with a head on his shoulders who took advantage of--he would come to my house in the middle of the night, and four large towering massive men surround the house at all four corners while he's in the room with me pounding away his rhetoric. Angel would supply almost all the rhetoric. My role was to inspire the rhetoric or to edit it so he's not calling MB a naked whore. It just wasn't proper. Things like that.

- I became his political confidant, and then political pressure was applied to me and I had to pull back. That's how --Ondera became the young adult leader, but I was still very quietly supplying Angel with a lot of political rhetoric. That was '98. [indigenous transformation of neocolonial power structure]

PhD Study-Interview-SD
2022-04-13
Via TEAMS

- I think that if this kind of opportunity is given to everybody, people will be nicer to each other and understand each other better.

PhD Study-Interview-MB-20220413

- It was following everything that they did. I knew we had a bunch of Council member that didn't read--I love Shirley Fleming, apparently Fleming told everybody that she knew the material, she did her reading all morning. So knowing that most of them didn't know the material, and I could download the information myself. I started doing that, and I would just go and speak. Even if they didn't listen to me. The public knew the other side of the story.

- When I started the Islander Foundation, it was really meant to bring a bunch of people together to effectuate change, to help those in need. Its even inherent at the time, in the preamble--which read something like: know ye young men, know he all man, that we the founders of IFIL (spelled out…Islander Foundation.); hereby establish, integrity, comradery, general assistance as a cornerstone upon which we unite in common; enhance ourselves; and through which we establish this constitution for IFIL. That was my preamble. So you can see that integrity, general assistance, comradery; those are all the three key elements that was driving what I was doing at that time.

- There are many many examples in my life where I try to influence policy, or completely outright change it or get rid of it. So that it would be softer upon the struggling human.

- WC: In 1996, I graduated from FD. Angel Santos is actually my second cousin. His family and my family are very close blood related, his dad and my dad are first cousins. So I would go to the family get-togethers. When the movement was starting I was approached by them to participate. At the time I think I was a Senior, and in my head I was like--fuck no. Why would I want to join an agrarian--very agrarian based, very unrefined. At the time I wasn't getting from the rhetoric. There wasn't a whole lot of in the media. It wasn't politically laden. It was agrarian. It was a movement of people who weren't going to college, didn't have gainful employment…at least from what I saw. Who were looking to go occupy lands that were theirs I would think--to live off the land. I was not interested in that.

- I started talking with him in 1997. '94 I started picking up on this Nationalistic Movement, if you will. Nationalism. Really strong pride for the Chamorro Nation.

- He was going to hand deliver that to Janet Reno at the time. We spent a lot of time when he was at Harvard getting to know each other, laughing, feeling him.

[IMF color code informs the dimensions of mediation framework-Knowing Other]
022822

1. Email Informed Consent

Dear __________________:

Thanks you for participating in study. Please find attached informed consent as discussed in our participant-researcher meeting. Following instruction:

2. Review and sign upon approval
3. Email back to researcher with yes, also provide:
   4. Contact information: cell and mailing address--will remain confidential
5. Social media account profiles (linkedIn, facebook, twitter, etc.)

Next steps: this week receiving a survey, 10-20min. Please follow instructions carefully. Thank you for sharing valuable experience and perspectives moving forward.

*note: attach UTEP IRB/IC form.

Email survey

030222

SURVEY EMAIL

Media Survey Questionnaire

Instructions to Participant: choose an example of propaganda in the fields of business, health, education, work, religion and politics. Answer the following questions, and ask at least one question relative to your answer:

Message: what key information and ideas are being expressed?

Techniques: what symbols and rhetorical strategies are used to attract attention and activate an emotional response? what makes them effective?

Means of Communication and Format: How does this message reach people, and what form does it take?

Representation: How does this message portray people and events? What points of view and values are activated?

Audience Receptivity: How may people think and feel about the message? How free are they to accept or reject it?

What ?'s come to mind while you watch this media? List questions here: (as many or few); # your questions

Deadline: Mar 05: conduct survey
Mar 06-Mar 12 transcribing & analysis
Mar 13-Mar 19: conduct focus group------participants advise of best date/time.
CURRICULUM VITA

Roque Anthony Aguon, Jr. holds a Ph.D. candidacy at the University of Texas at El Paso, focusing on SocioCultural Foundations of Education/Civic Engagement & Media Education. He anticipates graduation in December 2023, emphasizing civic and media literacy education, public policymaking, and intercultural communications. His research interests span civic participation, media literacy, political communications, Indigenous studies, and multicultural community development. Aguon earned a Master of Public Administration & Legal Studies from the University of Guam in 2005. He also pursued a Master of Arts in Teaching and holds a Bachelor of Arts in Communication Studies from the University of Guam.

Aguon's extensive executive experience includes roles such as Public Relations & Marketing Director for III Armored Corps/U.S. Army-FedWriters, Aviation Business Manager in Killeen, TX, and Principal Consultant for Victory Communications. He served as a Legislative Aide & Chief of Staff in El Paso, TX, U.S. Department of Commerce Partnership Specialist in West TX, and held various leadership positions in Guam, U.S.A serving as Gubernatorial, Congressional, University Presidential, U.S. Presidential Campaign and Legislative Speaker appointments. He is a board member of Black Brown Dialogues on Policy at the University of Texas at Austin, contributing to discussions on DEI and Ethnic Studies Policy.

In academia, Aguon has taught courses at Wayland Baptist University, The University of Guam, Guam Community College and the University of Texas at El Paso, demonstrating his commitment to education. His accomplishments also extend to the business realm, with successful projects such
as launching the Re-designation brand campaign for Fort Hood to Fort Cavazos, TX, and securing a $1,000,000 grant for the Killeen-Fort Hood Regional Airport.

Aguon has been recognized for his contributions, receiving commendations, awards, and scholarships, including the U.S. Bureau of the Census commendation. He has presented his research at various conferences, contributing to the academic discourse.

For inquiries, Roque Aguon can be reached at aguonroque@gmail.com.